

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09268-6 - The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt
on the Limits of Constitutional Law

Lars Vinx

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

- Altona, civil unrest in, 1
 Anschütz, Gerhard, 98, 127, 147
 Austria
 Constitution, 7, 215
 constitutional court, 7, 215
 autocracy, democracy and, 14, 19, 43, 198
 autonomy
 autonomous state entities, 164
 constitutional adjudication and, 49
 Länder, 224, 230
 municipal, 51
 public service independence, 170
 ‘state-free’ society, 125
- Bilfinger, Carl, 122, 223
 Bluntschli, Johann, 106, 129
 Bonn, Moritz Julius, 138
 Braun, Otto, 1, 3
 Brecht, Arnold, 226
 Brüning, Heinrich, 2, 3, 100
- ‘Captain of Köpenick’ *see* Voigt, Friedrich Wilhelm
 civil service *see* public service
Codex Juris Canonici, 128
 communists, 1
 compromise, principle of
 Constitution of the Weimar Republic, 115, 120
 constitutional adjudication and, 120–4
 democracy and, 14, 72, 94
 exercise of head of state’s powers, 208
 majorities/minorities, 94
 pluralism and, 201, 206
 political parties, 142
- Constant, Benjamin, 96, 105, 151, 156, 178, 179, 211
 constitution
 contractualisation by adjudication, 120–4
 guarantees for protection, 35–43
 guarantees of constitutionality, 43–4
 Kelsen’s conception, 27–35
 unconstitutional acts, nullification, 35–43
 Constitution of the Weimar Republic
 compromise, principle of, 115, 120
 constitutional theory and drafting of, 119
 democratic politics. and, 14
 drafting of, 12
 emergency powers, 1, 2
 limits on amendment, 10
 constitutional adjudication
 as adversarial procedure, 194–6
 concept of constitution, 27–35
 constitutional guardianship, 79–90
 constitutional legislation
 distinguished, 107–20, 189–94
 as contractualisation of constitution, 120–4
 democracy and, 71–2
 existence of, 185–9
 federal state, 72–5
 federalism and, 252
 impeachment, 96–8, 101
 importance of, 69–78
 incidental right of, 6
 judicial right of review, 6, 79, 82–8
 jurisprudential debate as to, 5, 6
 Kelsen’s advocacy, 19, 181–3
 legal hierarchy, theory of, 7, 13

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09268-6 - The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt
on the Limits of Constitutional Law

Lars Vinx

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

275

- legality, 22–7
- limits on, 10, 90–107
- pluralism and, 196–201
- ‘political’ acts, and, 183–5
- political crimes, 95–6
- procedural guidelines, 75
- result of, 61–4
- Schmitt’s critique, 79–124
- scope of, 48–56
- standard of, 56–61
- ‘total state’ theory and, 196–201
- ‘turn to total state’, and, 201–5
- constitutional court
 - democracy and, 8, 215
 - initiation of proceedings, 64–7
 - judgments, 68–9
 - oral arguments, 67
 - parties, 67–8
 - procedure, 64–9, 75
 - provision for, 5, 6
 - public proceedings, 67
 - rationales for, 44–8
 - review *see* constitutional adjudication
- constitutional guardianship
 - democracy and, 21
 - dictatorship and, 180
 - judicial *see* constitutional adjudication; courts
 - jurisprudential debate as to, 5
 - monarchical, 175–7
 - ‘neutral power’ doctrine, 150–60, 177–81
 - presidential *see* President of the Weimar Republic
 - rule of law, and, 175
 - scope, 174
- constitutional legality, Kelsen–Schmitt debate, 16–21
- constitutional legislation
 - constitutional adjudication distinguished, 107–20, 189–94
- constitutional monarchy
 - constitutional guardianship, 177
- constitutional theory
 - democracy and, 178
 - drafting of Weimar Constitution, 119
 - head of state, 155
 - ‘monarchical principle’, 175
 - relationship of state and economy, 134
 - rule of law, 93, 105–6, 152
- Constitutional Theory* (Schmitt), 12
- courts
 - constitutional guardianship, 79
 - judicial right of review, 6, 79, 82–8
 - see also* constitutional adjudication; *Reichsgericht*; *Staatsgerichtshof*
- crimes against the state
 - constitutional adjudication, 95–6
- Dawes plan, 104
- decentralization, federalism and, 230
- Defence of Democracy* (Kelsen), 20
- democracy
 - autocracy and, 14, 19, 43, 198
 - compromise and, 14, 72, 94
 - constitutional adjudication, 71–2
 - constitutional court and, 8, 215
 - constitutional guardianship, 21
 - constitutional theory and, 178
 - dictatorship and, 20
 - federalism and, 236
 - head of state, 164
 - Kelsen’s theory, 14
 - majorities, 20
 - minority and, 94, 140
 - party system, 141–4
 - restriction, 230
- democratic politics, Weimar Constitution and, 14
- dictatorship
 - constitutional guardianship, 180
 - democracy and, 20
 - indefinite continuation, 19
 - majority/minority, 72
 - president’s powers, 11
 - suspension, 149
 - temporary, 18
 - will of the people, and, 14, 15
- Ebert, Friedrich, 158
- economy
 - constitutional theory, 134
 - ‘turn to total state’, 133

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09268-6 - The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt
on the Limits of Constitutional Law

Lars Vinx

Index

[More information](#)

276

INDEX

- emergency powers
 - constitutional provision, 1, 11
 - jurisprudential debate as to, 5
 - suspension, 2
 - see also* dictatorship
- federal state
 - constitutional adjudication, 72–5
- federalism
 - constitutional adjudication and, 252
 - constitutional guardianship, 226
 - decentralization and, 230
 - democracy and, 236
 - Länder* autonomy, 224
 - pluralism and, 196
 - Preussenschlag* and, 4
 - Preussenschlag* judgment and, 16
 - suspension, 230
- finance law
 - reparations payments under Dawes plan, 104
- French senate as court of justice, 95
- Gneist, Rudolf von, 81, 92, 106
- Goebbels, Josef, 4
- Göring, Hermann, 4
- government ministers *see*
 - impeachment
- Guardian of the Constitution, The* (Schmitt), 6, 9, 12, 19, 79–124, 125–73
- Guizot, François, 105
- head of state *see* President of the Weimar Republic
- Heimann, Eduard, 100
- Heller, Hermann, 225
- Hindenburg, Paul von, 1, 2, 11, 18, 99, 158, 226
- Hitler, Adolf, 3, 4, 18
- House of Lords (United Kingdom)
 - Staatsgerichtshof* compared, 95
- impeachment
 - constitutional adjudication, 96–8, 101
- interests
 - balancing, 53, 184, 195
 - economic, 171
 - judicial expression, 195
 - legislative expression, 59
 - organisation into parties, 132, 198
 - pluralism, 124, 206
 - protection, 17, 48, 72, 93
 - pursuit, 10, 183
 - state guarantee, 199
 - transformation into unified will, 142
 - unified, 208
- Jacobi, Erwin, 223
- Jellinek, Georg, 153, 224
- Joseph, Barthélemy, 153
- judicial review *see* constitutional adjudication
- Jünger, Ernst, 132
- Kaufmann, Erich, 107
- Kelsen, Hans
 - Austrian Constitution, 7
 - Austrian Constitutional Court, 7
 - concept of constitution, 27–35
 - constitutional adjudication *see* constitutional adjudication
 - constitutional guardianship, 5
 - constitutional legality, 16–21
 - constitutional legislation, 189–94
 - debate with Schmitt, 6–16, 19
 - democracy, theory of, 14, 19
 - legal hierarchy, theory of, 7, 13
 - monarchical constitutional guardianship, 175–7
 - and Nazism, 19
 - ‘neutral power’ doctrine, 177–81
 - pluralism and ‘total state’, 196–201
 - ‘political’ acts, 183–5
 - President as constitutional guardian, 14, 206–11
 - President as only guardian, 211–16
 - rule of law, 175
 - scope of constitutional guardianship, 174
 - Staatsgerichtshof* judgment, 5, 17, 228–53
 - ‘turn to total state’, 201–5
 - unconstitutional acts, nullification, 35–43

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09268-6 - The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt
on the Limits of Constitutional Law

Lars Vinx

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

277

Länder

autonomy, 224, 230

constitutional protection, 16

federalism, 224

see also Prussia

Larnaude, Ferdinand, 107

legal hierarchy, theory of, 7, 13, 28,
31, 34legislation *see* constitutional legislation

legislative competence of majorities, 99

Ludwig II, King of Bavaria, 218

majorities

compromise with minorities, 94

conflict with minorities, 205

democracy and, 20

dictatorship by, 72

formation, 149, 158

instability, 143

lack of, 218

legislative competence, 99

limitations on power, 10

minorities protection, and, 71, 93

president's election by, 14, 209

president's independence from, 171

pursuit of interest, 10

rule of, 8

will of, 140, 208

see also will of the people

Mann, Fritz Karl, 134

Mayer, Otto, 112

Merkel, Adolf Julius, 7

Meyer, Georg, 98, 127, 147

Mill, John Stuart, 93

minorities

compromise with majorities, 94

democracy and, 94, 140

dictatorship by, 72

protection, 71, 93

Mohl, Robert von, 99, 106

monarchy

constitutional guardianship, 175–7

'monarchical principle', 175

municipal autonomy, public authority
and, 51

Naumann, Friedrich, 158

Nawiaskey, Hans, 222, 225, 226

Nazis, 1, 2, 18

'neutral power' doctrine

constitutional guardianship, 150–60,
177–81

nullification of unconstitutional acts

constitutional protection, 35–43

*On the Nature and Development of
Constitutional Adjudication*
(Kelsen), 6, 22–78

Papen, Franz von, 1, 2

Parliament *see Reichstag*parliament and pluralism, Schmitt's
analysis, 125–50parliamentary sovereignty, Schmitt's
analysis, 9party system, development of,
130–44, 198Permanent Court of International
Justice, 222

pluralism

compromise and, 201, 206

constitutional adjudication and,
196–201

federalism and, 196

Schmitt's analysis, 125–50

'political' acts

constitutional adjudication, 183–5

political crimes

constitutional adjudication, 95–6

political parties, compromise and, 142

Popitz, Johannes, 133

President of the Weimar Republic

compromise in exercise

of powers, 208

constitutional adjudication, and,
217–21constitutional guardianship, 5, 11,
18, 150–60, 206–11

constitutional theory, 155

democratic basis for authority, 168–73

dictatorship *see* dictatorship

election, 14

emergency powers, 1, 2, 11

independence, 164

as 'neutral power', 150–60

as only guardian, 211–16

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09268-6 - The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt
on the Limits of Constitutional Law

Lars Vinx

Index

[More information](#)

278

INDEX

- President of the Weimar (cont.)
 presidential government, 2
Staatsgerichtshof judgments, and, 5
see also Ebert, Friedrich;
 Hindenburg, Paul von
- Preuß, Hugo, 91, 119, 137, 149, 157
- Preussenschlag*, 1–6
 constitutional legality, 16
 constitutional situation in Prussia, 3
 court case *see* *Preussenschlag*
 judgment
 emergency decree, 1
 jurisprudential debates, 5
- Preussenschlag* judgment
 compromise, 240–3
 consequences, 243–5
 explanation
 first version, 234–5
 second version, 235–40
 judgment, 16, 231–4
 Kelsen's critique, 5, 17, 228–53
 object, 228–31
 opinion, 245–53
 Schmitt's closing statement, 222–7
 Schmitt's critique, 5, 17
- Prussia
 appeal to *Staatsgerichtshof*, 4
 constitutional conflict of 1862–6, 98,
 226
Preussenschlag see *Preussenschlag*;
Preussenschlag judgment
 public authority, municipal autonomy
 and, 51
 public service independence, 161–8
- Rathmann, August, 100
- Reichsgericht*
 constitutional guardianship, 91
 political crimes trials, 95
 ruling as to judicial right of review, 6,
 79, 82–8
Staatsgerichtshof as special
 tribunal of, 4
- Reichsrat*, 17, 104, 230, 238, 239, 241,
 246
- Reichstag*
 constitutional guardianship, 213
 dissolution of 18 July 1930, 99
- emergency powers, 2
 powers of control, 149
 reparations payments, 104
 rule of law
 constitutional guardianship and, 175
 constitutional theory, 93, 105–6, 152
- Saemisch, Friedrich, 134
- Saxon constitution of 1831, 117, 122
- Schmitt, Carl
 constitutional adjudication, 9
 constitutional adjudication and
 constitutional legislation
 distinguished, 107–20
 constitutional adjudication as
 contractualisation of
 constitution, 120–4
 constitutional adjudication as
 guardian of constitution, 79–90
 constitutional guardianship, 5
 constitutional legality, 16–21
 courts as guardians of
 constitution, 79
 debate with Kelsen, 6–16
 democratic basis for presidential
 authority, 168–73
 limits on constitutional
 adjudication, 10, 90–107
 and Nazism, 18, 19
 'neutral power' doctrine, 150–60
 parliament and pluralism, 125–50
 parliamentary sovereignty, 9
 presidential guardianship of
 Constitution, 11, 18, 125–73
 public service independence, 161–8
Staatsgerichtshof judgment, 5, 18,
 222–7
 will of the people, 15
- Seydel, Max von, 155
- Sieyès, Emmanuel Joseph, Abbé, 105
- Simons, Walter, 86, 159
- Smend, Rudolf, 101
- social democrats, 3
- Spranger, Eduard, 137
- Staatsgerichtshof*
 appeal by Prussian government, 4
 appointment, 103
 as constitutional court, 6, 122, 165

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-09268-6 - The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt
 on the Limits of Constitutional Law
 Lars Vinx
 Index
[More information](#)

INDEX 279

- constitutional guardianship, 90, 212, 226
- general competence, 98
- House of Lords compared, 95
- impeachment cases, 97, 101
- as international court, 222
- political crimes trials, 95
- ‘political party’, definition, 138
- Preussenschlag* judgment *see* *Preussenschlag* judgment
- Stahl, Friedrich Julius, 154
- state entities, autonomy of, 164
- ‘state-free’ society, autonomy and, 125
- Stein, Lorenz von, 153
- Stoll, H, 91
- Sturmabteilung* (SA), 1
- Talleyrand, Charles Maurice de Talleyrand-Périgord, Prince de, 135
- tax law, delimitation of competences, 104
- Thoma, Richard, 129
- ‘total state’
 - theory, 196–201
 - ‘turn to’, 130–46, 201–5
- Triepel, Heinrich, 7, 86, 91, 101, 138, 153
- unconstitutional acts, nullification of, 35–43
- United Kingdom *see* House of Lords
- United States Supreme Court
 - constitutional guardianship, 79–82, 86
 - decision-making, 117
 - independence, 175
 - right of review, 182
- Voigt, Friedrich Wilhelm (‘Captain of Köpenick’), 247
- Warren, Charles, 117
- Weber, Max, 12, 138
- Weimar Constitution *see* Constitution of the Weimar Republic
- Who Ought to be the Guardian of the Constitution?* (Kelsen), 6, 13, 174–221
- Wilhelm, Hofacker, 109
- will of the people
 - dictatorship and, 14
 - existence, 15
 - interests as origin, 142
 - majority will as, 208
 - pluralism and, 11