

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07792-8 — Hegel's Elements of the Philosophy of Right
Edited by David James
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

HEGEL'S *ELEMENTS OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF RIGHT*

A Critical Guide

Hegel's *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*, one of the classic texts of German Idealism, is a seminal work of legal, social and political philosophy that has generated very different interpretations since its publication in 1821. Written with the advantage of historical distance, the essays in this volume adopt a fresh perspective to make readers aware of the breadth and depth of this classic work. Their themes reflect the continuing relevance of the text to modern-day concerns, and include the concept of property, Hegel's view of morality, the concept of *Sittlichkeit*, the modern family, and the nature and tensions of civil society, together with its relation to the state. The volume will be of interest to all scholars and students of German Idealism.

DAVID JAMES is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick. His publications include *Fichte's Republic: Idealism, History and Nationalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2015); *Rousseau and German Idealism: Freedom, Dependence and Necessity* (Cambridge University Press, 2013); and *Fichte's Social and Political Philosophy: Property and Virtue* (Cambridge University Press, 2011). He is co-editor (with Günter Zöller) of *The Cambridge Companion to Fichte* (Cambridge University Press, 2016).

CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

Titles published in this series:

Hegel's *Phenomenology of Spirit*

EDITED BY DEAN MOYAR AND MICHAEL QUANTE

Mill's *On Liberty*

EDITED BY C. L. TEN

Kant's *Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim*

EDITED BY AMÉLIE OKSENBERG RORTY AND JAMES SCHMIDT

Kant's *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*

EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMAN

Kant's *Critique of Practical Reason*

EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMAN

Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*

EDITED BY ARIF AHMED

Kierkegaard's *Concluding Unscientific Postscript*

EDITED BY RICK ANTHONY FURTAK

Plato's *Republic*

EDITED BY MARK L. MCPHERRAN

Plato's *Laws*

EDITED BY CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH

Spinoza's *Theological–Political Treatise*

EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED AND MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL

Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics*

EDITED BY JON MILLER

Kant's *Metaphysics of Morals*

EDITED BY LARA DENIS

Nietzsche's *On the Genealogy of Morality*

EDITED BY SIMON MAY

Kant's *Observations and Remarks*

EDITED BY RICHARD VELKLEY AND SUSAN SHELL

Augustine's *City of God*

EDITED BY JAMES WETZEL

Descartes' *Meditations*

EDITED BY KAREN DETLEFSEN

Kant's *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*

EDITED BY GORDON MICHALSON

Kant's *Lectures on Anthropology*

EDITED BY ALIX COHEN

Kierkegaard's *Fear and Trembling*

EDITED BY DANIEL CONWAY

Kant's *Lectures on Ethics*

EDITED BY LARA DENIS AND OLIVER SENSEN

Aristotle's *Physics*

EDITED BY MARISKA LEUNISSEN

Aristotle's *Politics*

EDITED BY THORNTON LOCKWOOD AND THANASSIS SAMARAS

Aquinas's *Disputed Questions on Evil*

EDITED BY M. V. DOUGHERTY

Fichte's *Foundations of Natural Right*

EDITED BY GABRIEL GOTTLIEB

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07792-8 — Hegel's Elements of the Philosophy of Right
Edited by David James
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

HEGEL'S *ELEMENTS*
OF THE PHILOSOPHY
OF RIGHT
A Critical Guide

EDITED BY
DAVID JAMES
University of Warwick



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07792-8 — Hegel's Elements of the Philosophy of Right
Edited by David James
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107077928
10.1017/9781139939560

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-07792-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	x
Introduction: Freedom and History in Hegel's <i>Philosophy of Right</i> David James	i
1 The Method of the <i>Philosophy of Right</i> Frederick Neuhouser	16
2 Property, Use and Value in Hegel's <i>Philosophy of Right</i> Stephen Houlgate	37
3 Hegel on Morality Allen W. Wood	58
4 Hegelian Conscience as Reflective Equilibrium and the Organic Justification of <i>Sittlichkeit</i> Dean Moyar	77
5 Living the Contradictions: Wives, Husbands and Children in Hegel's <i>Elements of the Philosophy of Right</i> Kimberly Hutchings	97
6 'The Ethicality in Civil Society': Bifurcation, <i>Bildung</i> and Hegel's Supersession of the Aporias of Social Modernity Andrew Buchwalter	116
7 Why Ethical Life is Fragile: Rights, Markets and States in Hegel's <i>Philosophy of Right</i> Hans-Christoph Schmidt am Busch	137
8 That Which Makes Itself: Hegel, Rabble and Consequences Frank Ruda	160

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07792-8 — Hegel's Elements of the Philosophy of Right
Edited by David James
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
9	Practical Necessity and the 'Logic' of Civil Society <i>David James</i>	177
10	How Modern is the Hegelian State? <i>Ludwig Siep</i>	197
	<i>Bibliography</i>	219
	<i>Index</i>	227

Contributors

Andrew Buchwalter is Presidential Professor at the University of North Florida. He is the author of *Dialectics, Politics, and the Contemporary Value of Hegel's Practical Philosophy* (Routledge, 2011) and the edited volumes *Hegel and Global Justice* (Springer, 2012) and *Hegel and Capitalism* (SUNY Press, 2015).

Stephen Houlgate is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick. He is the author of *Hegel, Nietzsche and the Criticism of Metaphysics* (1986), *An Introduction to Hegel: Freedom, Truth and History* (1991; 2nd edn, 2005), *The Opening of Hegel's Logic* (2006) and *Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit* (2013), and he has also published numerous articles on Hegel, as well as on Kant, Schiller, Schelling, Nietzsche, Derrida, Danto, Rawls, Brandom and McDowell. He is the editor of *Hegel and the Philosophy of Nature* and *The Hegel Reader* (both 1998), *Hegel and the Arts* (2007) and *G. W. F. Hegel: Elements of the Philosophy of Right* (2008), and co-editor with Michael Baur of *A Companion to Hegel* (2011).

Kimberly Hutchings is Professor of Politics and International Relations at Queen Mary University of London. She is the author of several books, including *Kant, Critique and Politics* (1996), *Hegel and Feminist Philosophy* (2003) and *Time and World Politics: Thinking the Present* (2008), and co-editor (with Tuija Pulkkinen) of *Beyond Antigone: Hegel's Philosophy and Feminist Thought* (2010).

David James is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick. His publications include *Fichte's Republic: Idealism, History and Nationalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2015), *Rousseau and German Idealism: Freedom, Dependence and Necessity* (Cambridge University Press, 2013) and *Fichte's Social and Political Philosophy: Property and Virtue* (Cambridge University Press, 2011).

Dean Moyar is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Johns Hopkins University. He is the author of *Hegel's Conscience* (Oxford University Press, 2011). He is co-editor (with Michael Quante) of *Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit: A Critical Guide* (Cambridge University Press, 2008) and the editor of the *Routledge Companion to Nineteenth Century Philosophy* (2010).

Frederick Neuhouser is Professor of Philosophy at Barnard College, Columbia University. He is the author of four books: *Rousseau's Critique of Inequality* (2014); *Rousseau's Theodicy of Self-Love: Evil, Rationality, and the Drive for Recognition* (2008); *Actualizing Freedom: Foundations of Hegel's Social Theory* (2000); and *Fichte's Theory of Subjectivity* (1990).

Frank Ruda is Interim Professor for Philosophy of Audiovisual Media at the Bauhaus University of Weimar. His publications include *Hegel's Rabble: An Investigation into Hegel's Philosophy of Right* (Continuum, 2011), *For Badiou: Idealism without Idealism* (Northwestern University Press, 2015) and *Abolishing Freedom: A Plea for a Contemporary Use of Fatalism* (Nebraska University Press, 2016).

Hans-Christoph Schmidt am Busch is Professor of Philosophy at the Technische Universität Braunschweig. His recent books include *La 'reconnaissance' comme principe de la Théorie critique* (Éditions de l'école normale supérieure, 2015) and *Hegel et le saint-simonisme* (Presses Universitaires du Mirail, 2012). He is the editor of Charles Fourier, *Über das weltweite soziale Chaos. Ausgewählte Schriften zur Philosophie und Gesellschaftstheorie* (Akademie Verlag, 2012) and co-editor (with C. F. Zürn) of *The Philosophy of Recognition: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2010). He has also edited a special issue of *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice* on 'Karl Marx and the philosophy of recognition' (2013).

Ludwig Siep is Professor Emeritus at the University of Münster. His books include *Hegels Fichtekritik und die Wissenschaftslehre von 1804* (1970), *Anerkennung als Prinzip der praktischen Philosophie* (2nd edn, 2014), *Praktische Philosophie im Deutschen Idealismus* (1992), *Der Weg der Phänomenologie des Geistes* (2000, English translation: *Hegel's Phenomenology of Spirit*, Cambridge University Press, 2014), *Aktualität und Grenzen der praktischen Philosophie Hegels* (2010) and *Der Staat als irdischer Gott. Genesis und Relevanz einer Hegelschen Idee* (2015). He is the editor of *G. W. F. Hegel: Grundlinien der Philosophie des Rechts* (3rd edn, 2014).

List of Contributors

ix

Allen W. Wood is Ruth Norman Halls Professor at Indiana University and Ward W. and Priscilla B. Woods Professor emeritus at Stanford University. He is the author of numerous articles and author or editor of over twenty books, including *Karl Marx* (1981; 2nd edn, 2004), *Hegel's Ethical Thought* (1990), *Kant's Ethical Thought* (1999), *The Free Development of Each: Studies on Freedom Right and Ethics in Classical German Philosophy* (2014) and *Fichte's Ethical Thought* (2016).

Abbreviations

Writings of Hegel

<i>Werke</i>	<i>Werke</i> , ed. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel, 20 vols. (Suhrkamp: Frankfurt am Main, 1969–1971). Cited by volume and page number.
EL	<i>The Encyclopaedia Logic</i> (Part I of the <i>Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences</i>), trans. T. F. Geraets, W. A. Suchting and H. S. Harris (Indianapolis: Hackett, 1991). Cited according to paragraph (§) numbers. R indicates a remark which Hegel himself added to the paragraph, while A indicates an addition deriving from student lecture notes.
GW	<i>Gesammelte Werke</i> , ed. Nordrhein-Westfälischen Akademie der Wissenschaften in association with the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1968–). Cited by volume and page number.
HPW	<i>Political Writings</i> , ed. Laurence Dickey and H. B. Nisbet (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999)
LNR	<i>Lectures on Natural Right and Political Science: The First Philosophy of Right, Heidelberg 1817–1818 with Additions from the Lectures of 1818–1819</i> , trans. J. Michael Stewart and Peter C. Hodgson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995). Cited by paragraph (§) numbers. R indicates a remark.
JR	<i>Jenaer Realphilosophie. Vorlesungsmanuskripte zur Philosophie der Natur und des Geistes von 1805–1806</i> , ed. Johannes Hoffmeister (Hamburg: Meiner, 1969)
NL	<i>Natural Law</i> , trans. T. M. Knox (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1975)
PhG	<i>Phenomenology of Spirit</i> , trans. A. V. Miller (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977)
PM	<i>Philosophy of Mind</i> , trans. W. Wallace and A. V. Miller, rev. Michael J. Inwood (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).

List of Abbreviations

xi

- Cited according to paragraph (§) numbers. R indicates a remark which Hegel himself added to the paragraph, while A indicates an addition deriving from student lecture notes.
- PR *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*, ed. Allen W. Wood, trans. H. B. Nisbet (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991). Translation of *Grundlinien der Philosophie des Rechts oder Naturrecht und Staatswissenschaft im Grundrisse*, in *Werke*, vol. 7. Cited according to paragraph (§) numbers. R indicates a remark which Hegel himself added to the paragraph, while A indicates an addition deriving from student lecture notes. The only exceptions are the Preface, which is cited by the page number of the English translation followed by that of the German edition, and Hegel's marginal notes, which are cited by the German edition page number only.
- PR 1819/20 *Philosophie des Rechts. Die Vorlesung von 1819/20 in einer Nachschrift*, ed. Dieter Henrich (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1983).
- PR 1819/20 *Vorlesungen über die Philosophie des Rechts. Berlin 1819/1820*, transcribed by Johann Rudolf Ringier, in *G. W. F. Hegel. Vorlesungen. Ausgewählte Nachschriften und Manuskripte*, vol. 14, ed. Emil Angehrn, Martin Bondeli and Hoo Nam Seelmann (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 2000).
- Ringier
- PR 1821/22 *Die Philosophie des Rechts. Vorlesung von 1821/22*, ed. Hansgeorg Hoppe (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 2005). Cited by paragraph (§) number.
- PW *Political Writings*, trans. T. M. Knox, ed. Z. A. Pelczynski (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1964)
- SEL *System of Ethical Life (1802/03) and First Philosophy of Spirit*, ed. and trans. H. S. Harris and T. M. Knox (Albany, NY: SUNY Press, 1979).
- SL *Science of Logic*, trans. A. V. Miller (Amherst: Humanity Books, 1999).
- VNS *Vorlesungen über Naturrecht und Staatswissenschaft*, transcribed by Peter Wannenmann, in *G. W. F. Hegel. Vorlesungen. Ausgewählte Nachschriften und Manuskripte*, vol. 1, ed. Claudia Becker, Wolfgang Bonsiepen, Annemarie Gethmann-Siefert, Friedrich Hogemann, Walter Jaeschke, Christoph Jamme, Hans Christian Lucas, Kurt Rainer Meist and Hans Josef Schneider (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1983). Cited by paragraph (§) number.

- VRP *Vorlesungen über Rechtsphilosophie 1818–1831*, ed. Karl-Heinz Ilting, 4 vols. (Stuttgart: Frommann-Holzboog, 1973–1974). Cited by volume and page number.

Writings of Kant

- AA *Kant's gesammelte Schriften*, ed. Königliche Preußische (later Deutsche) Akademie der Wissenschaften (Berlin: Reimer/de Gruyter, 1900–).
- G *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten* (AA 4). *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*, in *Practical Philosophy*, trans. and ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996). Cited by AA page number.
- KrV *Critique of Pure Reason*, trans. and ed. Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998). Cited by A/B pagination.
- KpV *Kritik der praktischen Vernunft* (AA 5). *Critique of Practical Reason*, in *Practical Philosophy*. Cited by AA page number.
- KU *Kritik der Urteilskraft* (AA 5). *Critique of the Power of Judgment*, ed. Paul Guyer, trans. Paul Guyer and Eric Matthews (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000). Cited by AA page number.
- MS *Metaphysik der Sitten* (AA 6). *The Metaphysics of Morals*, in *Practical Philosophy*. Cited by AA page number.
- R *Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der bloßen Vernunft* (AA 6). *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, ed. and trans. Allen W. Wood and George di Giovanni (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996). Cited by AA page number.
- TP *Über den Gemeinspruch: Das mag in der Theorie richtig sein, taugt aber nicht für die Praxis* (AA 8). *On the common saying: That may be correct in theory but it is of no use in practice*, in *Practical Philosophy*. Cited by AA page number.

Writings of Fichte

- SW *Fichtes sämtliche Werke*, ed. I. H. Fichte (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1970). Cited by volume and page number.
- EPW *Fichte: Early Philosophical Writings*, ed. Daniel Breazeale (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1988). Cited by page number.
- SE *The System of Ethics* (1798), trans. and ed. Daniel Breazeale and Günter Zöller (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).