

#### SELF-AWARENESS IN ISLAMIC PHILOSOPHY

This important book investigates the emergence and development of a distinct concept of self-awareness in post-classical, pre-modern Islamic philosophy. Jari Kaukua presents the first extended analysis of Avicenna's arguments on self-awareness - including the flying man, the argument from the unity of experience, the argument against reflection models of self-awareness and the argument from personal identity - claiming that all these arguments hinge on a clearly definable concept of self-awareness as pure first-personality. He substantiates his interpretation with an analysis of Suhrawardi's use of Avicenna's concept and Mulla Sadra's revision of the underlying concept of selfhood. The study explores evidence for a sustained, pre-modern and non-Western discussion of selfhood self-awareness, challenging the idea that these concepts are distinctly modern, European concerns. The book will be of interest to a range of readers in history of philosophy, history of ideas, Islamic studies and philosophy of mind.

JARI KAUKUA is Academy of Finland Research Fellow in the Department of Social Sciences and Philosophy at the University of Jyväskylä. He is the author of several articles in journals including *Vivarium* and *History and Theory*. This is his first book.





# SELF-AWARENESS IN ISLAMIC PHILOSOPHY

Avicenna and Beyond

JARI KAUKUA





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107088795

© Jari Kaukua 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Kaukua, Jari.

Self-awareness in Islamic philosophy: Avicenna and beyond / Jari Kaukua.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-08879-5 (hardback)

1. Self (Philosophy) 2. Self-consciousness (Awareness) 3. Islamic philosophy. I. Title.

B745.S35K38 2014 126.088'297-dc23 2014023812

ISBN 978-1-107-08879-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Ukko, Touko and Rauha





### Contents

Αc	Acknowledgements		
	Introduction	I	
I	Preliminary observations: self-cognition and Avicennian		
	psychology	12	
	I.I Self-cognition in the ancient heritage	12	
	1.2 Avicennian psychology in outline	22	
2	Avicenna and the phenomenon of self-awareness: the		
	experiential basis of the flying man	30	
	2.1 The purpose and basis of the flying man	31	
	2.2 The validity and plausibility of the flying man	37	
3	Self-awareness as existence: Avicenna on the individuality		
	of an incorporeal substance	43	
	3.1 The problem of incorporeal individuality	43	
	3.2 Self-awareness as incorporeal existence	51	
4	In the first person: Avicenna's concept of self-awareness		
	reconstructed	62	
	4.1 Three Avicennian arguments from first-personality	64	
	4.2 First-personality, the flying man and incorporeal existence	80	
	4.3 Self-awareness, reflection and intellection	89	
5	Self-awareness without substance: from Abū al-Barakāt		
	al-Baghdādī to Suhrawardī	104	
	5.1 Avicennian material in Suhrawardī	106	
	5.2 Substanceless self-awareness	II4	
6	Self-awareness, presence, appearance: the ishrāqī context		
	6.1 Self-awareness and knowledge as presence	125	

vii



viii		Contents		
	6.2	Self-awareness and being as appearance	142	
	6.3	Degrees of self-awareness	154	
7	Mullā	Ṣadrā on self-awareness	161	
	7.1	Four Avicennian arguments	164	
	7.2	The complicated evidence of self-awareness	181	
8	The self reconsidered: Ṣadrian revisions to the Avicennian			
	conce	pt	192	
	8.1	The self and cognitive unity	192	
	8.2	Identity in substantial change	208	
	Concl	usion: Who is the I?	228	
Ар	pendix:	Arabic terminology related to self-awareness	233	
Bil	Bibliography			
Inc	Index			



## Acknowledgements

This book is the distillation of the research conducted during my post-doctoral period, but some of its central insights were already formed during my doctoral studies. I therefore owe an immense debt of gratitude to my supervisors, the late Juha Sihvola, Mikko Yrjönsuuri and Taneli Kukkonen. The extremely conscientious and insightful comments of Jon McGinnis and Simo Knuuttila provided crucial corroboration and realignment at a formative stage. Finally, Peter Adamson not only added his characteristically penetrating points but also was pivotal for my full engagement with post-Avicennian philosophy by inviting me to share my hesitant first reflections on Suhrawardī at a conference held in London in February 2008.

Financially, my research has been enabled by generous support from the Academy of Finland (through research fellowships under the titles 'Selfhood in Medieval Islamic Philosophy' and 'Knowledge in Post-Avicennian Islamic Philosophy,' and through the two Centers of Excellence led by Simo Knuuttila, 'History of Mind' and 'Philosophical Psychology, Morality and Politics'), the European Research Council (through Taneli Kukkonen's research project on 'Subjectivity and Selfhood in the Arabic and Latin Traditions') and the Riksbankens Jubileumsfond (through the project 'Understanding Agency' led by Lilli Alanen and Pauliina Remes). I have had the pleasure of conducting the research at the inspiring environments of the Department of Social Sciences and Philosophy at the University of Jyväskylä, my academic home and the Department of Philosophy at the University of Uppsala. During the final revision, I enjoyed the hospitality of the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study in Uppsala. My gratitude goes to the staff and the directors of these organizations, but especially to all the dear colleagues who have shared their critical insights at the various stages of formation of my ideas, in particular to Vili Lähteenmäki, Juhana Toivanen, Mikko Yrjönsuuri, Taneli Kukkonen, Miira Tuominen, Timothy Riggs and Tomas Ekenberg. I have also benefited enormously from the comments of colleagues who listened to my talks at various seminars and conferences.



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08879-5 - Self-Awareness in Islamic Philosophy: Avicenna and Beyond Jari Kaukua Frontmatter More information

#### Acknowledgements

Particularly cherished have been the critical yet encouraging remarks I received during my visit to Iran from 'Alī 'Abidi Shahrūdi, Sa'īd Javadi Amoli and 'Abd al-Rasūl 'Ubūdīyat, and I would like to extend my gratitude to Yasser Pouresmail and Mohammad Javad Esmaeili for organizing these talks. Finally, I am heavily indebted to my editor Hilary Gaskin as well as the two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press, whose combined acumen helped me to improve the book quite considerably.

The librarians at the University of Jyväskylä and the University of Uppsala have been invaluably efficient in tracing down my frequently obscure requests. This book would not have been possible without their help. By the same token, I would like to recognize Sajjad Rizvi's and Vasileios Syros' collegial assistance with some particularly unobtainable texts. Deborah Black, Therese Scarpelli Cory, Jules Janssens and Luis Xavier López-Farjeat have kindly shared their own work, even in pre-publication form, for which I am most grateful. Jessica Slattery and Tim Riggs did a great job in polishing my English; I hold exclusive rights to the inelegancies that remain. Finally, I'm grateful for Ville Suomalainen's skilled and reliable preparation of the index.

Most of all, I am grateful for the unfailing love and support of my wife Lotta, who alone has had to bear with the more insecure stages of the book's labour. I dedicate the finished work to our children.