

KANT'S *CRITIQUE OF PURE REASON*

Kant's monumental book the *Critique of Pure Reason* was arguably the most conceptually revolutionary work in the history of philosophy, and its impact continues to be felt throughout philosophical debates today. But it is a notoriously difficult work whose basic meaning and lasting philosophical significance are both subject to ongoing controversy. In this *Critical Guide*, an international team of leading Kant scholars addresses the challenges, clarifying Kant's basic terms and arguments and engaging with the debates that surround this central text. Providing compact explanations along with cutting-edge interpretations of nearly all of the main themes and arguments in Kant's *Critique*, this volume provides well-balanced arguments on such controversial topics as the interpretation of Kant's transcendental idealism, conceptualism and nonconceptual content in perception, and the soundness of his transcendental arguments. This volume will engage readers of Kant at all levels.

JAMES R. O'SHEA is Professor of Philosophy at University College Dublin. He is the author of *Wilfrid Sellars: Naturalism with a Normative Turn* (2007) and *Kant's "Critique of Pure Reason": An Introduction and Interpretation* (2012), and the editor of *Sellars and His Legacy* (2016).

CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

Recent titles in this series:

- Kant's *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*
 EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMANN
 Kant's *Critique of Practical Reason*
 EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMANN
 Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*
 EDITED BY ARIF AHMED
 Kierkegaard's *Concluding Unscientific Postscript*
 EDITED BY RICK ANTHONY FURTA
 Plato's *Republic*
 EDITED BY MARK L. MCPHERRAN
 Plato's *Laws*
 EDITED BY CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH
 Spinoza's *Theological-Political Treatise*
 EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED AND MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL
 Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics*
 EDITED BY JON MILLER
 Kant's *Metaphysics of Morals*
 EDITED BY LARA DENIS
 Nietzsche's *On the Genealogy of Morality*
 EDITED BY SIMON MAY
 Kant's *Observations and Remarks*
 EDITED BY RICHARD VELKLEY AND SUSAN SHELL
 Augustine's *City of God*
 EDITED BY JAMES WETZEL
 Descartes' *Meditations*
 EDITED BY KAREN DETLEFSEN
 Kant's *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*
 EDITED BY GORDON MICHALSON
 Kant's *Lectures on Anthropology*
 EDITED BY ALIX COHEN
 Kierkegaard's *Fear and Trembling*
 EDITED BY DANIEL CONWAY
 Kant's *Lectures on Ethics*
 EDITED BY LARA DENIS AND OLIVER SENSEN
 Aristotle's *Physics*
 EDITED BY MARISKA LEUNISSEN
 Aristotle's *Politics*
 EDITED BY THORNTON LOCKWOOD AND THANASSIS SAMARAS
 Aquinas's *Disputed Questions on Evil*
 EDITED BY M. V. DOUGHERTY
 Plato's *Symposium*
 EDITED BY PIERRE DESTRÉE AND ZINA GIANNOPOULOU
 Spinoza's *Ethics*
 EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED
 Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*
 EDITED BY JAMES R. O'SHEA

KANT'S
*CRITIQUE OF
PURE REASON*
A Critical Guide

EDITED BY
JAMES R. O'SHEA
University College Dublin



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07481-1 — Kant's Critique of Pure Reason
Edited by James R. O'Shea
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi - 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107074811
DOI: 10.1017/9781139871389

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: O'Shea, James R., author.

Title: Kant's Critique of pure reason : a critical guide / James R. O'Shea,
University College Dublin.

Description: New York City : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes
bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017005279 | ISBN 9781107074811 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804. Kritik der reinen Vernunft. |
Knowledge, Theory of. | Causation. | Reason.

Classification: LCC B2779 .084 2017 | DDC 121 – dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017005279>

ISBN 978-1-107-07481-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication,
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Translations and Abbreviations</i>	x
Introduction <i>James R. O'Shea</i>	i
1 Kant on the Distinction between Sensibility and Understanding <i>Eric Watkins</i>	9
2 Knowledge and Its Object <i>Stephen Engstrom</i>	28
3 Transcendental Idealism and the Transcendental Aesthetic: Reading the <i>Critique of Pure Reason</i> Forward <i>Lucy Allais</i>	46
4 Kant on the Ideality of Space and the Argument from Spinozism <i>Michela Massimi</i>	64
5 How Precise Is Kant's Table of Judgments? <i>Michael Wolff</i>	83
6 Kant's "Transcendental Deduction" <i>Barry Stroud</i>	106
7 Kant's Critique of the Layer-Cake Conception of Human Mindedness in the B Deduction <i>James Conant</i>	120
8 The Critical and "Empty" Representation "I Think" <i>Patricia Kitcher</i>	140

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
9	Kant's Mathematical Principles of Pure Understanding <i>Lisa Shabel</i>	163
10	Kant's Dynamical Principles: The Analogies of Experience <i>Kenneth R. Westphal</i>	184
11	The Refutation of Idealism <i>Ralf M. Bader</i>	205
12	The Antinomies: An Entirely Natural Antithetic of Human Reason <i>Graham Bird</i>	223
13	The Ideal of Reason <i>John J. Callanan</i>	243
14	Knowledge, Discipline, System, Hope: The Fate of Metaphysics in the Doctrine of Method <i>Andrew Chignell</i>	259
	<i>List of References</i>	280
	<i>Index</i>	293

Contributors

LUCY ALLAIS is jointly appointed as Professor of Philosophy at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, and Henry Allison Chair of the History of Philosophy at the University of California, San Diego. She is a leading contributor to current debates on Kant's transcendental idealism, on the idea of nonconceptual content in relation to Kant, and on the supposed contrast between transcendental and naturalistic philosophy, most recently in her book *Manifest Reality: Kant's Idealism and His Realism* (2015). She has also published on forgiveness and other topics in ethics and is interested in moral psychology and free will.

RALF M. BADER is a Fellow of Merton College and an Associate Professor in the Philosophy Department at the University of Oxford. His research focuses on Kant, metaphysics, ethics, and political philosophy.

GRAHAM BIRD is Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at the University of Manchester and a cofounder of both the UK Kant Society and the journal *Kantian Review*. His book *Kant's Theory of Knowledge* (1962) was a groundbreaking work on Kant in the analytic tradition, and recently he has published a comprehensive commentary on Kant titled *The Revolutionary Kant: A Commentary on the Critique of Pure Reason* (2006).

JOHN J. CALLANAN is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Philosophy at King's College London. He has written articles on Kant on topics such as transcendental arguments, the holy will, and the mathematical method. He has also written on Strawson and Mandeville. He is the author of *Kant's Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals: A Reader's Guide* (2013).

ANDREW CHIGNELL is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania. His primary research is on Kant and modern philosophy, with additional interests in contemporary epistemology, aesthetics, and philosophy of religion.

JAMES CONANT is Chester D. Tripp Professor of Humanities, Professor of Philosophy, and Professor in the College at the University of Chicago. He works broadly in philosophy and has published articles in philosophy of language, philosophy of mind, aesthetics, German idealism, and history of analytic philosophy, among other areas, and on a wide range of philosophers, including Kant, Emerson, Nietzsche, Kierkegaard, Josiah Royce, William James, Frege, Carnap, Wittgenstein, Putnam, Cavell, Rorty, and McDowell, among others.

STEPHEN ENGSTROM is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. He has published articles on various topics in Kant's theoretical and practical philosophy. He is also the author of *The Form of Practical Knowledge* (2009) and coeditor (with Jennifer Whiting) of *Aristotle, Kant, and the Stoics* (Cambridge, 1996).

PATRICIA KITCHER is Roberta and William Campbell Professor of the Humanities and Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University. She is the author of two books on Kant's conceptions of cognition and the self, *Kant's Transcendental Psychology* (1990) and *Kant's Thinker* (2011).

MICHELA MASSIMI is Professor of Philosophy of Science at the University of Edinburgh. She has published widely on philosophy of science and on Kant's philosophy of natural science in particular. She was the principal investigator on the Leverhulme Trust international network *Kant and the Laws of Nature* (2012–15), and she is currently the principal investigator on an ERC grant on *Perspectival Realism* (2016–20), inspired in part by Kant. She is the editor of *Kant and Philosophy of Science Today* (Cambridge, 2008) and coeditor (with Angela Breitenbach) of *Kant and the Laws of Nature* (Cambridge, 2017).

JAMES R. O'SHEA is Professor of Philosophy at University College Dublin. He is the author of *Wilfrid Sellars: Naturalism with a Normative Turn* (2007) and *Kant's "Critique of Pure Reason": An Introduction and Interpretation* (2012), and the editor of *Sellars and his Legacy* (2016).

LISA SHABEL is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the Ohio State University. Her book *Mathematics in Kant's Critical Philosophy* (2003) and subsequent articles explore the role of mathematics in Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*.

BARRY STROUD is the Willis S. and Marion Slusser Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Berkeley. He works mainly in epistemology, metaphysics, philosophy of mind and language, and the history of

List of Contributors

ix

modern philosophy, and he has been a leading contributor to debates concerning Kant's transcendental deduction. He is the author of *Hume* (1977), *The Significance of Philosophical Scepticism* (1984), *The Quest for Reality: Subjectivism and the Metaphysics of Colour* (1999), *Engagement and Metaphysical Dissatisfaction: Modality and Value* (2011), and three volumes of collected essays.

ERIC WATKINS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, San Diego. Author of *Kant and the Metaphysics of Causality* (Cambridge, 2005) and well-known editor and translator of Kant's works (most recently of the Cambridge University Press volume of Kant's writings on science, *Immanuel Kant: Natural Science*, 2013), Watkins specializes in Kant's metaphysics and epistemology across both the Critical and pre-Critical periods.

KENNETH R. WESTPHAL is Professor of Philosophy at Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, Istanbul. His publications include several books on Kant, Hegel, and epistemology. His newest is *How Hume and Kant Reconstruct Natural Law* (2016); of special significance to his present contribution is his book *Kant's Transcendental Proof of Realism* (Cambridge, 2004).

MICHAEL WOLFF is Professor of Philosophy at Universität Bielefeld, Germany. Among his many other publications, his book on Kant's metaphysical deduction and Table of Judgments, *Die Vollständigkeit der kantischen Urteilstafel* (1995), transformed debates concerning that central topic in Kant's Critical philosophy.

Translations and Abbreviations

Unless authors indicate otherwise in their chapters, all translations are from the *Cambridge Edition of the Writings of Immanuel Kant* (CE), series editors Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood (Cambridge, 1992–). Page citations are to *Kant's gesammelte Schriften*, Ausgabe der Königlich-Preußischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1902–), using the volume:page number format (e.g., 10:129) found in the margins of the Cambridge Edition volumes, and in many cases, the pages of the Cambridge Editions are provided, too. References to the *Critique of Pure Reason*, however, are by means of the standard “A/B” references to the first (1781) and second (1787) editions, respectively. The following are the abbreviations of Kant's works used throughout this volume.

<i>Ak.</i>	Akademie Ausgabe
<i>Anthr</i>	<i>Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View</i> (<i>Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht</i> [1798], <i>Ak.</i> 7), in <i>Anthropology, History, and Education</i> , CE 2007, G. Zöllner, R. B. Loudon, eds., R. B. Loudon, trans.
<i>CE</i>	Cambridge Edition of the Writings of Immanuel Kant.
<i>CJ</i>	<i>Critique of the Power of Judgment</i> (<i>Kritik der Urteilskraft</i> [1790], <i>Ak.</i> 5), CE 2000, P. Guyer ed., trans., E. Matthews, trans.
<i>Corr</i>	<i>Correspondence</i> , CE 1999 (<i>Ak.</i> 10–13), A. Zweig, trans., ed.
<i>CPR</i>	<i>Critique of Pure Reason</i> (<i>Kritik der reinen Vernunft</i> [1781, 1787], <i>Ak.</i> 3–4), CE 1997, P. Guyer, A. Wood, trans., eds., cited by A (first edition)/B (2nd ed., 1787).
<i>CPrR</i>	<i>Critique of Practical Reason</i> (<i>Kritik der praktischen Vernunft</i> [1788], <i>Ak.</i> 5), in <i>Practical Philosophy</i> , CE 1996, M. J. Gregor, trans., ed.
<i>Discov</i>	<i>On a Discovery, according to which all Modern Critique of Pure Reason is alleged to be made Superfluous by an Earlier</i>

Translations and Abbreviations

xi

- Critique* (Über eine Entdeckung, nach der alle neue Kritik der reinen Vernunft durch eine ältere entbehrlich gemacht werden soll [1790], Ak. 8), in TP₂.
- DS *Concerning the Ultimate Ground of the Differentiation of Directions in Space* (Von dem ersten Grunde des Unterschiedes der Gegenden im Raume [1768], Ak. 2), in TP₁.
- E Erdmann, Benno: Kant's notes in his own copy of the first edition of CPR, referring to the original pages in Erdmann 1881, reprinted in Ak. 23, and as footnotes in the Cambridge Edition of CPR.
- FS *The False Subtlety of the Four Syllogistic Figures* (Die falsche Spitzfindigkeit der vier syllogistischen Figuren [1762], Ak. 2), in TP₁.
- G *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals* (Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten [1785], Ak. 4), in *Practical Philosophy*, CE 1996, M. J. Gregor, trans., ed.
- ID *Inaugural Dissertation (Concerning the Form and Principles of the Sensible and Intelligible World; De mundi sensibilis atque intelligibilis forma et principiis*, [1770], Ak. 2), in TP₁.
- Inquiry* *Inquiry Concerning the Distinctness of the Principles of Natural Theology and Morality* (Untersuchung über die Deutlichkeit der Grundsätze der natürlichen Theologie und der Moral [1764], Ak. 2), in TP₁.
- JL *Jäsche Logic*, in LL.
- LL *Lectures on Logic*, CE 1992, J. M. Young, trans., ed.
- LM *Lectures on Metaphysics*, CE 1997, K. Ameriks, S. Naragon, eds., trans.
- LRel *Lectures on the Philosophical Doctrine of Religion*, in RRT
- MF *Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science* (Metaphysische Anfangsgründe der Naturwissenschaft [1786], Ak. 4), in TP₂.
- NE *A New Elucidation of the First Principles of Metaphysical Cognition* (Principiorum primorum cognitionis metaphysicae nova dilucidatio [1755], Ak. 1), in TP₁.
- NF *Notes and Fragments*, CE 2005 (Ak. 14–23), P. Guyer, ed., C. Bowman, P. Guyer, F. Rauscher, trans.
- NM *Attempt to Introduce the Concept of Negative Magnitudes into Philosophy* (Versuch den Begriff der negativen Grössen in die Weltweisheit einzuführen [1763], Ak. 2), in TP₁.

xii	<i>Translations and Abbreviations</i>
OPA	<i>The Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God</i> (<i>Der einzig mögliche Beweisgrund zu einer Demonstration des Daseins Gottes</i> [1763], Ak. 2), in <i>TP</i> ₁ .
PM	<i>Physical Monadology</i> (<i>The Employment in Natural Philosophy of Metaphysics combined with Geometry, of which Sample I contains the Physical Monadology; Metaphysicae cum geometria iunctae usus in philosophia naturali, cuius specimen I. continet monadologiam physicam</i> [1756], Ak. 1), in <i>TP</i> ₁ .
ProI	<i>Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics that will be Able to Come Forward as Science</i> (<i>Prolegomena zu einer jeden künftigen Metaphysik, die als Wissenschaft wird auftreten können</i> [1783], Ak. 4), in <i>TP</i> ₂ .
Refl (R)	Reflexionen, from Kant's <i>handschriftliche Nachlaß</i> ("handwritten remains"), by Reflexionen number (R), Ak. volume:page reference, and page in <i>NF</i> where applicable.
RRT	<i>Religion and Rational Theology</i> , CE 1996, A. W. Wood and G. Di Giovanni trans., ed.
TP ₁	<i>Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770</i> , CE 1992, D. Walford, trans., ed., with Ralf Meerbote.
TP ₂	<i>Theoretical Philosophy after 1781</i> , CE 2002, H. Allison, P. Heath, eds., H. Allison, G. Hatfield, P. Heath, M. Friedman, trans.