

INDEX

Abu Dhabi arbitration, 107 ACHR. See American Human Rights Convention (ACHR) adjudication common law of international, 97 administrative law, 61, 76, 188, 192 global, 61, 188 administrative review, 61-62, 179 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 66 allocation of costs, 160 American Human Rights Convention (ACHR), 66 amicus curiae briefs, 59, 185 analogical reasoning, 2, 174, 245, See also analogies, comparative reasoning creativity in, 90 in investment treaty arbitration, 90-92, 135 analogies. See also comparative reasoning as subsidiary means for determination of rules of law, 138-166 as tool of legal interpretation, 35-38 definition of, 35 evaluative component of, 35 general principles of law and, 231-235 in doctrinal writings, 164-166 in investment treaty arbitration, 135-136 in judicial decisions, 138-164 international law, 41-42 international public law, 207-219, 239 - 243

legal transplants and, 235-239 legitimacy and, 241-243 macro-comparisons, 8, 76, 85, 137, 175 - 226manipulation of, 241 merits of using, 229-231 micro-comparisons, 8, 9, 76, 85-86, 137-174, 175 of arbitral tribunals, 60-61, 180-182 perils of, 235-239 public law, 188-207, 222 role of, 135, 137, 238, 239 use of, 2-3, 5, 6, 8-10, 15, 76, 227, 247 Annulment Committee, 87 annulment process, 60 anti-dumping measures, 156 Appellate Body, 61 arbitral awards, 13, 52, 60, 62, 64, 87, 179 disclosure of, 185 inconsistency in, 240 internal references to other, 97 reference to previous, 92-96, 141-144 arbitral tribunals, 4, 8, 13, 46, 229 analogies of, 60-61, 180-182 authority of, 141 comparative approach used by, 18, 64, 74, 235-239 composition of, 57 criticisms of, 240 decision-making power of, 13 general principles of law and, 119-127 judicial borrowing and, 88-96, 97-110, 127-130 jurisdiction of, 102 jurisprudence of, 8, 9 legitimacy of, 143, 240-241 precedents used by, 51, 74, 128



296	NDEX
arbitral tribunals (cont.)	Banjul Charter, 66
reference to national courts by,	Barcelona Traction case, 146
104–110, 162–164	Begriffsjurisprudenz, 22
reference to other international	bias
courts and tribunals by, 97–104,	cognitive, 27
128, 144–158, 241	bilateral investment treaties (BITs), 4,
reference to regional courts by,	13, 49–51, 54, 117, 148,
159–162	185
use of previous judicial decisions by,	BITs. See bilateral investment
138–164	treaties (BITs)
arbitration	breach of contract, 183, 184
binding, 194	Bretton Woods conference, 47
commercial, 180, 182–187,	
222–224, 259	Calvo doctrine, 194
international, 81-84	Canterbury Treaty, 102
inter-state, 208	case law, 84, 138, 236
investment treaty. See investment	Cayuga Indians Claim, 107
treaty arbitration	chapeau requirements, 215
investor-state. See investor-state	China, 51
arbitration	Chorzow Factory case, 52, 97
Arbitration Institute of the Stockholm	chthonic law, 244
Chamber of Commerce, 183	civil law, 36, 71, 126
arbitration law, comparative, 7, 81–84,	civil society, 59
127, 258	CJEU. See Court of Justice of
arbitrators	the European Union
as judges, 181, 207	(CJEU)
criteria used by, 91	Code Napoleon, 72
decision-making power of, 63	Codex Justinian Code, 36
function of, 86	cognitive bias, 27
independence of, 57	commercial arbitration, 180, 182–187
international, 81	222–224, 259
role of, 90, 223	commercial law, 175–187
selection of, 185	common law, 37, 71, 72, 126
Argentina, 87	common law of international
Aristotle, 36	adjudication, 97
Articles on State Responsibility	comparative arbitration law, 7, 81–84,
(ILC), 87	127, 258
Australia–US Free Trade Agreement, 13, 65	comparative investment law, 7, 78–81 127, 258
authority	comparative law, 69–71
of arbitral tribunals, 141	criticisms of, 24–27
awards, 4, 8, 13, 46, 229	definition of, 19, 20
disclosure of, 185	introduction to, 16–19
inconsistency in, 240	objectives of, 23
internal references to other, 97	origins of, 21–23
reference to previous, 92-96,	overview, 19–27
141–144	comparative lawyers, 243-245



INDEX 297

comparative legal research international investment law and,	vertical, 178, 246 conceptual dilemmas, 4
254–255	confidentiality, 58, 208
methodology, 7, 28-34, 43-44,	consistency, 95, 141, 235
246–253, 256–258	constitutional courts, 190
standards of, 33	constitutional law, 92, 188, 190–192,
comparative legal studies, 243–245	193, 195–198, 205
comparative methods, 7, 28–34, 43–44,	contract
130, 228, 235, 246–253	breach of, 183, 184
comparative reasoning. See also	contract claims, 183
analogies	Convention on the Settlement of
approximate, 236	Investment Disputes between
arbitral awards and, 92–96	States and Nationals of Other
benefits of, 243–245	States (ICSID Convention), 103,
critical approach to, 78	138, 157, 160, 183, 185, 191, 197
definition of, 2	Corfu Channel case, 99, 172
development of international	cosmopolitan legal culture, 82
investment law and, 9	costs, allocation of, 160
general principles of law and,	Court of Justice of the European Union
122–127	(CJEU), 105
in international investment law and	courts
arbitration, 13–15, 69–131,	constitutional, 190
227–255	Court of Justice of the European
in international law, 41–42	Union, 105
in treaty interpretation, 110–119	European Court of Human Rights,
introduction to, 1–7, 17–19	66, 102
judicial borrowing and, 88–92	International Court of Justice, 75, 77,
legal doctrine and, 84–88	84, 98, 104, 114, 119, 144, 145–147,
macro-comparisons. See	195, 233
macro-comparisons	international, jurisprudence, 97–104,
micro-comparisons. See	128, 144–158, 241
micro-comparisons	national, 60, 78, 80, 104–110, 127,
risks of using, 235-239	140, 162–164, 191
role of, 2–6, 7, 9, 14, 74, 75–77	Permanent Court of International
use of, 43–44, 227–255	Justice, 42, 52, 75, 98, 114, 119,
comparative surveys, 8, 166–171	144, 235
comparators, selection of, 159, 236	regional, 159–162
comparisons, 1, 239, See also analogies,	cross-judging, 7
comparative reasoning	crossover cases, 186
horizontal, 178, 246	cross-treaty interpretation, 143-144
longitudinal, 246	cultural approach, 31-33, 34, 43,
macro-comparisons. See	249–251, 257
macro-comparisons	cultural diversity, 17, 31, 32, 34, 213,
micro-comparisons. See	237, 260
micro-comparisons	customary law, 19, 41, 121, 135, 163, 236
multicultural, 246	•
multilateral, 246	decision-making power
term of comparison, 24-26, 27	of arbitral tribunals, 13
_	



INDEX

298

declaratory relief, 99, 100
developing countries, 48, 50, 80
diplomacy
gunboat, 210
discretion, judicial, 36
dispute resolution, 55–57, 63, 82,
184, 210
Dispute Settlement Understanding, 151
doctrinal writings, 164–166
domestic judicial borrowing,
104–110, 191
Dworkin, Ronald, 35

ECHR. See European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) economic growth, 46, 79 emerging economies, 51 encyclopedic comparisons, 239 Energy Charter Treaty, 116 English language, 28, 125 epistemic communities, 208, 209 ethnocentrism, 24 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), 66, 102 European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), 101, 115, 160, 199, 234

European legal systems, 70
European Union (EU), 65, 159, 234
Court of Justice of the European
Union, 105
evolutionary interpretation, 119
expropriation, 52–55, 86, 190, 198
compensation for, 66
indirect, 42, 52–55, 190

fair and equitable treatment (FET) standard, 86, 200
FCN. See Friendship, Commerce and Navigation (FCN) treaties feed-in tariff (FIT), 149
Feyerabend, Paul, 29
Fifth Amendment, 190
foreign direct investment, 45, 67, 243 attraction of, 51 comparative investment law and, 78–81 definition of, 46

global rules on, 48 normative framework for, 47-51 promotion of, 172, 240 protection of, 46, 49-55 Foreign Investment Promotion and Protection Agreement (FIPA), 114 foreign investors, 67, 180, 244 interests of, 193 nationality of, 91 protection of, 49-51, 98, 189 remedies for, 212 rights of, 218 settlement of disputes between states and, 55-57 free decision making, 4, 91, 104, 236, 256 free trade agreements (FTAs), 49-51, 52,65 Friendship, Commerce and Navigation (FCN) treaties, 56 functional approach, 31, 33, 43, 94, 108, 248, 249

Gabcikovo-Nagymaros case, 146 General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT), 42, 115, 149, 154-158, 209, 214-216 General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), 48, 154, 234 general principles of law, 39-41, 75, 77, 119-127, 129, 163, 230-231, 241, 247 analogies and, 231-235 general rule of interpretation, 113, 230 Germanic law, 125 global administrative law (GAL), 61, 192 global governance, 17, 189 globalisation, 27, 55, 72, 175, 190, 209, 252 governance global, 17, 189 good, 80 gunboat diplomacy, 210

harmonisation projects, 27 Havana Charter, 47 hermeneutical rules, 2, 3



INDEX 299

horizontal comparisons, 178, 246 Hull Rule, 50 human rights, 66, 74, 117, 159, 243 adjudication, 92 courts, 8, 60, 160, 161, 180, 219 law, 63, 76, 101, 161, 217-219, 242 treaties, 57 hybrid theory, 220 Hynes v. New York Central Railway Co., 37 IBRD. See International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) ICJ. See International Court of Justice (ICJ) ICSID. See International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) ICSID Arbitration Rules, 59 ICSID Convention, 103, 138, 157, 160, 183, 185, 191, 197 ICSID Regulations, 59 ICSID system, 13 IIAs. See international investment agreements (IIAs) ILC. See International Law Commission (ILC) IMF. See International Monetary Fund (IMF) India, 51 indirect expropriation, 42, 52-55, 190 induction, 35 Industrial Revolution, 21 intellectual property, 48, 100 international adjudication common law of, 97 international arbitration, 81-84 International Bank for Reconstruction

International Congress of Comparative International Court of Justice (ICJ), 75, 77, 84, 98, 104, 114, 119, 144, 145-147, 195, 233 international courts, jurisprudence of, 97-104, 128, 144-158, 241 international investment agreements (IIAs), 45 international investment law comparative legal research and, 254 - 255comparative reasoning and, 13-15, 69-131, 227-255 criticisms of, 64-67 development of, 9, 231 human rights law and, 217-219 hybrid nature of, 189 introduction to, 45-47 legal doctrine and, 84-88 legitimacy of, 14, 239-243 literature on, 172 multilateral investment rules, 48-49 normative framework for, 47-51 politics and, 172 proportionality in, 195-207 public law and, 188-207 role of comparative reasoning in, 2-6 scholarly analysis of, 84, 86-88 sources of, 45 theory of, 44 international investment lawyers, 243-245 international judges, 181 international law, 69-71, 244, 259 Americanisation of, 190 analogies in, 41-42 coherence of, 103 comparative reasoning in, 41-42 fundamental rules of, 74 general principles of, 144, 163, 230 general principles of law and, 119-127 harmonisation of, 16 legitimacy of, 239 origins of, 71 public. See public international law sources of, 29, 39-41, 75, 88, 119-120, 139, 140, 229

and Development (IBRD), 47

International Centre for the Settlement

55, 65, 225 annulment process, 60

tribunals, 98, 142

of Investment Disputes (ICSID),



> 300 INDEX

International Law Commission (ILC), 87, 229 International Monetary Fund (IMF), 47, 79, 80 international public law paradigm, 207-219, 224, 225, 239-243, 259 International Trade Commission (ITC), 156 international trade law, 61, 76, 209-217 International Trade Organization (ITO), 47 International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (ITLOS), 144 interpretation, 42 cross-treaty, 143-144 evolutionary, 119 general rule of, 113, 230 legal, analogies for, 35–38 systemic, 118-119 teleological, 117-118 textual, 113-115 treaty. See treaty interpretation inter-state arbitration, 208 investment law comparative, 7, 78-81, 127, 258 international. See international investment law investment treaties bilateral, 49-51, 117, 148, 185 common provisions in, 51-55 concept of expropriation in, 52-55 inception of modern, 50 intellectual property protection by, 100 international. See international investment agreements interpretation of. See treaty interpretation multilateral, 48-49 preambles, 116 proliferation of, 55 protection standards in, 51-55 purpose of, 46 teleological interpretation of, 95 investment treaty arbitration, 8, 46-47 analogies in, 135-136 commercial arbitration and, 182-187, 222-224

comparative reasoning in, 227-255 conceptualisations of, 60-64 dispute settlement, 55-57 international arbitration and, 82-83 international public law and, 207-219 inter-state arbitration and, 208 judicial borrowing and, 88-96, lack of transparency in, 58-60 legitimacy of, 1-2, 3, 9, 13, 14, 15, 64, 67, 74, 239-243 macro-comparisons in, 175-226 main characteristics of, 57-60 MFN status and, 86 micro-comparisons in, 137-174 proportionality analysis in, 195-207 provisions in, 13 use of analogies in, 8-10 investment treaty law, 8 investment treaty tribunals, 1 investor rights, 45, 47 dispute resolution and, 55-57 protection of, 49-55 investor-state arbitration, 3, 8, 13, 55-57, 244, See also investment treaty arbitration commercial arbitration and, 180, 182 - 187conceptualisations of, 60-64 human rights law and, 217-219 main characteristics of, 57-60 parties in, 151 Iran-US Claims Tribunal, 98 Islamic law, 125 ITO. See International Trade Organization (ITO) iura novit curia, 221-223 judges arbitrators as, 207 international, 181 judicial borrowing, 7, 74, 76, 88-96, 97-104, 127-130, 251-253,

domestic, 104-110, 191 judicial decisions, analogies in, 138-164 judicial discretion, 36



> INDEX 301

```
judicial globalisation, 16, 89, 97, 190
                                              polycentricism of, 73
jurisdiction, 102
                                              positive, 19
  mixed, 72
                                             private, 3, 82
  national, 57
                                             public. See public law
jurisprudence, 8, 9, 86, 92
                                              Roman, 36, 71, 72, 125
  of international courts and tribunals,
                                              sources of, 37
     97-104, 128, 144-158, 241
                                              trade, 61, 76, 209-217
   of national courts, 104-110, 127,
                                              unification of, 23, 252
     162 - 164
                                             universal, 27
  of regional courts, 159-162
                                              WTO, 209-217
  of the ICJ, 145–147
                                           Law of Citations, 165
  of WTO, 148-158
                                           lawyers
                                             comparative, 243-245
  US, 108
  WTO, 209-217
                                              international investment, 243-245
                                           LCIA. See London Court of
jurisprudence constante, 65, 96, 142
jus commune, 22
                                                International Arbitration (LCIA)
justice, 140
                                           least developed countries (LDCs), 50
                                           legal benchmarks, 166-171
Kahn-Freund, Otto, 31–32
                                           legal culture, 24, 27, 127, 257
                                             cosmopolitan, 82
lacuna legis, 36
                                           legal doctrine, 7, 84-88
laissez-faire philosophy, 188
                                           legal interpretation, analogies for,
                                                35 - 38
  administrative, 61, 69, 188, 192
                                           legal orders, 77
  as cultural expression, 32
                                           legal pluralism, 16, 17
  as social engineering, 79
                                           legal reasoning, analogies in, 35-38
  case, 84, 138, 236
                                           legal studies
  chtonic, 244
                                              comparative, 243-245
  civil, 36, 71, 126
                                           legal systems
  commercial, 76, 182-187
                                              classification of, 125
  common, 37, 71, 72, 126
                                              comparison of, 41, 122, 137, 178,
  comparative. See comparative law
                                                245, 247
                                              consideration of, 233
  constitutional, 92, 188, 190-192, 193,
     195-198, 205
                                             cultural differences and, 213, 237
  context and, 31-32, 33, 34
                                              differences between, 34, 43, 238,
  customary, 19, 41, 121, 135, 163, 236
  diffusion of, 72
                                              European, 70
  general principles of, 39-41, 75, 77,
                                             fluidity between, 227
     119-127, 129, 163, 230-235,
                                              hybrid, 72
     241, 247
                                             imported law and, 72
  human rights, 63, 76, 101, 161,
                                             linguistic barriers and, 28
     217-219, 242
                                             newly established, 97
  international. See international law
                                              non-Western, 72
  international investment. See
                                              similarity among, 31
     international investment law
                                             taxonomies of, 125
  Islamic, 125
                                              uniqueness of, 32
  national case, 236
```

legal theory, 19

legal transplants, 235-239, 251

non-state, 73



302

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-09331-7 - Analogies in International Investment Law and Arbitration Valentina Vadi Index More information

INDEX

legitimacy, 18 Multilateral Agreement on Investments of arbitral tribunals, 143, 240-241 (MAI), 48 of international investment law, 14, multilateral comparisons, 246 239-243 multilateral environmental agreements of international law, 239 (MEAs), 169, 174 of investment treaty arbitration, 1-2, multilateral investment rules, 48-49 3, 9, 13, 14, 15, 64, 67, 74, 239–243 legitimacy crisis, 14, 15, 64, 67, 74, NAFTA. See North American Free 213, 240 Trade Agreement (NAFTA) Legrand, Pierre, 32 national case law, 236 lex Americana, 190 national courts, 60, 78, 80, 140, 191 linguistic barriers, 28 jurisprudence of, 104-110, 127, 162-164 local particularism, 238 local remedies, 57, 60, 219 national investment codes, 81 London Court of International national jurisdictions, 57 Arbitration (LCIA), 221 nationality, of investor, 91 longitudinal comparison, 246 nec ultra petita, 222 Lotus case, 42 New York Convention, 60, 183, 186 non liquet, 40 non-discrimination provision, 157, macro-comparisons, 8, 76, 85, 137, 175-226 198, 201 commercial law paradigm, 182-187 non-precluded measures clause, 111, constitutional ideas, 195-198 213-215 critical assessment of, 219-225 non-state law, 73 international public law paradigm, non-Western legal systems, 72 207-219 norms, 44, 64, 117, 256 introduction to, 175-182 North American Free Trade Agreement public law paradigm, 188-207 (NAFTA), 52, 59, 103, 115, 116, use of, 177 150, 152-154, 155, 156, 167-168 MAI. See Multilateral Agreement on Nottebohm case, 98 Investments (MAI) obiter dicta, 38 manifest excess of power, 216 OECD. See Organisation for Economic market economy, 79 metaphors, 36 Co-operation and Development methodology, 7, 28-34, 43-44, 130, (OECD) 228, 235, 246-253, 256-258 Organisation for Economic micro-comparisons, 8, 9, 76, 85-86, Co-operation and Development 137-174, 175 (OECD), 48 comparative surveys, 166-171 critical assessment of, 172-174 paradigms, 172, 173, 178 commercial law, 182-187 doctrinal writings, 164-166 international public law, 207-219, introduction to, 137-138 judicial decisions, 138-164 224, 225, 239-243, 259 use of, 176, 177 public law, 188-207, 222 mixed jurisdiction, 72 Penn Central test, 42, 190 Permanent Court of International Most Favoured Nation (MFN), 51, Justice (PCIJ), 42, 52, 75, 98, 114, 86, 111 multicultural comparisons, 246 119, 144, 235



INDEX 303

Plato, 36	Roman law, 36, 71, 72, 125
politics, 172	rules of law, determination of, 138-166
positive law, 19	
postmodern critique, 33	Saleilles, Raymond, 21
preambles, 116	scale of values, 204
precedents, 37, 38, 51, 74, 92, 97, 104,	scholarly analysis, 84, 86-88, 235
108, 128, 141, 142, 236, See also	similitude, 24
judicial borrowing	social problems, 23, 31
principles of law, 39-41, 75, 77,	sovereign immunity, 61
119–127, 129, 163, 230–235,	stare decisis, 92
241, 247	state regulation, legitimate sphere for, 1
private law, 3, 82	state sovereignty, 24, 26, 27, 46, 67
private parties, 184, 193	state(s)
private property	nation-states, 244
expropriation of, 52	regulatory powers of, 53-55, 64, 65,
protection, 62	67, 166, 204
probabilistic reasoning, 35	settlement of disputes between
property rights, 66, 117-118, 160, 218	foreign investors and, 55-57
proportionality, 8, 195–207	welfare functions of, 189
protectionism, 212	surveys
public goods, 42, 46, 62, 64, 66, 67,	comparative, 8, 166-171
166	systemic interpretation, 118–119
public interest groups, 59	
public international law, 3, 6, 9, 63, 67,	teleological interpretation, 117-118
116, 185, 207–219, 224, 225,	term of comparison, 24, 25–26, 27
239–243, 259	textual interpretation, 113–115
public law, 3, 77, 82, 173, 259	theoretical frameworks, 172
definition of, 188	third parties, 193
paradigm, 188–207, 222	trade agreements, 49-51, 52, 65
publicists, 84	trade disputes, 148–158, See also World
	Trade Organization (WTO)
ratio decidendi, 38-39	trade law, 61, 76, 209–217
ratio legis, 36, 38	trade liberalisation, 212
reasonableness, 8	Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual
reasoning	Property Rights (TRIPS), 48, 100
analogical, 2, 90–92, 135,	Trade-Related Investment Measures
174, 245	(TRIMS), 48, 61, 181
comparative. See comparative	Transatlantic Trade and Investment
reasoning	Partnership (TTIP), 65
legal, analogies in, 35–38	translation, 28
regional courts, 159–162	transparency, 58–60, 91, 185
regional principles of law, 232	treaty interpretation, 7, 36, 75
regulation, 67	analogical reasoning and, 135
of public goods, 64, 166	comparative reasoning in, 110–119
vs. indirect expropriation, 53–55	context of, 116
representativeness, 123	customary rules of, 110–113,
res judicata, 150, 156	208, 230
research. See comparative legal research	evolutionary interpretation, 119



304

treaty interpretation (cont.) systemic interpretation, 118–119 teleological interpretation, 117–118 textual interpretation, 113–115 triple identity test, 161

UNCITRAL Rules on Transparency in Treaty-based Investor-State Arbitration, 59, 183 unification of law, 23, 252 United Nations Commission on International Trade Law (UNCITRAL), 59 United States, 65 Australia-US Free Trade Agreement, 13, 65 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 66 universal justice, 19 universal law, 27 US Constitution, 190 US jurisprudence, 108

INDEX

US Model BIT, 54, 116 US Supreme Court, 86, 108

value systems, 204 values, scale of, 204 vertical comparisons, 178, 246 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 75, 77, 110, 118–119, 166, 174, 197, 230, 235, 242

Washington Convention, 59
Watson, Alan, 31
welfare functions, 189
Western culture, 71, 72, 247
World Bank, 79, 80
World Trade Organization (WTO),
47–49, 61, 79, 86, 100, 144, 181
jurisprudence, 148–158, 209–217
law, 209–217
panels, 61, 181, 209, 211
WTO. See World Trade
Organization (WTO)