Mozart's Music of Friends

In 1829 Goethe famously described the string guartet as "a conversation among four intelligent people." Inspired by this metaphor, Edward Klorman's study draws on a wide variety of documentary and iconographic sources to explore Mozart's chamber works as "the music of friends." Illuminating the meanings and historical foundations of comparisons between chamber music and social interplay, Klorman infuses the analysis of sonata form and phrase rhythm with a performer's sensibility. He develops a new analytical method called multiple agency that interprets the various players within an ensemble as participants in stylized social intercourse characters capable of surprising, seducing, outwitting, and even deceiving one another musically. This book is accompanied by online resources that include original recordings performed by the author and other musicians, as well as video analyses that invite the reader to experience the interplay in time, as if from within the ensemble.

EDWARD KLORMAN is Assistant Professor of Music Theory and Viola at Queens College and The Graduate Center, City University of New York (CUNY). He also teaches graduate analysis seminars and chamber music performance at The Juilliard School, where he was founding chair of the Music Theory and Analysis department. Committed to intersections between musical scholarship and performance, he currently serves as co-chair of the Performance and Analysis Interest Group of the Society for Music Theory. He has performed as guest artist with the Borromeo, Orion, and Ying Quartets and the Lysander Trio, and he is featured on two albums of chamber music from Albany Records. He has published and presented widely on topics in the performance of eighteenth-century chamber music. Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-09365-2 - Mozart's Music of Friends: Social Interplay in the Chamber Works Edward Klorman Frontmatter More information



Frontispiece: Artist unknown, *String Quartet Playing under a Bust of Mozart*, nineteenth century. Lithograph, likely based on a painting (whereabouts unknown). Czech Museum of Music, National Museum, Prague.

Mozart's Music of Friends

Social Interplay in the Chamber Works

EDWARD KLORMAN

Foreword by Patrick McCreless





University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107093652

© Edward Klorman 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Names: Klorman, Edward, 1982– Title: Mozart's music of friends : social interplay in the chamber works / Edward Klorman ; foreword by Patrick McCreless. Description: Cambridge : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2015035033 | ISBN 9781107093652 (Hardback : alk. paper) Subjects: LCSH: Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756–1791–Criticism and interpretation. | Chamber music–18th century–History and criticism. Classification: LCC ML410.M9 K78 2016 | DDC 785.0092–dc23 LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2015035033

ISBN 978-1-107-09365-2 Hardback

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/9781107093652

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-09365-2 - Mozart's Music of Friends: Social Interplay in the Chamber Works Edward Klorman Frontmatter More information

> In memoriam CHARLES ROSEN 1927–2012

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-09365-2 - Mozart's Music of Friends: Social Interplay in the Chamber Works Edward Klorman Frontmatter More information

> Classic textures have strong mimetic values. Individual voices or parts in [a chamber] ensemble can move with or against each other much as actors or dancers do on the stage. Their musical figures are like gestures, taking on bold relief in the free and varied interplay of classic part-writing. The typical sound of classic instrumental music – transparent, with neat and uncluttered layouts and luminous, balanced sonorities – promotes this "little theater."

> – Leonard G. Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style* (New York: Schirmer, 1980), 118

Contents

```
List of figures [page viii]
  List of music examples [x]
  Foreword by Patrick McCreless [xiv]
  Preface [xxi]
  Acknowledgments [xxvii]
  About the web resources [xxx]
  PART I HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES [1]
1 The music of friends [3]
2 Chamber music and the metaphor of conversation [20]
3 Private, public, and playing in the present tense [73]
  PART II ANALYTICAL PERSPECTIVES
                                          [109]
4 Analyzing from within the music: toward a theory of multiple
  agency [111]
5 Multiple agency and sonata form [156]
6 Multiple agency and meter [198]
7 An afternoon at skittles: analysis of the "Kegelstatt" trio,
  K. 498 [267]
  Epilogue [289]
  Bibliography [298]
  Index [318]
```

vii

Figures

- Frontispiece: Artist unknown, String Quartet Playing under a Bust of Mozart, nineteenth century. Lithograph, likely based on a painting (whereabouts unknown). Czech Museum of Music, National Museum, Prague. [page ii]
- 1.1 Heliogravure by Franz Hanfstaengl, 1907, after Julius Schmid, *Haydn Quartet*, c. 1905–6 (painting now lost). Vienna City Museum. Reproduced by permission. [5]
- 1.2 String quartet table (*Quartetttisch*), late-eighteenth century. Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna. Reproduced by permission of the KHM-Museumsverband. [7]
- 1.3 Detail from title page of Haydn, Piano Trio, Hob. XV:10.Vienna: Artaria, 1798. Reproduced by the permission of the Jean Gray Hargrove Music Library, University of California, Berkeley. [8]
- 1.4 Gabriel Jacques de Saint-Aubin, *The Musical Duo*, c. 1772. Watercolor, gouache, brown and black ink, and graphite. The Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco. Reproduced by permission. [8]
- 1.5 Nicolaes Aartman, *Interior with a Musical Gathering*, c. 1723–60. Graphite and watercolor. Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam. Reproduced by permission. [9]
- 2.1 Title page of Haydn, String Quartets, op. 1, nos. 1–4. Paris: La Chevardière, [1764]. Reproduced by the permission of the Jean Gray Hargrove Music Library, University of California, Berkeley. [31]
- 2.2 Jeremy Ballard, caricature of Amadeus Quartet first violinist Norbert Brainin (left) and violist Peter Schidlof (right) performing the Mozart *Sinfonia concertante*. Reproduced by permission of Kay Ballard. [40]
- 3.1 Johann Ernst Mansfeld, Private Concert during Court Mourning. Engraving published in Joseph Richter, Bildergalerie weltlicher Misbräuche: ein Gegenstück zur Bildergalerie katholischer und klösterlicher (Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1785), 38. Reproduced by permission of the Burke Library, Union Theological Seminary. [93]

viii

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

CAMBRIDGE

LIST OF FIGURES

ix

- 3.2 Detail from Antoine Jean Duclos, *The Concert*, 1774. Etching and engraving after Augustin de Saint-Aubin. Image copyright © The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. Image source: Art Resource, NY. Reproduced by permission. [99]
- 5.1 The Adventures of a G♭ in Piano Quartet in E♭ Major, K. 493, Larghetto (ii) [196]
- 6.1 Metrical preference rules (MPRs), adapted from Lerdahl and Jackendoff [199]
- 6.2 Metrical Projection (from Danuta Mirka, *Metric Manipulations in Haydn and Mozart*, Ex. 1.13, © 2009 Oxford University Press).
 Reproduced by permission. [203]
- 7.1 Johann August Rosmaesler. Detail from title page of Franz Seydelmann, Sechs Sonaten für zwo Personen auf Einem Clavier. Leipzig: Breitkopf, 1781. Reproduced with the permission of the Nederlands Muziek Instituut, The Hague, The Netherlands. [272]

Music examples

- 0.1 Haydn, String Quartet in Bb Major ("La chasse"), op. 1, no. 1, Presto (i) [page xxi]
- 2.1 Haydn, *Sinfonia concertante* in Bb Major, Hob. I:105, Allegro con spirito (iii), final soli [38]
- 2.2 Mozart, Sinfonia concertante in Eb Major, K. 364, Presto (iii), final soli [39]
- 2.3 Haydn, String Quartet in G Major, op. 77, no. 1, Allegro moderato (i), opening
 - a. Score [43]
 - b. Recomposition of mm. 11–14 [45]
- 2.4 Momigny, arrangement of Mozart, String Quartet in D Minor,K. 421, Allegro moderato (i) (from *Cours complet d'harmonie et de composition* [Paris, 1806], Plate #30)
 - a. Facsimile of first page. Reproduced by permission of the Nederlands Muziek Instituut, The Hague, The Netherlands. [54]
 - b. "Commentary" by Aeneas (Enée) [55]
 - c. Statements by the Chorus [56]
 - d. Coda [57]
 - e. Development [63]
- 4.1 Mozart, Piano Quartet in Eb Major, K. 493, Allegretto (iii) [112]
- 4.2 Mozart, String Quartet in G Major, K. 387, Molto allegro (iv) [119]
- 4.3 Mozart, Duo in Bb Major for Violin and Viola, K. 424, Allegro (i) [137]
- 4.4 Schubert, Sonata in A Minor for Arpeggione and Piano, D. 821, Allegro moderato (i) [139]
- 4.5 Mozart, Clarinet Quintet in A Major, K. 581, Allegro (i), subordinate theme [142]
- 4.6 Mozart, Piano Quartet in Eb Major, K. 493, Allegro (i), subordinate theme
 - a. Score [145]
 - b. Normalized model (antecedent plus continuation) [149]
 - c. Expansion of basic idea and contrasting idea [149]

CAMBRIDGE

LIST OF MUSIC EXAMPLES

xi

- 4.7 Phrase (*Einschnitt*) expansion through partial rhythmic augmentation (from Johann Philipp Kirnberger, *Die Kunst des reinen Satzes*, vol. 2, pt. 1 [Berlin, 1776], 146)
 a. Four-bar model [149]
 - b. Five-bar expansion [149]
- 4.8 Mozart, Piano Sonata in A Minor, K. 310, Allegro maestoso (i), end of exposition [153]
- 5.1 Mozart, Sonata in E Minor for Piano and Violin, K. 304, Allegro (i), exposition [161]
- 5.2 Mozart, Piano Quartet in Eb Major, K. 493, Larghetto (ii), exposition [169]
- 5.3 Recomposition of mm. 19–22 [174]
- 5.4 Recomposition of mm. 23-27 [176]
- 5.5 Transformation of the breakthrough idea [177]
- 5.6 Identical scale degrees in opening and closing themes [178]
- 5.7 A subtle motivic repetition (Bb−C−D−Eb)
 a. Breakthrough idea (violin) [178]
 b. Closing theme (piano, right hand) [178]
- Mozart, Piano Quartet in Eb Major, K. 493, Larghetto (ii), development [182]
- 5.9 Recomposition of mm. 47–50 [184]
- 5.10 A comparison of breakthrough idea statementsa. Original statement [186]
 - b. Development [186]
- 5.11 Recomposition of mm. 56-59 [188]
- 5.12 Breakthrough motive (3-6-7-1) in the retransition
 a. Original breakthrough idea (violin) [190]
 b. Canonic treatment in the retransition [190]
- 5.13 Mozart, Piano Quartet in Eb Major, K. 493, Larghetto (ii), recapitulation [192]
- 6.1 Mozart, String Quartet in F Major, K. 590, Menuetto: Allegretto (iii)a. Score [206]
 - b. Recomposition of consequent phrase [207]
 - c. Durational reduction (Carl Schachter's analysis from "Rhythm and Linear Analysis: Aspects of Meter," in *Unfoldings*, Ex. 3.8b, © 1998 Oxford University Press). Reproduced by permission. [208]
- Bach, Fugue in C[#] Minor from *The Well-Tempered* Clavier, Book 1 (hypermetrical analysis from Heinrich Schenker, *Free Composition*, Fig. 149, 8a). *Der freie Satz* (vol. 3 of *Neue musikalische Theorien und*

xii

LIST OF MUSIC EXAMPLES

Phantasien) © 1935 Universal Edition A. G., Wien. Revised edition © 1956 Universal Edition A. G., Wien/UE 6869. Reproduced by permission. [210]

- 6.3 Mozart, Serenade in C Minor for Wind Octet, K. 388, Menuetto in canone (iii), oboes and bassoons only [211]
- 6.4 Mozart, String Quartet in G Major, K. 387, Molto allegro (iv), coda [212]
- 6.5 Brahms, Sonata in Eb Major for Piano and Clarinet, op. 120, no. 2, Allegro amabile (i)
 - a. Score [216]
 - b. Alternative barring of mm. 22–29, following the piano part [218]
- 6.6 Mozart, String Quartet in G Major, K. 387, Allegro vivace assai (i)a. Score [222]
 - b. Alternative barring of mm. 13–19 [224]
- 6.7 Haydn, String Quartet in F Major, op. 77, no. 2, Allegro moderato (i) [229]
- 6.8 Cycles of imitation in chamber music for strings
 - a. Mozart, String Quartet in C Major ("Dissonance"), K. 465, Allegro (i), retransition [230]
 - b. Beethoven, Quartet in C Minor, op. 18, no. 4, Allegro (iv), *maggiore* theme [231]
 - c. Tchaikovsky, Sextet in D Minor ("Souvenir de Florence"), op. 70, Allegro con spirito (i) [232]
- 6.9 Examples of slurs (from Türk, Klavierschule, p. 355) [234]
- 6.10 Slurs as equivalents of rhythmic values (from Lerdahl and Jackendoff, A Generative Theory of Tonal Music, Exx. 4.27 and 4.28, © 1983 Massachussets Institute of Technology). Reproduced by permission. [234]
- 6.11 Haydn, Piano Sonata in C Major, Hob. XVI:50, Allegro (i)a. Score [235]
 - b. Voice-leading derivation of m. 3 [235]
- 6.12 Ties across bar lines (from Leopold Mozart, Versuch einer gründlichen Violinschule [Augsburg, 1756], 259) [235]
- 6.13 Mozart, Clarinet Quintet in A Major, K. 581, Trio I (iii) [237]
- 6.14 Mozart, String Quartet in C Major ("Dissonance"), K. 465, Menuetto: Allegro (iii)
 - a. Hypermetrical analysis by McClelland ("Extended Upbeats in the Classical Minuet," Ex. 2, © 2006 Ryan McClelland).
 Reproduced by permission. [242]

LIST OF MUSIC EXAMPLES

xiii

- b. Opening renotated in **2** [243]
- c. Alternative hypermetrical analysis (second reprise only) [246]
- 6.15 Mozart, Sonata in G Major for Piano and Violin, K. 379, Allegro (ii), transition and subordinate theme [251]
- 6.16 Mozart, Trio in Eb Major for Piano, Clarinet, and Viola
 - ("Kegelstatt"), K. 498, Trio (ii)
 - a. Trio [256]
 - b. Voice-leading derivation of mm. 43-45 [259]
 - c. Two harmonic interpretations of m. 42 [260]
 - d. Bass-line reduction of mm. 63-68 [263]
 - e. Coda [265]
- 7.1 Derivation of subordinate theme (i)
 - a. Subordinate theme (clarinet, concert pitch) [277]
 - b. Cadential idea from primary theme (piano, right hand) [277]
 - c. Opening *grupetto* gesture (viola and piano, right hand) [277]
- 7.2 Comparison of opening vs. recapitulation (i)
 - a. Opening: a tentative exchange [279]
 - b. Recapitulation: a group of friends [279]
- 7.3 Recomposition of first reprise (ii) [282]
- 7.4 Two problematic rounded-binary recapitulations (ii)a. Minuet [285]
 - b. Trio [285]
- 7.5 $\hat{5}-\hat{6}-\hat{7}-\hat{8}$ motive
 - a. Subordinate theme, recapitulation (i; viola) [286]
 - b. Rondo theme (iii; clarinet, concert pitch) [286]

Foreword

Patrick McCreless Yale University

What Edward Klorman brings to Mozart's chamber music is not a single perspective, but a combination of three: performance, theory and analysis, and history. The strength of his book inheres in the skill with which he brings these perspectives to bear on Mozart's chamber music, and in the imagination with which he combines them into an original synthesis. In his own experience, performance came first. Trained as a violist, he has learned over many years what it feels like, and sounds like, to be in a chamber ensemble – especially in the middle of such an ensemble, where violists invariably find themselves. Through his experience in performance he developed an interest in music theory and analysis, which he then pursued through graduate school. His living with the chamber music repertoire as both performer and analyst accordingly inspired a curiosity about its history, especially that of Mozart's chamber works – and hence, the book you are about to read.

But what about history? In our current culture of Western art music, chamber music is regarded as the most rarified and elitist of genres musicians' music par excellence. At a string quartet concert one expects to find educated and knowledgeable listeners - listeners who can follow, and who indeed delight in, the musical arguments set before them. Nor is much of the chamber repertoire easy to play. Beethoven's middle and late string quartets, Schubert's quartets and piano trios, all Brahms's chamber music, and the quartets and other chamber pieces of canonic twentieth-century composers such as Bartók, Shostakovich, and Carter: These works, and many, many more, demand professional musicians of the highest caliber even well-rehearsed professional musicians of the highest caliber. Pushing back against this hyper-refined concept of chamber music, Klorman draws our attention to what we have known for a long time, but which has generally been lost in the public consciousness: Chamber music was born, in the second half of the eighteenth century, not in the concert hall (the concert hall itself was just in the process of being born then), but in the

xiv

FOREWORD

xv

aristocratic salon. Not only was such music not intended for professional performers; it was not even intended for "listeners," if by listeners we mean those who listen to professionally prepared chamber works in formal concert situations. Rather, string quartets and piano trios, and sonatas for piano and violin, to name the most popular genres, were fashioned for capable amateurs to play *a prima vista* – at first sight – at aristocratic social gatherings, for their own enjoyment and that of those present who chose to listen for a while rather than participate in conversation.

This is where Klorman begins, with the late-eighteenth-century's favorite metaphor for chamber music in general, and the string quartet in particular – *conversation*. It is surely no accident that the string quartet and other chamber genres developed simultaneously in the eighteenth century with a growing interest in conversation, and with the publication of many how-to manuals and countless journal articles about it. From a recent collection of essays on the topic we read:

Conversation, as concept and practice, arrived at a pivotal, and unprecedented, stage in its development during the historical period that has come to be known as the long eighteenth century. The eighteenth century's attention to, and production of, conversational forms manifests itself in the period's plethora of texts and images that address themselves to the description and conceptualization of conversation across a range of disciplines and genres. (Halsey and Slinn, eds., *The Concept and Practice of Conversation in the Long Eighteenth Century*, 1688–1848, 2008, ix)¹

To consider chamber works such as string quartets and piano trios as conversations was a natural step to take. Unlike the symphony, which was viewed as a formal, public statement governed by rhetoric, chamber works were experienced as conversations among individuals, and were governed by different values and different rules. The late-eighteenth-century theorist Heinrich Christoph Koch expressed the difference succinctly: "Since the melody of a sonata [of which the quartet was an exemplar] portrays the sentiments of individual people, it must be exquisitely cultivated and seem to represent the subtlest nuances of the sentiments. In contrast, the melody of the symphony must distinguish itself not through such subtleties of expression but through power and force" (Koch, *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition*, vol. 3, 1793, 315–16).

The telling phrase here is "individual people." If the individual instruments of a chamber ensemble each express the thoughts and sentiments of

¹ Since my short essay is only a foreword, I will exempt myself from the scholarly obligation of citing each source in full detail the first time it is mentioned, on the assumption that the reader can easily find all the sources in the text of the book, its bibliography, and its index.

xvi foreword

a single person, then the interaction of the parts becomes a conversation, and the individual players become agents who enact musical ideas with regard for one another. It is from this notion that Klorman derives the concept that drives the book, *multiple agency* – an idea that has its roots in both performance and music analysis, and that is also grounded historically, as he shows in abundance in the three chapters that comprise his Part I – "Historical perspectives." These chapters ably document the social history of the genre into which Mozart's chamber music fits, establishing through both citation of many primary sources and the ample work of music historians that this music was/is indeed "the music of friends," that its practice involved sight-reading rather than rehearsing, and that the textural freedom of its ensembles enabled both changes of musical topic within a single movement and easy interchange of voices back and forth, with one voice after another claiming primary agency in the temporal unfolding of the music.

Klorman has done his homework: He builds carefully on important work of others, as his numerous references to scholars past and present make clear. He is up to date, for example, on the work of those who have contributed to our understanding of the history of the string quartet in the eighteenth century through studies of sources, style, and social contexts – scholars such as Cliff Eisen, Ludwig Finscher, Floyd and Margaret Grave, Mary Hunter, Simon Keefe, Elisabeth Le Guin, Nancy November, Elaine Sisman, W. Dean Sutcliffe, and Gretchen Wheelock. One older source that is of particular relevance to Klorman's project, since it is of analytical more than historical character, is Charles Rosen's eye-opening (for me, at least, in 1971) discussion, in *The Classical Style*, of how a single voice in Haydn's quartets can morph imperceptibly from tune to lively rhythmic accompaniment before our very ears (Rosen, *The Classical Style* 1971/1997, 141–42).

What he adds to such a point of view is the consistent perspective of a player from *inside* the music – from the musical experience of a violist, whose roles have surely included putting up with a first violin's penchant for being the star, providing harmonic and rhythmic support for themes stated by other instruments, playing the crucial sharp that turns a sonata exposition from the tonic to the dominant, and occasionally interrupting the other players to play his own theme in the sunlight. Such a player can also imagine the experience of his/her colleagues – what it feels like to "lay back" while another instrument plays a theme, to come suddenly together in a homophonic passage, to react to a dramatic surprise introduced by another player, or to coordinate with "friends" in a taut fugato in

FOREWORD

xvii

a development section. We have all read descriptions or analyses of chamber works that discuss the music in such terms, but I know of no one who does so so explicitly from the perspective of the players, and so systematically through entire movements – or, as is the case with Klorman's Chapter 7, on Mozart's "Kegelstatt" trio, even through a whole multi-movement work.

And what shines through in his analytical chapters (Chapters 4–7) is not just the perspective of the player – a perspective that at least at times, is that of an imagined musician playing and experiencing the music for the first time, *a prima vista*, in a late-eighteenth-century salon. What also emerges is a point of view that is enriched by, and seasoned by, scholarship in modern music theory and analysis. To be sure, the modern discipline of music theory (from, say, the 1970s) is in some respects vulnerable to critique on the grounds of formalism and presentism. But, I would argue, it also offers a number of elements that, used sensitively, can bring us closer to, rather than taking us farther from, historical and musical understanding. It is precisely some of these features that Klorman adopts in his book.

Having noted above some of the musicological perspectives that inform Klorman's book, I outline here some of the musical theories that are in his interpretive arsenal and that undergird his whole project. Since he generally does not introduce these systematically or place them in their larger disciplinary context, a brief overview of some of these may be useful. I should also note that he is admirably eclectic in what he brings to the table: Even though American music scholarship is divided into music theory, on the one hand, and musicology, on the other, as presumably separate disciplines, he is comfortable with both, paying little attention to such disciplinary distinctions, but rather appropriating freely whatever he finds useful. Here are some of the analytical points of view that inform his work, in some cases along with comments on the issues that they raise both in the book, and beyond.

Schenkerian theory: It might seem odd to list Schenker, whose major publications appeared between 1906 and 1935, as a recent theorist. Yet no theorist of tonal music has had a more powerful impact on Anglo-American music theory than has the Austrian Heinrich Schenker (1868–1935). In the 1970s and 1980s Schenkerian theory was essentially synonymous with tonal theory. Schenker's aesthetic – which dictated absolute devotion to the concept of the musical work, to the masterpiece as the product of (almost exclusively) German genius, and the obligation of the performer faithfully to reproduce the work in the spirit of the

xviii FOREWORD

composer – sits uneasily with Klorman's historical tale of aristocratic amateurs sight-reading string quartets as a diversion (albeit a sophisticated and rewarding one) at dinner parties. But many of the *musical* aspects of Schenker's approach are central to Klorman's work: the centrality of harmonic and contrapuntal goal-directedness to cadences; the notion of musical levels, such that even in texturally adventurous chamber works the surface of the music is guided by an underlying simple counterpoint; and the tendency of melodic lines to move by step (especially by ascending step to points of melodic climax, and by descending step to cadential goals) – a concept that he called *melodic fluency* (*fliessender Gesang*). These concepts are foundational, and we encounter them throughout the analytical chapters of the book.

The New Formenlehre: Formenlehre is the German theory of musical form (as it functions in [mostly] German instrumental works), as developed in the nineteenth century by Adolph Bernhard Marx (1795-1866) and numerous theorists of later generations. In the eyes of some, it also reaches back to the approaches to form in the theoretical thinking of earlier generations – e.g., the work of Koch (1749–1816), whose ideas are more relevant to Mozart's chamber music than are those of Marx, who addressed himself primarily to the works of Beethoven. What makes the New Formenlehre "new" is that it involves the reinvigoration of an aspect of music theory that had fallen out of favor for many years, roughly from the 1960s through the 1990s. Schenker dismissed most earlier theories of form, proposing instead his own (though never fully worked-out) approach. In the decades when his influence held sway, the theory of form in tonal music became more or less moribund. Still, Edward T. Cone (Musical Form and Musical Performance, 1968), and Charles Rosen (The Classical Style, 1971/1997; Sonata Forms, 1982/1998) published important work on form during this period, and more recently William Caplin's Classical Form (1998) initiated a dramatic resurgence of interest in formal studies. Caplin's book and James Hepokoski and Warren Darcy's Elements of Sonata Theory (2006) constitute the two central texts of the New Formenlehre, which has to some degree supplanted Schenkerian theory within the world of Anglophone music theory as the industry that preserves and illuminates the Western canon of instrumental music. (Nonetheless, both theories interact with Schenkerian theory in intriguing ways, and most tonal theorists maintain competence in both Schenkerian and Formenlehre analysis.) In the analytical chapters of Mozart's Music of Friends, one encounters the New Formenlehre constantly, in Caplin's classification of theme-types as periods, sentences, or hybrids, and in

CAMBRIDGE

FOREWORD

xix

Hepokoski and Darcy's concept of teleology and goal-directedness toward important cadences in sonata form.

Performance and analysis: The discipline of music theory, as it has developed over the past few decades, has witnessed an ever-increasing interest in the relation of musical analysis to musical performance. Earlier studies were often glibly unidirectional - in the most one-sided endeavors, the analyst simply explained musical structure to the performer, who was then expected gratefully to incorporate these insights into his or her performance. More recent studies typically place the analyst and the performer on equal footing, with the idea that the instincts of performers are held to be as likely to offer insights to analysts as the observations of analysts are thought to be valuable for performers. Klorman, who has one foot firmly planted in each camp, is a committed proponent of the latter point of view, and an entertaining and informative aspect of his book is experiencing how his musician's sense of multiple agency - how individual musical parts/players pass around themes, interchange leading and accompanying functions, and compete, jostle, and joke with one another squares with his analytical insights.

The body and musical gesture: From the 1960s through much of the 1980s the enterprises of historical musicology and music theory were predominantly positivist and formalist - musicologists focusing on the study of historical documents, theorists on theory-based music analysis. But the late 1980s and 1990s saw a sea change, thanks in part to Joseph Kerman's Contemplating Music (1985), which took both disciplines to task and called for a newly humanistic music criticism. A propitious response on both sides of the aisle was the awakening of an interest in the musical body: a response evident in musicology in the 1990s feminist work of Susan McClary and Suzanne Cusick, and in the more recent performance studies of Elisabeth Le Guin; and in music theory in studies of musical gesture by Robert Hatten, Arnie Cox, and others. Klorman's concept of multiple agency resonates nicely with this work, since the act of making live musical sound requires bodily gestures by individual musicians, and such gestures are as open to observation, analysis, and interpretation as the notes in a musical score. Study of physical and musical gestures has the advantage of directing attention away from the object that is the score to the enactment of music in real time - a change of direction very much in keeping with the broadening interests of current musical scholarship.

Theories of musical rhythm and meter: Western music theory has generally focused primarily on aspects of musical pitch and harmony, but XX

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-09365-2 - Mozart's Music of Friends: Social Interplay in the Chamber Works Edward Klorman Frontmatter More information

FOREWORD

the past thirty years have seen a rapidly increasing interest in rhythm and meter. I need not address this issue in detail here, because Chapter 6 of *Mozart's Music of Friends* is entirely dedicated to the analysis and interpretation of musical meter in some of the chamber works, in the context of multiple agency. Of the seven chapters of the book, this is easily the one most explicitly based on specific theories, and Klorman explains their particulars and historical context adequately in the text, so that discussion here is unnecessary. Recent theories of meter show how it is established perceptually, and how it functions not only on the measure-to-measure level but also on the level of three- and four-measure units and beyond. As is eminently evident in Chapter 6, such theories afford rich insights into Mozart's chamber works, showing how their frequent asymmetry and unpredictability have important ramifications for performers, listeners, and analysts.

Musical topics: A wonderful and frequently noted feature of Mozart's music, both instrumental and vocal (and especially operatic), is its capability of moving, whether smoothly or abruptly, from one expressive state or register to another: from military march, to gentle and lyrical melody, to show of virtuosity. The historian Leonard Ratner called attention to this aspect of mid- to late-eighteenth-century music in his Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style (1980), and his students Wye Jamison Allanbrook and Kofi Agawu helped to bring the idea of such musical "topics," as they are called, into the musical mainstream. Further work by Robert Hatten and Raymond Monelle, both of whom have brought the perspective of semiotics into music scholarship, has been especially influential in the ongoing loosening of the grasp of formalism on music theory, and the recent Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory, edited by Danuta Mirka (2014), synthesizes a variety of historical and analytical perspectives within a single, comprehensive volume. This is yet another thread that enriches Klorman's account of Mozart's chamber music.

Music as play: Finally, an appealing aspect of Klorman's book is its willingness to *play*: to indulge in fantasy and language that mimic how musicians, whether of the eighteenth century or the twenty-first, might speak with one another about what they are doing. Without compromising the insightfulness or sophistication of his work, he is able to write cheerily about instrumental personas being chummy, coquettish, suave, and much more – far beyond what we're used to reading in analytical music theory, but refreshing, perceptive, and invariably assuring us that we are in the company of a sensitive and knowledgeable musician.

Preface

According to an oft-recounted founding myth, Haydn's first forays into quartet writing were motivated by a social occasion:

The following purely chance circumstances had led him to try his luck at the composition of quartets. A Baron Fürnberg had a place in Weinzierl, several stages from Vienna [about 50 miles], and he invited from time to time his pastor, his manager, Haydn, and Albrechtsberger (a brother of the celebrated contrapuntist, who played the violoncello) in order to have a little music. Fürnberg requested Haydn to compose something that could be performed by these four amateurs. Haydn, then eighteen years old, took up this proposal, and so originated his first quartet [see Ex. 0.1], which immediately appeared, received such great approval that Haydn took courage to work further in this form.¹

Ex. 0.1 Haydn, String Quartet in Bb Major ("La chasse"), op. 1, no. 1, Presto (i)

While this charming story is hardly a factual history of the string quartet's birth,² it does exemplify an intertwining of sociability and chamber music prevalent in late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century thought. At the time, the typical setting for playing sonatas and ensemble chamber music was the drawing room, a space that also served as the venue for gatherings

¹ Georg August Griesinger, *Biographische Notizen über Joseph Haydn* (Leipzig, 1810), 15–16 (Web Doc. #7). English translation from Vernon Gotwals, trans., *Haydn: Two Contemporary Portraits*, by Georg August Griesinger and Albert Christoph Dies (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968), 13. On the capacity of string quartets to forge bonds of friendship, compare Griesinger's remarks to an essay, also published in 1810, by Johann Conrad Wilhelm Petiscus (quoted in the epigraph to Chapter 1).

² See David P. Schroeder's appraisal of Griesinger's account in "The Art of Conversation: From Haydn to Beethoven's Early String Quartets," *Studies in Music from University of Western Ontario* 19–20 (2000–1): 377–8. See also James Webster and George Feder, *The New Grove Haydn* (New York: Macmillan, 2002), 8–9; Floyd K. Grave and Margaret Grave, *The String Quartets of Joseph Haydn* (Oxford University Press, 2006), 9–10; Mary Hunter, "The Quartets," in *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn*, ed. Caryl Clark (Cambridge University Press, 2005), 112–13; and David Wyn Jones, "The Origins of the Quartet," in *The Cambridge Companion to the String Quartet*, ed. Robin Stowell (Cambridge University Press, 2003), 177–78.

xxi

xxii

PREFACE

with witty, artful conversation and conviviality among friends. Could it be that social elements, manifest in the conception and playing of chamber music, *were also composed into musical scores?*

This book examines stylized social intercourse as it is encoded in Mozart's chamber music and animated by the musicians who play it. I was initially drawn to this subject by a dissonance I perceived between my education as a music theorist and my experience performing chamber music as a violist. Inspired by ideas I encountered as a student during coachings with eminent interpreters of Mozart's chamber music – including Robert Levin, Pamela Frank, and members of the Borromeo, Brentano, Emerson, Juilliard, Orion, and Takács Quartets – I was eager to capture in my analytical writing the moment-to-moment interchanges and "conversations" among instrumental parts that make this music so enjoyable to play. Yet I struggled to forge this connection between scholarly inquiry and performance experience using existing analytical methods. This book is the fruit of my effort to resolve that dissonance and to unite the two halves of my musical life.

The argument proceeds in two phases, the first historical and the second analytical. The historical survey in Part I begins with accounts of Mozart's own domestic music-making (Chapter 1) followed by a study of the eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century sources that describe chamber music as a metaphorical conversation or social interaction among the instruments (Chapter 2). Whereas the comparison of the string quartet to conversation was most famously articulated by Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, his remark is but one in a long tradition that originates in the 1770s and continues to this day. Chapter 3 examines aspects of private music-making that engendered a temporal, of-themoment quality. Specifically, the evidently common practice of playing at sight and from individual parts (since scores were rarely available, even for chamber music with piano) suggests an experience of moment-to-moment musical discovery that shares affinities with improvisation and that departs from today's public performances, which are carefully prepared in advance.

Part II develops a concept I call *multiple agency*, which refers to the capacity for independent action on the part of musical characters enacted by the various instrumentalists. This perspective, a refinement to traditional metaphors of conversation, offers a new vantage point for analyzing form and phrase rhythm as the interplay among these performer-personas. Instead of framing an analysis in terms of "what happens" in a musical work, one might conceive of a violin character seeking a cadence while a cello character evades it, or of clarinet and piano characters who exchange a melodic motive but disagree about its proper hypermetrical context. Multiple agency becomes a vocabulary for and theoretical model of how chamber music players conceive

PREFACE

xxiii

of their musical actions and agency as they play. It furthermore underscores their authority as creative agents in their own performances, as opposed to more conventional discourses that ascribe agency to "the work" or "the composer." While this analytical perspective is a thoroughly modern invention, it is nevertheless inspired by the historical ideas surveyed in Part I as well as by my own experience playing this music.

The Epilogue examines more closely the relationship of the historical and analytical parts of the book. I also address what multiple agency may offer chamber musicians performing today and situate it relative to current scholarship on musical performance. Suffice it to say, I do not intend an oversimple, one-to-one correspondence between how "they" played in Mozart's time and how "we" should analyze or perform today. Nor is "they" even a useful construct, since chamber music practices varied widely from Vienna to Paris to London, between amateurs and professionals, and in salon settings compared to more public spaces.

In recent decades, the analysis of musical "works" has come under scrutiny by some musicologists on a variety of grounds: (1) that musical analysis so defined tends to privilege composers and scores over the people who played and listened to them; (2) that it tends to essentialize a post-1800 concept of musical workhood; and (3) that it tends toward anachronism by inventing concepts and terminology foreign to the music's original context. As it is my aim within these pages to bring historical, analytical, and performance perspectives closer together, I am mindful of these critiques. In fact, the concept of multiple agency is inspired by them: Whereas some passages of chamber music may seem to express the agency of a single, unified persona ("the work" or "the composer"), the examples I have chosen for analysis are those in which distinct "characters" demonstrate their capacity to act independently, at times even in opposition to one another. This focus draws attention to the role musicians play in enacting the social interplay for which the score is but a script. Mozart may have chosen the notes, but the players compose the musical dialogue as they find meaning in their musical utterances, gestures, and interactions, in time, as they play. Listeners, when they are present, are then drawn into the social discourse through mimetic engagement. Although the medium of the scholarly monograph necessarily uses annotated scores to present analytical interpretations, the truest form of multiple-agency analysis, perhaps, is that conducted tacitly by musicians as they play together from their individual parts. The analytical videos provided among the Web Resources (about which more soon) are my best effort to simulate this experience, and I encourage readers to watch them while reading the analyses.

xxiv

PREFACE

This book does not offer anything like a comprehensive survey of Mozart's chamber music output, nor does it endeavor to survey the diverse landscape of composers and performers active during this period; other existing volumes present excellent style criticism along these lines. Rather, my principal aim is to develop an original analytical method, explore its historical and conceptual underpinnings, and test it through a series of analyses ranging from short passages to whole movements to one complete composition (Mozart's "Kegel-statt" trio, K. 498).

Although this book focuses almost exclusively on Mozart, the multiple agency concept surely has something to offer other repertoires – beyond the late-eighteenth century, beyond instrumental chamber music, beyond Western music. I welcome future contributions from other scholars who may wish to pursue these ideas further and in new contexts.

Advice to readers

I have endeavored to compose this book for a diverse readership, which may include historical musicologists, music theorists, performers, and Mozart enthusiasts of all stripes. For readers principally interested in my analytical method, the theoretical exposition commences in Part II, which may be read as a standalone study. But as the historical voices examined in Part I provide a richer context for the analyses, I recommend reading it first and believe it will reward the time spent.

For readers unfamiliar with recent theories of musical agency, sonata form, and meter: Although Part II involves some amount of technical language, jargon is kept to a minimum and terminology is explained along the way. Additional background and clarification are available through the supplemental Web Resources. Some readers may prefer to bypass Chapters 4–6 to begin with, proceeding directly to the discussion of Mozart's "Kegelstatt" trio, K. 498, in Chapter 7, and only then circling back for some more rigorous analyses and a discussion of their theoretical foundations.

Notes on the text

On the use of third-person pronouns: I refer to musical participants as "he" or "she" somewhat in accordance with the gendered realities of the late-eighteenth century, when performance on string and wind instruments was reserved for men, while women enjoyed more equal treatment as

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-09365-2 - Mozart's Music of Friends: Social Interplay in the Chamber Works Edward Klorman Frontmatter More information

PREFACE

xxv

keyboard players and, of course, as listeners. I will largely follow this convention both for real-world instrumentalists and their fictional personas, a distinction I introduce in Chapter 4. For any readers – especially Italian speakers – who are troubled by the masculine pronoun "he" in reference to the grammatically feminine "viola," I beg forgiveness for this dissonance.

All translations are my own unless otherwise indicated. Citations stating "English translation *from* ..." indicate that the quoted text is from the cited translation, whereas citations stating "see English translation in ..." or "see also English translation in ..." merely cross-reference a published translation to supplement my own. For short passages, the original, foreign-language text is generally provided in a footnote. More extended original texts appear online (as explained below).

Harmonies are indicated with uppercase Roman numerals only, regardless of chord quality. Scale degrees are designated as $\hat{1}$, $\hat{2}$, $\hat{3}$, etc. Pitches (and pitch classes) are generally designated simply as uppercase letter names. When more clarity about a precise register is required, I have adopted the following Helmholtz-like system: CC, C, c, c^1 , c^2 , c^3 , where middle C is c^1 . I have occasionally added the indication "great octave" to clarify in cases when a capital letter refers to the specific register as opposed to the pitch class. Captions for musical examples use lowercase Roman numerals to indicate the number of a given movement within a large-scale composition.

The abbreviation PAC, for "perfect authentic cadence" (introduced in Chapter 4), refers approximately to what many European scholars (following Rameau) call a "perfect cadence" (from root-position V to root-position I), except that it furthermore requires the melody to close on the tonic note. If the melody instead closes on $\hat{3}$, it is deemed an "imperfect authentic cadence," which is considered to be a weaker cadence. The distinction between these two types of authentic cadence accords with compositional theories contemporaneous to Mozart (see the references to Heinrich Christoph Koch in Chapter 5) and is an important consideration in the analysis of sonata form. A cadence that comes to rest on a root-position V harmony – sometimes called an "imperfect cadence" or "semicadence" – will be designated a "half cadence" (HC). For more information about the categories of cadence observed in this book, readers may consult the two publications by William E. Caplin listed in the bibliography.

Though style manuals advise authors to avoid lengthy footnotes, I confess that I have not heeded this wise guideline within these pages. As a part-time historian, trained primarily in music analysis and performance, some of my greatest joys in writing this book have been encountering compelling historical anecdotes and connections that, although not strictly essential to my central XXVI PREFACE

argument, provide colorful sidelights along the way. Since some of these documents will not be known to many readers and can be difficult to access, I have erred on the side of inclusion, quoting rather than paraphrasing historical documents and, where possible, citing them in both original and modern editions. But to avoid a meandering main text, I have relegated some sources to footnotes. Readers whose curiosity is piqued by historical details are invited to peruse the footnotes, but those who prefer a more streamlined reading can rest assured that the main text is self-sufficient and presents the complete argument.

> Edward Klorman New York, spring 2015

Acknowledgments

Chamber music is a collaborative art in which musical ideas blossom through an animated interchange; each person makes a distinctive, essential contribution. This book developed in much the same way, and I wish to acknowledge the many people who have shaped its development. First and foremost, I thank William Rothstein (who supervised the dissertation on which this book is based and whom I am honored to count among my colleagues at the Aaron Copland School of Music, Queens College, CUNY) for his enthusiastic engagement with this project over the course of several years. The integration of historical, analytical, and performance perspectives in his research and teaching, along with the imposing example set by his scholarly discipline, has shaped my own perspective. I am also enormously grateful to L. Poundie Burstein and Joseph Straus for their generous support, advice, and encouragement from the earliest stages of my work on this book.

I have also been fortunate to discuss aspects of this research with Kofi Agawu, Ellen Bakulina, Tom Beghin, Zachary Bernstein, William E. Caplin, Norman Carey, Nicholas Cook, Roger Graybill, L. Michael Griffel, Robert Hatten, James Hepokoski, Richard Kramer, Joseph Kraus, Joel Lester, Warwick Lister, Simon McVeigh, Danuta Mirka, Seth Monahan, Fabio Morabito, Markus Neuwirth, Nancy November, John Rink, Carl Schachter, Liza Stepanova, W. Dean Sutcliffe, Roger Tapping, and Channan Willner, as well as with dozens of students who have participated in my seminars on Mozart's chamber music or in ensembles I have coached at The Juilliard School. All of these conversations have stimulated many ideas that appear within these pages.

Special thanks are due to William Rothstein and Liza Stepanova for their consultations regarding translations from German, and to Rafael Klorman for his assistance with those from French. Their many fine suggestions helped to render sometimes-unwieldy historical texts into clear, English prose. Markus Neuwirth and Alexandra Moellmann kindly assisted with interpreting a number of regional or antiquated German words found in Mozart's letters.

David Bynog graciously read an early draft and has been an uncommonly forthcoming consultant on a wide variety of matters; his sound

xxvii

xxviii

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

advice and meticulous attention to detail have influenced this book for the better. Patrick McCreless, Rowland Moseley, and Nathan Pell reviewed the final manuscript, and for their expert suggestions and extraordinary generosity, I am deeply grateful. Two anonymous readers offered vital feedback that helped this book take shape in its current form. I thank my commissioning editors from Cambridge University Press: Vicki Cooper, who guided me through the initial proposal process, and Katharina Brett, who took over for the final stages after Vicki's retirement. Fleur Jones, assistant editor at CUP, deserves particular recognition for coordinating every aspect of the process with such remarkable virtuosity. Thanks are due to my production editor Sarah Starkey for her time and expertise, and to my copy-editor Andrew Dawes, who turned the final review of the manuscript into a particularly rewarding collaboration. Any errors that remain in this book are my own.

The Aaron Copland School of Music provided generous subvention funding and afforded me release time to complete this book. Additional subvention funding was provided by a grant from the Society for Music Theory. John A. Rice was a valuable and generous consultant, especially in matters of musical iconography. I also thank Kim de Beaumont (Hunter College and Pace University), Albert Rice (independent scholar), and Nicholas Wise (Frick Collection) for sharing their expertise about artwork that appears in this book. Rex Isenberg expertly typeset the musical examples, and Samantha Schaefer oversaw graphic design work for musical examples and figures.

The following museums, libraries, and publishing houses generously furnished materials reproduced in this book: Burke Library, Union Theological Seminary, Columbia University; Czech Museum of Music, National Museum, Prague; Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco; Jean Gray Hargrove Music Library, University of California, Berkeley; Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna; Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; MIT Press; Nederlands Muziek Instituut, The Hague; Oxford University Press; Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam; Vienna City Museum; and Universal Edition.

Kay Ballard kindly provided permission to reproduce the cartoon by her late husband, Jeremy Ballard, that appears as Fig. 2.2. I am grateful to Bernard Zaslav (former violist of the Kohon, Composers, Fine Arts, Vermeer, and Stanford String Quartets) for bringing this drawing to my attention, and to Michael Dennison for providing information about the artist. The musical comedy duo Igudesman & Joo granted permission to include their video "Endless Coda" (arranged and adapted from the Finale of "Colonel Bogey Variations" by Dudley Moore) among the Web

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

xxix

Resources. I thank all copyright holders for permission to reproduce these materials; all copyrights belong to their respective owners.

I dedicate this work to my family, whose constant love and support over many years have made me who I am; and to my major viola teachers, Heidi Castleman and Libba Seka, whose wisdom and guidance have shaped my musical sensibilities. And above all, I thank my partner, Heath, whose love, companionship, and support throughout this project have seen me through the best and worst of times.

About the web resources

www.mozartsmusicoff riends.com

The web resources comprise a variety of supplemental materials designed to enhance the reading experience. Although the print volume is selfsufficient, the online materials are recommended. They are divided into the following sections:

Chapter resources

Throughout the book, the symbol \triangleright next to a musical example or section heading indicates that a corresponding recording and analytical video are available online. These videos present a recorded performance of a given excerpt timed to a scrolling score with animated annotations, thus allowing the analyses to be experienced more viscerally. Some readers may opt to watch the videos first for an overview and to return to the prose discussion after for a more detailed presentation. These recordings and videos are organized by chapter and are generally numbered to correspond to the printed examples to which they pertain. Thus, Video 4.2 corresponds to Ex. 4.2 in the book and is filed online under resources for Chapter 4. (In a few cases, videos are given descriptive names rather than numbers, since they either pertain to multiple examples or to music not included as an example in the book.)

For two extended musical examples too lengthy to include in the text, PDF scores are provided online among the resources for the relevant chapter: J. J. de Momigny's analysis/arrangement of Mozart's String Quartet in D Minor, K. 421 (Chapter 2) and Mozart's "Kegelstatt" trio, K. 498 (Chapter 7).

The video "Endless Coda" by the musical comedy duo Igudesman & Joo – referenced in Chapter 4 – is included among that chapter's resources.

Also provided are brief primers entitled "Notes on Sonata Form" and "Notes on Metrical Theory," which offer background information about theories that inform Chapters 5 and 6; some readers may find these helpful.

XXX