

SHAKESPEARE AND RENAISSANCE ETHICS

Written by a distinguished international team of contributors, this volume explores Shakespeare's vivid depictions of moral deliberation and individual choice in light of Renaissance debates about ethics. Examining the intellectual context of Shakespeare's plays, the essays illuminate Shakespeare's engagement with the most pressing moral questions of his time, considering the competing claims of politics, Christian ethics and classical moral philosophy, as well as new perspectives on controversial topics such as conscience, prayer, revenge and suicide. Looking at Shakespeare's responses to emerging schools of thought such as Calvinism and Epicureanism, and assessing comparisons between Shakespeare and his French contemporary Montaigne, the collection addresses questions such as: when does laughter become cruel? How does style reflect moral perspective? Does shame lead to self-awareness? This book is of great interest to scholars and students of Shakespeare studies, Renaissance studies and the history of ethics.

PATRICK GRAY is Lecturer in Shakespeare and Renaissance Literature in the Department of English Studies at Durham University. He has taught Shakespeare, classics and comparative literature at Deep Springs College, Providence College and the United States Military Academy at West Point. His research interests include shame, guilt, the ethics of recognition (*Anerkennung*) and the reception of the classics in the Renaissance.

JOHN D. COX is DuMez Professor of English at Hope College. He is the author of many articles and books including *The Devil and the Sacred in English Drama, 1350–1642* (Cambridge, 2000), the co-editor of *A New History of Early English Drama* (1997) and the third Arden *3 Henry VI* (2001), and the editor of the Broadview Press/Internet Shakespeare edition of *Julius Caesar* (2012).





SHAKESPEARE AND RENAISSANCE ETHICS

PATRICK GRAY
AND
JOHN D. COX





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107071933

© Cambridge University Press, 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Shakespeare and Renaissance Ethics / edited by Patrick Gray and John D. Cox.

pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-07193-3 (hardback)

Shakespeare, William, 1564–1616–Ethics.
 Moral conditions in literature.
 Ethics, Renaissance, in literature.
 Literature and morals–History–16th century.
 Literature and morals–History–17th century.
 Gray, Patrick, editor of compilation.
 Cox, John D., 1945–editor of compilation.

PR3007.S39 2014 822.3'3-dc23 2014009433

ISBN 978-1-107-07193-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Notes on contributors Preface		<i>page</i> vii ix
	Introduction: rethinking Shakespeare and ethics Patrick Gray and John D. Cox	I
PΑ	RT I SHAKESPEARE AND CLASSICAL ETHICS	35
Ι	Fame, eternity, and Shakespeare's Romans <i>Gordon Braden</i>	37
2	Shakespeare and the ethics of laughter <i>Indira Ghose</i>	56
3	Aristotelian shame and Christian mortification in Love's Labour's Lost Jane Kingsley-Smith	76
4	Shakespeare's Virgil: empathy and <i>The Tempest Leah Whittington</i>	98
PΑ	RT II SHAKESPEARE AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS	121
5	Shakespeare's prayers John D. Cox	123
6	The morality of milk: Shakespeare and the ethics of nursing <i>Beatrice Groves</i>	139
7	Hamlet the rough-hewer: moral agency and the consolations of Reformation thought Russell M. Hillier	159

V



vi	Contents	
8	"Wrying but a little"? Marriage, punishment, and forgiveness in <i>Cymbeline Robert S. Miola</i>	186
	RT III SHAKESPEARE AND THE ETHICAL THINKING MONTAIGNE	211
9	"HIDE THY SELFE": Montaigne, Hamlet, and Epicurean ethics Patrick Gray	213
Ю	Conscience and the god-surrogate in Montaigne and Measure for Measure William M. Hamlin	237
II	Shakespeare, Montaigne, and classical reason Peter Holbrook	261
12	Madness, proverbial wisdom, and philosophy in King Lear Peter Mack	284
Ina	lex	304



Contributors

- GORDON BRADEN is Linden Kent Memorial Professor of English at the University of Virginia; author of *Renaissance Tragedy and the Senecan Tradition* (1985), *The Idea of the Renaissance* (with William Kerrigan, 1989), and *Petrarchan Love and the Continental Renaissance* (1999); and co-editor of *The Oxford History of Literary Translation in English, vol. 2:* 1550–1660 (2010).
- JOHN D. COX is the DuMez Professor of English at Hope College. He is the author most recently of *Seeming Knowledge: Shakespeare and Skeptical Faith* (2007), the co-editor of *A New History of Early English Drama* and the third Arden *3 Henry VI* (2001) and the editor of the Broadview Press/ Internet Shakespeare edition of *Julius Caesar* (2012).
- INDIRA GHOSE is Professor of English Literature at the University of Fribourg in Switzerland. Her book *Shakespeare and Laughter: A Cultural History* appeared in 2008.
- PATRICK GRAY is Lecturer in Shakespeare and Renaissance Literature at Durham University. His research interests include shame, guilt, the ethics of recognition (*Anerkennung*), and the reception of the classics in the Renaissance.
- BEATRICE GROVES is the Research Lecturer in Renaissance English at Trinity College, Oxford. She has published widely on Shakespeare and early modern drama, including the monograph *Texts and Traditions:* Religion in Shakespeare, 1591–1604 (2007).
- WILLIAM M. HAMLIN teaches English at Washington State University. A past recipient of fellowships from the National Endowment for the Humanities and the J. S. Guggenheim Foundation, he is the author of *Tragedy and Scepticism in Shakespeare's England* (2005) and *Montaigne's English Journey: Reading the* Essays *in Shakespeare's Day* (2013).

vii



viii

Notes on contributors

- RUSSELL M. HILLIER is Associate Professor of English at Providence College, Rhode Island. He is the author of *Milton's Messiah: The Son of God in the Works of John Milton* (2011) and articles on writers as diverse as Milton, Coleridge, Dostoevsky, and Cormac McCarthy.
- PETER HOLBROOK is Professor of English Renaissance Literature at the University of Queensland, Australia. His most recent book is *Shakespeare's Individualism* (Cambridge, 2010).
- JANE KINGSLEY-SMITH is a reader at Roehampton University, London. She is the author of two monographs: *Shakespeare's Drama of Exile* (2003) and *Cupid in Early Modern Literature and Culture* (Cambridge, 2010), and is currently editing *Love's Labour's Lost* for the new Norton Shakespeare.
- PETER MACK is Director of the Warburg Institute, University of London, and Professor of English, University of Warwick. His books include Renaissance Argument (1993), Elizabethan Rhetoric (2002), Reading and Rhetoric in Montaigne and Shakespeare (2010), and A History of Renaissance Rhetoric 1380–1620 (2011).
- ROBERT S. MIOLA is the Gerard Manley Hopkins Professor of English and a lecturer in Classics at Loyola University in Maryland. He has published on Shakespeare's classical background and edited a number of plays, most recently *Hamlet* and *Macbeth* (Norton) and Jonson's *The Case Is Altered* (Cambridge, 2012), as well as an anthology of poetry and prose, *Early Modern Catholicism* (2007).
- LEAH WHITTINGTON is Assistant Professor of English at Harvard University. She is the author of articles on Milton, Virgil, and Petrarch, and is Associate Editor of the I Tatti Renaissance Library.



Preface

This book originated in a conference that Patrick organized at Yale University in the fall of 2010. The conference had the same title as the book, and it originally included three plenary speakers, anticipating the book's three sections: Gordon Braden on Shakespeare and classical ethics, John D. Cox on Shakespeare and Christian ethics, and Lars Engle on Shakespeare and the ethical thinking of Montaigne. A paper by Brett Foster on realism in Shakespeare's love poetry became the focus of a fourth plenary session. An open invitation for shorter essays resulted in the delivery of thirty papers in concurrent sessions over the course of the conference's three days. Conversation was lively, inspiring, and informative.

We acknowledge gratefully the assistance of the Yale Elizabethan Club, which provided initial funding; the Dean's Fund for Student-Organized Symposia at Yale University, which provided matching funds; and the Department of Renaissance Studies at Yale in making the conference possible, as well as the support of Yale's Department of English. We would especially like to thank David Scott Kastan, Lawrence Manley, Catherine Nicholson, and David Quint, who served as respondents for the plenary sessions. We would also like to thank the other graduate students in Renaissance Studies who served on the initial planning committee for the symposium: Martin Devecka, Alexia Ferracuti, Michael Komorowski, James Ross Macdonald, Claudia Rammelt, and Courtney Erin Thomas.

Shortly after the conference, Patrick invited John to join him in editing a collection of essays based on the same idea as the conference. Two of the four plenary speakers were able to offer their papers for the collection, as did one presenter from the concurrent sessions, Leah Whittington. We commissioned all the other essays specifically for this book. We explained the book's title and focus to the contributors, who each wrote an essay for a particular section of the book, carrying on a lively conversation with us about their work. David Loewenstein and Michael Witmore read the typescript for Cambridge University Press, offering helpful suggestions for improvement,



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07193-3 - Shakespeare and Renaissance Ethics Edited by Patrick Gray and John D. Cox Frontmatter More information

Preface

from which we benefited in revising the introduction and in requesting contributors to revise their essays. We are grateful to them and also to Sarah Stanton, Drama Editor for Cambridge University Press, for her encouragement, keen listening, and constructive suggestions. Hazel Harris's indefatigable work as copy editor offered strong support in the finishing stages.

We would like to thank Robert S. Miola for organizing a seminar on the same topic as our book, and with the same title, at the 2012 meeting of the Shakespeare Association of America in Boston. Several contributors to this volume presented papers in the seminar: Indira Ghose, Will Hamlin, Bob Miola himself, and both of us. Lars Engle was also part of the seminar, and, though he was unable to attend the conference because of a family emergency, he supplied helpful responses to papers by Will Hamlin and Patrick Gray. The conversation at the seminar was animated, useful, and encouraging.

We chose Rubens's *The Death of Seneca* to adorn the cover of our book for several reasons. It is contemporary with Shakespeare, to begin with. Its subject is the stoic death of an influential classical philosopher, who died in conscious imitation of Socrates, the fountainhead of classical philosophy; both were judicially executed, based on false charges. Rubens chose the subject in response to the increasing popularity of Neo-Stoicism in the late sixteenth century – a movement of which Shakespeare was well aware. "Philosophy" for him nearly always means a generalized Stoicism, whether or not he was familiar with the assumptions and arguments of particular Stoic philosophers.

Rubens painted this Roman Stoic philosopher in deliberate imitation of Christian iconography. The philosopher's loincloth and uplifted eyes, the soldiers looking on, the figure kneeling at the dying man's feet: all are reminiscent of common features in depictions of Christ's crucifixion. Medieval legend held that Seneca had been converted to Christianity by St. Paul, and the official order for his death seemed to excuse his suicide, which was otherwise morally unacceptable to all Christian thinkers in the Renaissance. The painting therefore represents the same combination of classical and Christian influences that we see at work in Shakespeare's ethical thinking. Stoicism was also important for Montaigne, the influence of whose ethical thought is the third central concern in this collection of essays.

We are glad to dedicate this book to our respective wives, Elizabeth Baldwin Gray and Karen A. Cox. The four of us spent a pleasant evening over dinner together at the Carnegie Abbey Club in Portsmouth, Rhode Island, in the summer of 2011. A lot has happened in all four of our lives since the Yale conference in the fall of 2010, and we are grateful for our wives' support, encouragement, and companionship through it all.