Fichte’s Foundations of Natural Right (1796/97) was one of the most influential books in nineteenth-century philosophy. It was read carefully by Schelling, Hegel, and Marx, and initiated a tradition in German philosophy that considers human subjectivity to be relational and intersubjective, thus requiring relations of recognition between subjects. The essays in this volume highlight this little understood book’s most important ideas and innovations. They offer discussions of Fichte’s conception of freedom, self-consciousness, coercion, the summons, the body, and human rights, together with new analyses of his deduction of right, his views on the social contract, and his arguments for the separation of right from morality. The essays expand and deepen ongoing debates in the scholarship and chart new avenues of thought about Fichte’s most enduring work of political philosophy. They will be essential reading for students and scholars of German Idealism, nineteenth-century philosophy, and the history of political thought.

Gabriel Gottlieb is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Xavier University. He has published numerous articles on Fichte and the philosophy of action.
CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

Titles published in this series:

Hegel’s Phenomenology Of Spirit
EDITED BY DEAN MOYAR AND MICHAEL QUANTE

Mill’s On Liberty
EDITED BY C. L. TEN

Kant’s Idea For A Universal History With A Cosmopolitan Aim
EDITED BY AMÉLIE OKSENBERG BORTY AND JAMES SCHMIDT

Kant’s Groundwork Of The Metaphysics Of Morals
EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMANN

Kant’s Critique Of Practical Reason
EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMANN

Wittgenstein’s Philosophical Investigations
EDITED BY ARIF AHMED

Kierkegaard’s Concluding Unscientific Postscript
EDITED BY RICK ANTHONY FURTAK

Plato’s Republic
EDITED BY MARK L. MCPHERRAN

Plato’s Laws
EDITED BY CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH

Spinoza’s Theological-Political Treatise
EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED AND MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL

Aristotle’s Nicomachean Ethics
EDITED BY JON MILLER

Kant’s Metaphysics Of Morals
EDITED BY LARA DENIS

Nietzsche’s On The Genealogy Of Morality
EDITED BY SIMON MAY

Kant’s Observations And Remarks
EDITED BY RICHARD VELKLEY AND SUSAN SHELL

Augustine’s City Of God
EDITED BY JAMES WETZEL

Descartes’ Meditations
EDITED BY KAREN DETLEFSEN

Kant’s Religion Within The Boundaries Of Mere Reason
EDITED BY GORDON MICHALSON

Kant’s Lectures On Anthropology
EDITED BY ALIX COHEN

Kierkegaard’s Fear And Trembling
EDITED BY DANIEL CONWAY

Kant’s Lectures on Ethics
EDITED BY LARA DENIS AND OLIVER SENSEN

Aristotle’s Physics
EDITED BY MARISKA LEUNISSEN

Aristotle’s Politics
EDITED BY THORNTON LOCKWOOD AND THANASSIS SAMARAS

Aquinas’s Disputed Questions on Evil
EDITED BY M. V. DOUGHERTY

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org
FICHTE’S FOUNDATIONS OF NATURAL RIGHT

A Critical Guide

EDITED BY

GABRIEL GOTTLIEB
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Contributors</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Abbreviations</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabriel Gottlieb</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Fichte’s <em>Foundations of Natural Right</em> and its Relation to Kant</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angelica Nuzzo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Fichte’s Separation of Right from Morality</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frederick Neuhouser</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Fichte’s Independence Thesis</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James A. Clarke</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Deduction of the Summons and the Existence of Other</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rational Beings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allen W. Wood</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Fichte’s Kabbalistic Realism: Summons as <em>zimzum</em></td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Franks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Fichte’s Developmental View of Self-Consciousness</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabriel Gottlieb</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 The Body as Site of Action and Intersubjectivity in Fichte’s</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Foundations of Natural Right</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Russon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Fichte’s Transcendental Deduction of Private Property</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne Martin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

9  Fichte on Personal Freedom and the Freedom of Others     177
    David James

10  Freedom, Coercion, and the Relation of Right     196
    Michael Nance

    Dean Moyar

12  Fichte and Human Rights     239
    Jean-Christophe Merle

Bibliography     259
Index     269
Contributors

James A. Clarke is a lecturer in the Department of Philosophy at the University of York. He has published articles on Fichte in Inquiry, British Journal for the History of Philosophy, and Review of Metaphysics.

Paul Franks is Professor of Philosophy at Yale University. His publications include: All or Nothing: Systematicity, Transcendental Arguments, and Skepticism in German Idealism (2005). He is the translator and editor (with Michael L. Morgan) of Franz Rosenzweig: Philosophical and Theological Writings (2000). He has published essays in the Yearbook of German Idealism and the Cambridge Companion to Hegel and Nineteenth Century Philosophy (2008).

Gabriel Gottlieb is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Xavier University. He has published articles on Fichte and philosophy of action in the International Philosophical Quarterly, Pacific Philosophical Quarterly, Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences, and The Nineteenth Century Philosophy Reader (2015).

David James is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick. His publications include: Fichte's Republic: Idealism, History and Nationalism (2015), Rousseau and German Idealism: Freedom, Dependence and Necessity (2013), and Fichte's Social and Political Philosophy: Property and Virtue (2011). He is currently editing Hegel's Elements of the Philosophy of Right: A Critical Guide for Cambridge University Press and also co-editing (with Günter Zöller) The Cambridge Companion to Fichte.

Wayne Martin is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Essex. His publications include: Theories of Judgment: Psychology, Logic, Phenomenology (2006) and Idealism and Objectivity: Understanding Fichte's Jena Project (1997). His work on Fichte has also appeared in the European Journal of Philosophy, Ratio and Tôpôi.
Contributors

Jean-Christophe Merle is Professor at Universität Vechta. His publications include: Spheres of Global Justice (2013) and German Idealism and the Concept of Punishment (2009). He is also editor of Johann Gottlieb Fichte: Grundlage des Naturrechts (2001) and with Andreas Schmidt, Fichtes Das System der Sittenlehre: Ein kooperativer Kommentar (2015).

Dean Moyar is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Johns Hopkins University. His publications include: Hegel's Conscience (2011). He is also the editor of The Routledge Companion to Nineteenth Century Philosophy (2010) and the co-editor (with Michael Quante) of Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit: A Critical Guide (2008).

Michael Nance is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Maryland Baltimore County. His work on Fichte and Kant has been published in the European Journal of Philosophy and International Journal of Philosophical Studies.


Angelica Nuzzo is Professor of Philosophy at the City University of New York. Her publications include: Memory, History, Justice in Hegel (2012), Ideal Embodiment: Kant's Theory of Sensibility (2008), and Kant and the Unity of Reason (2005).

John Russon is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Guelph. His publications include: Bearing Witness to Epiphany: Persons, Things and the Nature of Erotic Life (2009), Reading Hegel's Phenomenology (2004), Human Experience: Philosophy, Neurosis and the Elements of Everyday Life (2003), and The Self and Its Body in Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit (1997).

Acknowledgments

The idea of organizing a volume on Fichte’s philosophy began brewing in my mind while I was writing my dissertation. Like many other burgeoning Fichte scholars, I felt acutely the lacuna of high-quality scholarship on Fichte, especially when compared to the likes of Kant and Hegel. It took some time to find the right idea for the makings of an edited volume, and I finally hit upon the idea of a Critical Guide on the Foundations of Natural Right at the 2013 Pacific APA in San Francisco, where a conversation with Lara Denis about her work on the Critical Guide to Kant’s Metaphysics of Morals prompted me to reach out to Cambridge and Hilary Gaskin. Much thanks to Lara for her initial advice. Many thanks are due to Hilary Gaskin for guiding me through the process of putting together the proposal and the book. Thanks also to her team at Cambridge and in particular Emma Collison and Christofere Fila.

The New York German Idealism Workshop was kind of enough to host a conference on the topic of the book on October 3–4, 2014. This allowed a number of contributors to present drafts of their papers and to receive critical feedback. The conference certainly would have been impossible without the support and guidance of Scott Shushan. Thanks so much, Scott. Thanks also to the other members of the organizing committee of the Workshop (Michael Becker, Borhane Blili Hamelin, Anna Katsman, and Thimo Heisenberg). Many thanks to the contributors who presented (and Wayne Martin who had the great idea to host a workshop), and everyone who participated in the conference, especially Jay Bernstein and Nedim Nomer. There is no doubt that the workshop improved the overall quality of the book.

I am thankful also to the support of the Philosophy Department at Xavier University, and in particular conversations with Richard Polt, Tim Brownlee, Dan Dwyer, Tim Quinn, and Steve Frankel. Thanks are due to a number of friends and colleagues whose support I am grateful for as well: Evan Strevell, James Wood, Rachel Chrastil, Zed Adams, Lori
Acknowledgments

Francis and Reggie Tarantino, and Adam Rossi. I am thankful for my conversations with James Dow as they positively shape practically all of my philosophical work. Kristen Renzi’s support, comments, and advice helped me tremendously, and I am grateful for her love and dedication. Thanks to all the love and support of my family, especially my parents, Joel and Susan Gottlieb, as well as Kim, Matt, and Logan Brown. Finally, thanks so much to all of the contributors for their hard work, support, and commitment to the volume.
Abbreviations

The following abbreviations are used throughout the volume. The Foundations of Natural Right is referred to either by its entire title or by the shortened title Natural Right in the body of the essays. In the case of citations, it is referred to as FNR. Citations to Fichte’s work cite first an English translation, when available, and then his Sämtliche Werke. In the instances when Fichte’s German text is not published in the Sämtliche Werke, another German edition is cited.

Fichte


Abbreviations


Kant


Abbreviations


