## The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered

This collection of original essays brings a dramatically different perspective to bear on the contemporary "crisis of journalism." Rather than seeing technological and economic change as the primary causes of current anxieties, *The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered* draws attention to the role played by the cultural commitments of journalism itself. Linking these professional ethics to the democratic aspirations of the broader societies in which journalists ply their craft, it examines how the new technologies are being shaped to sustain value commitments rather than undermining them. Recent technological change and the economic upheaval it has produced are coded by social meanings. It is this cultural framework that actually transforms these "objective" changes into a crisis. The book argues that cultural codes not only trigger sharp anxiety about technological and economic changes, but provide pathways to control them, so that the democratic practices of independent journalism can be sustained in new forms.

JEFFREY C. ALEXANDER is a leading social theorist who helped create the contemporary field of cultural sociology. He has written and edited dozens of books, among them *The Meanings of Social Life, Trauma: A Social Theory, Performance and Power, The Civil Sphere, The Dark Side of Modernity*, and *Obama Power* (with Bernadette Jaworsky). His books and articles have won various national and international awards.

ELIZABETH BUTLER BREESE is a sociologist who works with highgrowth technology and education companies. She has published media, public sphere, and celebrity research in several sociology and communications journals and has been called on to comment on social media trends in *The New York Times*, *Wired*, and *AdAge*. She is currently Marketing Director at Panorama Education.

MARÍA LUENGO is Associate Professor of Journalism at Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, where she teaches and conducts research in the areas of media theory and journalism. Her work interprets developments at the nexus of social trends and movements, gender, migration, and journalistic culture and practice. She has published widely in the fields of journalism and media studies and co-authored *Periodismo social* (Social Journalism) with Juana Gallego (Síntesis 2014). Her research has appeared in *Journalism Studies*, *Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences*, *Communication & Society*, and *Revista Española de Investigaciones Sociológicas*, among others.

# The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered

Democratic Culture, Professional Codes, Digital Future

> Edited by JEFFREY C. ALEXANDER Yale University

ELIZABETH BUTLER BREESE Panorama Education

MARÍA LUENGO Universidad Carlos III de Madrid



#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006 USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107448513

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in The United States of America

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Alexander, Jeffrey C., 1947– editor. | Breese, Elizabeth Butler, editor. | Luengo, María, editor.

Title: The crisis of journalism reconsidered : democratic culture, professional codes, digital future / edited by Jeffrey C. Alexander, Elizabeth Butler Breese, María Luengo. Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015043635| ISBN 9781107085251 (Hardback) | ISBN 9781107448513 (Paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Journalistic ethics. | Journalism–History–21st century. | BISAC: SOCIAL SCIENCE / Sociology / General.

Classification: LCC PN4756 .C85 2016 | DDC 174/.907–dc23 LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2015043635

18BN 978-1-107-08525-1 Hardback 18BN 978-1-107-44851-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To David Carr (1956–2015), a fierce critic of the press, and its fiercest defender

# Contents

About the Contributors		<i>page</i> ix
Preface		xiii
Acknowledgments		xvii
	Introduction: Journalism, democratic culture, and creative reconstruction Jeffrey C. Alexander	I
PA	RT I: THE CRISIS NARRATIVE	
I	The perpetual crisis of journalism: Cable and digital revolutions <i>Elizabeth Butler Breese</i>	31
2	The crisis of public service broadcasting reconsidered: Commercialization and digitalization in Scandinavia Håkon Larsen	43
3	Beyond administrative journalism: Civic skepticism and the crisis in journalism <i>Daniel Kreiss</i>	59
4	The many crises of Western journalism: A comparative analysis of economic crises, professional crises, and crises of confidence <i>Rasmus Kleis Nielsen</i>	77
5	The crisis in news: Can you whistle a happy tune? <i>Michael Schudson</i>	98
PA	RT II: FEARS OF DIGITAL NEWS MEDIA: THE SYMBOLIC STRUG	GLE
6	When codes collide: Journalists push back against	
	digital desecration María Luengo	119
	num Durigo	vii
		V11

Cambridge University Press				
978-1-107-08525-1 - The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered: Democratic Culture, Professional				
Codes, Digital Future				
Edited by Jeffrey C. Alexander, Elizabeth Butler Breese and María Luengo				
Frontmatter				
More information				

viii	Contents		
7 Telling the crisis story of journalism: Narratives reassurance in <i>Page One</i> <i>Matt Carlson</i>	of normative 135		
8 Assembling publics, assembling routines, assemb Journalistic self-conception and the crisis in journ <i>C.W. Anderson</i>	0		
9 The constancy of immediacy: From printing pres Nikki Usher	ss to digital age 170		
10 News on new platforms: Norwegian journalists Kari Steen-Johnsen, Karoline Andrea Ihlebæk, and			
PART III: PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISM, CIVIL CODES, AND DIGITAL CULTURE			
11 Journalism in American regional online news sys David Ryfe	stems 211		
12 Digital media and the diversification of professio A US–German comparison of journalism culture <i>Matthias Revers</i>			
13 Professional and citizen journalism: Tensions and Peter Dahlgren	d complements 247		
14 Expressions of right and wrong: The emergence structure of journalism <i>Stephen F. Ostertag</i>	of a cultural 264		
Conclusion: News innovations and enduring con Elizabeth Butler Breese and María Luengo	nmitments 282		
Index	291		

## Contributors

Jeffrey C. Alexander, Lillian Chavenson Saden Professor of Sociology at Yale University works in the areas of theory, culture, and politics, developing a meaning-centered approach to the tensions and possibilities of modern social life. He is a director of the Center for Cultural Sociology, also at Yale. In his major work *The Civil Sphere* (2006), Alexander developed a new culturalsociological theory of democracy, a perspective that provides the foundation for *The Performance of Politics: Obama's Victory and the Democratic Struggle for Power* (2010), *Performative Revolution in Egypt: An Essay in Cultural Power* (2011) and *Obama Power* (with Jaworsky 2014).

**C. W. Anderson** is an Associate Professor at the College of Staten Island (CUNY). He is the author of *Rebuilding the News: Metropolitan Journalism in the Digital Age* (Temple University Press) and the forthcoming *Journalism: What Everyone Needs to Know* (Oxford University Press) (with Len Downie and Michael Schudson.)

Elizabeth Butler Breese (PhD, Yale University) is a cultural sociologist currently working at the education data analytics firm Panorama Education in Boston, MA, and a postdoctoral fellow at the Center for Cultural Sociology at Yale. Breese's research on media and the public sphere has appeared in *Cultural Sociology*, *Communication Theory*, and *Society*. Breese is co-editor of the 2010 volume Narrating Trauma: On the Impact of Collective Suffering.

**Matt Carlson** is Associate Professor of Communication at Saint Louis University, USA. His work examines public discourse about journalism, with an interest in the cultural construction of journalistic norms and practices. He is author of *On the Condition of Anonymity: Unnamed Sources and the Battle for Journalism* (University of Illinois Press, 2011), co-editor with Bob Franklin

ix

х

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08525-1 - The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered: Democratic Culture, Professional Codes, Digital Future Edited by Jeffrey C. Alexander, Elizabeth Butler Breese and María Luengo Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

Contributors

of *Journalism*, *Sources*, and *Credibility: New Perspectives* (Routledge, 2011), and author of over two dozen journal articles and book chapters on how journalists and others construct journalism.

**Peter Dahlgren** is professor emeritus at the Dept. of Communication and Media, Lund University, Sweden. His work focuses on media and democracy, from the horizons of late modern social and cultural theory; in particular he has been addressing democratic participation in relation to digital media. Active in European academic networks, he has also been a visiting scholar at several universities in Europe and the U.S. Along with journal articles and book chapters, his recent publications include *The Political Web* (Palgrave, 2013), *Media and Political Engagement* (Cambridge University Press, 2009), and the co-edited volume *Young People, ICTs and Democracy* (Nordicom, 2010).

**Bernard Enjolras** holds a diploma from the Institute of Political Studies in Paris (Sciences-Po), a PhD in Economics from the University of Paris I Sorbonne (France) and a PhD in Sociology from the University of Québec in Montreal (Canada). He is a Deputy Director at the Institute for Social Research (Oslo, Norway). His fields of research are civil society, voluntary organizations, public policies, governance, and social media and the public sphere.

Karoline Andrea Ihlebæk is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Department of Media and Communication at the University of Oslo, and an Associate Professor at the Norwegian University of Science and Technology. Her research interests include political communication, media participation, media innovation, journalism, and media power. She has published articles in international journals such as *Media*, *Culture & Society, Journalism: Theory, Practice and Criticism* and *Television & New Media*, and contributed to several Norwegian books and journals.

**Daniel Kreiss** is Assistant Professor in the School of Media and Journalism at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Kreiss's research explores the impact of technological change on the public sphere and political practice. Kreiss is the author of *Taking Our Country Back: The Crafting of Networked Politics from Howard Dean to Barack Obama* (Oxford University Press, 2012) and *Prototype Politics: Technology-Intensive Campaigning and the Data of Democracy* (Oxford University Press, 2016).

Håkon Larsen is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Department of Sociology and Human Geography at the University of Oslo. He has published extensively on cultural sociology, cultural policy, broadcasting, and the public sphere. His latest book is *Performing Legitimacy: Studies in High Culture and the Public Sphere* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2016).

María Luengo is Associate Professor of Journalism at Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, where she teaches and conducts research in the areas of media

#### Contributors

theory and journalism. Her work interprets developments at the nexus of social trends and movements, gender, migration, and journalistic culture and practice. Her research also adopts a cultural sociological approach in its examination of the media in the context of the civil sphere's independence from other, more materially dominant power spheres in society. She has published widely in the fields of journalism and media studies and co-authored *Periodismo social* (Social Journalism) with Juana Gallego (Síntesis 2014). Her research has appeared in *Journalism Studies*, *Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences*, *Communication & Society*, and *Revista Española de Investigaciones Sociológicas*, among others.

**Rasmus Kleis Nielsen** is Director of Research at the Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism at the University of Oxford and serves as Editor in Chief of the International Journal of Press/Politics. His work focuses on changes in the news media, on political communication, and the role of digital technologies in both. Recent books include *The Changing Business of Journalism and Its Implications for Democracy* (2010, edited with David Levy), *Ground Wars: Personalized Communication in Political Campaigns* (2012, winner of the American Political Science Association's Doris Graber Award), and *Political Journalism in Transition: Western Europe in a Comparative Perspective* (2014, edited with Raymond Kuhn).

Stephen F. Ostertag is an assistant professor in the Department of Sociology at Tulane University. He is a cultural sociologist with current interests in digital media, social problems, collective behavior, and civil/political society. His work focuses on understanding the relationship among morals, cultural structures, and collective behaviors like journalism. With his colleague David G. Ortiz he is also examining the digitally mediated processes of contentious and noncontentious behaviors in the wake of the levy failure in New Orleans. He has published in the *American Journal of Cultural Sociology, Cultural Sociology, Sociological Forum*, and *Information, Communication & Technology*.

**Matthias Revers** is a Senior Researcher and Lecturer ("Wissenschaftlicher Mitarbeiter") at the Department of Sociology at the University of Frankfurt. His recent research deals with news media and occupational cultures of journalism (mainly of the United States and Germany) as well the adoption and influence of digital media on journalism. His work has been published in the *Journal of Communication, Journalism: Theory, Practice & Criticism, Media, Culture & Society.* Revers is the author of *Contemporary Journalism in the US and Germany: Agents of Accountability* (under contract with Palgrave Macmillan).

**David Ryfe** is a professor in and Director of the School of Journalism and Mass Communication at the University of Iowa. He has published widely in the fields

xi

xii

## Contributors

of presidential communication, political communication, and the history and sociology of news. His most recent book, *Can Journalism Survive*? (Polity Press, 2012), is an ethnographic investigation of American newspaper newsrooms and an exploration of the future of journalism. Currently, he is working on a book manuscript, Journalism and the Public (Polity, forthcoming), and a long-term project on the evolution of regional online news systems in the United States.

**Michael Schudson** taught sociology and communication at the University of Chicago, 1976–80 and the University of California, San Diego, 1980–2009. Since 2006, part-time, and 2009 full-time, he has been a Professor of Journalism at Columbia University. Schudson is the author of eight books and editor of three others on the history and sociology of the American news media, the history of U.S. citizenship and political participation, and related topics. He is the co-author, with Leonard Downie, Jr., of a report commissioned by the Columbia School of Journalism, *The Reconstruction of American Journalism* (2009).

**Kari Steen-Johnsen** is a Research Director at the Institute for Social Research in Oslo, Norway. Her research interests include civil society, social capital, social media and the public sphere, and the conditions for free speech. Her latest publications include: "Social media and mobilization to offline demonstrations: Transcending participatory divides?" (with Bernard Enjolras & Dag Wollebæk, *New Media & Society*, 2012) and "After Utøya: How a High-Trust Society Reacts to Terror: Trust and Civic Engagement in the Aftermath of July 22" (with Dag Wollebæk, Bernard Enjolras & Guro Ødegård, *Political Science & Politics* 45: 2012).

Nikki Usher is an assistant professor at The George Washington University's School of Media and Public Affairs. Her work focuses on news in the digital age, with a particular emphasis on production studies. Dr. Usher's fieldwork has taken her across the U.S. and the world to newsrooms to learn about workflow, news values, news decision making and the internal, external and professional pressures on journalists. Her book, *Making News at The New York Times*, based on five months of ethnographic work at the news organization, won the Tankard Award for the Best Book of the Year from the Association for Education in Mass Communication and Journalism. She has published widely across top journals in Communication and Journalism Studies.

## Preface

In recent decades, there has been an unfortunate split between core social sciences and media studies. While journalism has virtually disappeared from the agenda of academic sociology, a massive new discipline has emerged around mass communication, sporting its own journals, paradigms, global meetings, and graduate schools. Tens of thousands of teachers and students in this new global discipline certainly constitute a potentially huge audience for innovative contributions to the field. But an inward-looking quality to debates in "media studies" makes much of its scholarly activity orthogonal to social theorizing and empirical sociology in their contemporary forms. The challenge for contemporary sociology is to find a way of speaking to the crisis of contemporary journalism in a language that is relevant to the vast and still-expanding discipline of media studies.

The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered aims to accomplish this feat by speaking in two languages – the widely understood language of fundamental social theory/sociology, on the one hand, and the discourse of "disciplinary journalism," on the other. The authors in this book are trained in sociology departments or in the handful of sociologically-oriented journalism schools, such as the Columbia School of Journalism, and most are housed in departments of journalism inside schools of media studies. Among such rare two-legged creatures, we have selected those most sophisticated in contemporary social theory and empirically based social science. Our volume's master theme addresses a contemporary crisis to which every media studient is attuned, but does so in a theoretical manner that bridges social science and media studies.

Among both the popular and academic media-studies books that address the current crisis in journalism, explanations have been one-sidedly focused on technology and economics – and, as a result, decidedly gloomy in their predictions: Meyer, *The Vanishing Newspaper: Saving Journalism in the Information Age* (University of Missouri Press, 2009, 2nd edition); Jones, *Losing the* 

xiii

xiv

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08525-1 - The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered: Democratic Culture, Professional Codes, Digital Future Edited by Jeffrey C. Alexander, Elizabeth Butler Breese and María Luengo Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

Preface

News: The Future of the News that Feeds Democracy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009); Mersey, Can Journalism be Saved? Rediscovering America's Appetite for News (Santa Barbara: Praeger, 2010); and McChesney and Pickard, Will the Last Reporter Please Turn Out the Lights: The Collapse of Journalism and What Can Be Done to Fix It (New York: The New Press, 2011).

Recently, a small number of more carefully academic conducted studies have emerged, which speak more broadly, and occasionally more hopefully, to the continuing role of journalism in democracy: Levy and Nielsen, eds., *The Changing Business of Journalism and Its Implications for Democracy* (Oxford: Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2010); Lloyd and Winter, eds., *Media, Politics and the Public* (Stockholm: Axel and Margaret Axson Johnson Foundation, 2012); Peters and Broesma, eds., *Rethinking Journalism: Trust and Participation in a Transfigured News Landscape* (Routledge 2012); and Franklin, ed., *The Future of Journalism: Developments and Debates* (London: Routledge, 2013).

Even these latter volumes, however, share many of the weaknesses of the first set. The Future of Journalism, which includes the best research works presented at previous conferences on the "Future of Journalism" - originally published as special issues of leading journals in the journalism studies field - rarely moves beyond techno-economic explanations of current problems. Most of its contributors are light years away from a cultural-sociological perspective, from an understanding of the "crisis in journalism" narrative as culturally constructed by long-standing, deeply-entrenched moral codes. Indeed, by looking only at distinctive national, political, and social contexts, the volume makes evident the shortcomings of such insistently noncultural frames. Its concentration on contextual variations seems responsive only to material factors, and the result is a decidedly determinist outlook. Our opposing form of argument, which places cultural commitments front and center, allows us to produce a more openended and also more hopeful argument. We suggest that the cultural codes driving new journalistic practices allow creative pathways to be discovered for sustaining journalistic commitments through digital technology and new organizational forms.

This volume's bridging qualities make it relevant, not only to journalism and media studies, but to key issues in contemporary sociology. In the last decade, sociology has produced only a handful of books devoted to journalism, and not a single volume among these concentrates squarely on the current digital crisis. If sociologists in sociology departments no longer specialize in journalism, however, they make frequent use of the products of journalism in their research and theorizing and are certainly avid consumers of journalism in their private lives. For all these reasons, *The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered* should generate wide interest inside the international sociology field.

The chapters in this book are original, researched and written for this thematic investigation. Each contributor is an academic specializing in journalistic practice;

## CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08525-1 - The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered: Democratic Culture, Professional Codes, Digital Future Edited by Jeffrey C. Alexander, Elizabeth Butler Breese and María Luengo Frontmatter More information

### Preface

each has a track record of major journal publications; and most have published research monographs with leading university presses. The editors have engaged with each contributor, working to shape their proposals to hue as closely as possible to the volume's core themes. Alexander's introduction is a major theoretical statement that develops a new perspective on the current crisis of journalism. Breese and Luengo provide core chapters laying out the historical and comparative perspectives that anchor the volume. They also co-author a conclusion that synthesizes the individual contributions, demonstrating how the chapters illuminate central themes even as they expose nuanced but substantial diversity of findings and opinions about the sources of crisis and the pathways beyond it.

Two points need mentioning in concluding this preface. The first is that the distinctiveness of our volume does not derive from its sociological qualities per se but, rather, from its taking the cultural turn. It is not only crisis-books in media studies that are one-sidedly materialist, but most of the small number of recent works on media in sociology itself. Pierre Bourdieu's neo-Marxist approach to journalism, exemplified in his polemic On Media (1999), explains the practice of journalism as a struggle for domination inside and outside the journalism "field," determinedly reducing the independent power of cultural discourses and the link between professional journalism and political democracy. The smaller band of new journalism scholars in American sociology have tended to follow in Bourdieu's path, for example, Benson and Neveu, eds., Bourdieu and the Journalistic Field (London: Polity 2005) and Eric Klinenberg, Fighting for Air: The Battle to Control America's Media (New York: Metropolitan). A most significant exception is Jacobs and Townsley, The Space of Opinion: Media Intellectuals and the Public Sphere (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), whose cultural-sociological approach and democracy-related theorizing is limited only by its neglect of the news side of journalism.

In arguing that theory and research shift from technology to culture, *The Crisis of Journalism Reconsidered* is bound to be controversial. For common sense and academic conventional wisdom, it seems blindingly obvious that the contemporary crisis of journalism is triggered by technology and powered by economics. Our position goes against this tide, but it does so by riding the rising wave of the cultural turn in the human sciences, the growing centrality of cultural sociology, and new theorizing about the civil sphere.

With these brief remarks, we submit this collective thinking about the democratic culture that sustains journalism, its professional codes, and its digital future for your consideration.

# Acknowledgments

In the summer of 2013, we invited leading communications and social science scholars to join us in a project to interrogate the crisis narrative in journalism. Thanks to their interest, diligence, and intellectual generosity with us and with each other, the contributors to this volume have become our colleagues.

In May of 2014 a two-day meeting, hosted and funded by the Social Trends Institute was held at the IESE Business School in Barcelona, which immensely strengthened our collaboration and this book. We especially thank Carlos Cavallé, Ana Marta González, and Tracey O'Donnell for joining us for engaging and challenging sessions, which made it possible for us to work out new understandings face-to-face.

We thank Springer and the editors of the Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences for giving us permission to reprint our three individual contributions.

- The Editors

xvii