The Apocalypse in the Early Middle Ages

This ground-breaking study reveals the distinctive impact of apocalyptic ideas about time, evil and power on Church and society in the Latin West, c. 400-c. 1050. Drawing on evidence from late antiquity, the Frankish kingdoms, Anglo-Saxon England, Spain and Byzantium and sociological models, James Palmer shows that apocalyptic thought was a more powerful part of mainstream political ideologies and religious reform than many historians believe. Moving beyond the standard 'Terrors of the Year 1000', The Apocalypse in the Early Middle Ages opens up broader perspectives on heresy, the Antichrist and Last World Emperor legends, chronography, and the relationship between eschatology and apocalypticism. In the process, it offers reassessments of the worlds of Augustine, Gregory of Tours, Bede, Charlemagne and the Ottonians, providing a wide-ranging and up-to-date survey of medieval apocalyptic thought. This is the first full-length English-language treatment of a fundamental and controversial part of medieval religion and society.

JAMES T. PALMER is Lecturer in Mediaeval History at the University of St Andrews.

The Apocalypse in the Early Middle Ages

James T. Palmer





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107449091

© James T. Palmer 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-08544-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-44909-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Sophie and Audrey

Contents

	List of figures page	ge viii
	List of maps	ix
	Acknowledgements	х
	List of abbreviations	xii
	Introduction: how the world ends	1
1	The end of civilisation (c. 380-c. 575)	25
2	The new urgency (<i>c</i> . 550– <i>c</i> . 604)	55
3	The ends of time and space (c. 600-c. 735)	79
4	Pseudo-Methodius and the problem of evil (c. 680-c. 800)	107
5	Charlemagne, pater Europae (c. 750-c. 820)	130
6	A Golden Age in danger (c. 820– c. 911)	159
7	The Year 1000 and other apocalypticisms (c. 911–c. 1033)	189
	Conclusion: the end (<i>c</i> . 400– <i>c</i> . 1033)	227
	Select bibliography	236
	Index of manuscript references	248
	General index	250

Figures

1	The opening of Gregory of Tours's Histories in an early	
	Corbie manuscript (source: Paris, Bibliothèque nationale	
	de France, lat. 17644, f. 2r)	page 69
2	Tomb of Mellebaudus of Poitiers (source: © Musées de	
	Poitiers/Christian Vignaud)	106
3	Petrus Monachus's Preface to Pseudo-Methodius	
	(source: Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 13348,	
	f. 93v–94r)	120
4	The Muspilli (source: Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek,	
	Clm 14098, 119v and 120r)	175
5	Revelation in the Vivian Bible (source: Paris, Bibliothèque	
	nationale de France, lat. 1, f. 415v)	177
6	Judgement Day in the Bamberg Apocalypse (source: Bamberg	з,
	Staatsbibliothek, Msc. Bibl. 140, f. 53r)	204

viii

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

Maps

1 The wider world

2 The Frankish world

page xiii xiv

Acknowledgements

I started out researching and planning this book shortly after I moved to the University of St Andrews back in 2007. My postdoctoral research on time in the early Middle Ages, generously funded by a Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship at the University of Nottingham, had drawn me into the subject of the apocalyptic and I was surprised that there was no sustained, coherent treatment of it for my period. I committed to teaching a third-year option on apocalyptic traditions from Rome to Joachim of Fiore and began piecing together ideas of my own, with not a little help from my students. For the academic season 2011/12 the AHRC gave me invaluable support with a research fellowship which allowed me to spend more time in libraries and to begin the process of writing up - a process aided by institutional leave from the School of History the following year. Invaluable time dedicated to the book was afforded by an ERASMUS exchange at the University of Oslo with Jón Viðar Sigurðsson, in 2011, and by a visiting fellowship at Virginia Tech in 2013, generously supported by the Residential College at West Ambler Johnston Hall, Ben Sax, and my indulgent host Matt Gabriele.

I incurred a great deal of academic debt in the period in which this book was produced. Colleagues in the School of History, St Andrews, were always supportive and encouraging. One could not hope to work in a more stimulating and friendly environment. Within that collective brilliance, a few individuals need to be thanked for their direct input. Simon MacLean kindly read most of the book in draft and gave much useful advice. Justine Firnhaber-Baker and Alex Woolf patiently listened to me talking about it at length and made many suggestions, some followed, others not. Tim Greenwood helped me to straighten up Chapter 4, and both he and Paul Magdalino helpfully talked through various aspects of eastern apocalyptic thought with me. John Hudson was an excellent nominated mentor for the AHRC, which is to say he said encouraging things but let me get on with it. The enthusiastic postgraduate community in St Andrews has also been a continuous source of support, tea and cake. It is a great sadness that, from among them, Berenike Walburg

X

Acknowledgements

never got to see this book, but I hope she would have appreciated the efforts to look East 'to the really interesting stuff'.

Outside the School, a special thanks needs to be expressed to Helen Foxhall Forbes, who carefully went through the whole draft manuscript before its initial submission and helped me to improve and sharpen up my ideas throughout. The two anonymous readers were magnificent and put in great care and effort in preparing reports to bring the best out of the finished volume. I also benefited from having Clemens Gantner, Simon Loseby, Rick Sowerby and Jo Story cast critical eyes over individual chapters. The remaining mistakes really are my own to bear. I have enjoyed being part of overlapping networks of scholars with related interests, and warmly thank Christopher Bonura, Lizzie Boyle, Katy Cubitt, Peter Darby, Sarah Foot, Matt Gabriele, Anke Holdenried, Mayke de Jong, Richard Landes, Rob Meens, Marco Mostert, Levi Roach, Jay Rubenstein, Felicitas Schmieder, Faith Wallis, Immo Warntjes, Brett Whalen, Steve White and Veronika Wieser for numerous conversations and emails which have helped to propel things forwards. (Sorry if I missed anyone out - I will make it up to you.) Individual elements of the book were tried out on audiences in London, Frankfurt, Utrecht, Blacksburg (Virginia Tech), Paris (IMS), Nottingham, Sheffield and, of course, Leeds and Kalamazoo, with many positive lessons learned along the way. Staff in the various libraries I worked in - in London, Paris, Berlin, Oxford, Cambridge and St Andrews - made my task much easier and I am grateful to all. And I must not forget to acknowledge my debt to the staff at Cambridge University Press, and in particular Liz Friend-Smith and Amanda George, who were encouraging from the beginning and saw that everything got done. I would also like to thank Annie Jackson for her sterling work as my copy-editor.

Finally, I must express my gratitude to those 'outside' the academic universe who made everything possible. My parents, Jan and Trevor, have been there beyond the call of duty more times than I can count. Christine and the Money family have always been patient and supportive even when they didn't have to be. On the other side of the water, the Firnhabers, Bakers and Oslunds have been wonderfully welcoming. At home, Sophie and Audrey have been the most inspiring source of joy and happiness, making all those early starts worth it. And then there's Justine, again – someone who has made anything and everything feel possible.

Abbreviations

AASS CCCM CCSL CLA	Acta Sanctorum Corpus Christianorum, continuatio mediaevalis Corpus Christianorum, series latina Codices latini antiquiores: A Palaeographical Guide to Latin Manuscripts Prior to the Ninth Century, ed. E. A. Lowe
DA	Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters
EHR	English Historical Review
EME	Early Medieval Europe
ĩЕН	Journal of Ecclesiastical History
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica
AA	Auctores antiquissimi
Cap.	Capitula regum Francorum
Conc.	Concilia
Epp. (Sel.)	Epistolae (selectae in usum scholarum)
Libri mem.	Libri memoriales
LL	Leges
QQ zur	
Geistesgesch.	Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters
SRG	Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum
	scholarum separatism editi
SRM	Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum
SS	Scriptores
P&P	Past and Present
PL	Patrologia Latina
SC	Sources chrétiennes
TRHS	Transactions of the Royal Historical Society

xii





Map 2 The Frankish world