

#### The Economics and Uncertainties of Nuclear Power

Is nuclear power a thing of the past or a technology for the future? Has it become too expensive and dangerous, or is it still competitive and sufficiently safe? Should emerging countries invest in it? Can we trust calculations of the probability of a major nuclear accident? In the face of divergent claims and contradictory facts, this book provides an in-depth and balanced economic analysis of the main controversies surrounding nuclear power. Without taking sides, it helps readers gain a better understanding of the uncertainties surrounding the costs, hazards, regulation and politics of nuclear power. Written several years on from the Fukushima Daiichi nuclear disaster of 2011, this is an important resource for students, researchers, energy professionals and concerned citizens wanting to engage with the continuing debate on the future of nuclear power and its place in international energy policy.

FRANÇOIS LÉVÊQUE is Professor of Economics at Mines ParisTech and a part-time professor at the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies (European University Institute). He has advised many international bodies on energy policy and the economics of regulation, including the International Energy Agency, the OECD and the European Commission.





# The Economics and Uncertainties of Nuclear Power

FRANÇOIS LÉVÊQUE





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107087286

© François Lévêque 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-08728-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## **Contents**

List of abbreviations	page viii
Introduction	1
Part I Estimating the costs of nuclear power: points of	
reference, sources of uncertainty	7
1 Adding up costs	9
The notion of cost	10
Social, external and private costs	12
External effects relating to independence and security	13
The price of carbon	16
Decommissioning and waste: setting the right discount rate	e 23
Liability in the event of accident	34
Technical and financial production costs	36
Adding up the costs: the levelized cost method	39
2 The curse of rising costs	43
The rising costs of nuclear power	44
International comparisons	49
Is there no limit to escalating costs?	53
3 Nuclear power and its alternatives	64
The relative competitive advantage of nuclear power over	((
gas or coal	66
The competitive advantages of nuclear power and	72
renewable energies	72



#### vi • Contents

Pa	rt II The risk of a major nuclear accident: calculation	
	and perception of probabilities	79
4	Calculating risk	81
	Calculating the cost of major accidents	81
	Calculating the frequency of major accidents	86
	Divergence between real-world observation of accidents and their frequency as predicted by the models	91
5	Perceived probabilities and aversion to disaster	102
	Biases in our perception of probabilities	103
	Perception biases working against nuclear power	111
6	The magic of Bayesian analysis	118
	The Bayes–Laplace rule	118
	Are we naturally good at statistics?	121
	Choosing the right prior probability	123
	Predicting the probability of the next event	125
	What is the global probability of a core melt tomorrow?	132
Pa	rt III Safety regulation: an analysis of the American,	
	French and Japanese cases	139
7	Does nuclear safety need to be regulated?	141
	Inadequate private incentives	142
	Civil liability	147
	Civil liability for nuclear damage, in practice	149
	A subsidy in disguise?	151
8	The basic rules of regulation	157
	An engineer's view of safety regulation	157
	Japanese regulation, an example to avoid	160
	The Japanese regulator is a captive to industry	166
9	What goal should be set for safety and how is it	
	to be attained?	172
	Technology versus performance-based standards in the	
	United States	174



### Contents • vii

Choosing a goal for overall safety: words and figures A French approach in complete contrast to the	179
American model	186
Regulator and regulated: enemies or peers?	193
Pros and cons of American and French regulation	198
Part IV National policies and international governance	207
10 Adopting nuclear power	211
Atoms for peace	212
Pioneers and followers	216
Aspiring nuclear powers	222
11 Nuclear exit	226
German hesitation over a swift or gradual exit	226
In France early plant closure and nuclear cutbacks	235
12 Supranational governance: learning from Europe	244
Why is the national level not sufficient?	244
European safety standards	247
Europe's patchwork of liability	251
Coexistence fraught by conflicting views on nuclear power	256
13 International governance to combat proliferation:	
politics and trade	265
The IAEA and the NPT: strengths and weaknesses	266
Nuclear trade	269
Which model: the armament industry, or oil and gas	
supplies and services?	273
Export controls	282
Conclusion	296
Notes	302
Index	



# **Abbreviations**

ANRE Agency for Natural Resources and Energy (Japan)

ASN Autorité de Sûreté Nucléaire

CEA Commissariat à l'Energie Atomique

EDF Electricité de France

Ensreg European Nuclear Safety Regulation Group

EPR European Pressurized Reactor

GDP Gross Domestic Product

IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
 INES International Nuclear Event Scale
 INPO Institute of Nuclear Power Operations
 IRRS International Regulatory Review Service

IRSN Institut de Radioprotection et de Sûreté Nucléaire

JNES Japan Nuclear Energy Safety Organization MIT Massachusetts Institute of Technology

NPT Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons

NRC Nuclear Regulatory Commission NSC Nuclear Safety Commission (Japan)

NSG Nuclear Suppliers Group

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and

Development

UAE United Arab Emirates

viii