## The Emergence of Humanitarian Intervention

How should the international community react when a government transgresses humanitarian norms and violates the human rights of its own nationals? And where does the responsibility lie to protect people from such acts of violation? In a profound new study, Fabian Klose unites a team of leading scholars to investigate some of the most complex and controversial debates regarding the legitimacy of protecting humanitarian norms and universal human rights by non-violent and violent means. Charting the development of humanitarian intervention from its origins in the nineteenth century through to the present day, the book surveys the philosophical and legal rationales of enforcing humanitarian norms by military means, and how attitudes to military intervention on humanitarian grounds have changed over the course of three centuries. Drawing from a wide range of disciplines, the authors lend a fresh perspective to contemporary dilemmas using case studies from Europe, the United States, Africa, and Asia.

Fabian Klose is a senior researcher at the Leibniz Institute of European History (IEG) in Mainz, Germany.

### Human Rights in History

Edited by

Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, University of California, Berkeley Samuel Moyn, Harvard Law School

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation states, international governance, and transnational law.

#### Also in the series

Fehrenbach and Rodogno Fisch	Humanitarian Photography: A History A History of the Self-Determination of
Hoffmann	Peoples Human Rights in the Twentieth Century
Hong	Cold War Germany, the Third World, and
	the Global Humanitarian Regime
Snyder	Human Rights Activism and the End of the Cold War: A Transnational History of
	the Helsinki Network
Winter and Prost	René Cassin and Human Rights: From the Great War to the Universal Declaration

# The Emergence of Humanitarian Intervention

Ideas and Practice from the Nineteenth Century to the Present

Edited by

FABIAN KLOSE

Leibniz-Institut für Europäische Geschichte, Mainz



### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107075511

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data The emergence of humanitarian intervention : ideas and practice from the nineteenth century to the present / edited by Fabian Klose, Leibniz Institut fur Europaische Geschichte, Mainz. pages cm ISBN 978-1-107-07551-1 (Hardback)

1. Humanitarian intervention. I. Klose, Fabian.

JZ6369.E54 2016

327.1'1-dc23 2015017083

Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-07551-1

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

Lisi	t of figures and tables	<i>page</i> vii
Lisi	t of contributors	viii
Ack	knowledgements	ix
I	The emergence of humanitarian intervention: three centuries of 'enforcing humanity' <i>Fabian Klose</i>	5 I
	PART I THEORETICAL APPROACH AND LEGAL Discourse on the concept of Humanitarian intervention	
2	Humanitarianism and human rights: a troubled rapport <i>Michael Geyer</i>	31
3	Humanitarian intervention and the issue of state sovereignty in the discourse of legal experts between the 1830s and the First World War <i>Daniel Marc Segesser</i>	y 56
4	The legal justification of international intervention: theories of community and admissibility <i>Stefan Kroll</i>	73
	PART II FIGHTING THE SLAVE TRADE AND PROTECTING RELIGIOUS MINORITIES: MAJOR IMPULSES FOR HUMANITARIAN INTERVENTION IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY	
5	Enforcing abolition: the entanglement of civil society action, humanitarian norm-setting, and military intervention <i>Fabian Klose</i>	, 91

v

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07551-1 - The Emergence of Humanitarian Intervention: Ideas and Practice from
the Nineteenth Century to the Present
Edited by Fabian Klose
Frontmatter
More information

vi	Contents	
6	Lord Vivian's tears: the moral hazards of humanitarian intervention <i>Mairi S. MacDonald</i>	121
7	From protection to humanitarian intervention? Enforcing Jewish rights in Romania and Morocco around 1880 <i>Abigail Green</i>	142
	PART III TRANSFERRING A CONCEPT TO THE Twentieth Century	
8	Prudence or outrage? Public opinion and humanitarian intervention in historical and comparative perspective <i>Jon Western</i>	165
9	Non-state actors' humanitarian operations in the aftermath of the First World War: the case of the Near East Relief <i>Davide Rodogno</i>	185
10	Humanitarian intervention as legitimation of violence – the German case 1937–1939 Jost Dülffer	208
	PART IV LIMITED OPTIONS OR FURTHER DEVELOPMENT? HUMANITARIAN INTERVENTION DURING THE COLD WAR	
II	Cold War peacekeeping <i>versus</i> humanitarian intervention: beyond the Hammarskjoldian model <i>Norrie MacQueen</i>	231
12	From the protection of sovereignty to humanitarian intervention? Traditions and developments of United Nations peacekeeping in the twentieth century <i>Jan Erik Schulte</i>	253
	PART V A NEW CENTURY OF HUMANITARIAN INTERVENTION?	
13	A not so humanitarian intervention Bradley Simpson	281
14	The responsibility to protect: foundation, transformation, and application of an emerging norm <i>Manuel Fröhlich</i>	299
15	Humanitarian interventions, past and present Andrew Thompson	331
Ind	lex	357

# Figures

9.1	News Bulletin published by the American Committee	
	for Armenian and Syrian	page 195

# Tables

11.1	'Plebiscite Peacekeeping' in Europe, 1920–1935	page 234
14.1	Transformation of R2P elements from the ICISS	
	report to the General Assembly Outcome Document	313
14.2	'Responsibility to protect' in UN Security Council	
	Resolutions, 1946–2013	321

# Contributors

JOST DÜLFFER, University of Cologne MANUEL FRÖHLICH, Friedrich Schiller University Jena MICHAEL GEYER, Department of History, University of Chicago ABIGAIL GREEN, Brasenose College, Oxford FABIAN KLOSE, Leibniz Institute of European History, Mainz STEFAN KROLL, Goethe University, Frankfurt MAIRI S. MACDONALD, University of Toronto NORRIE MACQUEEN, University of St Andrews DAVIDE RODOGNO, The Graduate Institute, Geneva JAN ERIK SCHULTE, Ruhr University Of Bern BRADLEY SIMPSON, University of Connecticut ANDREW THOMPSON, University of Exeter JON WESTERN, MOUNT HOlyoke College

viii

# Acknowledgements

The present book is the result of an existing network among international scholars in the field of humanitarianism and human rights as well as of the annual conference of the German Association for Historical Peace Research (Arbeitskreis Historische Friedensforschung) held in October 2012 at the Historisches Kolleg in Munich. I am most grateful to the German Foundation for Peace Research (DSF) for the generous funding of the conference and to the German Research Foundation (DFG), the History Department of the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität Munich, and the German Association for Historical Peace Research for their significant support. I am indebted to all the scholars from different disciplines attending the conference for their perceptive remarks and contributions, which significantly helped to shape this book. Additionally, I would like to say thank you to Adrian Franco, who worked relentlessly as conference administrative assistant as well as conference rapporteur. Furthermore, I would like to thank Martin Aust at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität Munich, Brendan Simms at the University of Cambridge, and Tobias Grill at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität Munich for their important suggestions on various issues concerning the conference and the book. I am particularly grateful to Johannes Paulmann at the Leibniz Institute of European History in Mainz, Martin Geyer at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität Munich, and Andrew Thompson at the University of Exeter for their crucial and perceptive comments on earlier drafts of the manuscript. During the process of preparing this book for publication, I could rely heavily on the editorial work of Dona Gever for which I am very grateful. Finally, I would like to thank Michael Watson at Cambridge University Press for his inestimable support in the publication process. Many thanks to all of you!