

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

- accessory liability *see* liability; *specific jurisdictions*
- accountability
  - capacity and, 108
  - children, 108–9
  - defences, 114–15
  - mentally disordered persons, 109–10
  - vicarious and accessory liability, 110–14
- action
  - cause of action, 34, 237, 394
- action to compel public charges (*Klageerzwingungsverfahren*), Germany, 166–7
- adhesion, principle of *see specific jurisdictions*
- advocates *see specific jurisdictions*
- ‘antecedent concert’, 298
- ‘art and part’, 296–7
- assault, case study *see specific jurisdictions*
- attempt and liability, 31, 45–7, 145, 174, 442
- Australia
  - assault, case study, 492
  - boat theft, case study, 491
  - capacity, 385–6
  - car theft, case study, 490–1
  - case study, 490–2
  - causation, 389–90
  - changes in law
    - conclusion, 415
    - external/non-legal factors, 411–15
    - generally, 406
    - institutions, 408–11
    - legal fields, 406–8
  - children’s liability, 385–6
  - coherence, 375
  - conclusion, 415
  - complexity of tort and crime law, 369–70
  - crime prioritised over tort, 401–2
  - defences, 392–6
  - evidence
    - burden and standards of proof, 402–4
    - parallel proceedings, 404–6
    - procedure, 396
  - fault, 386–7
  - federal, 367, 415
  - federation, 367
  - incidence of tort and crime, 372–3
  - institutions, 368–9
  - insurance, 373–5
  - intention, 387–9
  - introduction, 367–8
  - legal culture, 368–9
  - legal education, 370
  - legal practice, 371–2
  - legal scholarship, 370–1
  - liability
    - accessory liability, 390–2
    - children, 385–6
    - defences, 392–6
    - fault, 386–7
    - insurance, 372–7, 413–4
    - no fault schemes, 490–1
  - parallel proceedings, 404–6
  - parties, 398–9
  - procedure
    - crime prioritised over tort, 401–2
    - evidence *see* evidence *above*
    - judicial organisation, 396–8
    - parties, 398–9

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

494

## INDEX

- Australia (*cont.*)
  - remedies, 399–400
  - rules, 401
  - reasoning, 375–6
  - recourse to law, 377–8
  - remedies, 399–400
  - res judicata*, 405
  - substantive interactions
    - classification of wrongs, 378–82
    - generally, 378
    - legal theory, 382–5
  - tort law reform, 370, 375–6
- boat theft, case study *see specific jurisdictions*
- bodily physical integrity, invasions of, 289–92
  - see also* assault
- capacity
  - substantive interactions, 437–9
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- car theft, case study *see specific jurisdictions*
- case study, 17, 476–92
- causation
  - substantive interactions, 441–2
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- changes in law *see* legal change
- children's liability *see specific jurisdictions*
- chose jugée see* France
- common purpose, 227, 488
  - 'common criminal purpose', 297–8
- compensation
  - beginning and end of claim, 449–50
  - enforcement, 453–4
  - limits, 450–3
  - nature of claim, 449
  - orders, 55–9, 285–6, 377–98, 449–53
  - state and inter-state rules, 454–5
- complicity and vicarious liability,
  - France, 114
  - see also* accessory liability; *specific jurisdictions*
- consent
  - substantive interactions, 439–40
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- counsel *see specific jurisdictions*
- courts *see specific jurisdictions*
- Crime victim compensation, 66–7, 190–2, 380, 399, 429
- criminal law
- cumulation *see* Sweden
- defamation and fault, France, 99
- defences
  - substantive interactions, 443–5
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- delict *see* tort
- disparagement of product or services, 99–100
- employers' vicarious liability, 110–13
- England
  - accessory liability, 35–6
  - assault, case study, 478–9
  - boat theft, case study, 478
  - breach of stationary duty, 306, 379
  - capacity, 29–33
  - car theft, case study, 476–8
  - case study, 476–9
  - causation, 44–8
  - coherence, 69
  - collateral attack, 462
  - compensation order, 53–9
  - conclusion, 71–2
  - consent, 36–40
  - consistency, 51, 69
  - deceit, 39–42
  - defamation, 29, 60–2, 66
  - defences, 49–51
    - self defence, 50
  - evidence, 61–6
  - fraud, 42–3
  - illegality, 28
  - institutions, 19–23
  - insurance, 50, 61
  - intention, 40–1
  - interaction, reasons for, 68–70, 71–2
  - introduction, 18–19
  - jurisdiction, 51–7
  - liability for others, 33–6
  - negligence, 43–4
  - normative theories, 25–7
  - procedure, 51, 57–61, 71

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

495

- property, 48–9
- reasonableness, 44
- reasoning, 23–5, 71
- recklessness, 41–2
- resolutions, 66–8
- separation of tort and crime, 71
- substantive differences, 29
- substantive interactions, 27–9, 71
- evidence
  - questionnaire, 15
  - trial procedure, 456–9
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- family immunities as to theft, 101
- fault
  - substantive interactions, 440–1
  - see also liability; specific jurisdictions*
- France
  - accessory liability *see* vicarious liability *below*
  - accountability
    - capacity and, 108
    - children, 108–9
    - defences, 114–15
    - mentally disordered persons, 109–10
    - vicarious and accessory liability, 110–14
  - assault, case study, 481
  - boat theft, case study, 480–1
  - capacity and accountability, 108
  - car theft, case study, 480
  - case study, 479–81
  - causation
    - direct or indirect causality, 106–8
    - existence of cause, 101–5
    - requirements for, 101
  - children, accountability of, 108–9
  - chose jugée*
    - basis of, 87–8
    - consequences of acquittal and discharge, 88–9
    - consequences of conviction, 88
    - scope of, 86–7
  - compensation in criminal cases
    - compensation as goal, 118–19
    - judge's powers, 119–21
    - public prosecutor's powers, 119
  - complicity and vicarious liability, 114
  - conclusion, 121–2
  - defamation and fault, 99
  - defences to liability, 114–15
  - disparagement of product or services, fault and, 99–100
  - employers' vicarious liability, 110–13
  - family immunities as to theft, 101
  - fault *see* liability *below*
  - finality principle, 84–5
  - imputation *see* accountability *above*
  - institutions, 74–8
  - insurance, 96
  - intention and fault, 94–8
  - introduction, 73–4
  - legal persons' vicarious liability, 113
  - liability
    - accessory liability, 110–14
    - accountability *see* accountability *above*
    - arising of, 91–2
    - civil law relevant to criminal law, 100–1
    - defamation, 99
    - defences, 114–15
    - disparagement of product or services, 99–100
    - erosion of unity between tortious and criminal fault, 92–4
    - family immunities as to theft, 101
    - intention and fault, 94–8
    - scope of criminal liability, 98
    - vicarious liability, 110–14
  - mentally disordered persons,
    - accountability of, 109–10
  - procedure
    - chose jugée*, 86–9
    - finality, 84–5
    - generally, 78–9
    - material scope, 82–3
    - personal scope, 83–4
    - res judicata*, 85–6
    - victim's role in selecting, 79–82
  - punitive damages, 115–18
  - res judicata*, 85–6
  - stay of civil claim, 89–91
  - substantive interactions, 91, 98

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

496

## INDEX

France (*cont.*)

theft

case study, 480–1

family immunities as to, 101

unity principle, 92–4

vicarious liability

academic debates as to, 110

complicity, 114

employers, 110–13

legal persons, 113

fraud *see specific jurisdictions*

functionalism, 7–8

general integrative technique, 436–7,  
466

Germany

action to compel public charges

(*Klageerzwingungsverfahren*),

166–7

adhesion (*Adhäsionsverfahren*), 166

assault, case study, 483–4

attempt and liability, 145

boat theft, case study, 483

car theft, case study, 481–3, 484

case study, 481–3, 484

causation, 149–52

children's liability, 159

conclusion, 172

courts, 139–40

division of legal system

constitutional basis, 137

criminal law from tort, 132–3

methodological differences, 141–2

procedural law, 127

question of, 124

theoretical basis for, 128–9

tort from criminal law, 132

fault *see liability below*

guilt and liability, 155–9

institutions, 137

insurance, 126, 154–8

legal practice, 138–9

legal scholarship, 138

liability

attempt, 145

causation, 149–52

children, 159

definition of legal interests,

differences in, 147–9

differences in general

requirements, 144–5

general clause: 'small' general

clauses, 142–4

guilt, 155–9

injury of protected legal interest,

146

legislative styles, differences in,

145

negligence, definition of, 155–7

protection of different legal

interests, 147

wrongfulness, 152–5

negligence, definition of, 155–7

procedure

differences, 163–4

interactions, 164–9

remedies, 169–72

substantive interactions

generally, 124

unity principle, 142

suspension rules, 168–9

theoretical comparisons, 134–5

unity of legal system

criminal law looking to private

law, 160–3

preservation of, 140

principle of, 123–4

sameness across legal system,

159–60

tort law looking to criminal law,

160

victim's right to act as accessory

prosecutor (*Nebenklage*), 167

victim's right to initiate proceedings

(*Privatklageverfahren*), 167–8

wrongfulness and liability, 152–5

guilt and liability, 155–9

historical developments, 473–5

homogeneity of the legal system, 16,

72, 319, 366, 468

indicators of tort and crime, 419–21

informal means of interaction, 466–7

institutions

indicators of tort and crime,

419–21

legal actors *see legal actors*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

497

- legal framework, 416–18
- questionnaire, 13
- reasons for imposing liability, 421–4
- structural issues, 424–6
- terminology, 3
- see also specific jurisdictions*
- insurance *see specific jurisdictions*
- intention
  - fault and, 94–8
  - substantive interactions, 440–1
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- interaction between tort and crime
  - aims of book, 1–2, 475
  - axes of, 465
  - boundaries, question of, 473
  - case study, 17
  - distinctiveness, question of, 473
  - historical developments, 473–5
  - informal means, 466–7
  - legal systems *see legal systems*
  - mechanisms for, 465–7
  - non-interaction, question of, 473
  - outline of book, 2, 475
  - pinch points, 467
  - practical methodologies, 12–13
  - question of, 1
  - questionnaire, 13–17, 475
  - reasons for
    - balancing of, 468–9
    - categories of, 467–8
    - patterns in expression of, 469–73
  - terminology *see terminology*
  - theoretical methodologies, 6
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- invasions and threatened invasions *see Scotland*
- ‘joint wrongdoing’, 297
  - see also accessory liability*
- judges/judicial organisation *see specific jurisdictions*
- jurisdiction, 15
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- language *see terminology*
- lawyers *see specific jurisdictions*
- lay judges, 184–5
- legal actors
  - in both tort and crime, 426–30
  - confined to tort or to crime, 431
  - crossing tort and crime, 430–1
  - specialisation, 431–2
- legal change, 416–75
  - legal transplants, 10–12
  - path dependence, 9–10
  - understanding of, 9
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- legal culture *see institutions*
- legal scholarship *see specific jurisdictions*
- legal systems *see specific jurisdictions*
  - change and development *see legal change*
  - choice of jurisdictions, 2–3
  - Directness/Indirectness axis as to
    - influence between, 465
  - doctrinal differences, 3–4
  - Equality/Hierarchy axis as to
    - ranking of legal objects, 465
  - overlap of tort and crime,
    - approaches to, 3
  - Partition/Permeability axis as to
    - boundaries within, 465
  - structural differences, 3
- legal transplants, 10–12, 466
- liability
  - reasons for imposing, 421–4
  - substantive interactions, 442–3
  - terminology, 4–5
  - see also fault; specific jurisdictions*
- mentally disordered persons’
  - accountability *see specific jurisdictions*
- methodology in practice, 12
- methodology in theory, 19
- negligence
  - definition, 155–7
  - terminology, 4, 6
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- Netherlands
  - adhesion, 341–3
  - admissibility, ‘ten minute rule’, 343–5
  - appeals, 346–7
  - assault, case study, 489–90
  - boat theft, case study, 489
  - car theft, case study, 489, 490

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

498

## INDEX

- Netherlands (*cont.*)
- case study, 489, 490
  - clarification of claims, 345
  - compensation
    - advance compensation, 351
    - orders, 348–51
    - priority in statutory reform, 363–6
    - procedural interactions, 333–6
    - return of stolen property, order for, 351
    - substitute custody, 350
  - conclusion, 366
  - concurrent claims, 347–8
  - court rulings, 346
  - evidence
    - burden of proof, 358–9
    - connections between tort and crime, 354, 362–3
    - disclosure, 361
    - investigation powers, 360–1
    - means and production of, 359–60
    - overlap of tort and crime, 354–5
    - relationship between tort and crime, 362
    - standards of proof, 355–8
  - introduction, 316
  - overlap of tort and crime, 320–6, 336–8
  - procedure
    - adhesion, 341–3
    - admissibility, ‘ten minute rule’, 343–5
    - appeals, 346–7
    - clarification of claim, 345
    - compensation, 333–6
    - concurrent claims, 347–8
    - connections between tort and crime, 352–4
    - convictions, 346
    - interaction between tort and crime, 340–1
    - overlap of tort and crime, 338–40
    - remedies *see* compensation *above*
    - routing of cases, 336–8
  - purposes of tort law and criminal law, 319–20
  - relationship between tort and crime, 316–19
  - remedies *see* compensation *above*
  - routing of cases, 336–8
  - substantive differences, 329–33
  - substantive interactions, 327–9
  - normative theories, 3, 14
    - see also specific jurisdictions*
  - overlap of tort and crime *see*
    - interaction between tort and crime
  - parties *see specific jurisdictions*
  - path dependence, 9–10
  - personality rights, invasions of, 294
  - pinch points, 12, 13
  - principles *see* reasoning
  - procedure
    - comparisons, 462–3
    - compensation *see* compensation questionnaire, 15
    - terminology, 3–6
    - trials *see* trial procedure
    - victim’s role in prosecutions, 445–8
      - see also specific jurisdictions*
  - process *see* procedure
  - property *see specific jurisdictions*
  - prosecutors *see specific jurisdictions*
  - purposes of tort and crime *see specific jurisdictions*
  - questionnaire, 13–17
  - reasonableness *see specific jurisdictions*
  - reasoning
    - examples, 432
    - principles crossing into other areas of law, 435–6
      - see also specific jurisdictions*
    - questionnaire, 14
    - unity of legal system, 432–4
    - weighting of principles, 434–5
  - recklessness *see specific jurisdictions; fault*
  - remedies, 16
    - choice, 463–4
    - interaction, 464–5
    - questionnaire
      - see also specific jurisdictions*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

499

- res judicata, 460–2
  - see also specific jurisdictions*
- resolutions *see* remedies
- rules of procedure *see* procedure
- Scotland
  - ‘antecedent concert’, 298
  - ‘art and part’, 296–7
  - assault, case study, 488–9
  - boat theft, case study, 488
  - bodily physical integrity, invasions of, 289–92
  - breach of statute, 288–9
  - capacity, 287–8
  - car theft, case study, 487–8
  - case study, 487–9
  - causation, 305–7
  - children’s liability, 287–8
  - ‘common criminal purpose’, 297–8
  - compensation
    - compensation orders in criminal courts, 285–6
    - private compensation, 282
    - state compensation, 282–5
  - conclusion, 313–15
  - conduct, 288–9
  - defences, 307–13
  - distinctiveness of tort and crime, 276
  - intention, 288
  - introduction, 271
  - invasions and threatened invasions
    - bodily physical integrity, 289–92
    - other personality rights, 294
    - property, 294–6
    - sexual integrity, 292–4
  - ‘joint wrongdoing’, 297
  - judicial organisation, 273–5
  - legal actors, 275–6
  - legal scholarship, 272–3
  - liability
    - accessory liability, 300–5
    - ‘antecedent concert’, 298
    - ‘art and part’, 296–7
    - children, 287–8
    - ‘common criminal purpose’, 297–8
    - joint and several liability, 299–300
    - ‘joint wrongdoing’, 297
    - ‘spontaneous concert’, 298–9
    - location of tort and crime, 271
    - negligence, 288
    - overlap between civil and criminal proceedings, 281
    - personality rights, invasions of, 294
    - private parties in criminal courts, 281
    - procedure
      - compensation *see* compensation *above*
      - generally, 278–80
      - overlap between civil and criminal proceedings, 281
      - private parties in criminal courts, 281
    - property, invasions of, 294–6
    - purposes of tort and crime, 277–8
    - recklessness, 288
    - res judicata*, 289
    - sexual integrity, invasions of, 292–4
    - ‘spontaneous concert’, 298–9
    - substantive interactions, 286
  - secondary liability *see* liability
  - sexual integrity, invasions of, 292–4
  - Spain
    - adhesion, 242
    - assault, case study, 487
    - boat theft, case study, 487
    - capacity, 250, 254–6
    - car theft, case study, 486, 487
    - case study, 486, 487
    - causation
      - criminal law, 258–9
      - tort law, 258–9
    - changes in law, 229
    - children’s liability, 261–2
    - civil action in criminal proceedings
      - adhesion, 242
      - capacity and reduced liability, 250
      - civily liable third parties, 250–1
      - ‘damaged party’ as civil party in criminal proceedings, 247–8
      - defendants, 248–50
      - generally, 241
      - insurance, 249–50
      - liability, imposition of, 241
      - mentally disordered persons’ liability, 250
      - offenders, 248–9

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

500

INDEX

Spain (*cont.*)

- victim's decision as to reserving
  - civil claim, 243–7
- civil procedure, 237–8
- civilly liable third parties, 250–1
- conclusion, 269–70
- courts, 240
- criminal judgments and civil claims
  - enforcement of judgment, 254
  - joint actions and criminal acquittal, 252–3
  - joint actions and criminal conviction, 252
  - separate actions, 253–4
- criminal matters in civil proceedings, 240–1
- criminal procedure, 238–40
- 'damaged party' as civil party in criminal proceedings, 247–8
- damages in criminal proceedings, 251
- defendants, 248–50
- dependent adults' liability, 261
- divisions within tort law and criminal law, 232–3
- enforcement of judgments, 254
- entrepreneurs' liability, 262–3
- ex delicto* liability, 230, 239–43, 250
- fault, 256–8
- historical developments, 224–5
- insurance, 249–50, 266–7
- intention, 258
- introduction, 223–4
- judicial organisation, 235–6
- lawyers, specialisation, 231
- legal scholarship, 230–1
- liability
  - accessory liability, 263
  - children, 261–2
  - civil action in criminal proceedings, 241
  - civilly liable third parties, 250–1
  - dependent adults, 261
  - entrepreneurs, 262–3, *see* Spain: *ex delicto* liability
  - mentally disordered persons, 250, 261
  - public authorities, 262

- vicarious liability, 261–3
- mentally disordered persons'
  - liability, 250, 261
- offenders, 248–9
- procedure
  - civil actions *see* civil action in criminal proceedings *above*
  - civil procedure, 237–8
  - criminal matters in civil proceedings, 240–1
  - criminal procedure, 238–40
  - interaction between civil and criminal courts, 240
  - principles generally, 236
- public authorities' liability, 262
- purposes of tort law and criminal law, 228
- reasoning, 233–5
- reciprocal influences, 229
- res judicata*, 240, 241, 252, 253–4
- restitution of property in criminal proceedings, 251
- separate actions, 253–4
- sources of law, 231–2
- substantive interactions and differences
  - accessory liability, 263
  - assessment of damages, 264–6
  - capacity, 254–6
  - causation, 258–60
  - defences, 264
  - fault, 256–8
  - insurance, 266–7
  - intention, 258
  - remedies, effects of, 267–9
  - vicarious liability, 261–3
- unity of legal system, 225–8
- victim's decision as to reserving civil claim, 243–7
- 'spontaneous concert', 298–9
- stay of civil claim, 89–91
- structuralism, 8
- substantive differences *see specific jurisdictions*
- substantive interactions
  - comparison between parallel rules, 436
  - general integrative techniques, 436–7



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08048-5 - Comparing Tort and Crime: Learning from across and within Legal Systems

Edited by Matthew Dyson

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

501

- questionnaire, 15
- terminology, 3
- see also specific jurisdictions*
- suspension rules, 459–60
- see also specific jurisdictions*
- Sweden
  - adhesion
    - before 1734, 209–10
    - and cumulation, 216
    - post-1734, 210–11
    - post-1948, 211–12
  - advocates, 189
  - aggrieved parties (*målsägande*), 187–8
  - assault, case study, 485–6
  - boat theft, case study, 485
  - capacity, 204–5
  - car theft, case study, 483–5
  - case study, 484–6
  - causation, 205
  - children's liability, 204–5
  - conclusion, 221–2
  - counsel, 188–9
  - courts, 183
  - Crime Victim Compensation and Support Authority (Brottsoffermyndigheten), 190–2
  - criminal code of 1864 (*strafflagen*), 180–1
  - cumulation of cases, 216
  - damages, 197–8
  - evidence, 216–18
  - historical background, 174–5
  - institutions, 183–92
  - insurance companies, 189–90
  - intention, 205–6
  - introduction, 173
  - judges, 184
  - jurisdiction
    - adhesion post-1948, 211–12
    - connection between crime and civil claim, 212–14
    - cumulation and separation of cases, 216
    - prosecutor's duty to present claim, 214–16
  - law code of 1734, 175–6
  - lawyers, 184
  - lay judges, 184–5
  - legal scholarship, 185
  - mediaeval law, 175
  - mentally disordered persons' liability, 204
  - negligence, 206
  - norms
    - damages, 197–8
    - distinctions between tort and crime, 195–6
    - generally, 192–3
    - overlap of tort and crime, 198–200
    - purposes of tort law and criminal law, 193–4
    - sentencing, 196–7
  - procedure
    - adhesion before 1734, 209–10
    - adhesion post 1734, 210–11
    - adhesion post 1948, 211–12
    - advantages and disadvantages of Swedish system, 218
    - evidence, 216–18
    - historical development, 209–11
    - tort tried in criminal cases, 209–11
  - prosecutors
    - duty to present claim, 214–16
    - role of, 185–7
  - reform in early nineteenth century, 175–6
  - remedies, 221
  - secondary liability, 206–9
  - sentencing, 196–7
  - separation of cases, 216
  - substantive interactions
    - capacity, 204–5
    - causation, 205
    - civil law requirements in criminal statutes, 203–4
    - crime as a prerequisite in tort law, 201–3
    - generally, 200–1
    - intention, 205–6
    - negligence, 206
    - secondary liability, 206–9
  - Tort Liability Act of 1972, 181–2

502

terminology  
    common terms, 6  
    language generally, 4–5  
    specific terms, 5–6  
    system-neutral language,  
        4  
    terms of art, 6  
theft  
    case study, 17, 476–92  
    *see also specific countries*  
tipping points, 12  
transplanted law *see* legal  
    transplants  
trial procedure  
    evidence, 456–9  
    legal framework, 455–6

INDEX

*res judicata*, 460–2  
suspension rules, 459–60  
  
unity of legal system, 416–75, *see*  
    *specific jurisdictions*  
  
vicarious liability  
    legal persons', 113  
victim  
    as civil party in criminal  
        proceedings, 247–8  
    right to act as accessory prosecutor,  
        167  
    right to initiate proceedings, 167–8  
  
wrongfulness and liability, 152–5