

Boundaries of Loyalty

Talmudic legislation prescribed a penalty for a Jew testifying in a non-Jewish court, against a fellow Jew, to benefit a gentile – for breach of a duty of loyalty to a fellow Jew. Through close textual analysis, Saul Berman explores how Jewish jurists responded when this virtue of loyalty conflicted with values such as justice, avoidance of desecration of God's name, deterrence of crime, defense of self, protection of the Jewish community and the duty to adhere to law of the land.

Essential for scholars and graduate students in Talmud, Jewish law and comparative law, this key volume details the nature of these loyalties as values within the Jewish legal system, and of how the resolution of these conflicts has been handled. Berman additionally explores why this issue has intensified in contemporary times and how the related area of 'Mesirah' has wrongfully come to be prominently associated with this law regulating testimony.

Saul J. Berman is Professor of Jewish studies at Stern College of Yeshiva University and Adjunct Professor at Columbia University Law School, where he is the Rotter Fellow of Talmudic Law. As an Orthodox Rabbi in Berkeley, CA, Brookline, MA and at Lincoln Square Synagogue in New York, Berman was an early participant in the Soviet Jewry and Civil Rights movements. His research and teaching are focused on women in Jewish law, Jewish social and medical ethics, and the connections between law and spirituality, on each of which he has published articles.

Boundaries of Loyalty

*Testimony Against Fellow Jews in
Non-Jewish Courts*

SAUL J. BERMAN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, New York NY 10006, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107090651

© Saul J. Berman 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Berman, Saul J., author.

Title: Boundaries of loyalty : testimony against fellow Jews in non-Jewish courts / Saul J. Berman.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016021103 | ISBN 9781107090651 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Informers (Jewish law) | Witnesses (Jewish law) | Conflict of laws (Jewish law) | Criminal jurisdiction. | Legal polycentricity.

Classification: LCC KBM2025 .B47 2016 | DDC 347/.066-dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016021103>

ISBN 978-1-107-09065-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*Of the many gifts with which God has blessed me –
the greatest is my wife,*

Shellee

מצא אשה מצא טוב

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
Introduction	I
1 The Use of Non-Jewish Courts: The <i>Tannaitic</i> Period	3
1.1 Litigation in Non-Jewish Courts	3
1.1.1 <i>Fact Finding</i>	4
1.1.2 <i>Execution of Judgment</i>	6
1.1.3 <i>Judging</i>	8
1.2 Testimony in Non-Jewish Courts: Advantaging Testimony on Behalf of the Jewish Party	11
1.2.1 <i>To Achieve “Religious Rescue”</i>	12
1.2.2 <i>Limits on the Duty to Testify</i>	13
2 Legislative Constraint on Testimony: The Amoraic Period	16
2.1 The Amoraic Legislation	16
2.1.1 <i>The Authority of the Teaching: The term Machriz</i>	18
2.1.2 <i>The Legal Constraint on Testimony</i>	19
2.1.3 <i>The Role of Subpoena</i>	20
2.1.4 <i>Magista Courts and Dawar Courts</i>	21
2.1.5 <i>Literary Structure of the Passage</i>	24
2.2 Later Amoraic/Stammaitic Limitations on the Constraint	28
2.2.1 <i>Identifying the Original Legislation of Rava</i>	28
2.2.2 <i>The First Limitation and the Rationale of Rava</i>	29
2.2.3 <i>The Second Limitation and the Rationale of Rava</i>	30
2.3 The Gaonic Rationale of Procedural Justice: Some Justice is Better than None	31
3 Rejected Rationales for Testimonial Restriction: The Gaonic Period into the Period of the Rishonim	38
3.1 As Extension of the Ban on Litigation – <i>Lifneihem</i>	38

3.1.1	<i>Rejection of the Theory by R. Nissim</i>	39
3.1.2	<i>Basis of the Inapplicability of Lifneihem</i>	40
3.1.2.1	Permissibility of Litigation Between Jew and Non-Jew in Non-Jewish Courts	40
3.1.2.2	Permissibility to Testify in Honest Non-Jewish Courts	42
3.1.2.3	Absence of Challenge from the <i>Tosefta</i> Text	43
3.2	The Law of <i>Mesirah</i> (Handing Over/Collaboration)	44
3.2.1	<i>Mesirah in Biblical Narratives</i>	44
3.2.1.1	The Case of Samson	44
3.2.1.2	The Case of Sheva ben Bichri	45
3.2.1.3	The Case of the Seven Sons of Saul and the Gibeonites	46
3.2.2	<i>Mesirah in the Talmudic Era</i>	49
3.2.2.1	Mishnah and Tosefta	49
3.2.2.2	Jerusalem Gemara	54
3.2.3	<i>The Approach of Rambam: Distinction between Religious Oppressor, Violent Criminal and Government</i>	56
3.2.3.1	<i>Mesirah</i> and <i>Kiddush Hashem</i>	57
3.2.3.2	<i>Mesirah</i> and the Law of Damages	59
3.2.4	<i>Is Mesirah Based on the Duty of Rescue? Limits on Loyalty to Life</i>	64
3.2.5	<i>Inapplicability of Mesirah to Testimony in Non-Jewish Courts: Rashba and Rambam</i>	69
3.2.6	<i>Summary of the Elements of the Crime of Mesirah</i>	75
4	The Creation of a Duty to Testify Against Fellow Jews in Non-Jewish Courts: The Period of the <i>Rishonim</i>	77
4.1	To Avoid <i>Chillul Hashem</i> (Desecration of God's Name)	78
4.1.1	<i>The Biblical Texts of Chillul Hashem</i>	79
4.1.2	<i>Rambam on Chillul Hashem</i>	82
4.1.3	<i>Ravad's Use of Chillul Hashem</i>	88
4.1.4	<i>Chillul Hashem as a Factor for the Rishonim of Ashkenaz</i>	94
4.2	To Prevent a Fellow Jew from Perpetrating a Crime (<i>Chiyuv Lehafrisho min HaIssur</i>)	102
4.3	When Required to Testify by Non-Jewish Law: Being Subject to Two Masters	110
4.4	To Avoid Monetary or Bodily Penalty for Refusal to Testify	119
4.5	If Refusal or Failure to Testify would Threaten the Security or the Economic Well-Being of the Jewish Community	129
5	The Tension Between Responsa and Codification – Maharam Mintz, Rabbi Joseph Karo and Rabbi Moshe Isserlis	140
5.1	Maharam Mintz	140
5.2	Rabbi Joseph Ben Ephraim Karo	146
5.3	Rabbi Moshe Isserlis (Rama)	158
5.4	The Tension between Codification and Responsa	176

Contents

ix

6	Further Expansion of the Duty of Testimony Against Fellow Jews in Non-Jewish Courts in the Period of the <i>Acharonim</i>	182
6.1	If the Testimony is Itself Not Definitive and Not Determinative of the Outcome	183
6.2	The Role and Significance of the Subpeona	185
7	Contemporary Attempts to Revert to the Original Law of Rava: Expanding the Boundaries of Loyalty	191
7.1	The Hovering of the Term <i>Mesirah</i>	192
7.2	The Dual Meaning of Legal Terms	192
7.3	The Dual Meaning of the Term <i>Mesirah</i>	199
7.4	<i>Mesirah</i> in the Responsa of Rabbi Moshe Feinstein	205
8	Conclusion: Reflections on Loyalty and Law	213
	<i>References</i>	223
	<i>Index</i>	231

Acknowledgments

My parents, Rabbi Ephraim and Rose Berman, of blessed memory, taught me integrity, humility, the centrality of Torah study and the importance of striving for justice in an imperfect world. My parents in-law, Dr. Nathan and Rose Birn, of blessed memory, taught me to work hard, to stand up for principles, to live modestly and to never think that you have enough knowledge. The four of them modeled for their children love of Torah, of family and of God. The only way in which one can repay such a debt, which Shellee and I have attempted to do, is to pass on those same values and virtues to the next generation.

A select group of teachers have shaped my spiritual and intellectual life. Prime amongst them was Rabbi Joseph B. Soloveitchik, of blessed memory, whose intellectual brilliance and religious passion enlightened my mind and elevated my soul. Dr. Louis Feldman and Rabbi Emanuel Rackman at Yeshiva College, Professor Edmond Cahn of New York University Law School, Professor David Daube at the University of California at Berkeley, Justice Menachem Elon at Hebrew University Law School and Professor Aaron Kirschenbaum at Tel Aviv University Law School – each in his unique way empowered me to study Jewish legal texts not only as God’s will, but as God’s will for the governance of all of human society; which then allowed for and enriched the application of Halacha to contemporary reality, and the comparison between Jewish law and other legal systems. The teaching and writings of my friend Dr. Haym Soloveitchik demanded a level of precision and rigor in reading texts and in the analysis of ideas and of reality that enriched my thinking, teaching and writing in Torah. Each one of them contributed

in important ways to my own attempt to tease out of Jewish law the underlying truths, virtues and values that are the spiritual underpinnings of legal and ethical decision making.

“Give me friendship, or give me death,” said Choni HaMe’agel correctly (Ta’anit 32a), for in friendship there is unparalleled richness of life. I am blessed with friends, too many to mention, but in the interaction with whom the virtues and values expressed in this book came to be formed and sharpened as intellectual awareness, as spiritual devotion and as living forces. Childhood friends, and friends from Yeshiva Torah Vodaath, friends from Yeshiva College, and RIETS of YU, from Berkeley California and Brookline Massachusetts, from Murray Hill, Lincoln Square Synagogue and the Upper West Side in Manhattan – they and their children have accompanied us, as we them, through the challenges of a lifetime, the sorrows and the joys, the failures and the successes. We always remember the kindnesses and moments of mutual caring in those relationships that brighten our lives.

My earliest research on the subject matter of this book took place during my initial years as a faculty member and Chairman of the Department of Jewish Studies at Stern College, under the Deanship of Rabbi David Mirsky. He encouraged my desire to develop a series of courses in Jewish law and contemporary social and political problems, entitled *The Individual and Society*. By now over four decades of students at Stern College, and twenty years of students at Columbia Law School, have studied with me elements of the relevant values, ideas and sources embedded in this book, and I have been enriched by their ever-fresh insights and passionate ethical commitments as we have confronted the texts themselves and their struggle with competing loyalties.

In the academic year 2009–2010, I was honored to serve as the Berkowitz Fellow at The Tikvah Center for Law and Jewish Civilization at New York University School of Law. I am indebted to The Tikvah Fund for its sponsorship of the Center, and to Professors Joseph Weiler and Moshe Halbertal, both for their vibrant intellectual leadership of the Center, and for reading drafts of this book and making valuable recommendations that contributed to its final form. I am grateful for the collegiality of all of the extraordinary scholars who served as Tikvah fellows with me; and particularly to Professors Aharon Shemesh and Adiel Schremer whose breadth of knowledge and insight into primary and secondary sources in Jewish law enriched me enormously as I wrote this book. Rabbi Dr. Menachem Meier, a devoted friend, read much of the

Acknowledgments

xiii

manuscript and recommended small and large changes from which the readers will benefit.

My thanks to Dr. Lewis Bateman of Cambridge University Press for his confidence in the merits of this book. Also to Cassi Roberts for shepherding the book through the process of being prepared for publication and Helen Flitton for her excellent editorial work on the manuscript. Special thanks to my daughter, Esther Lefkowitz, for her consistently outstanding work on every aspect of the preparation of the manuscript for publication and for the performance of technical skills which I could never have mastered.

Shellee, to whom this volume is dedicated, often wears a pin with the Hebrew word “bonayich,” meaning “your builders,” which at the end of Tractate Berachot is used in a play on the word “banayich,” “your children,” in Isaiah 54:13, “(you shall have) much wholeness (through) your children.” Indeed, our children, their spouses and our grandchildren have been the builders of our wholeness and happiness. Gifts of God to us, they taught us the varied forms that depth of intellect, goodness of heart, sensitivity to justice, and humor can take. They have embodied the values and virtues of integrity, self-sacrifice, religious devotion, joy in life and kindness in uniquely configured proportions appropriate to each one’s distinctive, autonomous identity. And so, I acknowledge them all: Shama and Rachel Berman, and Shoshi, Adira, Ephraim and Adiv (may God grant him healing and long life); Efrath and Gal Levy, and Natalie, Gabriel and Abigail; Akiva Berman; Esther and Rafi Lefkowitz and Ava. To all, with pride and love.