

# SCRIBAL CORRECTION AND LITERARY CRAFT

This extensive study of scribal correction in English manuscripts explores what correcting reveals about attitudes to books, language and literature in late medieval England. Daniel Wakelin surveys a range of manuscripts and genres, but focuses especially on poems by Chaucer, Hoccleve and Lydgate, and on prose works such as chronicles, religious instruction and practical lore. His materials are the variants and corrections found in manuscripts, phenomena usually studied only by editors or palaeographers, but his method is the close reading and interpretation typical of literary criticism. From the corrections emerge often overlooked aspects of English literary thinking in the late Middle Ages: scribes, readers and authors seek, though often fail to achieve, invariant copying, orderly spelling, precise diction, regular verse and textual completeness. Correcting reveals their impressive attention to scribal and literary craft – its rigour, subtlety, formalism and imaginativeness - in an age with little other literary criticism in English.

DANIEL WAKELIN is Jeremy Griffiths Professor of Medieval English Palaeography in the Faculty of English Language and Literature, University of Oxford, and a fellow of St Hilda's College. He is the author of *Humanism, Reading and English Literature 1430–1530* (2007) and coeditor with Alexandra Gillespie of *The Production of Books in England 1350–1500* (Cambridge, 2011).



#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL LITERATURE

GENERAL EDITOR
Alastair Minnis, Yale University

#### EDITORIAL BOARD

Zygmunt G. Barański, University of Cambridge
Christopher C. Baswell, Barnard College and Columbia University
John Burrow, University of Bristol
Mary Carruthers, New York University
Rita Copeland, University of Pennsylvania
Roberta Frank, Yale University
Simon Gaunt, King's College, London
Steven Kruger, City University of New York
Nigel Palmer, University of Oxford
Winthrop Wetherbee, Cornell University
Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, Fordham University

This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c. 1100–1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

#### RECENT TITLES IN THE SERIES

Lisa H. Cooper Artisans and Narrative Craft in Late-Medieval England Alison Cornish Vernacular Translation in Dante's Italy: Illiterate Literature Jane Gilbert Living Death in Medieval French and English Literature Jessica Rosenfeld Ethics and Enjoyment in Late Medieval Poetry: Love After Aristotle Michael Van Dussen From England to Bohemia: Heresy and Communication in the Later Middle Ages

Martin Eisner Boccaccio and the Invention of Italian Literary Culture: Dante,
Petrarch, Cavalcanti, and the Authority of the Vernacular
Emily V. Thornbury Becoming a Poet in Anglo-Saxon England
Lawrence Warner The Myth of 'Piers Plowman'
Lee Manion Narrating the Crusades: Loss and Recovery in Medieval and Early
Modern English Literature
Daniel Wakelin Scribal Correction and Literary Craft: English Manuscripts
1375–1510

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at the end of the volume.



# SCRIBAL CORRECTION AND LITERARY CRAFT

English Manuscripts 1375–1510

DANIEL WAKELIN





## CAMBRIDGE

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

> www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107076228

> > © Daniel Wakelin 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Wakelin, Daniel.

Scribal correction and literary craft: English manuscripts 1375–1510 / Daniel Wakelin. pages cm. - (Cambridge studies in medieval literature; 91)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-I-107-07622-8 (hardback)

- 1. English literature Middle English, 1100-1500 History and criticism.
- 2. Manuscripts, Medieval England History. 3. Transmission of texts. 4. Literature, Medieval Criticism, Textual. 5. England Intellectual life 1066–1485. I. Title.

Z106.5.G7W35 2014 091′.0942 – dc23 2014010611

ISBN 978-1-107-07622-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

List of illustrations List of tables		<i>page</i> vii
		viii
Ack	enowledgements	X
Note on transcriptions List of abbreviations		xii
		xiv
I	Introduction	I
PAI	RT I CONTEXTS	
2	Inviting correction	19
3	Copying, varying and correcting	43
4	People and institutions	71
PAI	RT II CRAFT	
5	Techniques	IOI
6	Accuracy	128
7	Writing well	157
PAI	RT III LITERARY CRITICISM	
8	Diction, tone and style	187
9	Form	217
Ю	Completeness	246

v



vi <i>Contents</i>	
PART IV IMPLICATIONS	
11 Authorship	277
12 Conclusion: varying, correcting and critical thinking	302
Bibliography	
Index of manuscripts	
General index	338



## Illustrations

I	HEHL, MS HM 268, f. 117 <sup>v</sup> : two marginal prompts in John	
	Lydgate's <i>The Fall of Princes</i> . Reproduced by permission of the	
	Huntington Library, San Marino, California	page 96
2	HEHL, MS HM 143, f. 6 <sup>r</sup> : signes de renvoie and notes reordering	g
	the text in William Langland's Piers Plowman. Reproduced by	
	permission of the Huntington Library, San Marino, California	119
3	HEHL, MS HM 58, f. 18 <sup>v</sup> : crossing out of a passage copied	
	prematurely in Agnus castus. Reproduced by permission of the	
	Huntington Library, San Marino, California	147
4	HEHL, MS HM 112, f. 65 <sup>r</sup> : three additions in the margins in	
	Walter Hilton's <i>The Scale of Perfection</i> . Reproduced by	
	permission of the Huntington Library, San Marino, California	214
5	HEHL, MS HM 144, f. 18 <sup>v</sup> : the correction of misdivided stanza	
	in John Lydgate's <i>Life of Our Lady</i> . Reproduced by permission of	of
	the Huntington Library, San Marino, California	244
6	CUL, MS Mm.2.5, f. 32 <sup>v</sup> : erased braces in Geoffrey Chaucer's	
	The Canterbury Tales. Reproduced by permission of the Syndics	S
	of Cambridge University Library	268



## Tables

3.1	Divergences in some direct copies of still surviving exemplars,	
	and the number of corrections in the direct copies	page 46
3.2	Divergences between cognate copies, and the number of	
	corrections in all two (a) or three (b) of the cognate copies	47
3.3	Variants in open-class words which are difficult to explain	
	'mechanically' in sampled passages of Mc and Ra <sup>1</sup>	59
3.4	Gaps left in part of Gl, for which the exemplar survives in Mm	62
<b>4.</b> I	The person responsible for corrections for manuscripts in	
	English in the HEHL	73
5 <b>.</b> I	Some techniques for correcting in the HEHL sample	105
6.I	The frequency of corrections per page for manuscripts in	
	English in the HEHL	131
6.2	Interlineations which needlessly correct spelling in HEHL,	
	MS HM 148 (Part II)	139
6.3	Corrections to two lyrics in English in HEHL, MS El.	
	34.B.60, f. 11 <sup>r-v</sup>	140
6.4	The agreement of corrections in some manuscripts in English	
	in the HEHL with modern printed editions of their texts	143
7 <b>.</b> I	Corrections to single words, spellings and grammar in	
	manuscripts in English in the HEHL	158
7.2	Some corrections to archaism in Chicago, Newberry Library,	
	MS f36, ff. 78 <sup>r</sup> /8–85 <sup>r</sup> /1, from Walton (trans.), <i>Boethius</i> ,	
	prol. 1–176, and 1.1–224	169
7.3	Some corrections to spelling in the stint of scribe 1 in	
	Durham, UL, MS Cosin V.iii.24	171
7 <b>·</b> 4	Needless changes to spelling in HEHL, MS HM 144, with	
	extant printed exemplars	176
7.5	Needless changes to spelling in OTC, MS 29, with an extant	
	printed exemplar	176

viii



	List of tables	ix
8.1	Corrections to lexical or open-class words in the manuscripts in English in HEHL	188
8 2	Some marginal prompts changing lexical words in <i>Fall</i> in	100
0.2	HEHL, MS HM 268	193
8 3	Marginal additions of adjectives and adverbs to <i>Tales</i> in BL,	193
0.9	MS Harley 1758	199
8.4	Some corrections to doublets, adjectives and adverbs in	
	Mirror in HEHL, MS HM 1339	209
8.5	Some corrections to doublets in HEHL, MS HM 112,	
	compared with Scale and also Hilton, The Scale of Perfection,	
	ed. Bestul	213
9.1	Corrections to rhyming words which already made sense in	
	context in Tales in OTC, MS 49	223
9.2	Corrections to the spelling of rhyme-words in <i>Fall</i> in PML,	
	MS M.124	233
	Lines copied out of sequence in Tales in BL, MS Sloane 1686	251
	Gaps left for missing lines in Tales in BL, MS Sloane 1686	254
10.3	Gaps left in the right and wrong places for lines missing in	
	Fall in PUL, MS Garrett 139 and Chicago, Newberry Library,	
	MS +33.3	255
10.4	Whole lines or longer passages added in the margins of <i>Tales</i>	
	in BL, MS Harley 1758	264
10.5	Missing lines in <i>Tales</i> in Mc, with invented and modified	
	lines in the cognate copy, Ra <sup>I</sup>	272
II.I	Frequency and types of correction in definite or possible	
	autograph manuscripts of Thomas Hoccleve's poetry	284
	Variant lines in two copies of dedicatory poems from <i>Regiment</i>	291
11.3	Interlineations into Ee, with corresponding poem-stanza-line	
	numbers from Ryman, 'Gedichte', ed. Zupitza.	295



## Acknowledgements

I received some generous grants for travel to study manuscripts in various places. The most important were two scholarships from the Huntington Library, San Marino, at which I was a Francis Bacon Foundation Fellow in 2006 and a Mayer Fellow in 2009. I was also able to visit libraries in the eastern USA when I was kindly invited to be the Charles A. Owen Ir Visiting Professor of Medieval Studies at the University of Connecticut in September 2009, and in Illinois thanks to the Newberry Library, Chicago, and to the Faculty of English in the University of Oxford. Grants from the Master and Fellows of Christ's College in Cambridge and from the University of Cambridge's Research Travel Fund allowed me to commute over several months to the British Library and to visit the Huntington Library once more. Toshiyuki Takamiya generously invited me to see his manuscripts in Tokyo, and he and his Round Table welcomed me there very warmly. The research was also expedited when I was granted a term of sabbatical as an Early Career Fellow at CRASSH, and when the Isaac Newton Trust in Cambridge and the Faculty of English in Oxford paid for Sara Harris and Daniel Sawyer each to spend a week gathering and checking some transcriptions and bibliography for Chapter 3. Lately, I have benefited a great deal from the opportunities provided by my new post in Oxford, which has been generously created by John and Jeanne Griffiths. I am extremely grateful to all these people and institutions.

I am grateful, too, to the librarians who have facilitated this research, at Corpus Christi College, St John's College, Trinity College and the University Library, Cambridge; the University of Illinois, Urbana—Champaign; the Newberry Library and the University Library, Chicago; the University Library, Durham (especially A.I. Doyle); the University Library, Glasgow; the Cathedral Library, Lincoln; the British Library, London; the John Rylands Library, Manchester; Columbia University Library (especially Consuelo Dutschke) and the Pierpont Morgan Library, New York;



#### Acknowledgements

хi

Corpus Christi College and the Bodleian Library, Oxford; the Rosenbach Museum and Library, Philadelphia; the University Library, Princeton; Longleat House, Wiltshire; and most of all the Huntington Library, San Marino.

People at conferences of the New Chaucer Society, the Early Book Society, the Early English Text Society, the Material Text Network and the Medieval Song Network and at seminars at the Universities of Cambridge, Connecticut, Glasgow, Harvard, Illinois, London, Oxford and UCLA all put me right on many useful points. Among many who offered advice, Richard Beadle, Orietta Da Rold, Catherine Nall, Derek Pearsall and Kathleen Tonry time and again not only tolerated my obsession with correcting but encouraged it. For Cambridge University Press, Anna Bond, Linda Bree, Damian Love and Alastair Minnis were encouraging and patient, and two anonymous readers offered some extremely constructive criticism.

Most importantly I must thank Joel Harvey who, when I long ago mentioned a manuscript with 'unusually many corrections', asked 'How do you know what's usual?' and 'So what?' This book began as an attempt to answer these two questions – especially the second, which people who are not palaeographers quite reasonably ask.



## Note on transcriptions

In transcribing corrections from manuscripts, I use the following conventions:

cats —and dogs—	and dogs added level in a blank space or
_	adjacent to the end of the line
cats dogs —and—	and added in the margin
cats ^and dogs	and dogs interlineated above the line, in
	this case with a <i>caret</i> mark of some sort
cats and [cats]dogs	cats crossed out, subpuncted or erased
cats and [cats]^dogs	cats crossed out, subpuncted or erased; dogs
	interlineated above the line
cats and [cats]{dogs}	cats erased; dogs written over the erasure
_	(overwritten)
cats [-d] dogs	a word between cats and dogs crossed out,
0	subpuncted or erased and impossible to
	read, but likely having three letters, two of
	them indeterminable, the last likely d
[->]{cats and dogs}	cats and dogs written over erasure; the
	erasure now illegible but of the same
	length as the writing above it
[->]{cats and dogs }	cats and dogs written over erasure; the
	erasure now illegible and slightly longer
	than the writing above it, with space left
	blank
cats <and> dogs</and>	and difficult to read for whatever reason

The terms *cross out*, *subpunct*, *erase* and *interlineate* or *interline* are explained in Chapter 5.

I have used italics to mark all expansions of abbreviations, which is ugly but necessary here, as the argument often concerns points of spelling. I have not usually noted my policy for deciding which possible marks of



#### Note on transcriptions

xiii

abbreviation to treat as 'otiose' strokes, unless relevant to the argument. As most of the manuscripts date from the fifteenth century, I have tended to ignore flourishes and horizontal marks as otiose when they would add <e> to word-final <ch>, <gh>, <ght>, <m>, <n> and (for instance, ignoring an otiose stroke on II in 'will' in the epigraph to Chapter 1), but tended to expand them when they would add <e> to <r> or would add <i>, <n> or <u> to <on>, <iou> or <ion>. I have reproduced the punctuation in manuscripts as best I could in typescript. The *punctus elevatus* is reproduced thus: .' with a full-stop followed by an apostrophe. For clarity about what is a scribal *punctus*, my ellipses of quotations are in square brackets thus [...].

I place letters discussed for their spelling in angle brackets, such as <ght>, phonetic symbols in virgules, such as /xt/, and graphs discussed as visual phenomena in bold, such as 3.

I provide line numbers from manuscripts only when the feature discussed seems difficult to spot. Such line numbers follow the folio and a virgule / and, where relevant, 'a' or 'b' to specify which column: f. 1<sup>r</sup>/a7 is the seventh line on the first column of the first page.

If modern editions have line numbers, I use them rather than page numbers. I place 'book' numbers in roman numerals before a point: *Fall*, 1.1421 is book I, line 1421 of Lydgate's *The Fall of Princes*. If the line numbers restart on each page, as in some editions of prose, the page number is given followed by the line number after a point: *Brut*, 243.6 is line 6 on page 243 of the Middle English prose *Brut* as edited by Friedrich W.D. Brie.



### Abbreviations

BL London, British Library BodL Oxford, Bodleian Library

Brut Friedrich W.D. Brie (ed.), The Brut or The

Chronicles of England, EETS os 131, 136, 2 vols.

(London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1906–8)

CCCC Cambridge, Corpus Christi College Library

ChRev. Chaucer Review

CUL Cambridge, University Library EETS Early English Text Society

os original series

es extra series ss supplementary series

EMS English Manuscript Studies

Fall John Lydgate, Fall of Princes, ed. Henry Bergen,

EETS es 121–4, 4 vols. (London: Oxford University

Press, 1924-7), with book numbers and line

numbers thus: VIII.426

Gamelyn, in Donald B. Sands (ed.), Middle English

Verse Romances (1966; University of Exeter Press,

1986), 154–81

GUL Glasgow, University Library

HEHL San Marino, CA, Henry E. Huntington Library

HLQ Huntington Library Quarterly

Hoccleve, MP Thomas Hoccleve, Minor Poems, ed. Frederick J.

Furnivall, EETS es 61 (London: Kegan Paul,

Trench, Trübner, 1892)

xiv



#### List of abbreviations

XV

Hudson (ed.), 'The Egerton sermon', in Anne Hudson

'Omnis plantacio' (ed.), The Works of a Lollard Preacher, EETS os 317

(London: Oxford University Press, 2001), 2-143,

with line numbers

JEBS Journal of the Early Book Society
JRL Manchester, John Rylands Library

LALME Angus McIntosh, M.L. Samuels and Michael

Benskin, with the assistance of Margaret Laing and Keith Williamson, *A Linguistic Atlas of Late* 

Mediaeval English, 4 vols. (Aberdeen University

Press, 1986)

LIMES Linne R. Mooney, Simon Horobin and Estelle

Stubbs, *Late Medieval English Scribes*, www. medievalscribes.com, ISBN 978-0-9557876-6-9

Lydgate, LOL John Lydgate, Life of Our Lady, ed. Joseph A.

Lauritis, Ralph A. Klinefelter and Vernon F. Gallagher, Duquesne Studies: Philological Series 2 (Pittsburgh, PA: Duquesne University Press, 1961)

Lydgate, MP-I John Lydgate, Minor Poems, ed. Henry Noble

MacCracken, EETS es 107 (London: Oxford

University Press, 1911)

Lydgate, MP-II John Lydgate, Minor Poems, ed. Henry Noble

MacCracken, EETS os 192 (London: Oxford

University Press, 1934)

MÆ Medium Ævum

MED Hans Kurath and others (eds.), The Middle English

Dictionary (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1952–2001); http://ets.umdl.umich.edu/m/

mea

Mirror Nicholas Love, The Mirror of the Blessed Life of Jesus

Christ, ed. Michael G. Sargent (University of

Exeter Press, 2005)

N&Q Notes and Queries

NHC Anne B. Thompson (ed.), The Northern Homily

Cycle (Kalamazoo, MI: Medieval Institute

Publications, 2008)

NM Neuphilologische Mitteilungen

OED The Oxford English Dictionary, ed. John A.

Simpson and E.S.C. Weiner, 2nd edn, 20 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989); www.oed.com



xvi List of abbreviations

OTC Oxford, Trinity College

Piers A William Langland, Piers Plowman: The A Version:

Will's Visions of Piers Plowman and Do-Well, ed. George Kane, rev. edn (1960; London: Athlone, 1988), with passus-and-line numbers for the poem ('xx.1'), or followed by 'ed. Kane' and page

numbers for the introduction

Piers B William Langland, Piers Plowman: The B Version:

Will's Visions of Piers Plowman, Do-Well, Do-Better and Do-Best, ed. George Kane and E. Talbot Donaldson, rev. edn (1975; London: Athlone,

1988), with references as for *Piers A* 

Piers C William Langland, Piers Plowman: The C Version:

Will's Visions of Piers Plowman, Do-Well, Do-Better, and Do-Best, ed. George Russell and George Kane (London: Athlone, 1997), with references as for

Piers A

PML New York, NY, Pierpont Morgan Library
Polychronicon Ranulph Higden, Polychronicon, trans. John

Trevisa, ed. Churchill Babington and J. Rawson Lumby, RS 41, 9 vols. (London: HMSO, 1865–86),

with book, chapter, and page numbers thus:

III.33.57

Prick Richard Morris (ed.), The Pricke of Conscience

(Stimulus conscientiae) (Berlin: Asher, 1863)

PUL Princeton, NJ, Princeton University Library
Regiment Thomas Hoccleve, The Regiment of Princes, ed.

Charles R. Blyth (Kalamazoo, MI: Medieval

Institute Publications, 1999)

RS Rolls Series

SAC Studies in the Age of Chaucer SB Studies in Bibliography

Scale Walter Hilton, The Scale of Perfection, ed. Evelyn

Underhill (London: Watkins, 1923)

STC A. W. Pollard and G. R. Redgrave, A Short Title

Catalogue of Books Printed in England, Scotland, and Ireland, and of English Books Printed Abroad, 1475–1640, ed. W.A. Jackson, F.S. Ferguson and Katherine F. Pantzer, 2nd edn, 3 vols. (London:

Bibliographical Society, 1976-91)



List of abbreviations

xvii

Tales Geoffrey Chaucer, The Canterbury Tales, in The

Riverside Chaucer, ed. Larry D. Benson (Oxford University Press, 1988), with fragment-numbers

and line numbers

TCC Cambridge, Trinity College Library

Troilus Geoffrey Chaucer, Troilus and Criseyde, ed. B.A.

Windeatt (London: Longman, 1984), with reference to book and line numbers (1.515), or followed by 'ed. Windeatt' and page numbers for

the introduction

UL University Library

Walton (trans.), John Walton (trans.), Boethius: De

Boethius consolatione philosophiae, ed. Mark Science, EETS

os 170 (London: Oxford University Press, 1927)

Wycliffite Bible Josiah Forshall and Frederic Madden (eds.), The

Holy Bible, Containing the Old and New Testaments, with the Apocryphal Books, in the Earliest English Versions Made from the Latin Vulgate by John Wycliffe and His Followers, 4 vols. (Oxford University Press, 1850), with book, chapter

and verse thus: Galatians 5.16

YLS Yearbook of Langland Studies

Yorkshire Writers C. Horstmann (ed.), Yorkshire Writers: Richard

Rolle of Hampole, an English Father of the Church, and His Followers, 2 vols. (London: Sonnenschein,

1895–6)

Some chapters cite certain MSS frequently by the following sigla, repeated here for ready reference:

Ar BL, MS Arundel 38 Bm BL, MS Add. 10574 Bo BodL, MS Bodley 814

Cot BL, MS Cotton Caligula A.xi

D BodL, MS Douce 372

Ds Tokyo, Takamiya collection, MS 24, olim 'The Devonshire

Chaucer'

Du Durham, UL, MS Cosin V.iii.9

Ee CUL, MS Ee.1.12 En<sup>1</sup> BL, MS Egerton 2726



List of abbreviations
GUL, MS Hunter 197 (U.1.1)
GUL, MS Hunter 83 (T.3.21)
BL, MS Harley 4775
BL, MS Harley 4866
HEHL, MS HM 58
HEHL, MS HM 111
HEHL, MS HM 744 (Part II)
BL, MS Harley 3730
Chicago, UL, MS 564
CUL, MS Mm.2.5
Cambridge, Peterhouse, MS 190
BodL, MS Rawl. poet. 141
BL, MS Royal 17.D.xviii
BL, MS Harley 2281
HEHL, MS HM 130