

International Organizations as Orchestrators

International Organizations as Orchestrators reveals how international organizations (IOs) leverage their limited authority and resources to increase their effectiveness, power, and autonomy from states. By "orchestrating" intermediaries - including non-governmental organizations (NGOs) - IOs can shape and steer global governance without engaging in hard, direct regulation. This volume is organized around a theoretical model that emphasizes voluntary collaboration and support. An outstanding group of scholars investigate the significance of orchestration across key issue areas, including trade, finance, environment, and labor, and in leading organizations, including the Global Environment Facility (GEF), G20, World Trade Organization (WTO), European Union (EU), Kimberley Process, United Nations Environment Program (UNEP), and the International Labor Organization (ILO). The empirical studies find that orchestration is pervasive. They broadly confirm the theoretical hypotheses while providing important new insights, especially that states often welcome IO orchestration as achieving governance without creating strong institutions. This volume changes our understanding of the relationships among IOs, non-state actors, and states in global governance, using a theoretical framework applicable to domestic governance.

KENNETH W. ABBOTT is the Jack E. Brown Professor of Law at the Arizona State University College of Law.

PHILIPP GENSCHEL holds the Chair in European Public Policy at the European University Institute in Florence.

DUNCAN SNIDAL is Professor of International Relations at Nuffield College, University of Oxford.

BERNHARD ZANGL is Professor of Global Governance at the Geschwister-Scholl-Institute for Political Science at the Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich.





International Organizations as Orchestrators

Kenneth W. Abbott,

Arizona State University

Philipp Genschel,

European University Institute, Florence

Duncan Snidal,

University of Oxford

Bernhard Zangl,

Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107082205

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
International organizations as orchestrators / edited by Kenneth W. Abbott,
Arizona State University, Philipp Genschel, European University Institute,
Florence, Duncan Snidal, University of Oxford, Bernhard Zangl,
Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich.

pages cm
ISBN 978-1-107-08220-5 (Hardback)
ISBN 978-1-107-44269-6 (Paperback)
1. International agencies—Decision making. 2. International organization—Decision making. 3. International cooperation. I. Abbott, Kenneth W. JZ4839.I586 2015
341.2-dc23 2014025958
ISBN 978-1-107-08220-5 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-107-44269-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	List of figures List of tables List of contributors Acknowledgments List of abbreviations	page vii viii ix xi xii
PA	RT I Introduction	1
1	Orchestration: global governance through intermediaries KENNETH W. ABBOTT, PHILIPP GENSCHEL, DUNCAN SNIDAL AND BERNHARD ZANGL	3
PA	RT II Managing states	37
2	Orchestrating policy implementation: EU governance throug regulatory networks MICHAEL BLAUBERGER AND BERTHOLD RITTBERGER	gh 39
3	Orchestration on a tight leash: state oversight of the WTO MANFRED ELSIG	65
4	Orchestration by design: the G20 in international financial regulation LORA ANNE VIOLA	88
5	Efficient orchestration? The Global Environment Facility in the governance of climate adaptation ERIN R. GRAHAM AND ALEXANDER THOMPSON	114
6	Orchestrating monitoring: the optimal adaptation of international organizations XINYUAN DAI	139

V



VI	Contents	
7	Orchestrating enforcement: international organizations mobilizing compliance constituencies JONAS TALLBERG	166
PA	RT III Bypassing states	189
8	WHO orchestrates? Coping with competitors in global health TINE HANRIEDER	191
9	Orchestrating peace? Civil war, conflict minerals and the United Nations Security Council VIRGINIA HAUFLER	214
10	Governing where focality is low: UNEP and the Principles for Responsible Investment CORNIS VAN DER LUGT AND KLAUS DINGWERTH	237
11	Orchestration for the "social partners" only: internal constraints on the ILO LUCIO BACCARO	262
12	Orchestrating the fight against anonymous incorporation: a field experiment MICHAEL FINDLEY, DANIEL NIELSON AND J. C. SHARMAN	286
	Appendix to Chapter 12 – examples of letters across experimental conditions	307
PA	RT IV Implications	313
13	Orchestration along the Pareto frontier: winners and losers WALTER MATTLI AND JACK SEDDON	315
14	Orchestrating global governance: from empirical findings to theoretical implications KENNETH W. ABBOTT, PHILIPP GENSCHEL, DUNCAN SNIDAL AND BERNHARD ZANGL	349
	References Index	380 420



Figures

Figure 1.1	indirect governance through orchestration	page 4
Figure 1.2	IGOs as agents and orchestrators	27
Figure 4.1	The G20 and the O-I-T model	97
Figure 5.1	GEF orchestration and climate adaptation	118
Figure 6.1	Orchestration and hierarchical regulation	143
Figure 6.2	Problem structures and IGO orchestration	147
Figure 6.3	Empirical examples of IGO orchestration	150
Figure 10.1	Evolution of PRI and orchestration techniques	
	employed	242
Figure 10.2	Orchestration of Principles for Responsible	
	Investment	245
Figure 10.3	Mapping UNEP focality	258
Figure 11.1	Actors' preferences in ILO cases	280
Figure 11.2	Use of "civil society" in DG's strategic reports	283
Figure 12.1	Financial transparency compliance rates in FATF	
	member countries	295
Figure 12.2	Outcome proportions across conditions and average	e
	treatment effects	300
Figure 13.1	Types of intermediary and distributional	
	implications	325
Figure 13.2	Orchestrator/intermediary pairs	327

vii



Tables

Table 1.1	Four modes of governance	page 9
Table 1.2	Hypotheses on orchestration	20
Table 2.1	Overview of variables and cases	49
Table 3.1	Orchestration by WTO Secretariat	73
Table 5.1	Overview of GEF adaptation projects by fund and	
	implementing agency	122
Table 5.2	Intermediary strengths vis-à-vis GEF deficits	131
Table 5.3	Intermediary benefits from association with GEF	134
Table 7.1	Summary of cases	174
Table 8.1	Interaction of focality and intermediary availability	
	in WHO orchestration	210
Table 9.1	Conditions for Security Council orchestration,	
	1991–present	232
Table 10.1	UNEP compared to five peers	246
Table 10.2	Core complementary capabilities provided by PRI	
	partners	248
Table 10.3	Overview of orchestration by UNEP during	
	1990s-2000s	260
Table 14.1	Mapping IGO orchestration	352
Table 14.2	Dichotomous coding of variables	362
Table 14.3	Goal divergence and initiation of orchestration	370
Table 14.4	Interaction of goal divergence and oversight:	
	frequency and initiation of orchestration	372

viii



Contributors

- KENNETH W. ABBOTT Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law, Arizona State University
- LUCIO BACCARO Department of Sociology, University of Geneva
- MICHAEL BLAUBERGER Department of Political Science and Sociology, University of Salzburg
- XINYUAN DAI Department of Political Science, University of Illinois
- KLAUS DINGWERTH Department of Political Science, University of St. Gallen
- MANFRED ELSIG World Trade Institute, University of Bern
- MICHAEL FINDLEY Department of Government, University of Texas at Austin
- PHILIPP GENSCHEL Social and Political Sciences Department and Robert Schumann Center for Advanced Studies, European University Institute
- ERIN R. GRAHAM Department of History and Politics, Drexel University
- TINE HANRIEDER Research Unit Global Governance, WZB Berlin Social Science Center
- VIRGINIA HAUFLER Department of Government and Politics, University of Maryland
- WALTER MATTLI Department of Politics and International Relations, St John's College, University of Oxford
- DANIEL NIELSON Political Science Department, Brigham Young University
- BERTHOLD RITTBERGER Geschwister Scholl Institute for Political Science, Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich

ix



x List of contributors

- JACK SEDDON Department of Politics and International Relations, St John's College, University of Oxford
- J. C. SHARMAN Centre for Governance and Public Policy, Griffith University
- DUNCAN SNIDAL Department of Politics and International Relations, Nuffield College, University of Oxford
- JONAS TALLBERG Department of Political Science, Stockholm University
- ALEXANDER THOMPSON Department of Political Science, Ohio State University
- CORNIS VAN DER LUGT Centre for Corporate Governance in Africa, Stellenbosch University Business School Cape Town
- LORA ANNE VIOLA John F. Kennedy Institute, FU Berlin
- BERNHARD ZANGL Geschwister Scholl Institute for Political Science, Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich



Acknowledgments

We acknowledge the generous support of the Center of Advanced Studies (CAS) at Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich and the Collaborative Research Center "Transformations of the State" at the University of Bremen. The CAS funded and hosted a series of editors' meetings and author workshops during which the concept of orchestration and the individual contributions to this volume took shape. Without CAS support, the volume could not have become what it is, the joint product of twenty-two authors. The idea for the orchestration project was initially developed in 2009 at a meeting of the editors in Bremen funded by the Collaborative Research Center, which also supported a subsequent editors' meeting to finalize the volume. We are grateful for the support provided by both institutions.

We are thankful to two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press for highly insightful comments on an earlier draft of the entire volume, and to Karolina Milewicz for valuable comments on the concluding chapter. We thank the participants in panels and colloquia at which one or more of the editors presented parts of this work, including at the American Political Science Association, British International Studies Association, International Studies Association and Standing Group on International Relations, the universities of Bern, Bremen and Oxford, Cornell University and the University of North Carolina.

We also thank Anna Waldmann and Xenia Lanzendörfer for efficient editorial support. Finally, we thank the Hotel Biederstein in Munich, a home away from home for three of the editors during the course of the project.

хi



Abbreviations

AB Appellate Body

ACAMS Association of Certified Anti-Money Laundering

Specialists

ACHPR African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

AfDB African Development Bank AFM Authority for Financial Markets

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ASrIA Association for Sustainable and Responsible

Investment in Asia

ASTM International, formerly known as the

American Society for Testing and Materials

ATJ Andean Tribunal of Justice

BCBS Basel Committee on Banking Supervision BEREC Body of European Regulators for Electronic

Communications

BIS Bank for International Settlements

BWI Bretton Woods institutions

CalPERS California Public Employees' Retirement System

CAT Convention Against Torture

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

Discrimination against Women

CERES Coalition for Environmentally Responsible

Economies

CESR Committee of European Securities Regulators
CFATF Caribbean Financial Action Task Force

CFCs chlorofluorocarbons

CITES Convention on International Trade in Endangered

Species of Wild Fauna and Flora

Codex Alimentarius Commission

COP Conference of Parties

CPR Committee of Permanent Representatives
CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child

xii



Abbreviations xiii

CSD Commission for Sustainable Development

CSOs civil society organizations
CSR corporate social responsibility

DG Director General

DG COMP Directorate-General for Competition
DG ENV Directorate-General Environment

DG Market Directorate-General Internal Market and Services

DRC Democratic Republic of the Congo

D-SIFIs domestic systemically important financial institutions
DTIE Division of Technology, Industry and Economics

EACJ East African Court of Justice EAPs Environmental Action Programs ECA European Competition Authorities

ECJ European Court of Justice ECN European Competition Network

ECOFIN Economic and Financial Affairs Council ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights EEB European Environmental Bureau

EECMA European Electronics Communications Market

Authority

ENGOs Environmental Non-Governmental Organizations

EPE European Partners for the Environment

ERG European Regulators Group ERNs EU regulatory networks

ESC European Securities Committee
ESG environmental, social and governance
ESMA European Securities and Markets Authority
ESME European Securities Markets Expert Group

EU European Union

EuroSIF European Sustainable Investment Forum

EWE Early Warning Exercise

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United

Nations

FASB Financial Accounting Standards Board

FATF Financial Action Task Force

FESCO Forum of European Securities Commissions

FI Finance Initiative

FINTRAC Financial Transactions and Reports Analysis Centre FIN-USE Forum of User Experts in the Area of Financial

Services



xiv Abbreviations

FOE Friends of the Earth FoFs Friends of Fish

FRR Fonds de Réserve pour les Retraites
FSAP Financial Services Action Plan
FSB Financial Stability Board
FSC Forest Stewardship Council
FSF Financial Stability Forum

FSSAs Financial Sector Stability Assessments

FY fiscal year

GAAP Generally Accepted Accounting Principles GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade GAVI formerly Global Alliance for Vaccines and

Alliance Immunization GC Governing Council

GEF Global Environment Facility
GERT Group of European regulators
GeSI Global e-Sustainability Initiative

GNP+ Global Network of People Living with HIV GOARN Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network

GPA Global Program on AIDS

GPHIN Global Public Health Intelligence Network

GRI Global Reporting Initiative

G-SIFIs global systemically important financial institutions

IAASB International Auditing and Assurance

Standards Board

IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency

IAESB International Accounting Education Standards Board IAIS International Association of Insurance Supervisors

IAs implementing agencies

IASB International Accounting Standards Board IASC International Accounting Standards Committee

IASs international accounting standards

ICASO International Council of AIDS Service Organizations

ICC International Chamber of Commerce

ICJ International Court of Justice

IESBA International Ethics Standards Board for

Accountants

IFAC International Federation of Accountants

IFAD International Fund for Agricultural Development

IFC International Finance Corporation IFI international financial institutions



IMF

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08220-5 - International Organizations as Orchestrators Kenneth W. Abbott, Philipp Genschel, Duncan Snidal and Bernhard Zangl Frontmatter More information

> Abbreviations ΧV

IFRS International Financial Reporting Standards **IGOs** international or intergovernmental organizations

IHR International Health Regulations 2005 International Labor Conference **ILC** ILO International Labor Organization

IMFC International Monetary and Financial Committee International Medical Products Anti-Counterfeiting **IMPACT**

International Monetary Fund

Taskforce.

IOs international organizations

IOSCO International Organization of Securities

Commissions

Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change **IPCC IPEC** International Program for the Elimination of

Child Labor

IR international relations **IRB** institutional review board **IRG** Independent Regulators Group

ISO International Organization for Standardization

ISR International Sanitary Regulations

International Union for the Conservation of Nature **IUCN**

and Natural Resources

KPCS Kimberley Process Certification Scheme **LDCF** Least Developed Countries Fund

Least Developed Countries **LDCs**

Long Range Transboundary Air Pollution **LRTAP**

M&E monitoring and evaluation MAP Mutual Assessment Process multilateral development banks **MDBs MERCOSUR** Southern Common Market

most favored nation **MFN**

NAFTA North American Free Trade Area **NAPAs** National Adaptation Programs of Action Non-Cooperative Countries and Territories NCCT

NPT Non-Proliferation Treaty national regulatory agencies **NRAs**

Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights **ODIHR OECD**

Organization for Economic Co-operation and

Development

OFT Office of Fair Trading

OHCHR Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights



More information

xvi Abbreviations

O-I-T model Orchestrator–Intermediary–Target model OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in

Europe

OSFI Office of the Superintendent of Financial Institutions

OTC over-the-counter
P-A model Principal-Agent model
PAC Partnership Africa Canada
PHC Primary Health Care

PIOB Public Interest Oversight Board PoW UNEP Program of Work PPPs public–private partnerships

PRI Principles for Responsible Investment
ProMED Program for Monitoring Emerging Diseases

RAF Resource Allocation Framework

ROSCs Reports on the Observance of Standards and Codes

SARS Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome

SBCI Sustainable Buildings and Climate Initiative

SCCF Special Climate Change Fund SDOs standards-developing organizations

SEA Single European Act

SEC Securities and Exchange Commission
SICA Soccer Industry Council of America
SIPS statements of investor principles

SO₂ sulfur dioxide

SPA Strategic Priority on Adaptation

SPS WTO Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and

Phytosanitary Measures

SRI socially responsible investment SSBs public standard-setting bodies

TBT WTO Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade

TGN transgovernmental network
TNC Trade Negotiations Committee

TOI Tour Operators Initiative for Sustainable Tourism

Development

TPRM Trade Policy Review Mechanism

TRAC Transnational Resource and Action Center

TRAFFIC environmental NGOs

TRTA Trade-Related Technical Assistance

UKSIF UK Sustainable Investment and Finance Association

UN/ECE Economic Commission for Europe

UNAIDS Joint United Nations Program on HIV/AIDS



Abbreviations xvii

UNCITRAL United Nations Commission on International

Trade Law

UNDP United Nations Development Program

UN-EMG UN interagency Environmental Management Group

UNEP United Nations Environment Program

UNEP FI UNEP Finance Initiative

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organization

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate

Change

UNGC United Nations Global Compact

UNHCR United Nations High Commission for Refugees

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

UNIDO U Nations Industrial Development Organization
UNIFAD United Nations International Fund for Agricultural

Development

UNITA Angola rebel group

UNSC United Nations Security Council
USTR United States Trade Representative
WBCSD World Business Council for Sustainable

Development

WDC World Diamond Council

WFSGI World Federation of the Sporting Goods Industry

WHA World Health Assembly
WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organization WMO World Meteorological Organization

WSSD World Summit on Sustainable Development

WTO World Trade Organization WWF World Wildlife Fund