Ancient Greece and China Compared

*Ancient Greece and China Compared* is a pioneering, methodologically sophisticated set of studies, bringing together scholars who all share the conviction that the sustained critical comparison and contrast between ancient societies can bring to light significant aspects of each that would be missed by focusing on just one of them. The topics tackled include key issues in philosophy and religion, in art and literature, in mathematics and the life sciences (including gender studies), in agriculture, city planning and institutions. The volume also analyses how to go about the task of comparing, including finding viable comparanda and avoiding the trap of interpreting one culture in terms appropriate only to another. The book is set to provide a model for future collaborative and interdisciplinary work exploring what is common between ancient civilisations, what is distinctive of particular ones, and what may help to account for the latter.

**G. E. R. Lloyd** is Emeritus Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Science at the University of Cambridge, Former Master of Darwin College, Cambridge, and Senior Scholar in Residence at the Needham Research Institute, Cambridge. He is the author of twenty-two books and editor of four, and was knighted for ‘services to the history of thought’ in 1997.

**Jingyi Jenny Zhao** is Lloyd-Dan David Research Fellow at the Needham Research Institute and at Darwin College, Cambridge.

**Qiaosheng Dong** is currently affiliated to the Cambridge Peking University China Centre at Jesus College.
Ancient Greece and China Compared

EDITED BY G. E. R. LLOYD AND JINGYI JENNY ZHAO

In collaboration with Qiaosheng Dong
Contents

List of Figures [page vii]
Acknowledgements [x]
Notes on Editions [xi]
List of Contributors [xiii]

Introduction: Methods, Problems and Prospects [1]
G. E. R. Lloyd

PART I  METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES AND GOALS [31]

1 Why Some Comparisons Make More Difference than Others [33]
Nathan Sivin

2 Comparing Comparisons [40]
Walter Scheidel

3 On the Very Idea of (Philosophical?) Translation [59]
Robert Wardy

PART II  PHILOSOPHY AND RELIGION [81]

4 Freedom in Parts of the Zhuangzi and Epictetus [83]
R. A. H. King

5 Shame and Moral Education in Aristotle and Xunzi [110]
Jingyi Jenny Zhao

6 Human and Animal in Early China and Greece [131]
Lisa Raphals

7 Genealogies of Gods, Ghosts and Humans: The Capriciousness of the Divine in Early Greece and Early China [160]
Michael Puett
Contents

PART III ART AND LITERATURE [187]

8 Visual Art and Historical Representation in Ancient Greece and China [189]
   Jeremy Tanner

9 Helen and Chinese Femmes Fatales [234]
   Yiqun Zhou

PART IV MATHEMATICS AND LIFE SCIENCES [257]

10 Divisions, Big and Small: Comparing Archimedes and Liu Hui [259]
   Reviel Netz

11 Abstraction as a Value in the Historiography of Mathematics in Ancient Greece and China: A Historical Approach to Comparative History of Mathematics [290]
   Karine Chemla

12 Recipes for Love in the Ancient World [326]
   Vivienne Lo and Eleanor Re'Em

PART V AGRICULTURE, PLANNING AND INSTITUTIONS [353]

13 From the Harvest to the Meal in Prehistoric China and Greece: A Comparative Approach to the Social Context of Food [355]
   Xinyi Liu, Evi Margaritis and Martin Jones

14 On Libraries and Manuscript Culture in Western Han Chang’an and Alexandria [373]
   Michael Nylan

Afterword [410]
   Michael Loewe

Index [420]
Figures

2.1 Comparative ancient East/West publications. [page 49]
8.1 Tyrannicides: Harmodius and Aristogeiton. Roman marble copy of bronze statues by Kritios and Nesiotes, 476 BCE. Photo: Permission of the Ministero dei Beni e delle Attività Culturali e del Turismo – Museo Archeologico Nazionale di Napoli. [190]
8.2 Wu Liang Shrine, West Wall. Second century CE. Rubbing after the original stone engravings. Image: Courtesy of the C.V. Starr East Asian Library, University of California, Berkeley. [191]
8.3 (a) He zun, eleventh century BCE. (b) Rubbing of the inscription from the interior of the He zun. Photos: © Baoji Bronze Ware Museum, 宝鸡青铜器博物院. [195]
8.4 Shi Qiang bronze pan vessel, tenth century BCE. Zhuangbai, Fufeng, Shaanxi Province. Photo: Zhang Yawei. © Zhouyuan Museum. [196]
8.7 Reconstruction of compositional scheme of the Battle of Marathon Painting in the Stoa Poikile. After E. Harrison (1972), ill. 1; courtesy Archaeological Institute of America and The American Journal of Archaeology. [204]
8.9 South frieze from the Temple of Athena Nike, Athens. Slab G, British Museum. Photo: © British Museum. [207]
vi

List of Figures

8.10 (a) Temple of Athena Nike, Athens, c. 425 BCE. Photo: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, Archives, Alison Frantz Photographic Collection. (b) Reconstruction of bastion of the Temple of Athena Nike, with shields attached. Drawing: David Scahill. [211]

8.11 (a) Reconstruction of shrine from Songshan, second century CE. After Wu Hung 1989, figure 42. (b) West wall of shrine from Songshan, second century CE. Rubbing after engraved stones in Shandong Provincial Museum. Image: with permission of the Royal Ontario Museum © ROM. [215]

8.12 Jing Ke and the King of Qin (top register). Rubbing after engravings on the south wall of Shrine 1, Wu Family Cemetery. Second century CE. Image: Courtesy of Harvard University Fine Arts Library, Special Collections. [217]

8.13 Rubbing after engraving from Eastern Han shrine, Songshan, Shandong Province. Image: with permission of the Royal Ontario Museum © ROM. [218]


10.1 The ‘Box-Lid’. [260]

10.2 Archimedes’ Method 14 supplemented by a three-dimensional extension above the base. [262]

10.3 Proof of properties in Figure 10.2. [263]

10.4 Bicylinder and circumscribed sphere. [266]

10.5 Figure 10.4 with added plane parallel to the base of the cube. [267]

10.6 Box-Lid decomposed. [268]

10.7 Illustration of use of Cavalieri’s principle. [272]

11.1 The rectangular cropland in the first problem in chapter 4. [310]

11.2 The representation of a quantity of area of 240 bu using measurement units for length. [311]

11.3 Interpreting the expression ‘Reducing the Width’ using the geometrical representation of the value of areas. [317]

12.1 Red-figure pelike, attributed to the Hasselmann Painter, BM1865, 1118.49. [327]

12.2 Double phalli from Tomb M1 Mancheng, Hebei. [328]
List of Figures ix

12.3 A chart of the vulva, Mawangdui tomb 3. [329]
13.1 Locations of key sites mentioned in the text. [369]
14.1 The Tianlu ge library site. [382]
14.2 Han roof-tile end bearing the legends ‘Shiqu qianqiu’. [383]
14.3 Western Jin scholars collating texts. [385]
Acknowledgements

This book originated in a conference entitled Comparing Ancient Worlds: Greece and China that marked the celebration of G. E. R. Lloyd’s eightieth birthday on 25 January 2013. The idea for such a conference came from Qiaosheng Dong and Jenny Zhao, who jointly organised the whole proceedings, and it could not have taken place without the generous support of the Needham Research Institute, the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities, the Classics Faculty at Cambridge and above all the Chiang Ching-kuo foundation. Our thanks go to all these organisations and especially to the staff of CRASSH, Catherine Hurley and Michelle Maciejewska, and at the NRI, Sue Bennett and John Moffett. Not all the original talks held at the conference have been included and some have been added to cover subjects that were not part of our original discussions, but every chapter has been extensively revised in the light of comments at the original conference and from external reviewers. Given Qiaosheng Dong’s other commitments, the bulk of the editorial work was undertaken by G. E. R. Lloyd and Jenny Zhao.
Notes on Editions

Unless otherwise specified

For Greek and Latin texts

References to Plato are to Burnet’s Oxford edition.


The following is cited according to the Loeb Classical Library: Homer (1919) *Odyssey*. Trans. A. T. Murray. Cambridge, MA.

For Chinese texts

The following editions are used:


References to the dynastic histories are to the Beijing Zhonghua shuju editions, as follows:

*Shiji* 史記 (1959) Sima Qian 司馬遷. 10 vols.


xii Notes on Editions

Citations are made in accordance with the Ancient Chinese Text Concordance Series (Institute of Chinese Studies, Chinese University of Hong Kong) for the Daodejing, Liji and Lunyu, and in accordance with the Harvard Yenching Concordances for the Xunzi.

Details of the editions used for other texts that are cited in only one chapter appear in the separate bibliography for the chapter in question.
Contributors

Karine Chemla is Senior Researcher at the French National Center for Scientific Research (CNRS), in the laboratory SPHERE (CNRS & University Paris Diderot). She co-edited recently The Oxford Handbook of Generality in Mathematics and the Sciences (with R. Chorlay and D. Rabouin, 2016) and Cultures without Culturalism: The Making of Scientific Knowledge (with Evelyn Fox Keller, 2017).

Qiaosheng Dong is currently affiliated to the Cambridge Peking University China Centre at Jesus College.


Xinyi Liu is Assistant Professor at the anthropology department, Washington University in St. Louis. He has published extensively in archaeology, Quaternary geology and scientific journals.

G. E. R. Lloyd is Emeritus Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Science in the University of Cambridge and Senior Scholar in Residence at the Needham Research Institute. The most important of his comparative studies of ancient Greek and Chinese thought is the book he wrote with Nathan Sivin, The Way and the Word: Science and Medicine in Early China and Greece (2002).

Vivienne Lo is Senior Lecturer at University College London and Director of the China Centre for Health and Humanity there. She was the founder editor of the journal Asian Medicine: Tradition and Modernity, and publications include Perfect Bodies: Sports Medicine and Immortality (2008), Medieval Chinese Medicine (2005, with Christoper Cullen ed.) and Imagining Chinese
List of Contributors


Evi Margaritis is Assistant Professor at the Science and Technology for Archaeology Research Center, the Cyprus Institute, Nicosia, Cyprus. She has published extensively in the field of Mediterranean archaeobotany.

Reviel Netz is Patrick Suppes Professor of Greek Mathematics and Astronomy at Stanford University. He has published widely on Greek mathematics, and in particular he is among the co-editors of The Archimedes Palimpsest (2011).

Michael Nylan is Professor of History at the University of California at Berkeley. She is the author of Chang'an 26 BCE (2014) and The Five 'Confucian' Classics (2001).

Michael Puett is the Walter C. Klein Professor of Chinese History and Anthropology, and Chair of the Committee on the Study of Religion, at Harvard University. He is the author of The Ambivalence of Creation: Debates Concerning Innovation and Artifice in Early China (2001) and To Become a God: Cosmology, Sacrifice, and Self-Divinization in Early China (2002), as well as the co-author, with Adam Seligman, Robert Weller and Bennett Simon, of Ritual and its Consequences: An Essay on the Limits of Sincerity (2008).

Lisa Raphals is Professor of Chinese and Comparative Literature at the University of California, Riverside. Among her most important books are Knowing Words: Wisdom and Cunning in the Classical Traditions of China and Greece (1992), Sharing the Light: Representations of Women and Virtue in Early China (1998) and Divination and Prediction in Early China and Ancient Greece (2013).

Eleanor Re'Em is a Classics graduate of King’s College, Cambridge and has an MA in History of Art from the Warburg Institute. She now works in software design and coding, and with Vivienne Lo is working on an animated series for children called Granny and the Wolf.

Walter Scheidel is Dickason Professor in the Humanities, Professor of Classics and History, and Kennedy-Grossman Fellow in Human Biology at Stanford University. His research covers ancient social and economic history and the comparative history of population, state formation, labour regimes and inequality, and includes comparative studies of ancient Rome and early China.

Nathan Sivin is Emeritus Professor of Chinese Culture and the History of Science in the Department of the History and Sociology of Science at the University of Pennsylvania. Among his most influential studies of ancient
List of Contributors


**Jeremy Tanner** is Professor of Classical and Comparative Art at the Institute of Archaeology, University College London, where he coordinates the MA programme in Comparative Art and Archaeology. Recent publications include ‘Portraits and politics in classical Greece and early imperial China’ (*Art History* 2016) and ‘Narrative, naturalism and the body in classical Greek and early imperial Chinese art’ (in J. Elsner, ed., *Comparativism in Art History*, 2017).

**Robert Wardy** is Reader in Ancient Philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a fellow of St Catharine’s College. *Aristotle in China: Language, Categories and Translation* (2000) is one of his books.

**Jingyi Jenny Zhao** is Lloyd-Dan David Research Fellow at the Needham Research Institute, and at Darwin College, University of Cambridge. She works on ancient Greek and early Chinese philosophy from a comparative perspective, with a special interest in shame and the emotions, and representations of infancy and childhood.

**Yiqun Zhou** is Associate Professor in the Department of East Asian Languages and Cultures, Stanford University. Her book *Festivals, Feasts, and Gender Relations in Ancient China and Greece* was published in 2010.