

Printers Without Borders

This innovative study shows how printing and translation transformed English literary culture in the Renaissance. Focusing on the century after Caxton brought the press to England in 1476, Coldiron illustrates the foundational place of foreign, especially French-language, materials. The book reveals unexpected foreign connections between works as different as Caxton's first printed translations, several editions of *Book of the Courtier*, sixteenth-century multilingual poetry, and a royal Armada broadside. Demonstrating a new way of writing literary history beyond source-influence models, the author treats the patterns and processes of translation and printing as co-transformations. This provocative book will interest scholars and advanced students of book history, translation studies, comparative literature, and Renaissance literature.

A. E. B. COLDIRON is Professor of English and History of Text Technologies and affiliated faculty in French at Florida State University. She is the author of *Canon, Period, and the Poetry of Charles of Orleans: Found in Translation* (2000) and *English Printing, Verse Translation, and the Battle of the Sexes,* 1476–1557 (2009). She has also published numerous articles on translation, Renaissance literature, print culture, and poetics. She serves on the board of directors of SHARP and on the editorial board of the MHRA Tudor and Stuart Translations Series.





Printers Without Borders

Translation and Textuality in the Renaissance

A.E.B. COLDIRON





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107073173

© A. E. B. Coldiron, 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Coldiron, A. E. B. (Anne Elizabeth Banks)

Printers without borders: translation and textuality

in the Renaissance / A. E. B. Coldiron.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-07317-3 (hardback)

- 1. Translating and interpreting England History 16th century.
- 2. Book industries and trade England History 16th century.
- Renaissance England.
 Printers England History 16th century.
 Transmission of texts England History 16th century.
 Title.

P306.8.G7C65 2014

418'.020941-dc23

2014009761

ISBN 978-1-107-07317-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Nick





Contents

List of figures and tables		page 1x	
Acknowledgments		xiii	
1	"Englishing" texts: patterns of Early Modern translation		
	and transmission	1	
	Nation/transnation: appropriation and English exceptionality	7	
	The present book: selection of cases, theory, methods	14	
	Patterns of translation and transmission	20	
	The chapters and illustrating cases	30	
2	Caxton, translation, and the Renaissance reprint culture	35	
	Translating the hybrid past: catenary Caxtons	35	
	Troys for England (via Burgundy): reprinting lost empires	40	
	Wandering wisdom, textual authority, and acculturation in		
	The Dictes or Sayengis of the Philosophres	65	
	Two English versions of Chartier's Curial: poetic paratexts	91	
3	"Bastard allone": radiant translation and the status		
	of English letters	107	
	The Quadrins group: genres, translation, and the "English		
	exception"	112	
	The printer	119	
	"All poetics is local": people, places, and paratexts in the		
	Quadrins group	122	
	Radiant titles: "true and lyuely" as English code-phrase	140	
	French and English prefaces: sister arts, sibling languages	145	
	Radiant transnationalism and repairing Babel	155	
4	Compressed transnationalism: John Wolfe's trilingual		
	Courtier	160	
	Appropriation and anxiety in England: translations as substitute,		
	prophylaxis, or heuristic	166	
	Polyglot pages: Wolfe's mise-en-page in context	172	

vii



vii	i	Contents
	Purged paratexts Conclusion	186 197
5	The world on one page: an octolingual Armada broadside The form[e]s of transnationhood The poems: translators' forms The page and its contexts Armada discourses, alternatives, and afterlives	199 199 205 228 245
6	Macaronic verse, plurilingual printing, and the uses of translation Early macaronics' strategic use of translation Eschewing translation? Macaronics' satiric mobile phonemes Expressive tactics of macaronic verse Conclusion	255 258 270 276 282
Af	terword	283
Appendix		285
Bi	bliography	287
In	dex	324



Figures and tables

Figures

2.1	The Auncient Historie, of the Destruction of Troy	
	(London: Creede [and Simmes], 1597), Epilogue:	
	pp. 602-603. STC 15379. Bodleian Library Mal. 626. By	
	permission of The Bodleian Libraries, The University of	
	Oxford. Image published with permission of Proquest and	
	produced as part of Early English Books Online. www.	
	proquest.com. Further reproduction is prohibited without	
	permission.	page 48
2.2	Al-Mubashshir ibn Fâtik, Al-Hikam, Topkapı Saray	
	Museum, Ahmed III MS A.3206, fol. 48. By gracious	
	permission of the Museum and with use of Wikimedia.	65
2.3	Leaf from Guillaume de Tignonville, Les dits moraulx des	
	philosophes. France (Bourges). [Late?] fifteenth century.	
	Used by permission of the Rare Book Department, Free	
	Library of Philadelphia. MS Lewis [E209], fol. 24r.	82
2.4	Tignonville, trans., Dits moraulx, Pierpont Morgan	
	Library MS M771, fol. 045v. Purchased from Ellis, 1931.	
	Photographic Credit: The Pierpont Morgan Library.	83
2.5	Tignonville, trans., Dits moraulx, Pierpont Morgan	
	Library MS M771, fol. 071r. Purchased from Ellis, 1931.	
	Photographic Credit: The Pierpont Morgan Library.	84
2.6	Woodville, trans., The Dyctes and the sayenges of the	
	philosophers. London: Wynkyn de Worde, 1528. TP. STC	
	6830. This item is used by permission of The Huntington	
	Library, San Marino California, RB 59068. Image	
	published with permission of Proquest and produced as	
	part of Early English Books Online. www.proquest.com.	
	Further reproduction is prohibited without permission.	86

ix



List of figures and tables

x

5.1	Claude Paradin, Quaarins nistorique de la Bible. Lyon:	
	Jean de Tournes, 1553. [B6r]. By permission of the	
	Bibliothèque nationale de France; côte NUMM-79266	
	[Gallica].	113
3.2	Ymages of the old testament set forthe in Ynglishe and	
	Frenche. Lyon: by Johan Frellon, 1549. [B2v]. STC 3045.	
	By permission of The Folger Shakespeare Library. Folger	
	Copy HH119/8.	118
3.3	Peter Derendel, trans., True and Lyuely Historyke	
	Purtreatures of the Woll Bible. Lyon: Jean de Tournes,	
	1553. A2. STC 3043. This item is used by permission of	
	The Huntington Library, San Marino California, RB	
	59069. Image published with permission of Proquest and	
	produced as part of Early English Books Online. www.	
	proquest.com.Further reproduction is prohibited without	
	permission.	125
3.4	Damiano Maraffi, trans., Figure del Vecchio Testamento,	
	con versi toscani, per Damiano Maraffi nuovamente	
	composti, illustrate. Lyon: Jean de Tournes, 1554. Title	
	verso. By permission of the Bibliothèque nationale de	
	France; côte NUMM-79232 [Gallica].	129
4.1	Thomas Hoby, trans., The Courtier of Count Baldessar	
	Castilio. London: John Wolfe, 1588. TP. STC 4781. By	
	permission of The Folger Shakespeare Library. Folger	
	Copy 1, HH47/29.	161
4.2	Thomas Hoby, trans., The Courtier of Count Baldessar	
	Castilio. London: John Wolfe, 1588. [A2v]-A3. STC	
	4781. By permission of The Folger Shakespeare Library.	
	Folger Copy 1, HH47/29.	162
4.3	Thomas Hoby, trans., The Courtyer of count Baldessar	
	Castilio. London: Seres, 1561. [D3v]-D.iiii. STC 4778. By	
	permission of The Folger Shakespeare Library. Folger	
	Copy Acc#cs108.	174
4.4	Gabriel Chappuys, trans., Le Parfait Courtisan. Paris:	
	N. Bonfons, 1585. By permission of the Bibliothèque	
	nationale de France; côte NUMM-75479 [Gallica].	176
4.5	William Patten, The Calender of Scripture. London:	
	Richard Jugge, 1575. [I.1v]-I.ii. STC 19476. By	



List of figures and tables	xi
 permission of The Folger Shakespeare Library. Folger Copy 2, HH42/26, HH16/17. 4.6 Thomas Watson, <i>The Hekatompathia or Passionate Century of Love</i>. London: John Wolfe for Gabriel Cawood, [1582]. [A3v–A4r]. STC 25118a. By permission of The Folger Shakespeare Library. Folger Copy 1 (cs0114). 	182
5.1 Ad Serenissimam Elizabetham Angliae Reginam Theodor Beza. London: Bishop and Newbery, 1588. STC 1999. Thanks to the British Library and Proquest for permission to reproduce this image. © The British Library Board; British Library shelfmark C.18.e.2.(18.). Image published with permission of Proquest and produced as part of Early English Books Online. www.proquest. com. Further reproduction is prohibited without	
permission. 6.1 Upper: <i>Hic incipit paruus Catho</i> . Westminster: W. Caxton, 1477. STC 4850 [Fol.1, unpaginated, unsigned]. By permission of Cambridge University Library, Inc.5.J.1.1.[3483]. Lower: <i>Hic incipit paruus</i> Chato [sic]. Westminster: W. Caxton, 1483. aii. STC 4852. © The British Library Board; British Library shelfmark C.10.b.8. Both images are published with permission of Proquest and produced as part of Early English Books Online. www.proquest.com. Further	201
reproduction is prohibited without permission. 6.2 Upper: "Salve Regina," in John Lydgate, <i>Stans puer ad mensam</i> . Westminster: Caxton, [1477?]. STC 17030 [Fol. 3v; unpaginated, unsigned]. By permission of Cambridge University Library, Inc.5.J.1.1 [3490]. Lower: "Salve Regina," in John Lydgate, <i>Stans puer ad mensam</i> . London: Wynkyn de Worde, 1510. A.iii. STC 17030.5. By permission of Cambridge University Library, Sel.5.12. Both images are published with permission of Proquest and produced as part of <i>Early English Books Online</i> . www.proquest.com. Further reproduction is prohibited	262
without permission.	265



xii List of figures and t		nd tables
Tables		
2.1 Some basic features of <i>Recuyell</i> edit	ions, 1473–1684	50
3.1 Comparison of paratexts in five ver	sions of Jean de	
Tournes's Quadrins		127
5.1 Single-sheet Catholic-related items p	orinted on vellum, held	
in the British Library		235



Acknowledgments

It is an honor to thank so many fine people and institutions for their contributions to this long, multifaceted project. First gratitude goes to the National Endowment for the Humanities and to the Folger Shakespeare Library for long-term research fellowships. Warm thanks to all the Folger staff, including Betsy Walsh and the Reading Room dream team, Harold Batie, Lu Ellen DeHaven, Rosalind Larry, and Camille Seerattan. Also at the Folger, Georgianna Ziegler, Heather Wolfe, Owen Williams, Sarah Werner, David Schalkwyk, Gail Paster, Kathleen Lynch, Stephen Galbraith, and Carol Brobeck (and indeed everyone at the Folger) unfailingly encouraged, advised, and informed me. Fellow fellows Jennifer Keith, Jeremy Lopez, Jean-Christophe Mayer, Marc Schachter, and Francesca DiBlasio shared important knowledge that informed this work, as did Ian Gadd and members of his seminar on the History of the Company of Stationers. Folger Institute symposia and conferences on translation and on book history were timely and stimulating. Photographic and permissions specialists were unerring and speedy. This project would not have been possible without the Folger, its programs, and its people.

Audiences have given their time to attend my talks and lectures on this work in several venues, including RSA, MLA, SRS (UK), the University of Toronto, Columbia University, the Library of Congress, and the places noted hereafter; their excellent questions and comments have immeasurably improved the project: at Oxford University, I am especially grateful to Laurie Maguire, Colin Burrow, David Norbrook, Gerard Kilroy, Paul Strohm, Bart van Es, and others at the Merton College early modern group. At St. John's College, Oxford, special thanks to Tania Demetriou and Rowan Tomlinson. At the Nida Institute for Translation Studies, Lawrence Venuti, Anna Strowe, Mary Helen McMurran, Anne Birien, symposium organizer Bob Hodgson, and others shared insights. At the Southeastern Renaissance Conference, many friends asked fine questions; thanks to Beth Quitslund and Scott Lucas for special queries and

xiii



xiv Acknowledgments

information. At the University of Connecticut, Kathleen Tonry assembled an audience of sparkling, engaged interlocutors, including Pamela Benson, Fred Biggs, Yohei Igarahshi, and Fiona Somerset. Margaret M. Smith, David McKitterick, and others in the Cambridge University Library Masterclass on Incunables shared useful information. At Cambridge University, Helen Cooper, Ruth Morse, Daniel Wakelin, Jason Scott-Warren, and others at the Centre for Material Texts offered warm welcome and superb challenging discussion.

At Florida State University, special thanks to the Council on Research and Creativity for generous early-stage funding. Thanks to FSU colleagues, students, and friends whose conversations enlivened the workplace, and to research assistants Meaghan J. Brown, Jacob Gibbons, Marie Hause, Amber Pepe, and Jennifer Terry. In her marathon of bibliographical and editorial work on this book, Molly Hand always saw both forest and trees and was never daunted by either.

Parts of Chapter 2 appeared in earlier forms in "The Mediated Medieval and Shakespeare," in *Shakespeare*, *Pasts and Presents*, edited by H. Cooper, P. Holland, and R. Morse (Cambridge University Press, 2013), 55–77; and in "Women in Early Print Culture," in *History of British Women's Writing*, Vol. II, ed. J. Summit and C. Bicks (London and New York: Palgrave, 2010), 60–83. Thanks to Cambridge University Press and to Palgrave for permission to reproduce these revised versions.

Thanks to the libraries and collections whose images appear here (see the list of figures for details): the Bibliothèque nationale de France, the Bodleian Library, Oxford University; the British Library; Cambridge University Library; the Folger Shakespeare Library; the Free Library of Philadelphia; the Huntington Library; the Pierpont Morgan Library; ProQuest/UMI; and the Topkapı-saray Palace Museum.

At the Press, anonymous readers made excellent suggestions. Rosemary Crawley guided the book through pre-production with organized, calm clarity; no international permissions problem could faze her. Thanks to production editor, Charlotte Thomas, to team-leader Sam Saint André, and to the most brilliant, humane, learned polyglot copy-editor I have ever encountered, Jacqueline French. Abiding thanks, too, to the most patient, kind, and savvy visionary, Sarah Stanton.

Colleagues and friends near and far have offered every sort of help; the actual list, like my gratitude, exceeds this space. Some appear above;



Acknowledgments

ΧV

among others who gave comments, references, very special books, encouragement, wisdom, phone calls to Istanbul, and more: Guyda Armstrong, Sabrina "Vervliet" Baron, Jodi "España" Bilinkoff, Rick Blackwood, Bruce Sensei Boehrer, Joyce Boro, Jackson Boswell, Warren Boutcher, Gordon Braden, Tony Edwards, Aysegul Giray, Gingie Glover, Andrew Hadfield, Carter Hailey, Gil Harris, Brenda Hosington, Erin Kelly, Clare Kinney, Roger Kuin, Stephanie Leitch, David Levinson, Steven May, Randall McLeod, Steve Il Cortegiano Milner, Ruth Morse, Hélène Morzadec, Karen Newman, Anne Lake Prescott, Mark Rankin, Meg Roland, Keli Rylance, Neil "most patient" Rhodes, Tony Spearing, Peter Stallybrass, and Gary "just write it" Taylor. Awesome Heather Dubrick miraculously rescued the index. I am especially indebted to Alastair Fowler for extended, expert commentary and suggestions on several chapters, and to Jennifer Keith and Russell Wyland for astute reading and comments on Chapters 1 and 5 respectively; they bear no responsibility for remaining errors. For reading the entire manuscript more than once, for excellent suggestions on writing, for generous help of all kinds, and for the book's title, very special thanks and love to Nicholas Crawford. And finally, measureless gratitude to Michelle Zerba, whose timely hospital intervention quite literally saved my life.