

THE QUIET POWER OF INDICATORS

Using a power-knowledge framework, this volume critically investigates how major global indicators of national legal governance are produced, disseminated, and used, and to what effect. Original case studies include Freedom House's Freedom in the World indicator, the Global Reporting Initiative's structure for measuring and reporting on corporate social responsibility, the World Justice Project's measurement of the rule of law, the World Bank's Doing Business index, the World Bank–supported Worldwide Governance Indicators, the World Bank's Country Performance Institutional Assessment, and the Transparency International Corruption (Perceptions) index. Also examined is the use of performance indicators by the European Union for accession countries and by the U.S. Millennium Challenge Corporation in allocating U.S. aid funds.

Sally Engle Merry is Silver Professor of Anthropology at New York University.

Kevin E. Davis is Beller Family Professor of Business Law and Vice Dean at New York University School of Law.

Benedict Kingsbury is Murry and Ida Becker Professor of Law and director of the Institute for International Law and Justice at New York University School of Law.





CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are: studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers' discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law, sociolegal studies, sociology, and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series Editors

Chris Arup, Monash University, Victoria Sally Engle Merry, New York University Susan Silbey, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.





The Quiet Power of Indicators

MEASURING GOVERNANCE, CORRUPTION,
AND RULE OF LAW

Edited by

SALLY ENGLE MERRY

New York University

KEVIN E. DAVIS

New York University

BENEDICT KINGSBURY

New York University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107427877

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

The quiet power of indicators: measuring governance, corruption, and the rule of law / edited by Sally Engle Merry, Kevin E. Davis, Benedict Kingsbury.

pages cm. - (Cambridge studies in law and society)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-07520-7 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-42787-7 (paperback)

- 1. Public administration Evaluation. 2. Rule of law. 3. Law and economic development.
- 4. Political indicators. 5. Ranking and selection (Statistics) Political aspects. I. Merry, Sally Engle, 1944– editor. II. Davis, Kevin E. editor. III. Kingsbury, Benedict, editor.

JA71.7.Q54 2015

340'.11-dc23 2014049551

ISBN 978-1-107-07520-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-42787-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Not	tes on Contributors	page ix
Ack	nowledgments	xiii
	Introduction: The Local-Global Life of Indicators: Law, Power, and Resistance Kevin E. Davis, Benedict Kingsbury, and Sally Engle Merry	1
	PART I GLOBAL INDICATORS OF GOVERNANCE, CORRUPTION, AND RULE OF LAW	
1	International Organizations and the Production of Indicators: The Case of Freedom House Christopher G. Bradley	27
2	Indicators and the Law: A Case Study of the Rule of Law Index René Urueña	75
3	Measuring Corporate Accountability through Global Indicators Galit A. Sarfaty	103
4	The Quest for Measuring Development: The Role of the Indicator Bank María Angélica Prada Uribe	133
5	Tradeoffs in Accountability: Conditionality Processes in the European Union and Millennium Challenge Corporation Nikhil K. Dutta	156



viii	Contents	
	PART II INDICATORS IN LOCAL CONTEXTS	
6	Rule of Law Indicators as a Technology of Power in Romania Mihaela Serban	199
7	Indicators, Global Expertise, and a Local Political Drama: Producing and Deploying Corruption Perception Data in Post-Socialist Albania Smoki Musaraj	222
8	Evaluating the Impact of Corruption Indicators on Governance Discourses in Kenya Migai Akech	248
9	Measuring Labor Market Efficiency: Indicators that Fuel an Ideological War and Undermine Social Concern and Trust in the South African Regulatory Process Debbie Collier and Paul Benjamin	284
10	Conclusion: Contesting Global Indicators David Nelken	317
Index		339



Notes on Contributors

Migai Akech is a legal scholar based in Nairobi, Kenya. He teaches at the University of Nairobi's School of Law, where he is an associate professor. He is a graduate of the University of Nairobi, Cambridge University, and New York University School of Law, where he was a Hauser Global Scholar. He has published widely on legal and public policy issues. He is the author of "Constraining Government Power in Africa" (Journal of Democracy 2011) and Privatization and Democracy in East Africa: The Promise of Administrative Law (East African Educational Publishers, 2009), among others. He was a Reagan-Fascell Democracy Fellow at the National Endowment for Democracy (Washington, DC) between October 2009 and February 2010. He consults for local and international organizations. His research interests are democracy, governance, public law (constitutional and administrative law), public procurement, sports law, security, and international trade and development.

Paul Benjamin is a labor and public lawyer based in Johannesburg, South Africa. He has held academic positions at the University of Cape Town and the University of the Witwatersrand, where he is currently a visiting associate professor in the School of Governance. He combines legal practice with academic life and during the apartheid years was involved in major human rights and trade union litigation. Since the advent of democracy in South Africa, he has focused on legislative policy development and drafting.

Christopher G. Bradley holds a JD, magna cum laude, from New York University School of Law; an LLM in International Law from New York University School of Law; a doctorate in English Literature from the University of Oxford; and a bachelor's degree, summa cum laude, from Princeton University. He has served as law clerk to the Hon. Patrick E. Higginbotham of the United States Court of



X

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07520-7 - The Quiet Power of Indicators: Measuring Governance, Corruption, and Rule of Law
Edited by Sally Engle Merry, Kevin E. Davis and Benedict Kingsbury
Frontmatter
More information

Notes on Contributors

Appeals for the Fifth Circuit; practiced commercial and bankruptcy litigation with the law firm of Weil, Gotshal & Manges; and served as postgraduate research Fellow at the University of Texas at Austin.

Debbie Collier is an associate professor in the Department of Commercial Law at the University of Cape Town and a member of the Institute of Development of Labour Law at the University of Cape Town. Debbie is involved in teaching various aspects of employment law; her current research projects are in the field of workplace discrimination and equality law with a particular, comparative, focus on regulatory approaches and the limitations of the law, in a globalized context, in regulating behavior in this field of study.

Kevin E. Davis is Beller Family Professor of Business Law and Vice Dean at New York University School of Law. He has written extensively about anticorruption law as well as the relationship between law and economic development in such journals as the *American Journal of Comparative Law*, *Law and Society Review*, and the *New York University Law Review*.

Nikhil K. Dutta is an attorney advisor with the Office of Legal Adviser at the US Department of State. His contribution to this volume is published in his personal capacity and the views expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the United States government. Nikhil received his AB from Harvard College, his MPA from Princeton University, and his JD from New York University School of Law.

Benedict Kingsbury is Murry and Ida Becker Professor of Law and director of the Institute for International Law and Justice at New York University School of Law. In addition to being coeditor-in-chief of the *American Journal of International Law* he is the editor and coeditor of more than fifteen books, including *International Financial Institutions and Global Legal Governance* (2011).

Sally Engle Merry is Silver Professor of Anthropology at New York University. She is the author or editor of nine books, including the J. Willard Hurst Prize—winning Colonizing Hawai'i: The Cultural Power of Law (2000) and Governance by Indicators (2012, coedited with Kevin Davis, Angelina Fisher, and Benedict Kingsbury).

Smoki Musaraj is Assistant Professor of Anthropology at Ohio University and Faculty Affiliate at the Center for Law, Justice, and Culture at Ohio University. She holds a PhD in anthropology from the New School for Social Research and was recently a Postdoctoral Scholar at the Institute of Money, Technology, and Financial Inclusion at the University of California, Irvine. Her research focuses on money, value, and economic transformations as well as corruption and the rule of law in postsocialist contexts.



Notes on Contributors

David Nelken is Professor of Comparative and Transnational Law and Head of Research at the Dickson Poon Law School at King's College, London, UK; Visiting Professor of Criminology at Oxford University's Centre of Criminology; and Distinguished Professor of Legal Institutions and Social Change at the University of Macerata in Italy. Widely published, David received a Distinguished Scholar award from the American Sociological Association in 1985. In 2009 he was given the Sellin-Glueck international career award by the American Society of Criminology and was made an Academician of the UK Academy of the Social Sciences. In 2011 he gained the biannual senior Podgorecki career prize from the International Sociological Association. In 2013 the (US) Law and Society Association gave him its International Scholar Award, and Cambridge University awarded him an LLD degree as an authority in his subject(s). He is the independent board member responsible for evaluating all law journals for the Scopus Web site (Elsevier).

Galit A. Sarfaty is Canada Research Chair in Global Economic Governance and an assistant professor in the Faculty of Law at the University of British Columbia. She holds a JD from Yale Law School, a PhD and MA in anthropology from the University of Chicago, and an AB summa cum laude from Harvard University. She previously served as an assistant professor in the Department of Legal Studies and Business Ethics at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania. Prior to her position at Wharton, Galit was a Fellow at Harvard Law School's Program on the Legal Profession and Human Rights Program, a graduate Fellow at Harvard's Center for Ethics, and a visiting scholar at the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. Her scholarship offers an anthropological perspective to the study of international law and regulatory governance. In particular, she studies the convergence of economic globalization with public law values, such as human rights. Galit's research has focused on major international economic organizations such as the World Bank, and she recently published a book on the subject entitled Values in Translation: Human Rights and the Culture of the World Bank (2012).

Mihaela Serban is an assistant professor of law and society at Ramapo College of New Jersey. Mia's teaching and research interests include law and society in Eastern Europe, law and culture, human rights and women's rights, comparative law, and constitutional law. Her most recent publication on sociolegal issues in Central and Eastern Europe is "Surviving Property: Resistance against Urban Housing Nationalization during the Transition to Communism (Romania, 1950–1965)," in Special Issue: Interdisciplinary Legal Studies: The Next Generation, Studies in Law, Politics, and Society, Volume 51 (2010), ed. Austin Sarat. She is currently working on a book manuscript provisionally entitled Law, Property and Subjectivity in Early Communist Romania (1945–1965).

хi



xii

Notes on Contributors

María Angélica Prada Uribe is a research Fellow and coordinator of the International Law Master at Universidad de los Andes. She holds a master's degree in international law from Universidad de los Andes. She is also professor of the International Economic Law course at the same university. She has been a teaching assistant for the Legislation and Public Policy, Public International Law, International Economic Law, and Comparative Law courses. She is currently a researcher for the first component of the "Global Administrative Law Network" Project, funded by the International Development Research Centre. She has also worked as an intern at the International Legal Office of the Colombian Ministry of Commerce.

René Urueña is an associate professor and director of the International Law Program at Universidad de Los Andes (Bogota, Colombia). He also belongs to its Global Justice and Human Rights Clinic, working in its human rights and foreign investment practice. He earned his doctorate in law at the University of Helsinki (eximia cum laude) and holds a postgraduate degree in economics from the Universidad de Los Andes. He has published extensively on international law and currently leads a project on Inter-Institutional Evaluation through the Use of Indicators, which brings together young scholars from Latin American and Africa exploring the use of indicators in global governance.



Acknowledgments

From the beginning, this was a very collaborative project. Generous support from the National Science Foundation and from New York University's Institute for International Law and Justice (IILJ) enabled us to bring together for regular meetings a group of scholars working directly on indicators and measurement in relation to rule of law, corruption, and good governance (the contributors to this volume), together with several other young scholars doing very interesting work on other data and indicators issues focused in particular on developing countries: Yamini Aiyar, Jane Anderson, Paola Bergallo, Nehal Bhuta, Rene Gerrets, and Luciana Gross Cunha. All of us in this research collective were greatly enriched in our thinking by the intellectual contributions of other scholars who attended some of our workshops and conferences. These included Christian Arndt, Sabino Cassese, Lorenzo Casini, Wendy Espeland, Marianne Fourcade, Tom Ginsburg, Terrence Halliday, Bronwen Morgan, David Nelken, Catherine Powell, Jothie Rajah, Annelise Riles, Maira Rocha Machado, Meg Satterthwaite, Greg Shaffer, and Horatia Muir Watt. Terry Halliday went far beyond the call of duty in preparing written comments on draft contributions by many of the participants, and David Nelken kindly made numerous comments and wrote the concluding chapter.

The Law and Society Association at its annual meetings very helpfully provided a setting for this work, as did more specialized conferences at New York University Law School and the Aspen Institute in Rome. This project grew out of the long-term collaboration of Kevin E. Davis, Benedict Kingsbury, and Sally Engle Merry. We have been mightily aided in all of this by Angelina Fisher, IILJ Program Director, who has throughout been a creative intellectual participant and interlocutor, a key person in orchestration of IILJ funding, and a superb organizer. We are immensely grateful to her. We also appreciate the help of Mayuri Anupindi in putting the book together.



xiv

Acknowledgments

Finally, we could not have carried through this project without the support of the Law and Social Sciences Program of the National Science Foundation. The conferences and workshops that formed the book were made possible by two grants from the National Science Foundation, #SES-1023717 and #SES-1123290. The latter was a RCN grant, designed to facilitate the creation of a Research Collaboration Network.