

QUALIA AND MENTAL CAUSATION IN A PHYSICAL WORLD

How does mind fit into nature? Philosophy has long been concerned with this question. No contemporary philosopher has done more to clarify it than Jaegwon Kim, a distinguished analytic philosopher specializing in metaphysics and philosophy of mind. With new contributions from an outstanding lineup of eminent scholars, this volume focuses on issues raised in Kim's work. The chapters cluster around two themes: first, exclusion, supervenience, and reduction, with attention to the causal exclusion argument for which Kim is widely celebrated, and, second, phenomenal consciousness and qualia, with attention to the prospects for a functionalist account of the mental. This volume is sure to become a major focus of attention and research in the disciplines of metaphysics and philosophy of mind.

TERENCE HORGAN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona.

MARCELO SABATÉS is Associate Provost for International Programs at Kansas State University.

DAVID SOSA is Temple Professor in the Humanities at the University of Texas at Austin.





QUALIA AND MENTAL CAUSATION IN A PHYSICAL WORLD

Themes from the Philosophy of Jaegwon Kim

EDITED BY TERENCE HORGAN, MARCELO SABATÉS, AND DAVID SOSA





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107077836

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-07783-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of contributors Preface		<i>page</i> vii ix
Ι	Reality and reduction: What's really at stake in the causal exclusion debate Louise M. Antony	Ι
2	Two property theories and the causal conundrum for physicalism Frank Jackson	25
3	Mental causation: The free lunch Barry Loewer	40
4	Does mental causation require psychophysical identities? Brian P. McLaughlin	64
5	The Canberra Plan neglects ground Ned Block	105
6	Microrealization and the mental Sydney Shoemaker	134
7	Supervenience and the causal explanation of behavior Fred Dretske	154
8	Visual awareness and visual qualia Christopher Hill	167
9	Phenomenal externalism, Lolita, and the planet Xenon <i>Michael Tye</i>	190
10	Troubles for radical transparency Iames Van Cleve	209

V



•	
T 74	
VI	

II	How theories work: Open questions for methodological philosophy of science Lawrence Sklar	231
-	References Index	



Contributors

- LOUISE M. ANTONY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst.
- NED BLOCK is Silver Professor of Philosophy, Psychology, and Neural Science at New York University.
- FRED DRETSKE was, at the time of his passing in 2013, Senior Research Scholar in Philosophy at Duke University.
- CHRISTOPHER HILL is Professor of Philosophy at Brown University.
- FRANK JACKSON is Distinguished Professor in the School of Philosophy at the Australian National University and Visiting Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University.
- BARRY LOEWER is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Rutgers Center for Philosophy of Science at Rutgers University.
- BRIAN P. MCLAUGHLIN is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy and Cognitive Science at Rutgers University.
- SYDNEY SHOEMAKER is Susan Linn Sage Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at Cornell University.
- LAWRENCE SKLAR is Carl G. Hempel and William K. Frankena Distinguished University Professor of Philosophy at University of Michigan, Ann Arbor.
- MICHAEL TYE is the Dallas TACA Centennial Professor in Liberal Arts at the University of Texas, Austin.
- JAMES VAN CLEVE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Southern California.

vii





Preface

The essays collected here are presented to Jaegwon Kim in recognition, and appreciation, of the enormous contributions he has made over the course of a long and distinguished career. Kim graduated from Dartmouth College in 1958 and received his PhD from Princeton University in 1962. He held teaching positions at Swarthmore College (1961-3), Brown University (1963-7), Cornell University (1970-1), Johns Hopkins University (1977-8), and the University of Michigan (1967-87) before returning to Brown University, in 1987, as the Herbert Perry Faunce Professor of Philosophy. Kim was president of the American Philosophical Association, Central Division, in 1988–9, and he was elected to the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 1991. He is the author of six books: Supervenience and Mind (1993), Philosophy of Mind (1996, 2nd edn. 2006), Mind in a Physical World (1998), Physicalism, or Something Near Enough (2005), Trois essais sur l'émergence (2006), and Essays in the Metaphysics of Mind (2010). Kim's published articles are too numerous to list here, but many of them have been seminal works, setting a new agenda for the discipline or reconfiguring the existing dialectic. It is a testament to his effect that so many other significant philosophers engage with his work, either directly or indirectly, by approaching philosophical issues that have been shaped by his treatment. The editors are grateful to the contributors for their patience as this publication came to fruition. We do think it is, now, a fitting tribute to Professor Kim's body of work.