

A FAREWELL TO FRAGMENTATION

Fragmentation has been much discussed as a threat to international law as a legal system. This book contends that the fragmentation of international law is far exceeded by its convergence, as international bodies find ways to account for each other and the interactions of emerging fields. Reasserting its role as the 'principal judicial organ of the United Nations', the International Court of Justice has ensured that the centre of international law can and does hold. This process has strengthened a trend towards the re-unification of international law. In order to explore this process, this book deals with the issues of fragmentation and convergence both from the point of view of the centre of the International Court and of the position of other courts and tribunals. Featuring contributions by leading international lawyers from a range of backgrounds, this volume proposes both a new take and the last word on the fragmentation debate in international law.

MADS ANDENAS is a Professor in the Faculty of Law at the University of Oslo, and the UN Special Rapporteur on Arbitrary Detention and the Chair of the UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, which reports to the UN Human Rights Council and the UN General Assembly. He has held senior academic appointments in the United Kingdom, including as Director of the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, London, and Director of the Centre of European Law at King's College, University of London.

EIRIK BJORGE is Shaw Foundation Junior Research Fellow at Jesus College, University of Oxford. Eirik has taught at Oxford and Sciences Po, Paris. He is the author of *The Evolutionary Interpretation of Treaties* (2014) and a co-editor, with Cameron Miles, of *Landmark Cases in Public International Law* (2016).





A FAREWELL TO FRAGMENTATION

Reassertion and Convergence in International Law

Edited by
MADS ANDENAS AND EIRIK BJORGE





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107082090

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

A farewell to fragmentation: reassertion and convergence in international law / edited by Mads Andenas, Eirik Bjorge.

pages cm. – (Studies on international courts and tribunals)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-08209-0 (hardback)

1. International law. 2. International courts. I. Andenas, Mads Tonnesson, 1957– editor.

II. Bjorge, Eirik, 1983– editor.KZ3410.F37 2015

341 – dc23 2015002842

ISBN 978-1-107-08209-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of contributors page viii

Introduction: from fragmentation to convergence in international law
 MADS ANDENAS AND EIRIK BJORGE

PART 1 Reassertion and convergence: 'proliferation' of courts and the centre of international law

A. At the centre: the International Court

- 2 Unity and diversity in international law 37 SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD
- 3 A century of international justice and prospects for the future 56
 ANTÔNIO AUGUSTO CANÇADO TRINDADE
- The International Court of Justice and human rights treaty bodies 87
 SIR NIGEL RODLEY
- 5 The ICJ and the challenges of human rights law 109
 VERA GOWLLAND-DEBBAS
- 6 Factors influencing fragmentation and convergence in international courts 146
 PHILIPPA WEBB

v



vi	CONTENTS

B. 'Regimes' of international law

- 7 Fragmentation or Partnership? The reception of ICJ case-law by the European Court of Human Rights 173 DEAN SPIELMANN
- 8 Factors influencing the reception of international law in the ECtHR's case law: an overview 191

 MAGDALENA FOROWICZ
- 9 The influence of the International Court of Justice on the law of provisional measures 218

 CAMERON A. MILES
- Just another case of treaty interpretation? Reconciling humanitarian law and human rights law in the ICJ 272
 LAWRENCE HILL-CAWTHORNE
- 11 Fragmentation within international human rights law 297
 MEHRDAD PAYANDEH
- 12 The European Union's participation in international economic institutions: a mutually beneficial reassertion of the centre 320

 EMANUEL CASTELLARIN
- 13 Reinforcing the ICJ's central international role? Domestic courts' enforcement of ICJ decisions and opinions 343

 VERONIKA FIKFAK

PART 2 A farewell to fragmentation and the sources of law

A. Custom and Jus Cogens

- 14 The International Court of Justice and the international customary law game of cards 371

 LORENZO GRADONI
- 15 State practice, treaty practice and State immunity in international and English law 407

 ALEXANDER ORAKHELASHVILI



CONTENTS vii

16 Historical sketches about custom in international law 459
JEAN-LOUIS HALPÉRIN

B. Treaty Interpretation

- Is there a subject-matter ontology in interpretation of international legal norms? 473
 ROBERT KOLB
- 18 Halfway between fragmentation and convergence: the role of the rules of the organization in the interpretation of constituent treaties 486
 PAOLO PALCHETTI
- 19 The convergence of the methods of treaty interpretation:
 Different regimes, different methods of interpretation?

 498
 EIRIK BIORGE
- 20 Reassertion and transformation of international law 536 MADS ANDENAS

Index 570



CONTRIBUTORS

MADS ANDENAS University of Oslo; Chair-Rapporteur, UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention

EIRIK BJORGE Jesus College, University of Oxford

JUDGE ANTÔNIO AUGUSTO CANÇADO TRINDADE Judge at the International Court of Justice

DR EMANUEL CASTELLARIN Ecole de droit, University of Paris I

VERONIKA FIKFAK Homerton College, University of Cambridge

DR MAGDALENA FOROWICZ Senior Research Fellow, Faculty of Law, University of Zurich

PROFESSOR VERA GOWLLAND-DEBBAS Emeritus Professor, Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva

PROFESSOR LORENZO GRADONI Faculty of Law, University of Bologna

SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD Judge at the International Court of Justice

viii



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

ix

PROFESSOR JEAN-LOUIS HALPÉRIN Humanities and Social Sciences Department, Ecole normale supérieure, Paris

DR LAWRENCE HILL-CAWTHORNE School of Law, University of Reading

PROFESSOR ROBERT KOLB Faculty of Law, University of Geneva

DR CAMERON A. MILES
Trinity Hall, University of Cambridge; 3 Verulam Buildings

DR ALEXANDER ORAKHELASHVILI School of Law, University of Birmingham

PROFESSOR PAOLO PALCHETTI
Faculty of Law, Unversity of Macerata

PROFESSOR MEHRDAD PAYANDEH
Faculty of Law, University of Dusseldorf

SIR NIGEL RODLEY
School of Law, University of Essex; Chair, UN Human Rights Committee

PRESIDENT DEAN SPIELMANN European Court of Human Rights

DR PHILIPPA WEBB Dickson Poon School of Law, King's College, University of London