

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Employer and Worker Collective Action

This book compares sources of worker and employer power in Germany, South Africa, and the United States in order to identify the sources of comparative U.S. decline in union power and to analyze more precisely the nature of labor movement power. It finds that this power is not confined to allied parties, union confederations, or strikes, but rather consists of the capacity to translate power autonomously from one context to the next. By combining their product, labor market, and labor law advantages through their dominant employers' associations, leading firms imposed constraints on labor's free collective bargaining regionally and nationally, defeating employer interests that are more amenable to labor in the process. Through an examination of these patterns of interest organization, the book shows, however, that initial employer advantages prove to be contingent and unstable and inform subsequent conditions under which employers are forced to cede to more far-reaching demands of increasingly organized workers.

Andrew G. Lawrence teaches courses in politics and international relations at the Vienna School of International Studies, Vienna, Austria.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*Advance Praise for Employer and Worker Collective Action*

“Andrew Lawrence’s *Employer and Worker Collective Action* steps boldly outside the norm in political science, examining a truly important question from a unique vantage point. Lawrence’s analysis of the politics of labor markets and movements in both the developed and developing worlds is theoretically sophisticated, rigorously detailed, and genuinely pathbreaking. It contains invaluable resources for anyone hoping to understand labor politics in today’s world.”

– Jason C. Myers, California State University, Stanislaus

“Andrew Lawrence’s wide-ranging research on employer and worker collective action in Germany, South Africa, and the United States is a unique contribution to understanding the significance of institutional contingencies in the historical growth and decline of unions. Retaining a hopeful appraisal of the future of trade unions, this scholarly book should be an important addition to the literature on labor and comparative politics.”

– Immanuel Ness, Brooklyn College, City University of New York

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Employer and Worker Collective Action

*A Comparative Study of Germany,  
South Africa, and the United States*

ANDREW G. LAWRENCE

*Vienna School of International Studies*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107071759](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107071759)

© Andrew G. Lawrence 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Lawrence, Andrew G., 1966–

Employer and worker collective action : a comparative study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States / Andrew G. Lawrence.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-07175-9 (hardback)

1. Working class – Germany – History. 2. Working class – South Africa – History.

3. Working class – United States – History. 4. Labor unions – Germany – History.

5. Labor unions – South Africa – History. 6. Labor unions – United States –

History. I. Title.

HD8451.L39 2014

331.88–dc23 2014002759

ISBN 978-1-107-07175-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page ix
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	xiii
I. POWER IN THEORY AND CONTEXT	
1. Contending Theories of Labor Power	3
1.1 <i>Introduction</i>	3
1.2 <i>Worker Power: Lost in Isolation, Found in Translation</i>	13
1.3 <i>Why Size and Structure Aren't Everything</i>	21
1.4 <i>Mind the Gap: Labor and Democratization</i>	29
1.5 <i>Method, Sources, and Case Selection Rationale</i>	37
2. Contextualizing Workers' Power	43
2.1 <i>Introduction: Varieties of Labor Power and Logics of Collective Action</i>	43
2.2 <i>Power-Resource and Employer-Centered Approaches</i>	58
2.3 <i>Faces of Power in the Politics of Production</i>	65
2.4 <i>Varieties versus Uniformity of Capitalism: The Firm in Global Context</i>	70
2.5 <i>Conclusion: Collective Action at the Present Conjuncture</i>	77
II. EMPLOYER STRATEGY AND COLLECTIVE ACTION	
3. Varieties of Firm Strategy: Monopolization, Cartelization, Concentration	85
3.1 <i>Introduction: Trusts versus Cartels in Theory and Practice</i>	85
3.2 <i>U.S. Steel Trusts versus Cartels</i>	89
3.3 <i>German Steel Trusts versus Cartels</i>	94
3.4 <i>South African Mining</i>	103
3.5 <i>Conclusion</i>	112

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

4. Varieties of Employer Associations: Origins, Development, and Divergence	121
4.1 <i>Introduction</i>	121
4.2 <i>German Employers' Associations, from Kaiserreich to Postwar Reconstruction</i>	124
4.3 <i>U.S. Employer Associations</i>	130
4.4 <i>South African Employer Associations</i>	134
4.5 <i>Conclusion</i>	139
III. WORKERS: OUTLAWS, IN THE LAW, AND BY THE LAW	
5. Failed Incorporation and Union Response	147
5.1 <i>Introduction: From Labor Exclusion to Ambiguous Inclusion</i>	147
5.2 <i>Codetermination in the German Workplace between the Wars</i>	151
5.3 <i>South African Unionization, from Its Origins to the Apartheid Era</i>	161
5.4 <i>Shop-Floor Contention in U.S. Manufacturing before the NLRA</i>	173
5.5 <i>Conclusion</i>	182
6. Varieties of Juridification	188
6.1 <i>Introduction: Labor Law and Juridification</i>	188
6.2 <i>Germany</i>	195
6.3 <i>The United States</i>	199
6.4 <i>Canada</i>	210
6.5 <i>South Africa</i>	217
6.6 <i>Conclusion</i>	221
IV. FROM POSTWAR "GOLDEN QUARTER-CENTURY" TO POST-COLD WAR INTERLUDE	
7. The "Golden Quarter-Century": Revival, Containment, or Decline?	229
7.1 <i>Introduction: Cold War Stabilizations?</i>	229
7.2 <i>German Codetermination, from Adoption to Adaptation</i>	232
7.3 <i>South African Social Movement Unionism's Rise and Fall</i>	247
7.4 <i>U.S. Business Unionism from the 1940s to the 1960s</i>	250
7.5 <i>Conclusion</i>	252
8. Union and Employer Relations after the "Golden Quarter-Century"	256
8.1 <i>Introduction: Increasing Exit and Voice, Diminishing Loyalty</i>	256
8.2 <i>Workplace Rights and Contestation in Germany</i>	260
8.3 <i>Revolts of the Unrepresented in South Africa</i>	273
8.4 <i>Dissociations of Representation from Struggle in the United States</i>	286
8.5 <i>Conclusion</i>	297

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	vii
V. COLLECTIVE ACTION BEFORE AND IN THE GLOBAL ECONOMIC CRISIS	
9. From Tripartism to Global Economic Crisis	303
9.1 <i>Introduction: The Absence of U.S. Tripartism in Comparative Perspective</i>	303
9.2 <i>Failed Tripartism in South Africa</i>	306
9.3 <i>Failed Tripartism in Germany</i>	322
9.4 <i>Conclusion: Beyond Tripartite Bargaining</i>	327
10. Conclusion: Doing the Work of Crisis without Crisis?	328
10.1 <i>The Argument and Way Forward</i>	328
10.2 <i>What Is to Be Done?</i>	334
<i>Bibliography</i>	351
<i>Index</i>	353

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acknowledgments

Over the many years I have spent writing and revising this book, as teacher of and participant-observer in labor movements on three continents, I have incurred countless debts to the many individuals who have provided help, ideas, and encouragement. It is a pleasure to recognize at least some of these individuals and their organizations here.

I gratefully acknowledge the following funding sources: the British Academy; Columbia University's Center for European Studies; DAAD; the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung; the Dankwart A. Rustow Civil Society Fellowship at City University's Ralph Bunche Center for International Studies; and CUNY Graduate Center research and teaching fellowships. A research fellowship at the Vienna School of International Studies has afforded me a most *gemütlich* place to complete revisions; many thanks to its director, Hans Winkler, as well as Gerhard Loibl, Werner Neudeck, Thomas Row, and especially Markus Kornprobst, for their collegiality. Earlier versions of chapter sections appeared in *The Political Economy of Extraction*, France Bourgooin and Jewellord Nem Singh, eds. (Palgrave Macmillan, 2013); *New Political Science*, v. 26, no. 2, June 2004: 189–204; and *Politikon* v. 27, no. 1, May 2000: 117–132. I thank Palgrave and Taylor & Francis for permitting me to use them here.

In this book's first incarnation as my PhD dissertation, my advisor, John Bowman, and committee members, Ken Erickson, Volker Berghahn, Diana Gordon, and David Kettler, provided helpful comments, and several friends, mentors, and colleagues gave valuable insights and support, including Mark Blyth, Peter Bratsis, Tatianna Caryannis, Dave Engerman, Adam Habib, Mark Kesselman, Andy Markovits, Lenny Markovitz, Tony Marx, Jason Myers, Manny Ness, Molly Nolan, Claus Offe, Leo Panitch, Anthony Pereira, Frances Piven, Louwrens Pretorius, Simon Reich, Bernd Reiter, Rupert Taylor, fellow members of the CUNY Africa Research Group and the South African Reading Group in New York, especially Penny Andrews, Steve Ellman, and Tom Karis. With many others, I fondly remember Marshall Berman, Eric Hobsbawm,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Ralph Miliband, and Joseph Murphy, whose deaths have left the world within and beyond academia poorer.

After graduate school, those providing helpful feedback include David Cingranelli, Colin Elman, Robert Fatton, Walter Korpi, Alex Lichtenstein, Tom Lodge, Michael MacDonald, Jonas Pontusson, Herman Schwartz, John Stephens, and Peter Swenson. An enjoyable stint as visiting researcher at the European University Institute was made all the more enjoyable and productive thanks to the encouragement, ideas, and support of Donatella Della Porta, Reinhart Koselleck, Alessandro Pizzorno, Martin Rhodes, Philippe Schmitter, and Jelle Visser. I am grateful to Michael Keating for extending affiliation with EUI's Department of Political and Social Sciences. Students in Edinburgh, New York, Virginia, and at the Global Labor University at Kassel have been both patient and fruitful interlocutors.

Many people helped make various research stints enjoyable, insightful, and productive. They include, in Berlin, Michael Fichter, Bob Hancké, Ulrich Jürgens, and Thomas Welskopp; and in Bochum, Christian Kleinschmidt, Karl Lauschke, Peter Friedemann, and Klaus Tenfelde, at the Ruhr University's Institut zur Erforschung der europäischen Arbeiterbewegung. Professor Tenfelde led stimulating seminars and pointed me to useful material; I note with sadness his recent passing. In South Africa, extended family, colleagues, and friends at Qhakaza School, and in Cosatu, especially the SADWU and SADTU unions, provided homes away from home: they include Nikita Cindi, Roy Maartens, Nomsa Mabaso, David Robb, France Sesedinyane and the Cajee, Habib, Labuschagne, Nagdee, Vorster, and Zwane families.

Staff at several libraries, collections, and archives were of great help in locating and providing materials: these include, in Berlin, the Staatsbibliothek and Otto Suhr Institut; in the Ruhrgebiet, the Historisches Archiv Krupp, the Hans Böckler Stiftung, the Thyssen Archiv A.G., the Mannesmann Archiv, and the Westfälisches Wirtschaftsarchiv. I would like in particular to thank Dr. Horst A. Wessel of the Mannesmann Archiv and Dr. Manfred Rasch of the Thyssen Archiv. The South African History Archive and Cullinan Library at the University of the Witwatersrand, the National Library of Scotland in Edinburgh, Alderman Library at the University of Virginia, and in New York, Columbia University's Butler Library, the NYU Bobst Library and the New York Public Library, its Wertheim Room in particular, were indispensable resources.

At Cambridge University Press, the Political Science and History Senior Editor, Lew Bateman, his assistant editor, Shaun Vigil, Project Manager, Bhavani Ganesh, and their transcontinental team have been immensely helpful; Margaret Levi provided early encouragement; and I gratefully acknowledge the very helpful comments of two anonymous reviewers. I am especially grateful to Mark Kesselman, David Kettler, Kate and Jane Lebow, Jason Myers, Frances Piven, and Dan Wadhvani for reading through several chapter drafts and on occasion the entire manuscript at critical junctures and providing

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*Acknowledgments*

xi

speedy and helpful feedback. As ever, I alone am responsible for all remaining shortcomings in the text.

Most essential have been the love and support of my extended family: Jane, Ruth, Carol, Ned, David, Eli, Chris, Dia, Kristen, Nick, Isobel, Zoe, Diana, Peter, Emma, and Sashko. The book is dedicated to Kate, without whom I could not have finished it and for whom no book can be too historical; and to Naomi and Jacob, for whom, when they read it, it will all be history.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acronyms

### General

BIG	basic income guarantee
CME	coordinated market economy
EC	employer centered
EEC	European Economic Community
HRM	human resource management
ISC	International Steel Cartel
LME	liberal market economy
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PoP	politics of production
PR	power resources
VoC	varieties of capitalism

### Germany

ADGB	<i>Allgemeine Deutscher Gewerkschaftsbund</i>
ASU	<i>Arbeitsgemeinschaft Selbständiger Unternehmer</i>
BDA	<i>Bundesvereinigung der Deutschen Arbeitgeberverbände</i>
BDI	<i>Bundesverband der Deutschen Industrie</i>
CDI	<i>Centralverband Deutscher Industrieller</i>
CDU	<i>Christlich Demokratische Union</i>
DAG	<i>Deutsche Angestellten-Gewerkschaft</i>
DGB	<i>Deutscher Gewerkschaftsbund</i>
DIHT	<i>Deutscher Industrie- und Handelstag</i>
GDK	<i>Gewerkschaft Deutscher Kaiser group</i>
GDR	German Democratic Republic
GHH	<i>Güttehoffnungshütte</i>
KPD	<i>Kommunistische Partei Deutschlands</i>

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

*Acronyms*

RDI	<i>Reichsverband der Deutschen Industrie</i>
SPD	<i>Sozialdemokratische Partei Deutschlands</i>
VdA	<i>Vereinigung der deutschen Arbeitgeberverbände</i>
VSt	<i>Vereinigte Stahl</i>
ZAG	<i>Zentralarbeitsgemeinschaft</i>

**South Africa**

AAC	Anglo American Corporation
AHI	<i>Afrikaanse Handelsinstituut</i>
AMCU	Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union
AMIC	Anglo-American Industrial Corporation
AMWU	African Mine Workers' Union
ANC	African National Congress
BEE	Black Economic Empowerment
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CPSA	Communist Party of South Africa
CSO	Central Selling Organization
EOS	E. Oppenheimer and Son
FOSATU	Federation of South African Trade Unions
ICA	Industrial Conciliation Act
ICU	Industrial and Commercial Union of Africa
JSE	Johannesburg Stock Exchange
MWU	Mine Workers' Union
NEDLAC	National Economic Development and Labour Council
NLRA-SA	Native Labour Regulation Act
NNU	National Nurses United
NP	National Party
NRC	Native Representative Council
NUM	National Union of Mineworkers
SACCOLA	South African Consultative Committee on Labor Affairs
SACP	South African Communist Party
SACTU	South African Council of Trade Unions
SANLAM	South African National Trust and Assurance Mutual
SATALC	South African Trades and Labor Council
UDF	United Democratic Front

**United States**

AFL	American Federation of Labor
AFL-CIO	American Federation of Labor–Congress of Industrial Organizations
AFCME	American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07175-9 - Employer and Worker Collective Action: A Comparative Study of Germany, South Africa, and the United States

Andrew G. Lawrence

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acronyms*

xv

BR	Business Roundtable
CIO	Congress of Industrial Organizations
EFCA	Employee Free Choice Act
EPP	employee participation plan
HUAC	House Un-American Affairs committee
IBT	International Brotherhood of Teamsters
ILA	International Longshoremen's Association
ILWU	International Longshoremen's and Warehousemen's Union
NAM	National Association of Manufacturers
NEA	National Erectors' Association
NFA	National Founders' Association
NIRA	National Industry Recovery Act
NLRA	National Labor Relations Act
NLRB	National Labor Relations Board
NMTA	National Metal Trades Association
NSEA	National Steel Erector's Association
NWLB	National War Labor Board
OWS	Occupy Wall Street
PATCO	Professional Air Traffic Controllers Organization
SEA	Steel Exporters Association
SEIU	Service Employers' International Union
SWOC	Steel Workers Organizing Committee
TDU	Teamsters for a Democratic Union
UAW	United Auto Workers
UE	United Electrical Workers
UFCW	United Food and Commercial Workers
UFW	United Farm Workers union
UMWA	United Mine Workers of America
UPS	United Parcel Service