

# Women and Justice for the Poor A History of Legal Aid, 1863–1945

This book reexamines fundamental assumptions about the American legal profession and the boundaries between "professional" lawyers, "lay" lawyers, and social workers. Creating a dialogue between legal history and women's history, it demonstrates that nineteenth-century women's organizations were the first to offer legal aid to the poor, and that middle-class women, functioning as lay lawyers, provided that assistance. Felice Batlan illustrates that by the early twentieth century, male lawyers had founded their own legal aid societies. These new legal aid lawyers created an imagined history of legal aid and a blueprint for its future in which women played no role and their accomplishments were intentionally omitted. In response, women social workers offered harsh criticisms of legal aid leaders and developed a more robust social work model of legal aid. These different models produced conflicting understandings of legal expertise, professionalism, the rule of law, and, ultimately, the meaning of justice for the poor.

Felice Batlan is professor of law and associate dean at IIT/Chicago–Kent College of Law. Her groundbreaking work, which explores interactions among law, gender, history, and the legal profession, has appeared in numerous law reviews, history journals, and anthologies. She is a book review editor for *Law and History Review* and was an associate editor of the *Encyclopedia of the Supreme Court* and *Continuity and Change*. She has been a New York University Golieb Fellow, a Hurst Fellow, and a Freehling Fellow, and she received the Coordinating Council for Women in History (CCWH)/Berkshire Women's History Dissertation Award.



In memory of my mother, Syrene R. Batlan,

Who stood with me on the starting line

In dedication to my husband, the Honorable Robert Balanoff,

Who took each step with me



#### Studies in Legal History

#### **Editors**

SARAH BARRINGER GORDON University of Pennsylvania HOLLY BREWER University of Maryland, College Park MICHAEL LOBBAN London School of Economics and Political Science

Felice Batlan, Women and Justice for the Poor: A History of Legal Aid, 1863–1945

Sophia Z. Lee, The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Michael A. Livingston, The Fascists and the Jews of Italy: Mussolini's Race Laws, 1938–1943

Mitra Sharafi, Law and Identity in Colonial South Asia: Parsi Legal Culture, 1772–1947





### Women and Justice for the Poor

A History of Legal Aid, 1863-1945

#### **FELICE BATLAN**

IIT/Chicago-Kent College of Law





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107446410

© Felice Batlan 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Batlan, Felice, 1965– author.

Women and justice for the poor : a history of legal aid, 1863–1945 / Felice Batlan. pages cm. – (Studies in legal history)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-08453-7 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-44641-0 (paperback)

1. Legal aid – United States – History. 2. Women – United States – History. I. Title.

KF336.B38 2015

362.5'8-dc23 2014046191

ISBN 978-1-107-08453-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-44641-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### Contents

List of Plates		page ix
Ac	knowledgments	xi
$A \ell$	pbreviations of Primary Organizations	XV
	Introduction	I
	PART I. A FEMALE DOMINION OF LEGAL AID, 1863–191	0
Ι	The Origins of Legal Aid	17
2	The Chicago Experience: The Maturation of Women's	
	Legal Aid	47
	PART II. THE PROFESSIONALIZATION OF LEGAL AID, 1890-	-1921
3	Of Immigrants, Sailors, and Servants: The Legal Aid Society of New York	87
4	Reinventing Legal Aid	123
	PART III. DIALOGUES: LAWYERS AND SOCIAL WORKERS	5,
	1921-1945	
5	Constellations of Justice	157
6	Compromises	185
	Conclusion	215
Index		2.2.5

vii





#### **Plates**

#### Plates follow page xvi.

- 1. Working Women's Protective Union: "Complaint Day"
- 2. "The Waiting-Room in the Building of the Workingwoman's Protective Union"
- 3. Cover of pamphlet published by the Legal Aid Society of Chicago
- 4. Advertisement in Legal Aid Society of Chicago pamphlet: "Regulate the Loan Sharks!"
- 5. Legal Aid Society of New York, main office waiting room
- 6. The Chicago Legal Aid Bureau: "Poor Man's Portia"

