#### Hildegard of Bingen and Musical Reception

Since her death in 1179, Hildegard of Bingen has commanded attention in every century. In this book Jennifer Bain traces the historical reception of Hildegard, focusing particularly on the moment in the modern era when she began to be considered as a composer. Bain examines how the activities of clergy in nineteenth-century Eibingen resulted in increased veneration of Hildegard, an authentication of her relics, and a rediscovery of her music. The book goes on to situate the emergence of Hildegard's music both within the French chant restoration movement driven by Solesmes and the German chant revival supported by Cecilianism, the German movement to reform church music more generally. Engaging with the complex political and religious environment in German speaking areas, Bain places the more recent anglophone revival of Hildegard's music in a broader historical perspective and reveals the important intersections amongst local devotion, popular culture, and intellectual activities.

JENNIFER BAIN is Associate Professor of Music at the Fountain School of Performing Arts at Dalhousie University. Her articles have appeared in book collections, in *The New Catholic Encyclopedia*, and in music journals such as the *Journal of Music Theory*, *Music Theory Spectrum*, the *Journal of Musicological Research*, and *Studi musicali*. She edited a special early music issue of the *Journal of Music Theory*, and with French literature scholar, Deborah McGrady, co-edited *A Companion to Guillaume de Machaut* (2012). The inaugural recipient of the Sarah Jane Williams Award from the International Machaut Society, she has received publication grants from both the Society for Music Theory and the American Musicological Society, as well as research grants from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

# Hildegard of Bingen and Musical Reception

The Modern Revival of a Medieval Composer

JENNIFER BAIN



#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107076662

© Jennifer Bain 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Bain, Jennifer, 1967– Hildegard of Bingen and musical reception : the modern revival of a medieval composer / Jennifer Bain. pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-07666-2 (hardback) 1. Hildegard, Saint, 1098–1179–Appreciation–History. 2. Gregorian chant–History and criticism. I. Title. ML410.H618B35 2015 782.25092–dc23 2014044209

ISBN 978-1-107-07666-2 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> To my mother, Susan Bain

# Contents

List of figures [page viii] List of music examples [x] List of tables [xi] Acknowledgements [xii]

Introduction: *O virga ac diadema* – historiography of a song [1]

- 1 Forgotten? Hildegard's reception from 1179 to 1850 [35]
- 2 Hildegard's increased veneration and emergence as a composer [70]
- 3 The German revival of chant [101]
- 4 Hildegard and the *Kulturkampf* [135]
- 5 Hildegard, tourism, and the politics of chant [165]

Conclusion: new century, new abbey, new Hildegard [193]

Bibliography [205] Index [227]

vii

#### Figures

- 0.1 The Hildegardis Apotheke in Rüdesheim. Photo by the author. [13]
- 0.2 Opening of *O virga ac diadema* from the *Riesencodex*, fol. 473v (with permission of the Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain). [21]
- 0.3 Jakob Köbel's 1524 author portrait woodcut, as reproduced by P. Ignatius Stützle, OSB, *Hildegard-Büchlein* (1929), illustration inserted between pages 16 and 17. Photo reproduced with permission of Dalhousie Photography Services. [26]
- 1.1 The northern pediment at Walhalla (1842) depicting Arminius (Hermann) victorious in battle with the Romans. Photo by the author. [43]
- 1.2 Plate on wall featuring Hildegard at Walhalla (1842). Photo by the author. [45]
- 2.1 Ludwig Schneider's leaflet, Die heilige Hildegardis, Jungfrau und Abtissin (1857), with three scenes depicted: Hildegard healing a blind child in Rüdesheim, and her monastic buildings as they stood at Rupertsberg in 1632 and Eibingen in 1857 (Gm5381<sup>II</sup>, front side, with permission of the Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain). [85]
- 3.1 Frontispiece of *Graduale romanum* (Mechlin, 1848). Photo reproduced with permission of Dalhousie Photography Services. [109]
- 3.2 Side-by-side comparison of the *Missa in duplicibus et solemnibus diebus*, in *Graduale Romanum* (Mechlin), 290 and [Schneider], *Lateinische Choralgesänge*, 17. *Graduale Romanum* photo reproduced with permission of Dalhousie Photography Services, and *Lateinische Choralgesänge* (My 6476) with permission of the Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain. [114]
- 4.1 Raymund Schlecht, facsimile of top two columns of the opening folio of music in the *Riesencodex*, fol. 466r, as published on the front page of the Appendix in Johannes Schmelzeis, *Das Leben und Wirken der heiligen Hildegardis* (1879). Photo reproduced with permission of Dalhousie Photography Services. [151]

viii

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07666-2 - Hildegard of Bingen and Musical Reception: The Modern Revival of a Medieval Composer Jennifer Bain Frontmatter More information

List of figures

ix

- 4.2 Raymund Schlecht, first page of his edition of Hildegard's *O vis aeternitatis*, as published in the Appendix in Schmelzeis, *Das Leben und Wirken der heiligen Hildegardis* (1879), 1. Photo reproduced with permission of Dalhousie Photography Services. [154]
- 4.3 A scene depicting the meeting of Hildegard and Barbarossa from the interior of the modern Hildegard Abbey. Photo by the author. [162]
- 5.1 Map tracing the journey of the Pothier brothers from Solesmes to Mainz and Wiesbaden in 1878. [167]
- 5.2 Dom Pothier, transcription of Hildegard's Kyrie in his notebook, Bibliothèque Abbaye Saint-Wandrille, MS 71, fols. 22v–23r (photographed and reproduced with permission of the Bibliothèque de Saint-Wandrille). [180]
- 5.3 Hildegard's Kyrie in the *Riesencodex*, fol. 472v. Reproduced with permission of the Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain. [182]
- 5.4 Dom Pothier's published edition of Hildegard's Kyrie, in the *Revue du chant grégorien* 7/3 (1898): 65. (Photographed and reproduced with permission of the Bibliothèque de Saint-Wandrille). [185]
- 6.1 The modern Hildegard Abbey. Photo reproduced with permission of Katherine Helsen. [197]

## Music examples

0.1	Transcription of O virga ac diadema from the
	Riesencodex, Wiesbaden, Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek
	RheinMain, HS 2, fols. 473v-474r. [18]
~ ~	

- 0.2 Richard Souther's arrangement of Hildegard's *O virga ac diadema*. [20]
- 2.1 First stanza of *Ave, Sankt Hildegardis*, transcribed with melody from Stützle, OSB, *Hildegard-Büchlein* (1929), 70–71. [98]
- 3.1 Laetentur caeli: comparison between the Solesmes Graduale romanum (1908) and the Medicean Graduale de tempore (1614), adapted from Hiley, Gregorian Chant (2009), 210. [107]
- Transcription of Schneider's edition of O virga ac diadema, from [Schneider], Lateinische Choralgesänge (1867), 550–552. [116]
- 5.1 Transcription of Hildegard's Kyrie, from the Riesencodex, Wiesbaden, Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain, HS 2, fol. 472v. [186]

# Tables

- 0.1 Hildegard of Bingen, *O virga ac diadema*, sequence for Mary. Text and translation from Newman, *Symphonia* (1988), 128–131. [16]
- O sancta Hildegardis, from [Schneider], Andacht zu Ehren der heil. Jungfrauen und Abtissin Hildegardis (1857), 2–6.
  Full text with English translation. [87]
- 2.2 Rhyme comparison of *O sancta Hildegardis* and *Ave Maria klare*. *O sancta Hildegardis* as it appears in [Schneider], *Andacht* (1857), 2; and *Ave Maria klare* as reproduced by Bertold Hummel (1978), drawn from *Gesangbücher* from Olmütz (*c*. 1500) and Mainz (1947). [89]
- 2.3 Full texts of *O* sancta Hildegardis and Ave Maria klare. *O* sancta Hildegardis as it appears in [Schneider], Andacht (1857), 2–6, and Ave Maria klare as reproduced by Bertold Hummel (1978), drawn from Gesangbücher from Olmütz (c. 1500) and Mainz (1947). [90]
- 2.4 Ludwig Schneider's two-stanza antiphon text, *Ave Hildegardis*, with acrostic, from *Andacht* (1857), 16, with English translation. [92]
- 2.5 Comparison of *O sancta Hildegardis* and *Ave*, *Sankt Hildegardis*, from [Schneider], *Andacht* (1857), 2–6, and P. Ignatius Stützle OSB, *Hildegard-Büchlein* (1929), 70–73 respectively. [96]
- 3.1 Table comparing the contents of *Graduale romanum* (Mechlin, 1848), and [Schneider], *Lateinische Choralgesänge* (1867). [111]

### Acknowledgements

I have many people and institutions to thank for their encouragement and assistance over the years in helping me bring this book to completion. I have to thank in particular the patient and helpful staff at a number of libraries and archives, including the inter-library loan staff at the Killam Library at Dalhousie University; Wolfgang Podehl, Annette Schmelz, Martin Mayer, and Marion Grabka at the Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain in Wiesbaden (formerly the Hessische Landesbibliothek); the archivist and Schwester Hiltrud at the Benediktinerinnenabtei St. Hildegard in Eibingen; staff at the Priesterseminarbibliothek and Archive in Trier; Martina Wagner at the Diocesan Library and Archive in Limburg; Christiane Schäfer at the Gesangbucharchiv at the Johannes Gutenberg University in Mainz; and Henri Poujol at the library at Abbaye Saint-Wandrille. I have had a fabulous series of research assistants as well over the last decade, who have helped with many different parts of this project: Rebekah (Sheppard) McCallum, Kirsten Saliste, Laura Harris, Kate Helsen, Ryan Kirk, Clare Neil, and Barbara Swanson.

Numerous colleagues, family, and friends have helped at various stages, including Barbara Haggh-Huglo, Lori Kruckenburg, Margot Fassler, Timothy McGee, and the late Werner Lauter, who encouraged me at key moments in the project; faculty and students at Dalhousie who engaged in lively discussion over brownbag lunch presentations; and my colleague, Jacqueline Warwick, who agreed to relieve me of my chair duties for a semester so I could take a sabbatical leave in the fall of 2011. A number of faculty at McGill University where I completed my M.A. supported my early work on Hildegard, including Candace Marles, who bought me Barbara Newman's edition and translation of Hildegard's musical texts, and especially Don McLean and Julie Cumming, who were model co-supervisors of my Master's thesis (my first major study on Hildegard), and who have kept an active interest in my professional life. Jim Docking, Simon Docking, John Slinn, Horst Bussiek, and Stephen McClatchie all assisted with translations. Susan Bain, Deborah McGrady, and my anonymous readers provided me with helpful conceptual feedback on the first draft, while my long-time friend, Jennifer Ormston, provided meticulous and detailed commentary

xii

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

Acknowledgements

xiii

on the clarity of my writing, which improved the text and my thinking enormously. Jean-Pierre Noiseux generously provided me with materials, read through various chapter drafts, and answered numerous queries over email. I am certain that I only managed to finish the first draft of the book in the summer of 2012 because of an inspirational chat with Peter Loewen at Kalamazoo that allowed me to reconceptualize the trajectory of the book and complete it three months later.

For technical assistance, my thanks go to Don Giller and Ian Crutchley, for their careful typesetting of my music examples, and Nick Pearce, a photographer at Dalhousie, for his attention to detail. I am most grateful to my commissioning editor at Cambridge, Vicki Cooper, for guiding me through the process and for encouraging my project from our very first interaction over email, and to Cambridge editor Fleur Jones, for her helpful and very quick responses to my many questions about formatting and permissions as I reached the final stages. I am grateful as well for Rob Wilkinson's able guidance through the production stage and Robert Whitelock's conscientious and thorough copy-editing. All errors that remain are, of course, my own.

I must acknowledge as well the library at Abbaye Saint-Wandrille and the Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek RheinMain for supplying me with images and allowing me to reproduce them here. Also the *Journal of Musicological Research* for permission to reproduce much of my article "Was Hildegard Forgotten?" in Chapter 1 of this book. The bulk of the research for this book was supported by a standard research grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, as well as through Research Development Fund grants and the Burgess Award at Dalhousie University, and finally through a publication subvention grant from the American Musicological Society.

On a personal level, I am ever grateful to my mother, who first inspired me to read about the history of extraordinary women, and to my retired colleague, David Schroeder, who started supporting my work on Hildegard when he interviewed me for the job at Dalhousie, and who, with his wife Linda, has been a generous and dear friend. My friends Sonya and Tim have kept me grounded – and frequently well fed and imbibed. Most importantly, for their unfailing support, patience when I am preoccupied, and engaging, witty, and happy companionship, I thank Simon and Hannah.