

# **Studies in Forensic Biohistory**

# **Anthropological Perspectives**

The lives of kings, poets, authors, criminals, and celebrities are a perpetual fascination in the media and popular culture, and for decades anthropologists and other scientists have participated in "postmortem dissections" of the lives of historical figures.

In this field of biohistory, researchers have identified and analyzed these figures' bodies using technologies such as DNA fingerprinting, biochemical assays, and skeletal biology. This book brings together biohistorical case studies for the first time, and considers the role of the anthropologist in writing the historical narratives surrounding the deceased. Contributors theorize biohistory with respect to the sociology of the body, examining the ethical implications of biohistorical work and the diversity of social theoretical perspectives that researchers' work may relate to.

The volume defines scales of biohistorical engagement, providing readers with a critical sense of scale and the different paths to "historical notoriety" that can emerge with respect to human remains.

**Christopher M. Stojanowski** is Professor of Anthropology at Arizona State University. His bioarchaeological work focuses on dental anthropology, the colonial southeastern USA and early and middle Holocene North Africa and North America.

**William N. Duncan** is Associate Professor of Anthropology at East Tennessee State University. His research focuses on Mesoamerican cultures and dental anthropology.





**More Information** 

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07354-8 — Studies in Forensic Biohistory Edited by Christopher M. Stojanowski , William N. Duncan Frontmatter

# **Cambridge Studies in Biological and Evolutionary Anthropology**

#### Consulting Editors

C. G. Nicholas Mascie-Taylor, University of Cambridge Robert A. Foley, University of Cambridge

#### Series Editors

Agustín Fuentes, University of Notre Dame Sir Peter Gluckman, The Liggins Institute, The University of Auckland Nina G. Jablonski, Pennsylvania State University

Clark Spencer Larsen, The Ohio State University

Michael P. Muehlenbein, University of Texas at San Antonio

Dennis H. O'Rourke, The University of Utah

Karen B. Strier, University of Wisconsin

David P. Watts, Yale University

#### Also Available in the Series

- 53. *Technique and Application in Dental Anthropology* Joel D. Irish & Greg C. Nelson (eds.) 978 0 521 87061 0
- 54. Western Diseases: An Evolutionary Perspective Tessa M. Pollard 978 0 521 61737 6
- 55. *Spider Monkeys: The Biology, Behavior and Ecology of the Genus* Ateles Christina J. Campbell 978 0 521 86750 4
- 56. Between Biology and Culture Holger Schutkowski (ed.) 978 0 521 85936 3
- 57. Primate Parasite Ecology: The Dynamics and Study of Host-Parasite Relationships Michael A. Huffman & Colin A. Chapman (eds.) 978 0 521 87246 1
- 58. The Evolutionary Biology of Human Body Fatness: Thrift and Control Jonathan C. K. Wells 978 0 521 88420 4
- 59. Reproduction and Adaptation: Topics in Human Reproductive Ecology C. G. Nicholas Mascie-Taylor & Lyliane Rosetta (eds.) 978 0 521 50963 3
- 60. Monkeys on the Edge: Ecology and Management of Long-Tailed Macaques and their Interface with Humans Michael D. Gumert, Agustín Fuentes & Lisa Jones-Engel (eds.) 978 0 521 76433 9
- 61. The Monkeys of Stormy Mountain: 60 Years of Primatological Research on the Japanese Macaques of Arashiyama Jean-Baptiste Leca, Michael A. Huffman & Paul L. Vasey (eds.) 978 0 521 76185 7
- 62. African Genesis: Perspectives on Hominin Evolution Sally C. Reynolds & Andrew Gallagher (eds.) 978 1 107 01995 9
- 63. Consanguinity in Context Alan H. Bittles 978 0 521 78186 2
- 64. *Evolving Human Nutrition: Implications for Public Health* Stanley Ulijaszek, Neil Mann & Sarah Elton (eds.) 978 0 521 86916 4
- 65. *Evolutionary Biology and Conservation of Titis, Sakis and Uacaris* Liza M. Veiga, Adrian A. Barnett, Stephen F. Ferrari & Marilyn A. Norconk (eds.) 978 0 521 88158 6
- 66. Anthropological Perspectives on Tooth Morphology: Genetics, Evolution, Variation G. Richard Scott & Joel D. Irish (eds.) 978 1 107 01145 8
- 67. Bioarchaeological and Forensic Perspectives on Violence: How Violent Death is Interpreted from Skeletal Remains Debra L. Martin & Cheryl P. Anderson (eds.) 978 1 107 04544 6



- 68. The Foragers of Point Hope: The Biology and Archaeology of Humans on the Edge of the Alaskan Arctic Charles E. Hilton, Benjamin M. Auerbach & Libby W. Cowgill (eds.) 978 1 107 02250 8
- 69. Bioarchaeology: Interpreting Behavior from the Human Skeleton, 2nd edn. Clark Spencer Larsen 978 0 521 83869 6 & 978 0 521 54748 2
- 70. Fossil Primates Susan Cachel 978 1 107 00530 3
- 71. Demography and Evolutionary Ecology of Hadza Hunter-Gatherers Nicholas Blurton Jones 978 1 107 06982 4
- 72. Skeletal Biology of the Ancient Rapanui (Easter Islanders) Vincent H. Stefan & George W. Gill 978 1 107 02366 6
- 73. The Dwarf and Mouse Lemurs of Madagascar: Biology, Behavior and Conservation Biogeography of the Cheirogaleidae Shawn M. Lehman, Ute Radespiel & Elke Zimmermann 978 1 107 07559 7
- 74. The Missing Lemur Link: An Ancestral Step in the Evolution of Human Behaviour Ivan Norscia & Elisabetta Palagi 978 1 107 016088



# **Studies in Forensic Biohistory**

# **Anthropological Perspectives**

Edited by

CHRISTOPHER M. STOJANOWSKI

Professo

Arizona State University, USA

WILLIAM N. DUNCAN

Associate Professor

East Tennessee State University, USA





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107073548

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First Published in 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Stojanowski, Christopher M. (Christopher Michael), 1973- editor. | Duncan, William N., editor.

Title: Studies in forensic biohistory: anthropological perspectives / edited Christopher M. Stojanowski, Arizona State University, USA, William N. Duncan, East Tennessee State University, USA.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge, [2016] | Series: Cambridge studies in biological and evolutionary anthropology | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016030824 | ISBN 9781107073548 (Hardback) Subjects: LCSH: Forensic anthropology. | Physical anthropology. |

Human remains (Archaeology) | Sociobiology.

Classification: LCC GN69.8 .S78 2016 | DDC 614/.17-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016030824

ISBN 978-1-107-07354-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



# **Contents**

		t of Contributors knowledgments	page x xii		
1	Defining an Anthropological Biohistorical Research Agenda: The History, Scale, and Scope of an Emerging Discipline Christopher M. Stojanowski and William N. Duncan				
	1.1	Defining and Delineating a Biohistorical Research Agenda	2		
	1.2 1.3	The Scope of Biohistory Volume Rationale, Goals, and Organization	6 11		
	1.4		18		
2		copsy of Past Leaders: What Do Remains Tell Us About Them?	29		
	2.1	First Patient: Richard I the Lionheart	29		
	2.2	Second Patient: Henri IV of France	32		
	2.3	Third Patient: Maximilien de Robespierre	38		
	2.4	Conclusion	40		
3	Game of Thrones: Richard III and the Creation of Cultural Heritage Richard Toon and Laurie Stone				
	3.1	A Game of Thrones	43		
	3.2	Epilogue (April 2015)	62		
4	The Search for Don Francisco de Paula Marin: Servant, Friend, and Advisor to King Kamehameha I, Kingdom of Hawai'i 6				
	and Advisor to King Kamehameha I, Kingdom of Hawai'i Michael Pietrusewsky, Michele Toomay Douglas, Rona M. Ikehara-Quebral, and Conrad Mac Goodwin				
	4.1	Marin Tower Housing Project	71		
	4.2	Marin's Health and Physical Features	75		
	4.3	Objectives of Study	77		
	4.4	Methods (Sex, Age, Stature, Ancestry)	77		
	4.5 4.6	Results Conclusion	79 88		
5	Karin	earthing Robert Kennicott: Naturalist, Explorer, Smithsonian Scienti n S. Bruwelheide, Sandra S. Schlachtmeyer, Douglas W. Owsley, Vicki E. Simon, ur C. Aufderheide, Larry W. Cartmell, and Stephan J. Swanson	st 92		
	5.1	Robert Kennicott	93		
	5.2	The Opening and Postmortem Examination	96		



More Information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07354-8 — Studies in Forensic Biohistory Edited by Christopher M. Stojanowski , William N. Duncan Frontmatter

viii Contents

	5.3	Discussion	112			
	5.4	Conclusion	117			
6	The	Influence of the Law on the Postmortem Narratives				
	of U	nknown Human Remains	124			
	Ryan	M. Seidemann				
	6.1	A Review of Louisiana's Legal Limitations on Trafficking in Human Remains	124			
	6.2	Case Examples of Human Remains Trafficking from Louisiana	128			
	6.3 6.4	Groping for Theory in the World of Human Remains Sales Conclusion	135			
	6.4	Conclusion	139			
7	The Biohistory of Prehistory: Mummies and the Forensic					
	Crea	ation of Identity	143			
	Kenn	eth C. Nystrom				
	7.1	Biohistory of Historic Mummies	144			
	7.2	Biohistory of Prehistoric Mummies	149			
	7.3	Conclusion	159			
8	Talk	king Heads and Other Specters of the Mountain Meadows Massacre	167			
Ū		non A. Novak	107			
	8.1	Facts of the Matter	170			
	8.2	Talking Heads	172			
	8.3	Naming and Knowing	178			
	8.4	Conclusion	185			
9	Facial Reconstruction of Famous Historical Figures: Between					
		ence and Art	191			
	Laura	a Buti, Giorgio Gruppioni, and Stefano Benazzi				
	9.1	Development of Principal Scientific Protocols and Their Reliability	193			
	9.2	Reliability: Artistic Component and Anatomical Prediction	196			
	9.3	Review of Some Published Examples of Historical Personages	199			
	9.4	Why do Scientists and Artists Endorse Facial Reconstructions?	201			
	9.5	The Humanistic and Conceptual Aspects Behind Reconstruction: Public Interest and Education	205			
	9.6	Conclusion	208			
40	<b>T</b> I	Donk abilitatis Donks for Identifying Individuals in				
10	The Probabilistic Basis for Identifying Individuals in Biohistorical Research					
	Biohistorical Research Lyle W. Konigsberg and Lee Meadows Jantz					
	10.1	Standing Height and Likelihood	213			
	10.1		215			
	10.3		216			
	10.4		219			
	10.5	Likelihood Ratios from Dental Pathology	219			



	Contents	ix				
	10.6 Combining Likelihood Ratios	221				
	10.7 What is a Reasonable Likelihood Ratio Threshold for					
	Making the Identification?	223				
	10.8 Cases	224				
	10.9 Conclusion	230				
11	Known Unknowns: Forensic Science, the Nation-State,					
	and the Iconic Dead	237				
	Sarah Wagner and Adam Rosenblatt					
	11.1 Post-Conflict Knowledge Production	239				
	11.2 An Unknown Soldier Named: First Lieutenant Michael J. Blassie	241				
	11.3 The Famous and the Mistaken: Exhumations and Identification in Chile	249				
	11.4 Conclusion	262				
12	The Biohistory of Atrocity and the Social Life of Human Remains	267				
	Claire Moon					
	12.1 Defining a Practice	268				
	12.2 Histories of a Practice	272				
	12.3 The Social Life of Human Remains	280				
	12.4 Conclusion	285				
13	Ethical Issues in Biohistory: No Easy Answers!	288				
	Jane E. Buikstra					
	13.1 Why <i>Do</i> Biohistory? <i>When</i> is it Justified?	291				
	13.2 Permeability of the Boundaries: Personhood, Agency, and Embodiment	293				
	13.3 Can the Dead be Harmed or Wronged? Do They Have Rights After Rites?	295				
	13.4 Legal and Ethical Perspectives: Global, National, and Museological	297				
	13.5 Ethics: This Volume	304				
	13.6 Conclusion	308				
14	Theoretical Facets of Biohistorical Research	315				
	William N. Duncan and Christopher M. Stojanowski					
	14.1 Engagement and Enchainment	315				
	14.2 Bodies, Objects, Personhood, Embodiment	317				
	14.3 Historicism, Race, Gender, and the State	320				
	14.4 Reflexivity and the Medical Gaze	322				
	14.5 Conclusion: Ethics and Public Engagement	324				
	Index	328				



# **Contributors**

### Arthur C. Aufderheide

Posthumous contribution

#### Stefano Benazzi

Department of Cultural Heritage, University of Bologna, Ravenna, Italy

#### Karin S. Bruwelheide

Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

### Jane E. Buikstra

School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA

#### Laura Buti

Department of Cultural Heritage, University of Bologna, Ravenna, Italy

# Larry W. Cartmell

Pathology Department, Valley View Regional Hospital, Ada, OK, USA

#### **Philippe Charlier**

Equipe d'anthropologie médicale et médico-légale, UFR des sciences de la santé (UVSQ / AP-HP), Montigny-le-Bretonneux, France

## **Michele Toomay Douglas**

Department of Anthropology, University of Hawai'i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI, USA

# William N. Duncan

Department of Sociology and Anthropology, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, TN, USA

# Rona M. Ikehara-Ouebral

International Archaeological Research Institute, Inc., Honolulu, HI, USA

# **Conrad Mac Goodwin**

4801 Westover Terrace, Knoxville, TN, USA

# **Giorgio Gruppioni**

Department of Cultural Heritage, University of Bologna, Ravenna, Italy

#### Lvle W. Konigsberg

Department of Anthropology, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL, USA

### Lee Meadows Jantz

Department of Anthropology, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN, USA



**More Information** 

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07354-8 — Studies in Forensic Biohistory Edited by Christopher M. Stojanowski , William N. Duncan Frontmatter

List of Contributors

χi

#### Claire Moon

Department of Sociology, Centre for the Study of Human Rights, London School of Economics, London, UK

#### Shannon A. Novak

Department of Anthropology, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY, USA

### Kenneth C. Nystrom

Department of Anthropology, State University of New York at New Paltz, New Paltz, NY, USA

## **Douglas W. Owsley**

Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

#### Michael Pietrusewsky

Department of Anthropology, University of Hawai'i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI, USA

#### **Adam Rosenblatt**

Peace, Justice and Human Rights, Haverford College, Haverford, PA, USA

# Sandra S. Schlachtmeyer

Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

#### Rvan M. Seidemann

Lands and Natural Resources Section, Louisiana Department of Justice, Baton Rouge, LA, USA

# Vicki E. Simon

Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

# Christopher M. Stojanowski

School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA

# **Laurie Stone**

8402 E Welsh Trail, Scottsdale, AZ, USA

# Stephan J. Swanson

The Grove, 1421 Milwaukee Avenue, Glenview, IL, USA

## **Richard Toon**

School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA

### Sarah Wagner

Department of Anthropology, George Washington University, Washington, DC, USA



# **Acknowledgments**

This book ultimately began with the initiation of the Pedro de Corpa consultation at the request of Father Conrad Harkins. We would like to thank Father Harkins for involving us and setting us on this path. We would also like to thank the staff of the Fort King George Museum, Debbie Wallsmith, and Linda Bitley for helping coordinate our visits to the site and arranging the temporary loan of the Fort King George skull. David Crass, Georgia State archaeologist, also supported this work. We would like to thank St. John Fisher College for an internal research grant that supported isotopic work and radiocarbon dates on the Fort King George skull. Research support was also provided by Southern Illinois University College of Liberal Arts. WND would like to thank his colleagues and friends in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at East Tennessee State University, particularly Melissa Schrift, Tony Cavender, Lindsey King, Joseph Baker, and David and Cara Harker for always having their doors open. They, along with their families, make coming to work seem not at all like work. Most importantly, WND would like to thank Margaret and Neill Duncan, and Carmen and Felix, to whom he dedicates this book. They have been a constant fount of support, love and grace and I could not be more grateful.