

INDEX

Abi-Saab, Georges, 465, 504, 529, 534, Allbeury, Kerry, 57 561-2 amendment rules, WTO agreements, Abkhazia, 296 382 access to justice amicus curiae briefs basic WTO principle, 198-9, 204 admissibility, 50 WTO agreements, 198-9 Appellate Body Accessions Division anarchic procedure, 462 Franco's account, 180 consensus decision, 458 Milthorp's account, 292-6 controversy, 370, 471 Acheson, Dean, 4 impact, 55, 106 Advisory Centre on WTO Law legal basis, 306 (ACWL), 68, 71, 105, 349 DSU and, 306, 550 Agreement on Agriculture General Council and, 376-7 frequency of disputes, 413 Analytical Index GATT principles, 95 Cook's account, 52, 424-33 negotiations, 171-2 evolution, 17, 52, 430-2 agriculture GATT, 17, 38, 52, 96, 139, 425-8 Agreement. See Agreement on Ehlermann and, 186, 187, 240 Agriculture history, 96, 425-30 Agriculture Division. See Agriculture LAD function, 139, 379-80, 403 Division public access to, 432 GATT disputes, 145-9, 151-2, 176-9 WTO, 379-80, 424, 428-30 GATT negotiations, 94, 152-3 Anan, Kofi, 62 quotas, 163 Andean Community, 206, 417 Anderson, Robert, 53, 275-90 Agriculture Division 1970s, 26-7, 119 Annecy Ministerial Conference (1949), 1980s, 33, 176-9 92 confidentiality, 152 anti-dumping creation, 145-9 1980s, 120-1 dispute settlement role, 35, 120, 124, access to justice, 198 145-9, 176-9 conciliation, 210, 211 Franco's account, 176-9 frequency of disputes, 412 aircraft subsidies, 411, 414 GATT Code, 22, 120 Al-Khasawaneh, Awn Shawkat, 435 **GATT** disputes Article VI as exception or remedy, ALADI (Latin American Integration 218 - 20Association), 417 Algeria, Evian Accords, 24 early disputes, 115–16, 211



630 INDEX

anti-dumping (cont.)	early years, 45–51, 370–2
evolution, 208–20	building reputation, 451–5
interpretation rules, 217	challenges, 449–51
issues, 213–20	Ehlermann's account, 482-506
Koulen's account, 208-20	first members, 47–8, 449–50
later disputes, 208-20	improvement on GATT, 491-3
list, 211	Lacarte-Muró's account, 477–8
number and complexity, 209	minority opinions, 478–9
preliminary objections, 217–18	quality of decisions, 451–5
standard of review, 216–17	Steger's account, 447–65
Tokyo Round agreements/GATT	Ehlermann, See Ehlermann,
relationship, 213–16	Claus-Dieter
Kennedy Round, 116, 118	enforcement power, 548, 549
Tokyo Round, 193	English as working language, 567–9
US GATT disputes, 223–4	evolution, 606–7
zeroing practices, 169, 200, 502, 580	fairness, 459–60, 468, 470–1
anti-legalism. See legalism	foundational principles, 48, 459-60
Antigua and Barbuda, US dispute, 71,	increased workload, 616–22
397	impact, 618–21
Appellate Body	solutions, 621–2
advantage, 420	independence, 69-71, 106, 450, 625
amicus curiae briefs	authority and, 467–8, 469–70
admissibility, 50	EC – Asbestos and, 461 – 2
anarchic procedure, 462	impartiality and, 460-2
consensus decision, 458	term of office and, 463–4
controversy, 370, 471	international law and, 508–16
impact, 55, 106	international reputation, 56, 448,
appointments, 270	451–5
authority	International Trade Court, 56, 482,
achievements, 543–6	547–9
acting within powers, 468, 473-5	interpretative approach, 533-41, 560
due process and, 470–1	avoidance of activism, 370, 537,
fairness and, 468	543
Ganesan's account, 527-46	constructive ambiguity, 480-1
independence and, 467–8, 469–70	cryptic reports, 243
meaning of authority, 466–9	formalism, 474
quality of reasoning, 451–5, 468,	free trade principles, 540–1
471–3, 541–2	scrutiny of facts, 537–9
reasonable time, 468–9	textualism, 51, 431, 535-7,
Unterhalter's assessment, 469	539–40, 543
Baptista's account, 559-69	jurisdiction
description of colleagues, 561–4	compulsory jurisdiction, 492–3,
budget, 70	522, 549
compliance. See compliance (WTO	issues of law, 322, 448, 538
dispute settlement)	legitimacy, 451–5
costs, 552	Matsushita's account, 547-58
critics, 569	members, 69–70, 448
cross-appeals, 617	diversity, 566-7
- *	•



INDEX 631

expenses, 469 criticism of panel reports, 371-2, first members, 449-50, 464 375, 501 part-time membership, 448, cryptic reports, 243 454-5, 463-4 dissenting opinions and, 48, 478-9, 531, 555-7 selection process, 560–1 term of office, 463-4, 469 drafting, 498 modest facilities, 560 evidence not used in panel reports, overruling decisions, 73, 396 550 - 1precedents, 308, 473, 501, 552 finality, 557-8 private counsel representation, 55, individual opinions, 48, 619-20 positive vs negative consensus, 501 procedures, 448, 455-60 quality of reasoning, 451-5, 468, autonomy, 470 471-3, 541-2 Baptista's account, 564-6 Secretariat, 112, 452-4 collegiality, 457-9, 478-9, 494, achievements, 544-5 500, 504-5, 529-31, 565 effectiveness, 563–4 confidential proceedings, 471 Ehlermann's experience, 493–5 consensus, 496-7, 531 issues papers, 494 differences with panels, 498-502 standard of review, 458, 474 divisions, 456-7 third-parties, 460, 496 due process, 459-60, 470-1 twenty-first century, Ganesan's Ehlermann's account, 489-91, account, 517-46 uniqueness, 447, 547-8 exchange of views, 47, 453, 457, Unterhalter's assessment, 466-75 470-1, 479, 496-7, 500, 529-31, Uruguay Round negotiations 551-4, 564-5 background, 524-7 fairness, 459-60, 468, 470-1 motivations, 447, 463, 548 Ganesan's account, 528-33 negative consensus, 303-4 issues, 550-8 success, 476-7 length of proceedings, 468-9, 606, useful previous EC experience, 502-4 615, 618 Vienna Convention and, 370-1, length of submissions, 346-7 473-4, 480 notices of appeal, 495 arbitration oral hearings, 455-6, 470, 479-80, ICSID, 414, 421, 570-1 495-6, 531-3 international commercial private proceedings, 105, 471 arbitration, 198, 381, 571 questions and answers, 496 retaliation arbitrations, 366-7, 398, rotation of members, 456–7 404, 421 transparency, 459-60, 471 Argentina, Argentina – Textiles and written submissions, 470 Apparel, 48 quality of decisions, 451-5, 468, Aristotle, 60 471-3, 541-2 Armenia, 285 regulation of dispute settlement Armstrong, Wade, 260, 263 procedures, 168 ASEAN, 418 remand power and, 474, 554–5 Australia reports ITO negotiations, 6, 7 adoption, 268, 467, 469, 521, subsidy on ammonium sulphate and 547 - 8Australia, 142-3



INDEX

632 Australia (cont.) Bridgman, Tessa, 52, 245 WTO disputes Brussels Ministerial Meeting (1990), Australia – Apples, 588 40, 228, 301, 304 Australia - Salmon, 357, 362 Bulgaria, accession, 139 Tobacco Plain Packaging Act, 408 Burgh House Principles, 70 WTO panellists from, 328 business Austria, Greek dispute on refractory rule of law and, 344 bricks, 25, 136 use of private lawyers in WTO, 347-8 Azevêdo, Roberto, 298, 339 WTO dispute settlement and, 345 Bacchus, James, 50, 449, 507-16, 529, CACM (Central American Common 532, 561, 562, 567 Market), 206, 417 Bagwell, K., 238 CAFTA-DR (Dominican Baker, Daniel Ari, 1–59, 112–28, Republic-Central 434-43 America-United States RTA), 417 balancing rights, private and public Canada interests, 197-200 Baldwin, R. E., 238 **GATT** disputes Bali Ministerial Conference (2013), 58, Canada – Eggs, 145 Canada – FIRA, 225, 233 72-3, 74, 108, 234, 628 Baptista, Luiz Olavo, 47, 559-69 Canada - Ice Cream and Yoghurt, Barfield, C., 242 148 Barthel-Rosa, Paulo, 246, 256 potato exports to US, 115 Bates, Ian, 131 US - Canadian Pork, 123, 218-19 Bautista, Lilia, 563 ITO negotiations, 5, 97 Beeby, Christopher, 449 South African dispute, 37 Uruguay Round and dispute Belgium GATT dispute, 191 settlement, 303 ITO negotiations, 6 WTO disputes tax system, 102, 191 Canada - Dairy, 589 Bentham, Jeremy, 317 Canada – Patent Protection, 375 Canada – Patent Term, 517 Berne Convention, 512 Canada - Periodicals, 550-1 bilateral agreements. See free trade agreements early years, 354 Bingham, Tom, 103 EC - Hormones, 360 Biodiversity Convention, 514 US/Canada - Continued Blackhurst, Richard, 188 Suspension, 360, 440 Blair House Agreement (1992), 42, WTO origins and, 39, 229 225, 230, 231 WTO panellists from, 328 Bossche, Peter Van den, 465, 508, 509, Cancún Ministerial Conference (2003), 511, 524, 527 277 Brauner, Karl, 623-8 capacity building, 375, 378 CARICOM, 206, 417 Brazil Brazil – Desiccated Coconut, 48, 357 Carlisle, Charles Roger, 125 Brazil - Internal Taxes, 9-10, 142 cartels, export cartels, 284 Brazil - Retreaded Tyres, 205 Castren, Kaarlo, 58, 616-22 judicial system, 559 Castro, Jorge, 57, 401 US - Upland Cotton and, 393, 398 causality requirement, 243



INDEX 633

Center for International Environmental Law, 306 Center for Marine Conservation, 306 Central American Common Market (CACM), 417 Chile Australian subsidy on ammonium sulphate and, 142-3 Chile - Price Band System, 593-4 EC - Apples (Chile I), 153-4 WTO panellists from, 328 China GPA ratification, 285 status, 139 WTO accession, 39, 52, 175, 293, 294, 295, 380 WTO dispute settlement and, 391–2 WTO disputes China – Auto Parts, 396, 581 China – Intellectual Property Rights, 396 China – Publications and Audio-visual Products, 396, 578 US disputes, 396-7 US – Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties (China), 586-8 Chinese Taipei, 285, 294, 391-2 Christie, Bruce, 286 CITES, 514 citizens, WTO dispute settlement and, 203 - 7Cobden, Richard, 88 Cobden-Chevalier Treaty (1860), 88 Committee on Trade and Development, 21 common law, 5-7, 22-4, 86, 562 competition 1997–2004 Working Group, Anderson's account, 276–84 development and, 289 Mexico - Telecoms, 280-1 RTA provisions, 279–80 state-owned enterprises, 284 telecoms, 280-1 compliance (WTO dispute settlement) asymmetric power, 416 compliance rate, 67–8, 414–16

implementation of decisions, 267–8, 269 issues, 610-11 rate, 67-8, 414-16 reports, 415, 452 sequencing, 270, 271, 365-7, 375 surveillance mechanism, 415-16, 419 suspension of concessions, 421, 548 arbitrations, 366-7, 398, 404, 421 no unilateral actions, 521, 524 sequencing, 270, 271, 365-7, 375 Uruguay Round negotiations, 172 time, 415, 452, 521 conciliation, 15–16, 83, 167, 190–5, 210, 211 Conference Affairs Division, 95, 117 consensus Appellate Body and, 496-7, 531 minority opinions, 48, 478-9, 531, 555 - 7GATT dispute settlement, 270, 302, 361, 476, 548 negative consensus advantages, 270, 302-4, 492-3 Appellate Body report adoption, 303-4, 469, 476, 547-8 Article 2.4 DSU, 521 effect, 476 importance, 623 meaning, 266, 469 positive vs negative consensus, 501 timing, 356 qualified majority voting and, 382-3 WTO vs GATT dispute settlement, consultations adequacy, 356-7 dispute settlement, 266 effective mechanism, 413 number of requests, 407–8 period, 394 Consultative Group of Eighteen, 163 context, Vienna Convention and, 579-81 Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals, 514 Cook, Graham, 17, 52, 424-33



634 INDEX

Corn Laws, 88 deliberative democracy, 201 corruption, threat to international rule democratic legitimacy, 199 of law, 62 developing countries 1960s GATT and, 20-1 cosmopolitanism, 200-3 Cossy, Mireille, 53, 300-10 ACWL and, 105 Costa Rica, WTO disputes, US capacity-building, 375 Underwear, 460 competition negotiations and, 280, Council of Representatives, 145, 147, 282 - 3Enabling Clause, 152 Court of Justice of the European Union fish exports, 176 (CJEU), 206, 207, 417, 488, GATT membership, 93 justifying protectionism, 108 crimes against humanity, 62 least-developed countries, 104, 384, Croome, John, 230 410 self-definition, 104 cross-appeals, 495, 617 Cuba, GATT dispute, 141 transitional provisions, 384 TRIPS, medicines and, 395 customary rules of treaty interpretation. See also Vienna Uruguay Round, 519 Convention on the Law of use of WTO dispute settlement, 398, Treaties 409 - 10Appellate Body and, 370-1, 473-4, WTO panellists from, 327 533-5 development contribution to treaty competition and, 289 interpretation, 570-95 WTO rules and, 287-8 balancing private and public rights, Dewost, Jean-Louis, 484 Dicey, A. V., 64, 103 GATT dispute settlement and, 431 Dillon Round (1960-1), 18-19, 93 anti-dumping, 217 diplomacy later disputes, 209 diplomatic capture vs cosmopolitan neglect, 188 public reason, 200-3 lawyers vs diplomats and, 383 diplomats vs lawyers, 299 Franco's account, 180-1 principles of justice, 204 textualism, 166 interpretation of WTO Uruguay Round negotiations, 525 agreements, 383 Vienna Convention and, 170, 204, Seattle/Doha period, 377-80 GATT dispute settlement, 11, 12-18, WTO interpretations, 421, 467, 508, 65-6, 82-4, 185-6 pragmatism, 300, 334 Customs Valuation Agreement, access Director-General to justice, 198 See also individual directors GATT, 31, 38, 175 Czako, Judith, 127 Czechoslovakia, GATT dispute, 142 WTO. See Director-General (WTO) Director-General (WTO) advising, 599-603 Davey, William, 48, 126, 353-73, 380, 399, 449, 455, 465 informing, 599-601 decision-making. See consensus LAD assistance to, 395, 402, 609 decolonisation, 18 legal assistants, 57-8 Delaume, George, 570 Legal Counsel to the Administration

and, 338

democracy



INDEX 635

panel selection, 69, 316-19, 381 neutral experts, 236-7 staff responsibility, 262 Panel on Complaints, 12-13, 15, trade disputes and, 601, 602 trade negotiations, 601-2 Panel on Conciliation, 15, 145 dispute settlement panels. See panels (GATT) DSU. See Dispute Settlement politics vs law, 29 Understanding (DSU) practices, 151-60, 183, 188-90 GATT. See dispute settlement pragmatism, 183, 263, 300, 334 rule of law, strengthening, 166-71 (GATT) ICJ, 407, 421 Rules, 39-40 ICSID, 414, 421, 570-1 stare decisis and, 16 ITLOS, 408, 421 Tokyo Round, 30-1, 37, 99, 100-1, ITO, 3-8, 96, 97, 98, 141, 190, 477 191, 210 civil vs common law jurisdictions, unilateral actions, 476, 485, 519, 523 - 4NAFTA. See NAFTA dispute Williams's account, 96 settlement dispute settlement (WTO) public reason, 195-7 2002-14 period, 54-8 regional systems, 206, 416-20 Wilson's experience, 389-99 transition period, 254-5 abuse of system?, 344-7 WTO. See dispute settlement (WTO) Appellate Body. See Appellate Body dispute settlement (GATT) binding nature, 172-3 1948-50 period, 8-12 caseload 1950s, 12-18 frequent use, 407-9 impact, 618-21 1960s, 18 increase, 348-9, 616-22 1970s, 27-9, 31 solutions, 621-2 1980s, 33-8, 120-3, 176-9 failures, 223-6 citizens' rights, 203-7 legacy of later disputes, 232-5 compliance. See compliance (WTO Petersmann's account, 190-5 dispute settlement) Porges's account, 223-6, 232-5 confidentiality, 323, 471, 614 1989-95, 38-9, 43 consultations, 266 Milthorp's account, 291-2 adequacy, 356-7 period, 394 Porges's account, 226-32 confidentiality, 152, 432 costs, 348-9, 419 consensus, 270, 302, 361, 476, minimising, 612-13 548 diplomacy vs law, 180-1 Council of Representatives, 145, disciplining agreements, 241-2 147 distribution of documents, 256-7 diplomatic system, 11, 12–18, 65–6, DSB. See Dispute Settlement Body 82-4, 185-6 (DSB) Director-General's role, 31 DSU. See Dispute Settlement early period, 96 Understanding (DSU) Schröder's account, 141-50 early years, 353-73 EEC's attitude to, 484-5 adoption of practices, 256-9 international rule of law and, 65-6 controversial cases, 367–9 judicial economy, 361 extensive usage, 354–5 LAD support, 404 pragmatical implementation of management approach, 164 DSU, 355-67



636 INDEX

dispute settlement (WTO) (cont.) Mueller-Holyst's account, 264–72 enforcement power, 548, 549 secrecy, 272, 614 ethics, 259-63 stages, 265-8 evolution, 604-8 regulation by Appellate Body, 168 Rules of Conduct, 259-63 foundational principles, 48 good faith, 542 Seattle/Doha period funding, 348-9, 419 cases, 375-6 future, 73-5, 309-10 lawyers vs diplomats, 377-80 GATT consensus and, 476 Secretariat support, 271 implementation of decisions, 267-8, success, 105, 309 Bacchus on, 516 improving, 380-5 broad participation, 409-10 international rule of law and, 65-75 compliance rate, 67–8, 414–16 judicial/political imbalances, 505-6 effectiveness, 413 jurisdiction, 572–3 efficiency, 413-14 LAD documentation, 403 frequent use, 407-9 legal certainty, 184, 196, 199, 207 measuring, 407–22 legalisation trend, 342–3 miracle, 464 legitimacy, 419 respected case law, 420-2 limited public reason, 195-7 RTA comparisons, 416-20 Wilson's account, 396-8 trust in system, 411–12 mediation, 421 surveillance mechanism, 415-16, member-driven organisation, 419 394 - 5third-party contributions, 266-7, mutual agreements, numbers, 420 410-11, 460, 496 negative consensus rule, 266, 270, unpredictable outcomes, 345-6 Uruguay Round, 172-3, 194-5, 302-4, 356, 469, 476, 492-3, 501, 521, 547-8, 623 301-5, 520-7 negotiations, 172-3, 194-5 vitality, 627 new elements, 353 Dispute Settlement Body (DSB) non-violations complaints, 304-5 adoption of Appellate Body reports, notifications, 613 268, 467, 521, 547-8 panels. See panels (WTO) forum, 265, 269 participation functions, 264-9 developing countries, 409-10 LAD assistance to, 402 third parties, 266-7, 410-11, 460, meetings, 265 membership, 106 top ten complainants, 410 monitoring role, 265 top ten respondents, 410 quasi-automatic decision-making, parties, 324 270-1, 303, 548 politics, 345 reverse consensus, 266, 270, 302-4, pragmatism, 355-67, 394 356, 469, 476, 492–3, 501, 521, precedents, 49, 308, 420, 473, 501, 547-8,623 552 Dispute Settlement Understanding private lawyers' role, 347-8 (DSU) procedures achievements, 194-5 adoption, 256-9 Article 1.1 (jurisdiction), 572 Cossy's account, 305-9 Article 2.4 (reverse consensus), 521



INDEX 637

7), Article 16.4 (adoption of panel

Article 3 (security and predictability), 184, 196, 199, 204, 207 Article 3.2 (customary rules of interpretation), 383, 467, 508, 521, 522, 529, 533–5, 573, 575 Article 3.3 (prompt settlement of disputes), 521 Article 3.7, 521 Article 3.10 (good faith), 542 Article 4.7 (requests for panel), 355 Article 4.8 (urgent disputes), 357 Article 6.1 (automatic panel establishment), 355, 356 Article 6.2 (panel establishment and consultations), 356, 358, 541 Article 7.1 (panel standard terms of reference), 357-8, 541 Article 7.2 (subject jurisdiction), 572 Article 7.3 (panel special terms of reference), 357-8 Article 8 (panel composition), 266, 381 Article 8.1, 323 Article 8.2, 325, 326 Article 8.3, 320, 381 Article 8.6, 313, 314, 380, 402 Article 8.7, 312, 316, 381 Article 8.8, 324 Article 8.9, 323 Article 8.10, 321, 322 Article 10.2 (written submissions), Article 11 (panel mandate), 322, 325, 438, 474, 522, 542, 572, 617 Article 12.2 (automatic closure), 155 Article 12.7 (panel reasoning), 522 Article 12.8 (report time limits), 364 Article 12.9 (circulation of reports), 364 Article 12.10 (consultation period), 394 Article 13 (expert evidence in panel proceedings), 306, 436-8 Article 13.2, 359 Article 15 (interim review), 362 Article 15.2, 363

reports), 324, 448 Article 17 (Appellate Body), 46, 447, 448, 606-7 Article 17.1, 448, 456, 467, 528, 529, 553, 572 Article 17.2 (members' term of office), 463-4 Article 17.3 (independence), 461, 470, 499 Article 17.4 (third-party rights), 460 Article 17.5 (length of proceedings), Article 17.6 (issues of law), 322, 467, 538, 550, 572 Article 17.7 (administrative support), 469, 545 Article 17.8 (expenses), 470 Article 17.9 (procedures), 448, 470, 528, 551 Article 17.11 (anonymous opinions), 498, 531, 619 Article 17.13 (decision powers), 554 Article 17.14 (adoption of reports), 467, 521 Article 21.1 (prompt compliance), 415, 521 Article 21.3 (compliance reports), 415, 452 Article 21.5 (compliance measures), Article 22 and, 270, 365-7 sequencing, 270, 271, 365-7, 375 Article 21.6 (surveillance), 415–16 Article 22 (suspension of concessions), 521 Article 21.5 and, 270, 365-7 Article 22.6, 404 Article 22.8, 521 Article 23 (jurisdiction), 204, 521 Article 25 (arbitration), 421 Article 26 (non-violation complaints), 304-5 Article 27.1 (legal advice to panels), 322, 404, 406 Appendix 3 (timelines), 363 Appendix 4 (expert evidence), 437 Cossy's account, 300-10

Article 15.3, 362



638 INDEX

Dispute Settlement Understanding (DSU) (cont.)	Uruguay Round negotiations, 40, 194
development, 44 Doha Round and, 481	Duthie, Lindsay, 81
formalism, 626	economists, 81
gaps, 550	EFTA Court, 206, 417
legal value of established practice,	Eggert, M., 145
258	Egypt, 261
pragmatical implementation, 355–67	Ehlermann, Claus-Dieter
transition period, 254–5	Appellate Body
Uruguay Round negotiations, 172–3, 194–5, 520–7	application for membership, 486–9
Cossy's account, 301–5	collegiality, 504–5
Ganesan's account, 501–7	compulsory jurisdiction, 492–3,
dissenting opinions, Appellate Body,	522
48, 478–9, 531, 555–7	early years, 482–506
Doha Declaration on TRIPS and Public	improvement on GATT, 491–3
Health, 384, 606–7	original members, 449
Doha Ministerial Conference (2001),	procedures, 47, 489–91
54, 374–5	Secretariat, 493–5
Doha Round	useful previous EU experience,
amendment rules and, 381	502–4
distrust of WTO Secretariat, 194	GATT experiences, 482–6
DSU amendment, 481	judicial/political imbalances, 505–6
impasse, 74, 176, 309, 506	social anecdote, 507
legal vetting of drafts, 385–6	success of WTO dispute settlement,
objective, 108	464, 526
problems, 108	El-Naggar, Said, 449
Doyle, Arthur Conan, 275, 289	Elsig, M., 489
Dunkel, Arthur	Enabling Clause, 152, 296
appointment as Director-General,	endangered species, 514
103	environmental protection, WTO law
appointments, 33, 35, 133, 138, 184,	and, 515
226	equality before the law, 62, 63, 64, 71,
Dunkel drafts, 230	435, 438, 443
formalisation of dispute settlement,	estoppel, 550
83	European Commission, legal advice,
GATT Secretariat reorganisation,	51
33–5, 119, 124	European Community
Legal Affairs Division and, 168–9	1960s development, 18
creation, 120, 122, 166, 173, 187	agricultural subsidies disputes, 120,
location, 192	121
reason for creation, 232	anti-dumping dispute with Japan,
mediation, 157	213–16
Tokyo Round, agriculture	Appellate Body and
negotiations, 153	composition, 449–50, 489
trade remedies and, 190	useful previous EC experience,
university career, 188	502–4



INDEX 639

C A 1 1 D. 1 150	T (1 C . T 1 1
Common Agricultural Policy, 158,	Transatlantic Trade and
485	Investment Partnership, 506
Dillon and Kennedy Rounds, 93	Uruguay Round negotiations,
free trade agreements, 418	230
GATT and	WTO disputes, 368, 396
approaches, 22, 164	Uruguay Round and, 485–6, 519
consistency, 16	WTO disputes
dispute settlement, 101, 484–5	EC – Asbestos, 305–6, 376, 459,
EEC Treaty, 502–3	461–2, 531
negotiations, 81–2	EC – Bananas, 149, 368, 397
GATT disputes, 191	EC – Bananas III, 48, 270, 359,
EC – Bananas III, 368–9	364, 365–7, 395, 582
EEC – Animal Feed Proteins, 146	EC – Bed Linen (Article 21.5 –
EEC – Apples (Chile I), 153–4	India), 592
EEC – Beef Imports, 148	EC – Chicken Cuts, 540, 581, 584,
EEC – Citrus, 37, 148, 156–9, 193	585, 591–2
EEC – Measures on Animal Feed	EC – Civil Aircraft, 586
Proteins, 27	EC – Computer Equipment, 590
EEC – Minimum Import Prices,	EC – Hormones, 360, 362–4,
147–8	368–9, 370, 504, 577, 610
<i>EEC – Oil Seeds</i> , 228, 234	EC – Poultry, 591
EEC – Parts and Components, 225,	EC – Sardines, 376
233	EC – Seal Products, 345
EEC – Pasta Subsidies, 35, 177, 178,	EC – Tariff Preferences, 593
189	extensive use of system, 354
EEC – Subsidies on Wheat Flour,	retaliation, 172
178	WTO origins and, 39, 229
EEC – Sugar Exports, 148, 225	WTO panellists from, 328, 329
EEC – Wheat Flour Subsidies,	WTO ratification, 180
121	European Court of Justice, 206, 207,
practices, 188–9	417, 488, 549
New Commercial Policy Instrument	Evans, Guy, 127
(1984), 224	Evenett, Simon, 279
Office of Legal Affairs and, 137,	Evian Accords, 24
138	expert evidence
origins, 16	consultation, 440
trade liberalisation and, 84	future, 442–3
United States and	legal basis, 436–8
1970s disputes, 27–8	length of process, 441–2
1992 aircraft agreement, 586	meetings, 441
agriculture, 225	panel proceedings, 359–61,
Appellate Body membership, 449	434–43
Blair House Accord, 42, 225	panel reports, 441
compliance to dispute settlement,	procedure, 306, 438–42
353	selection of experts, 439–40
role of GATT, 20	written questions, 440–1
role of lawyers, 137	WTO dispute settlement, 343
steel disputes, 223	export cartels, 284
51551 disp atco, 225	



640

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08523-7 - A History of Law and Lawyers in the GATT/WTO: The Development of the Rule of Law in the Multilateral Trading System Edited by Gabrielle Marceau Index More information

INDEX

fairness financial services, panellists' Appellate Body, 459-60, 470-1 experience, 322 frequency of disputes, 413 authority and, 468 GATT/WTO value, 2 LAD and Uruguay Round negotiations, 171 Farias, R. de Souza, 23 Feliciano, Florentino, 449, 491, 504, new ground, 485 non-violation complaints, 304 Finland, GATT disputes, New Zealand Reference Paper, 281 - Finnish Transformers, 213 regional trade agreements and, 296 Flory, Thiébaut, 137 schedules, 171 formalism GATT (1947) Appellate Body, 474 'à la carte' system, 301, 302 GATT avoidance of, 187 Analytical Index. See Analytical Index increasing WTO formalism, 335 decision-making, 79-80 forum shopping, 304, 528 dispute settlement. See dispute Fox, Eleanor, 281 settlement (GATT) France economists, 81 EEC Treaty and, 502-3 agriculture and, 132 Cobden-Chevalier Treaty (1860), Havana Charter and, 3-4, 427 institutional approach, 163-4 88 GATT dispute, 191 interim arrangement, 8, 190, 301, GATT origins and, 90 519 ITO negotiations, 6 international law and, 507-8 tax system, 102 landmark, 605 Franco, Renzo, 24, 26, 32, 175-81 legal relationship with Tokyo Round free trade agreements codes, 213-16 competition provisions, 279-80 legitimacy, 11 dispute settlement, 416-20 management approach, 162-4 fork in the road, 418 origins, 85-6 EC-US, 506 fragility, 86 ideas, 87 Milthorp's account, 296-7 private investor arbitration, 198 institutions, 91-2 scope of dispute settlement, 419 objective, 87-8 trend, 506, 570 original members, 86 functionalism, 161 personalities, 90 principles and rules, 88-90 Ganesan, A.V., Appellate Body successes, 92-5 Baptista's reminiscences, 562 survival, 86 contribution to new dispute system, US leadership, 87 43, 527-46 pragmatism, 183, 263, 300, 334 creation, 45, 47, 524-7 quasi-relational contract, 238–9 membership, 465, 517-46, 561 rule of law. See rule of law (GATT) textualism, 51, 535-7, 539-40 scope, 518-19 Secretariat. See Secretariat (GATT) Gardener, Richard, 162 GATS transition to WTO access to justice, 198 dispute settlement, 254-5 achievement, 107 legal context, 248-51 disputes, 307-8 legal problems, 247-8



INDEX 641

transfer of assets, 255 government procurement transition decisions, 251-3 2005-14 negotiations, Anderson's Williams's account, 85–108 account, 284-7 competition, 283-4 WTO and, 520 GATT (1994) GPA and access to justice, 198 exceptions, 537, 538 GPA membership, 285 frequency of disputes, 412 Greece, Austrian dispute on refractory GATT (1947) and, transition bricks, 25, 136 problems, 247-8 green room, 374 regional trade agreements and, Gundelach, Finn Olva, 34, 132 296 GATT Basic Instruments and Selected Harmonised Commodity Description Documents, 16, 186, 192 and Coding System, 581 GATT Council, 18, 92 Harrington, Ollie, 19 'GATT Rules', 124 Havana Charter General Council dispute settlement, 96, 97, 98, 141, adoption of Appellate Body reports, 190, 477 effectiveness, 557-8 failure, 85, 114 amicus curiae briefs and, 376-7 GATT and, 114, 427 DSB function, 264 negotiations, 3-7 EC – Asbestos and, 461–2 distrust of lawyers, 292 Implementation-Related Issues and priorities, 4 Concerns and, 384-5 US refusal to ratify, 548 interpretation of Agreements, headquarters, 339 Henkin, Louis, 67 exclusive authority, 583 Hillman, Jennifer, 16, 49, 60-75, 506, interpretation of WTO agreements, 383 563 legal basis of decisions, 51, 377 Hitler, Adolf, 106 Hobbes, Thomas, 201 General Division, functions, 117 Generalised System of Preferences, Hoda, Anwarul, 126, 179, 231 Hollis, Walter, 95 Holzen, Ernst von, 113 genocide, 62 Hudec, Robert Georgia, Abkhazia and South Ossetia, on 1970s GATT, 25-6 296 Germany on ad hoc panels, 12-13, 14 customs union (1834–1919), 183 on cross-cutting legal issues, 29 Dresden bombing, 161 on diplomatic approach, 11 GATT dispute with Norway, sardines, on early GATT Secretariat, 14, 16, 99, 144-5 18 Nazism and legality, 106 on EU policies, 22 status of Berlin, 19 on GATT disputes, 1980, 225 Gertler, Jeffrey, 39, 229, 230, 294 GATT Legal System and World Trade Gibson, Richard, 19 Diplomacy, 162, 200 on LAD creation, 239 Glanzmann, Hugo, 113 Goldstein, Marisa, 55, 434-43 on non-lawyers, 10 Goldstone, Richard, 63, 64 Office of Legal Affairs and, 137, good faith, DSU requirement, 542 Gosper, Bruce, 299 on Tokyo Round, 103, 224



INDEX

642 Hughes, Valerie, 56, 399, 400-23, 493, **International Competition Network** 545, 564 (ICN), 277, 278-9, 283 Human, Johann, 127 International Court of Justice (ICI) Human Resources Division (HRD), Havana Charter and, 4, 5-6, 7 independent judges, 462-3 human rights length of proceedings, 414 balancing private and public rights, number of cases, 407 197-200 opinions, 458 citizens' rights in WTO, 203-7 Registry, 494 rule of law and, 106 sources of law, 587 universalism, 196 WTO rulings and, 421, 435 WTO core principles and, 288 international government organisations (IGOs), legal WTO law and, 288–9, 515 advice, 337-8 Hussain, Arif, 125, 179, 293 International Labour Organisation Implementation-Related Issues and Administrative Tribunal (ILOAT), 297, 336, 337-8 Concerns, 384–5 independent judiciary international law ICJ, 462-3 customary rules of treaty international rule of law, 64 interpretation and, 585-8 GATT and, 507-8 WTO dispute settlement, 69-71 India independent judiciary and, 64 GATT dispute, India - Tax Rebates, LAD contribution to procedures, 141 43 WTO disputes WTO and, 508-16 EC - Bed Linen (Article 21.5 -International Law Commission, 576-7, 579, 586-8 India), 592 India – Patents, 362, 575, 577 International Monetary Fund (IMF), India - Quantitative Restrictions, 17, 165 368, 369 International Trade Organization (ITO). See Havana Charter third party, 460 US - Wool Shirts and Blouses, 361 International Tribunal for the Law of Intellectual Property Division, the Sea (ITLOS), 408, 421 Anderson's Account, 275-90 interpretation of WTO agreements Interim Commission for the Appellate Body International Trade approach, 533-41, 566 Organization (ICITO), 8, 91–2, constructive ambiguity, 480-1 111, 114, 255, 334 contribution to treaty interim reviews, early WTO years, interpretation, 570-95 362 - 3authority, 383 International Bar Association, 61, 64 customary rules. See customary rules International Centre for Settlement of of treaty interpretation Investment Disputes (ICSID), exclusive authority of Ministerial 414, 421, 570–1 Conferences/General Council, International Chamber of Commerce, languages and, 567 international commercial arbitration, teleology and, 540 198, 381, 571 IPIC Treaty, 512



INDEX 643

issues papers, 494 Kreier, Jesse, 126 Italy, trade disputes, 115, 227 Kuijper, Pieter Jan, 51–2, 374–88, 399, 465 Jackson, J. H., 22, 86, 103, 137, 210, 535 Kulacoglu, Vesile, 230 Janow, Merit, 562-3 labour rights, WTO law and, 515 Japan EEC anti-dumping dispute, 213-16 Lacarte-Muró, Julio **GATT** disputes Appellate Body Japan - Agricultural Products, 233 assessment, 492 Japan – Alcoholic Beverages, 233 beginnings, 48, 476-81 Japan - Semi-Conductors, 233 chair, 452, 490-1 Japan - Tobacco, 155 individual responsibility, 529 GATT membership, 92, 94 membership, 449 United States and automobiles, 224 procedures, 47, 528 WTO disputes diplomats and, 505 Japan – Alcoholic Beverages I, 534 on GATT dispute settlement, 98 influence, 464, 487, 490-1, 504, 526 Japan – Alcoholic Beverages II, 48, 492, 575, 577, 584 Uruguay Round negotiations, 194, Japan – Apples, 376 228-9, 230, 231 Japan - Film, 359, 364, 368, 369 Lamy, Pascal, 57, 339, 395, 442, 607 Jara, Alejandro, 55, 442, 604–15 Lavorel, Warren, 126, 246, 256, 465 Jenny, Frédéric, 277, 282 League of Nations, 88, 89 John, King, 60 least-developed countries, 104, 384, Joint Appeal Board, 336 410 Leddy, John, 91 judicial independence, 64, 69-71, 462 - 3Legal Affairs Division (LAD) Jung, Aegyoung, 57, 599-603 1989-95 period, 39-43, 123-7, 171-2 iustice Porges's account, 226-32 access to justice, 198-9, 204 contribution to international law, 43 GATT/WTO value, 2 creation, 33-7, 109-11, 119-20, 137, Vienna Convention and, 188, 197 166, 179 first years, 135-40 Kant, Immanuel, 183 mandate, 39, 239 Katz, Julius, 228 reasons, 225, 237 Kautzor-Schröder, Klaus, 33, 119, 120, rule of law, 185-90 125 digital registry, 387, 401 Kelly, William, 33, 119 documentation Kennedy, Matthew, 381 Analytical Index. See Analytical Kennedy Round (1964–67), 20, 22, 26, Index 93, 116, 118, 191 dispute settlement data, 403 Kenyon, Donald, 449 Status of Legal Instruments, 38, Kesavapany, K., 260 139, 186, 403 Keynes, John Maynard, 4 functions, 138-40 King, Martin Luther, 106 1980s, 121-3 assistance to Director-General, Korea, Korea - Beef, 148, 376 Kosovo, 337 395, 402, 609 Koulen, Mark, 32, 121, 122, 208-20 dispute settlement or legal affairs, Kraus, John, 113 608 - 10



644 INDEX

Legal Affairs Division (LAD) (cont.) WTO 2002-14 period, 54-8 documentation, 403 Wilson's experience, 389–99 WTO model and, 242-3 harmonising role, 168 mandate, 39, 239 WTO transition period and, 43, 44, outreach, 609 353 - 73panel support, 305-9, 402, 404-7 adoption of DSB practices, 256-9 scope of activities, 608 ethics of dispute settlement, technical assistance, 403 259-63 trade negotiations, 402 Marceau's account, 244-63 twenty-first century, 401-7 treaty succession problems, 247-8 independence, 168 Legal Counsel to the Administration Kuijper's experience, 374-88 assessment of role, 339-40 legal vetting, 385–6 creation of post, 335-6 legalism, 257–9 functions, 57, 112, 336-9 Lindén's account, 135-40 independence, 338 proactivity, 340 line management, 338 Mavroidis's account, 236-43 reactivity, 340 neutrality, 405-7 Renouf's account, 334-41 Legal Division, creation, 103 Porges's account, 223-35 legalism renaming, 38, 139, 168, 239 Roessler's account, 161-74 anti-legalism rule of law GATT system, 7, 185–7, 191, 291–2 dispute procedures, 166-71, Havana negotiations, 292 business and rule of law, 344 diplomacy and. See diplomacy from rule by law to rule of law, 182 - 5increasing legalism, 257-9, 342-3 Petersmann's account, 185-90 undermining rule of law, 349 Rules Division and, 387, 390, 625 pragmatism and Seattle/Doha period assessment, 624-6 assessment, 387-8 expert evidence, 443 WTO, 257-9 characteristics of the period, 374-88 specialisation trend and, 342-3 Kuijper's experience, 374-88 WTO legalisation of procedure, 343 lawyers vs diplomats, 377-80 like products, 226, 538, 550-1 thirtieth anniversary Lindén, Åke conference, 112, 400-1 account, 135-40 issues, 604-15 achievements, 400 trade remedy cases and, 168-9 death, 400 Uruguay Round and, 39–43, 171–2, on departmental responsibilities, 37, 239 - 40Porges's account, 228-32 director of Office of Legal Affairs, 35, van Tuinen's memories, 131-4 120, 166, 179, 239 vertical coordination, 243 functions, 52 Wilson's experience, 389-99 GATT career, 119, 126, 135, 166, 245 arrival, 389-90 GATT panel proceedings, 192 personal memories, 398–9 GATT Secretariat, 17 rule of law in challenging times, knowledge of GATT law, 398-9 390-8 legal background, 109, 390



INDEX 645

retirement, 123 role, 25 Tokyo Round, 118 track record, 35 Uruguay Round negotiations, 230 US vs EC views on GATT, 20 WTO ratification and, 180 Locke, John, 60 Lockhart, John, 561, 562 Long, Olivier appointments, 110 confidentiality and, 152 creation of Legal Division, 103, 161 diplomacy vs law, 180 GATT Director-General, 8, 24–5, GATT dispute settlement and, 83, 100 GATT origins, 114 legal background, 109, 183 legal oversight and, 57 role of law in GATT, 196-7 Tokyo Round, agriculture negotiations, 153 university career, 188 Lucq, Jean-Marc, 132, 145 Luyten, Paul, 14, 16, 17, 79-84, 137, 484, 624

Maggio, Giuseppe, 95, 98 Magna Carta (1215), 60 Malacrida, Reto, 55, 311-33 Malmgren, Harold, 94 management approach, 162-4 Marceau, Gabrielle, 1-59, 112-28, 244-63 Marrakesh Agreement, objectives, 107 Massur, Madan, 33 Mathur, Madan, 119, 230 Matsushita, Mitsuo, 49, 449, 547-58 Mavroidis, Petros, 53, 236-43, 428 mediation, WTO, 421 Melander, Johan, 99 member-driven organisation, 313, 314, 394-5, 526, 595 Mercier, Claude, 113

MERCOSUR, 206, 417 Mexico US-Mexico Agreement, 97 US - Tuna (Mexico), 513 US - Tuna II (Mexico), 579, 583, 588 MFN principle early GATT dispute, 141 GATT 1947 and GATT 1994, 247-8 original GATT Principle, 88-9 transition period, 44 Millán, Hector, 113, 230 Milthorp, Peter, 53, 291–9 Ministerial Conferences See also specific conferences adoption of Appellate Body reports, effectiveness, 557-8 'Implementation-Related Issues and Concerns', 384-5 interpretation of WTO agreements, 383, 583 minority opinions, Appellate Body, 48, 478-9, 531, 555-7 Montenegro, GPA and, 285 Montesquieu, Charles de, 161 Moore, Mike, 298 Morrison, Peter, 39, 229 Mueller-Holyst, Bozena, 246, 256, 264 - 72Multifibre Arrangement (MFA), 519 Murphy, Geraldine, 34, 52, 133, 138, 245, 380

NAFTA dispute settlement frequency of use, 417 interim reviews, 362 length of proceedings, 414 model, 43, 257 procedures, 454 state-to-state cases, 408 WTO forum alternative, 206 national treatment, original GATT Principle, 89 nationality, WTO panellists, 320–2, 327–8 negative consensus. See consensus Netherlands, GATT disputes, 102, 141, 191



INDEX

646 New Zealand confidentiality, 323, 614 GPA and, 285 early years, Davey's account, 353-73 New Zealand - Finnish Transformers, establishing, 266 agenda, 355-6 WTO panellists from, 328 consecutivity, 356 Niggli, Nicholas, 286 terms of references, 267, 357-8 non-lawyers expert evidence, 359-61, 434-43 development of GATT/WTO and, implementation of DSU, 355-62 624 - 5improving stability, 502 GATT disputes and, 29 independence, 69, 106, 325-6 ITO negotiations and, 7 interim reviews, 362-3 WTO advocates, 342 judicial economy vs extra issues, 361 WTO panellists, 322 LAD support, 401–2, 404–7, 420 non-tariff barriers, 90, 117-18, 165, Cossy's experience, 305–9 237 panel selection, 266 Norman, Terri, 147 aggregate results, 327–32 Norway chairpersons, 320 **GATT** disputes compelling reasons, 380 Germany and sardines, 99, 144-5 criteria, 314, 320 Norway - Apples and Pears, 228 DG stage, 316-19, 381 US - Norwegian Salmon AD, diversity of 212-13, 216-18, 220, 227 background/experience, 326-7 GATT documents and, 425 educational/professional background, 322 obiter dicta, 530 geographical diversity, 328–30 OECD, 278, 282, 382, 514 governmental status, 323-4, Office of Legal Affairs. See Legal Affairs 330 - 1Division (LAD) improving, 381, 387, 611-12, 615 Olmi, Giancarlo, 483 independence, 325-6 Orwell, George, 568 Indicative List, 269, 315 Oshima, Shotaro, 561, 563 law and practice, 320-32 Owada, Hisashi, 64 lawyers, 322 Malacrida's account, 311-33 nationality, 320-2, 327-8 Paemen, Hugo, 486 panels (GATT) numbers of panellists, 331 ad hoc panels, 13-14 pre-DG stage, 312-16 customary rules of interpretation prior panel experience, 326, 330 and, 431 process, 312-19 proceedings, 38 qualifications, 308-9 revolving door, 331 reports adoption and implementation, stages, 312 193 - 4subject expertise, 322-3, 330 procedures evolution, 209 positive consensus, 270, 302, 361, differences with Appellate Body, 476, 548 498-502 quality, 169-71, 232 early issues, 358-9 rejection, 226 private proceedings, 105 panels (WTO) specifying measures, 358-9



INDEX 647

timelines, 363-5 Plato, 60 written submissions, 460 Pollack, M. A., 489 remuneration, 406 Porges, Amelia 1990s GATT disputes, 39 reports adoption, 254, 267, 324 Analytical Index, 52, 428, 429 Appellate Body criticism of, 371–2, creation of Appellate Body, 45-6 375, 501 definition of GATT 1994, 247 confidentiality, 614 GATT career, 223 expert evidence, 441 historical survey, 1-59 quality, 396, 501-2 LAD and Uruguay Round, 223-35 reversal by Appellate Body, 396 LAD work, 39 statistics, 420 respect for legal correctness, 29-30 time limits, 364 Rules Division and, 113 unused evidence and Appellate Spain – Soyabean Oil, 33, 35 Body, 550-1 Portugal, colonialism, 559 terms of reference, 267, 357-8 Pre-Shipment Inspection Agreement, third-party rights, 460 access to justice, 198 Paris Convention, 512 precedents Peart, Desmond, 96 common vs civil law, 7 Pereyra, María, 55, 434-43 GATT disputes, 16, 227 Petersmann, Ernst-Ulrich WTO disputes, 49 1980s dispute settlement, 190-5 Appellate Body, 308, 473, 501, 552 predictability, 420 account, 182 Analytical Index, 52, 240, 427 preliminary objections, 209, 213, balancing private and public 217 - 18interests, 197-200 principles of WTO, human rights and, career, 166 288 citizens' rights, 203-7 public health, TRIPS waiver, 384, from rule by law to rule of law, 182-5 606 - 7judicial comity, 203-7 public procurement. See government LAD and rule of law, 185-90 procurement LAD and transition period, 244 public reason, 195-7, 200-3 LAD work, 38, 39 legal advice, 37-8 qualified majority voting, 382-3 legal officer, 96, 110, 138, 166, 239 quantitative methods, 342 pre-GATT career, 182-3, 185 quantitative restrictions, 17, 163 public reason cosmopolitan public reason, 200-3 Ramírez, Ricardo, 58, 616-22 limits of GATT/WTO dispute reciprocity, GATT Principle, 88 settlement, 195-7 regional trade agreements. See free role of law in GATT/WTO, 36, 182 trade agreements on Rules Division, 168 remand, Appellate Body power, 474, Uruguay Round, 229 554 - 5pharmaceuticals, TRIPS and, 395 Renouf, Alan, 8-9 Renouf, Yves, 52, 57, 334-41 Philippines, WTO disputes, Thailand -Cigarettes (Philippines), 578-9 res judicata, 555 Plank-Brumback, Rosine, 26, 37, 39, Research and Statistics Division, 33, 151 - 60119



648 INDEX

retaliation. See compliance (WTO human rights and, 106 dispute settlement) international rule of law reverse consensus. See consensus concept, 61-75 Robinson, Stuart, 21-2, 24, 36, 109-11, GATT dispute settlement, 65-6 161, 187, 239, 244 independent judiciary, 64, 69-71 Roessler, Frieder ITO and, 3-8 on 1980 reorganisation, 33, 35 Petersmann's account, 182 achievements, 399 WTO. See rule of law (WTO) appointments, 244 rule of law (GATT) career, 36, 173, 188 1948-50 period, 8-12 customary rules of treaty 1950s, 12-18 interpretation and, 188 Luyten's account, 79-84 definition of GATT 1994, 247 1960s, 18-25 division of legal responsibilities, 41, 1970s, 25-33, 165 42, 126 1980s, 33-8 on GATT and EEC, 484 1989-95, 38-43 GATT career, 138, 187 anti-legalism, 7, 185-7, 191, 292 GATT panel proceedings, 38, 169–71, dispute settlement 189, 192 1970s staff expansion, 29 influence, 452 diplomacy, 11, 12-18, 65-6, 82-4, LAD account, 161-74 LAD and transition period, 244, 246, Panel on Complaints, 12, 13–14 role of Secretariat, 8-9, 11-12, 31 LAD Director, 38, 123-4, 139, 187, strengthening, 166-71 239 early period, 2, 14-18, 117 on management approach to GATT first legal officer, 19-20 disputes, 28, 162-4 lawyers, 8-9 on reciprocity, 88 Williams's account, 95-103 role of law in GATT, 14, 36, 161-74 Franco's account, 180-1 transition decisions, 252 GATT culture, 80, 624 Uruguay Round, 229, 230 growing legalisation and, 349 Rome Convention, 512 institutional evolution, 112 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 183 Legal Division, creation, 103 Royer, Jean, 11, 18, 81, 115 legal research, 21-2 Rubin, S. J., 7 Long on, 196-7 rule-making, voting procedure, 75 Luyten's account, 79-84 rule of law non-dispute related legal work, business and, 344 16 - 18concept, 2, 60 politics vs law, 29 core elements, 63, 64 Robinson's account, 109–11 definitions, 103-4 transition to WTO, 43-54 domestic setting, 63–5 rule of law (WTO) 1995-2000 transition, 43-54 emergence of rule of law culture, 2 formalism, 187, 335 2002-14, 54-8 from rule by law to, 182-5 abuse of system?, 344-7 fundamental changes, 300 assessment, 624-6 GATT. See rule of law (GATT) broadly construed, 106-8 historical survey, 1-59 business and rule of law, 344



INDEX 649

employment rights, 297

challenging times, 390-8 science. See expert evidence compliance, 67–8 **SCM** Agreement dispute settlement and international access to justice, 198 frequency of disputes, 413 rule of law, 65-75 DSU and, 302 panel composition, 312 equality before the law, 71 US/EC dispute, 178 expert evidence and, 443 Seattle Ministerial Conference (1999), fundamental changes from GATT, 374, 391 Secretariat (GATT) future, 58-9, 73-5 See also specific divisions growing caseload, 348-9 1948-59, 113-15 independent judiciary, 69-71 1960s, 115-16 LAD and, 185-90 1970s, 116–18, 175–6 Legal Adviser to the Administration 1980 reorganisation, 33, 136 and, 339 1980s, 118-23 legalisation of procedure, 343 1990s, 123-7 narrowly construed, 104-6 anti-legalism, 7, 185-7, 191, 292 private lawyers' role, 347-8 authority, 14 separation of powers, 72-3 Committee on Trade and specialisation and legalisation, 342-3 Development, 21 transparency, 71-2 committee work, 18 Williams's discussion, 103 departmental structure, 21, 26-7, Wilson's experience, 390-8 40 WTO as model, 68-9 efficiency, 92 Rules Division history, 112–28 creation, 40-2, 113, 125-7 independence, 92 electronic archiving, 387 legal nature, 114 functions, 53 Office of Legal Affairs. See Legal dispute settlement, 608 Affairs Division (LAD) twenty-first century, 127-8 origins, 92, 114-15 LAD and, 387, 390, 625 restructuring, 116-17, 118-19 rule of law. See rule of law (GATT) line management, 338 Rules Division. See Rules Division trade remedy cases, 168-9, 190 Rules of Conduct (WTO) Secretariat (WTO) adherence to, 422 See also specific divisions dispute settlement support, 271 adoption, 246, 259-63 independence, 325, 461 distrust of, 194 rules of recognition, 204 functions, 236-7 internal organisation, 608 Georgia and, 296 legal services: structure, 625–6 use of dispute settlement, 410 Milthorp's experience, 291–9 WTO accession, 285, 293, 295-6, panel selection and, 312-16 410 restructuring, 55 rule of law. See rule of law (WTO) Sacerdoti, Giorgio, 561, 563 Rules of Conduct, 262, 422 staff Samurai group, 179 Saudi Arabia, WTO accession, 285 diversity, 625

Schröder, Christina, 13, 26, 27, 141-50



INDEX

650 Secretariat (WTO) (cont.) state-owned enterprises, competition internal appeals, 336, 338 and, 284 neutrality, 405-7, 422 Steger, Debra, 46, 47, 48, 447-65, 491, transition period, 43-54 493, 501, 505 Sen, Amartya, 207 strategic reviews, Milthorp's account, separation of powers, 62, 63, 72-3, 326, 298 448, 468 subsidies sequencing, 270, 271, 365-7, 375 aircraft, 411, 414 Shakespeare, William, 599 early GATT dispute, 142-3 Shaw, M. N., 573 Subsidies Code, 118 Shih, Constant, 21 Tokyo Round, 118 Shonfield, Andrew, 162 US - Upland Cotton, 393 Simma, Bruno, 435 Supachai, Dr, 392 Singapore issues, 282 surveillance mechanism, 415–16, 419 suspension of concessions. See single undertaking, 294, 519–20, 521, 523, 524, 536, 540 compliance (WTO dispute Slynn, Gordon, 486 settlement) social market economy, 183 Sutherland, Peter, 179, 230 Sørenson, Jan-Eirik, 113 Sweden South Africa Sweden - AD Duties, 115 dispute with Canada, 37 US - Swedish Steel, 212, 216, 217, WTO panellists from, 328 219 South Ossetia, 296 Switzerland Soviet Union, UNCTAD and, 94 accession, 176 Spain, Spain - Soyabean Oil, 35, 155-6, Appellate Body composition and, 165, 166, 193, 226 449 - 50specialisation trend, 342-3 Russo-Georgian conflict and, 296 SPS Agreement WTO panellists from, 328 customary rules of interpretation, 588 Ta-yul Cho, 286 disputes, 376 Taipei. See Chinese Taipei Taniguchi, Yasuhei, 465, 529, 561, 562 EC - Hormones, 360 expert evidence, 434, 436, 437 Tariff Division, 33, 35, 40, 119, 120, panel reports, 441 122, 124 selection of experts, 439 **TBT** Agreement frequency of disputes, 413 customary rules of interpretation, negotiations, 171 588 US/Canada - Continued Suspension, disputes, 376, 413 360 EC – Seal Products, 345 Staff Council, Milthorp's account, tobacco packaging and, 412 297 Technical and Other Barriers to Trade Staiger, R. W., 238 Division, 33, 119 standard of review Teh, Robert, 279-80 anti-dumping GATT disputes, telecommunications, competition, 216 - 17280 - 1Appellate Body, 458, 474 textiles, 1961 agreement, 94 Star Trek, 332-3 Textiles Monitoring Body (TMB), 261, stare decisis. See precedents 262



INDEX 651

textualism early GATT disputes, 115-16 Appellate Body, 51, 431, 535–7, Legal Affairs Division and, 168-9 539-40, 543 Rules Division and, 168-9, 190 customary rules of treaty Tokyo Round (1973–79), 119 interpretation, 166 transition period, 254 Vienna Convention, 431, 539-40 transition period Thailand, WTO disputes, Thailand dispute settlement, 254-5 Cigarettes (Philippines), 578-9 ethics of dispute settlement, 259-63 third-parties, WTO dispute settlement, GATT 1947 and GATT 1994, 247-8 266-7, 410-11, 460, 496 legal context, 248-51 tobacco packaging, 412 transition decisions, 251-3 Tokyo Round (1973-79) Legal Affairs Division agriculture negotiations, 152-3 adoption of DSB practices, 256-9 codes, 31–3, 40, 103, 117–18, 152–3, Marceau's account, 244-63 non-panel matters, 244–63 government procurement, 285 treaty succession problems, legal relationship with GATT, 247 - 8213 - 16transfer of GATT assets to WTO, 255 transition to WTO, 252 transparency voluntary nature, 301 Appellate Body procedures, 460, 471 dispute settlement, 30-1, 37, 99, GATT/WTO value, 2 WTO rule of law and, 71-2 100-1, 191, 210 failures, 224 travaux préparatoires, 217, 576, 590 forum shopping and, 304 TRIMs, 40 non-tariff measures, 117-18, 165, TRIPS 237 access to justice, 198 trade diplomacy, 196 achievement, 107-8 trade remedies, 119, 193 Chinese disputes, 396-7 transition period, 254 competition and, 281 Tolstoy, Leo, 627 early disputes, 354 Tooker, Robin, 176 incorporation of other treaties, 512 Torquay Ministerial Conference medicines and, 384, 395 (1950), 92new ground, 485 Torres, Noel, 19-20, 96, 137 non-violation complaints, 304 Trade Facilitation Agreement, 72-3, public health waiver, 384, 606-7 108, 234 tobacco packaging and, 412 Trade Policy Division Tuinen, Hielke van dispute settlement and, 18 career, 131-4 regional trade agreements, 296 death, 400 structural organisation, 117, 136 Director of Office of Legal Affairs, 34, trade remedy disputes, 115 119, 138, 186, 187, 226 trade policy reviews, competition dispute settlement and, 187 policies and, 281 GATT career, 26, 110, 185, 239 trade remedies on GATT Secretariat, 31 See also specific remedies memories of GATT, 131-4 1980s, 120-1 retirement, 187 Appellate Body approach, 538 Tumlir, Jan, 162, 188 business and rule of law, 344 Turkey, WTO disputes, 368, 369, 394



652 INDEX

UNCTAD, 20, 94, 278, 283 management approach, 163-4 unilateral actions, 476, 485, 519, 521, origins, 86, 90 523 - 4transition to WTO, 248, 250-1 United Kingdom unilateral actions, 485, 523-4 Cobden-Chevalier Treaty (1860), 88 **GATT** disputes 1970s, 27-8, 29 Corn Laws, 88 anti-dumping, 223-4 EEC/GATT negotiations and, 81 GATT origins and, 86 arguments, 188 ITO negotiations, 4, 6 Canada - Eggs, 145 United Nations Canadian potato exports, 115 Appeals Tribunal, 463 Czechoslovakia and US export international rule of law and, 61-2 licences, 142 ITO negotiations and, 4 EEC fruit and vegetables, 151–2 legal advisers to, 337 EEC - Animal Feed Proteins, 146 EEC - Citrus, 158 legal vetting, 386 Westphalian order, 200–3 EEC - Measures on Animal Feed United Nations Convention on the Law Proteins, 27 of the Sea (UNCLOS), 514 EEC - Minimum Import Prices, 147 United States EEC – Pasta Subsidies, 178 2001 terrorism, 54-5 income tax practices, 191 anti-dumping duties, 116, 193 Japan – Tobacco, 155 Section 301, 224 bilateral agreements pre-GATT, 89, 90 Spain - Soyabean Oil, 35, 155-6, 165, 166, 226 US-Mexico Agreement, 97 Constitution, rule of law and, 71 US - Canadian Pork, 123, 218-19 Declaration of Independence, 71 US - Cement, 219-20 dispute settlement and legitimacy, 45 US - Customs User Fee, 234 European Community and US - Disc, 102-3, 225 1970s disputes, 27-8 US - Norwegian Salmon AD, 1992 EC aircraft agreement, 586 212-13, 216-18, 220, 227 agriculture, 42, 225 US - Section 337 Tariff Act, 233 Appellate Body membership, 449 US - Sugar, 170 Blair House Accord, 42, 225 US – Sugar Headnote Quota, 234 US - Sugar Waiver, 228 compliance to dispute settlement, US – Superfund, 233 EC fruit and vegetables, 151-2 US - Swedish Steel, 212, 216, 217, role of GATT, 20 219 role of lawyers, 137 US - Tobacco, 148 steel disputes, 223 US – Tuna (Mexico), 513 Transatlantic Trade and International Competition Policy Investment Partnership, 506 Advisory Committee, 278 ITO and, 4-5, 7, 190, 548 Uruguay Round negotiations, 230 Japan and, 92, 224 WTO disputes, 368, 396 GATS Schedules, 590 MFN principle, 88-9 GATT and rule of law, 71 Congress issue, 94, 97, 163, 168 Seattle Conference, 374 Supreme Court appointments, 488 dispute settlement, 484 leadership, 87 Uruguay Round and, 230, 485, 519



INDEX 653

Vienna Convention and, 170 US - Upland Cotton, 393, 398, 531, waivers, 176 538, 593 WTO dispute settlement and US – Wool Shirts and Blouses, 361 criticism, 389, 391 US - Zeroing, 169 ethics, 261 WTO ratification, 180 retaliation, 172 Universal Declaration of Human Rules of Conduct, 260 Rights (1948), 205 WTO disputes Unterhalter, David, 7, 49, 63, 466-75, Canada - Periodicals, 550-1 506, 563 Chinese disputes, 396–7 Uruguay, Uruguay - Recourse to Article EC - Bananas, 397 XXIII, 99-100 EC - Bananas III, 365-7, Uruguay Round (1986-94) 368-9 Appellate Body, 303–4, 447, 463 *EC – Hormones*, 360, 368–9 Ganesan's account, 524-7 extensive use of system, 354 motivations, 548 *India – Patents (US)*, 575 success, 476–7 Japan – Film, 368 background, 518-27 level of disputes, 610 Brussels negotiations (1990), 40, 124, 228, 301, 304 Mexico - Telecoms, 280-1 Turkish rice, 394 dispute settlement, 172-3, 194-5, US/Canada-Continued520-7 Suspension, 360, 440 Cossy's account, 301-5 US - Anti-Dumping and EC and, 485-6 Countervailing Duties (China), **GATT** disputes and WTO 586-8 negotiations, 228 US - Carbon Steel, 590 LAD and, 39-43, 171-2, 239-40 US – Cloves Cigarettes, 579, 582–3 Porges's account, 228–32 US - Continued Zeroing, 580 origins, 39, 229 US - Customs Bond Directive, 517 United States and, 230, 485, 519 US - DRAMS, 593 US - FSC, 368-9, 379 Van den Bossche, Peter, 465, 508, 511, US - Gambling, 307, 397, 585, 588, 524, 527 589-90, 593 Vienna Convention on the Law of US - Gasoline, 48, 245, 305, 450, Treaties anti-dumping cases and, 217, 586-8 491, 508-9, 534, 575 US – Helms Burton, 368 Appellate Body and, 370–1, 473–4, *US – Lamb*, 538 US – Offset Act (Byrd contribution to treaty Amendment), 375, 393-4, 398 interpretation, 570-95 US - Section 301 Trade Act, 368, Article 31, 574, 577–89 369 context (31(2)), 579-81 US - Shrimp, 305-6, 362-4, 368, different contexts, 581 369, 513–14, 578, 585 holistic approach, 579–80 US – Softwood Lumber IV, 592 object and purpose of treaty, 578 US - Steel Safeguards, 375 ordinary meaning (31(1)), 566, US - Tuna II (Mexico), 579, 583-4, 568, 577-9 relevant rules of international law 588 US - Underwear, 460, 492 (31(3)(c)), 585-8



654 INDEX

Vienna Convention on the Law of on GATT Secretariat, 11, 21 Treaties (cont.) on Kennedy Round, 116 special meaning of terms (31(4)), LAD and transition period, 244 Office of Legal Affairs and, 137 subsequent agreement (31(3)(a)), role of law and, 4 258, 581-4 on Wyndham White, 23 subsequent practice (31(3)(b)), Wilson, Bruce, 54-5, 389-99 542, 584 Winchester, Simon, 432 Article 32 (supplementary means), Witt, Peter, 487, 488 574, 577, 589-92 World Economic Forum, 516 circumstances of conclusion, World International Property 590-2 Organization (WIPO), 512 preparatory work, 217, 576, 590 World Justice Project, 61 Article 33(3) (authentic languages), Woznowski, Jan, 34, 40, 48, 113, 118, 119, 124, 125, 127, 465 customary rules of interpretation Wright, Richard, 19 and, 170, 204, 573 WTO GATT panels and, 159, 431 See also specific departments and ILC commentary, 576-7, 579 agreements principles of justice and international council and committee structure, law, 188, 197 74 - 5termination of treaties dispute settlement. See dispute automatic termination, 382 settlement (WTO) liabilities, 251 evolution, 604-8 textualism, 431, 539-40 extending scope, 515–16 treaty preambles and, 217 future, 627-8 treaty succession, 249, 250 GATT (1947) and, 520 Uruguay Round and, 231 improving, 380-5 WTO interpretations, 421, 511, international law and, 508-16 570-95 member-driven organisation, 313, 314, 394–5, 526, 595 Volkai, János, 52, 245 voluntary export restraints, 163, 186 negotiations. See Doha Round; Uruguay Round (1986–94) voting procedures, WTO, 382-3 rule-based system, 541 Wager, Hannu, 288 rule of law. See rule of law (WTO) waivers, 377, 387 Seattle to Doha, 374-7 Wakoli, Chibole, 55, 434–43 Secretariat. See Secretariat (WTO) war crimes, 62 transition from GATT, 43-54 Weiler, Joseph, 65 WTO agreements Weiss, Friedl, 428 See also specific agreements Westphalian order, 182, 186, 195, 196, amendment rules, 382 199, 200-1 interpretation. See interpretation of Wilgress, Dana, 90-1, 98 WTO agreements Williams, Peter single undertaking, 294, 519-20, 521, civil vs common law, 7 523, 524, 536, 540 dispute settlement role, 30 Wyndham White, Eric GATT career, 33, 119, 120 ad hoc panels and, 13 on GATT history, 85-108 appointments, 19



INDEX 655

on diplomatic approach to dispute settlement, 11 EEC negotiations, 81, 82 first GATT Director-General, 8–9 on GATT Council membership, 92 on GATT decision-making, 14 GATT dispute settlement and, 98, 99 GATT negotiations, 91 ICITO Executive Secretary, 92 lawyer, 183 retirement, 22–4 rule of law and, 22–4, 57, 95 Trade Policy Division, 115 use of lawyers, 136–7

Yanovich, Alan, 50, 342–9 Yerxa, Rufus, 391

Zdouc, Werner, 449, 501, 508, 509, 511, 545, 564 zeroing, 169, 200, 502, 580 Zhang, Yuejiao, 49, 561, 563, 570–95