

Indigenous Intellectuals

In the United States of America today, debates among, between, and within Indian nations continue to focus on how to determine and define the boundaries of Indian ethnic identity and tribal citizenship. From the 1880s and into the 1930s, many Native people participated in similar debates as they confronted white cultural expectations regarding what it meant to be an Indian in modern American society. Using close readings of texts, images, and public performances, this book examines the literary output of four influential American Indian intellectuals who challenged long-held conceptions of Indian identity at the turn of the twentieth century. Kiara M. Vigil traces how the narrative discourses created by these figures spurred wider discussions about citizenship, race, and modernity in the United States and elsewhere. By setting them in dialogue with white American culture, Vigil demonstrates how these figures deployed aspects of Native American cultural practice to authenticate their status both as indigenous peoples and as citizens of the United States.

Kiara M. Vigil is an assistant professor of American studies at Amherst College and specializes in teaching and research related to Native American studies. She is a past recipient of the Gaius Charles Bolin fellowship from Williams College, as well as fellowships from the Mellon Foundation, the Autry National Center, the Newberry Library, and the Rackham Graduate School at the University of Michigan.





Studies in North American Indian History

Editors

Frederick Hoxie, *University of Illinois*, *Urbana-Champaign*Neal Salisbury, *Smith College*Tiya Miles, *University of Michigan*Ned Blackhawk, *Yale University*

This series is designed to exemplify new approaches to the Native American past. In recent years scholars have begun to appreciate the extent to which Indians, whose cultural roots extend back for thousands of years, shaped the North American landscape as encountered by successive waves of immigrants. In addition, because Native Americans continually adapted their cultural traditions to the realities of the Euro-American presence, their history adds a thread of non-Western experience to the tapestry of American culture. Cambridge Studies in North American Indian History brings outstanding examples of this new scholarship to a broad audience. Books in the series link Native Americans to broad themes in American history and place the Indian experience in the context of social and economic change over time.

Also in the Series:

Lucy Murphy Great Lakes Creoles: A French-Indian Community on the Northern Borderlands, Prairie du Chien, 1750–1860

Richard White The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650–1815, second edition

Gary Warrick A Population History of the Huron-Petun, A.D. 500–1650

John Bowes Exiles and Pioneers: Indians in the Trans-Mississippi West

David J. Silverman Faith and Boundaries: Colonists, Christianity, and the Community among the Wampanoag Indians of Martha's Vineyard, 1600–1871

Jeffrey Ostler The Plains Sioux and U.S. Colonialism from Lewis and Clark to Wounded Knee

Claudio Saunt A New Order of Things: Property, Power, and the Transformation of the Creek Indians, 1733–1816

Jean M. O'Brien Dispossession by Degrees: Indian Land and Identity in Natick, Massachusetts, 1650–1790

Frederick E. Hoxie Parading through History: The Making of the Crow Nation in America, 1805–1935

Colin G. Calloway The American Revolution in Indian Country: Crisis and Diversity in Native American Communities

Sidney L. Harring Crow Dog's Case: American Indian Sovereignty, Tribal Law, and United States Law in the Nineteenth Century





Indigenous Intellectuals

Sovereignty, Citizenship, and the American Imagination, 1880–1930

KIARA M. VIGIL

Amherst College





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107070813

© Kiara M. Vigil 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Vigil, Kiara M., 1975-

Indigenous intellectuals: sovereignty, citizenship, and the American imagination, 1880–1930 / Kiara M. Vigil, Amherst College. pages cm. – (Studies in North American Indian history)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-07081-3 (hbk.)

Indians of North America – Biography.
 Intellectuals – United States – Biography.
 Indians of North America – Intellectual life.
 Indians of North America – Politics and government.
 Title.

E89.V53 2015

970.004′97–dc23 2015002193

ISBN 978-1-107-07081-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLS for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In loving memory of

R. Max Vigil

Father, artist, and intellectual





Contents

List of Figures Acknowledgments		page x xi
I.	A Global Mission: The Higher Education of Charles Eastman	34
2.	Tracing Carlos Montezuma's Politics: Progressive Reform and Epistolary Culture Networks	101
3.	Red Bird: Gertrude Bonnin's Representational Politics	165
4.	Luther Standing Bear: Staging U.S. Indian History with Reel Indians	234
	Conclusion: The 1930s, Indian Reorganization, and Beyond	303
Afterword		321
Appendix		325
Bibliography		327
Index		351



Figures

т	"The Red Man's Rebuke" pamphlet cover (1893)	page 5
	1 1	puge 3
2	Musical program for Irene "Taluta" Eastman	58
3	Charles Eastman: Author's portrait (1916)	60
4	Dartmouth College reunion photograph (1927)	82
5	Carlos Montezuma portrait (circa 1915)	141
6	Gertrude Bonnin portrait by Gertrude Kasebier (circa 1898)	200
7	Gertrude Bonnin portrait by Gertrude Kasebier (circa 1898)	201
8	NCAI: Constitution and by-laws (circa 1926)	211
9	Chief Standing Bear full-length portrait	242
10	Luther Standing Bear actor's portrait	283



Acknowledgments

I could never have completed this book without a tremendous amount of scholarly and personal support from other people. In particular, I am grateful to my colleagues at Amherst College, especially those in the American Studies Department. Professors Lisa Brooks and Kevin Sweeney offered me feedback on certain parts of the manuscript in its final stages that I know has made for a better book. I am equally indebted to Karen Sanchez-Eppler and Barry O'Connell for their inspirational work as researchers, teachers, and mentors. My colleagues in American Studies have done well to provide me time and support to finish this book; thank you to: Carol Clark, Frank Couvares, Robert Hayashi, Sujani Reddy, Molly Mead, Solsi Del Moral, Leah Schmalzbauer, and Wendy Bergoffen. Much gratitude goes to our staff members Karen Graves and Lisa Ballou for managing the nitty-gritty of my life at Amherst when it counts. I am also grateful to Ted Melillo for his words of wisdom and kindness, as well as to Eunmi Mun and Sahar Sadjadi for their friendship. In addition to faculty and staff, I am very thankful for the help I received from Amherst College's students, in particular the efforts of my incredibly smart and capable research assistants who helped find images for this book. A very special thanks to: Julian Roberson, Holly Burwick, and Francheska Santos - you are all wonderful scholars in the making and I cannot wait to see what you will do in the future!

I am also indebted to the faculty and staff in the American Culture Department at the University of Michigan, where this project began as a dissertation under the guidance of Philip Deloria, June Howard, Magdalena Zabarowska, and my outside reader, Matthew Briones, now at the University of Chicago. All four of my readers were instrumental in guiding my research, writing, and thinking about this work. Phil in particular has remained steadfast as a mentor and inspiration; words cannot possibly capture what his work and friendship have meant to me and this project. Working in the field of Native American and Indigenous studies (NAIS) has also enabled me to



xii

Acknowledgments

find a wide range of mentors and colleagues whose scholarship, leadership, and guidance have greatly shaped the path taken to complete this book. I will forever be thankful to: Neal Salisbury, Tiya Miles, Ned Blackhawk, Fred Hoxie, Phil Deloria, Jean O'Brien, and Robert Warrior; and to J. Kēhaulani Kauanui, Beth Piatote, Chad Allen, Meg Noodin, Michael Witgen, Vince Diaz, and Kathleen Washburn; as well as to my fellow graduate students from Michigan whose work in NAIS is crucial to our field, John Low, Veronica Hutch, Angela Parker, and Kelly Fayard. Most recently I have had the pleasure of sharing my work with NAIS colleagues from across the Five Colleges in the Connecticut River Valley and I am grateful for their guidance and encouragement, with many thanks to: Neal Salisbury, Kathleen Brown-Perez, Sonya Atalay, Lisa Brooks, Christine DeLucia, Alice Nash, and, of course, Ron Welburn.

The research for this book would not have been possible without help from an array of talented archivists and librarians. All of the librarians working at Dartmouth College's Rauner Library should be given special recognition for their knowledge of the collection and availability to help with just about any item that one might need. I especially want to thank Andi Bartelstein, Sarah Hartwell, Jay Satterfield, and Joshua Shaw. Huge thanks also to Katherine Kominis at the Howard Gotlieb Archival Research Center at Boston University and Amy Hague from the Sophia Smith Collection at Smith College and all of their staff. Thanks so much to John Cahoon at the Los Angeles County Museum of Natural History; Cheryl Gunselman at the Washington State University Library; Kevin Bradley at the National Archives and Records Administration in College Park, Maryland; and Ashley Adair at the Dolph Briscoe Center for American History at the University of Texas at Austin, as well as to Sarah Allison and Gwido Zlatkes at the Rupert Costo Library of the American Indian at the University of California at Riverside. A special thanks also to Brigham Young University's well-organized and highly trained staff who work with BYU's special collections and who helped with Gertrude Bonnin's personal papers; the friendly and helpful staff at the Center for Southwest Studies in Durango, Colorado; and the incredibly capable staff at the Wisconsin Historical Society in Madison, Wisconsin, as well as the librarians of the Newberry Library in Chicago for their assistance with Carlos Montezuma's personal papers. Of course thanks go to the many dedicated and highly trained librarians and archivists who work at the Hatcher Graduate Library of the University of Michigan, the Bentley Historical Library (especially Karen Jania), and the Clements Library. Thank you also to the staff and librarians at the Gene Autry National Center and the Braun Research Library of the Southwest Museum of the American Indian, especially Marva Felchlin and Liza Posas. An important thank you also goes to Kate Boyle and the Jones Library in Amherst, Massachusetts, for helping me with images related to Charles Eastman's family. Finally, a special thank you to the library staff of Amherst College's Archives and



Acknowledgments

xiii

Special Collections, including Mike Kelly and Rebecca Henning, and the important work they have begun by acquiring and building on the new Kim-Wait/Pablo Eisenberg Native American Literature Collection, which arrived at the College shortly after I did and has been invaluable to me in finishing this book.

My many research trips were well funded because of numerous travel grants, beginning with support from the Department of American Culture and the Rackham Graduate School at the University of Michigan. Most recently my final research was supported (in part) by a grant from the Amherst College Faculty Research Award Program, as funded by The H. Axel Schupf '57 Fund for Intellectual Life. In addition, I received funding support from the Westerners' Corral of Los Angeles to enable me to be in residence at the Autry National Center's research libraries, which helped strengthen the fourth chapter. While still writing the dissertation that preceded this monograph, I received funding from the Newberry Library and a Frances C. Allen Fellowship as well as support from Williams College, where I was the Gaius Charles Bolin Fellow in American Studies. At Williams I worked closely with faculty who helped me develop and grow as a scholar and I would like to thank Liza Johnson, Mark Reinhardt, Merida Rua, Cassandra Cleghorn, Dorothy Wang, Ji-Young, Maria-Elena Cepeda, Jackie Hidalgo, Nick Howe, Vince Schleitwiler, and Scott Wong for their guidance and their friendship. In addition to colleagues, student researchers, archivists, and librarians, this project would not have come to fruition without extraordinary editorial support from Deborah Gershenowitz of Cambridge University Press. I am also thankful for the help of Dana Bricken in securing proper permissions for my images and in assisting to ensure the quality of their resolution.

The vast majority of research for this project took place across the United States. I am thankful for the hospitality of Chris and Sarah in Durango and Claire Decoteau and Andy Clarno for hosting me during a short (but productive) stay in Chicago. And, of course, to Paul Farber for a place to stay in DC. Thank you also to my academic friends who read parts of the manuscript at various stages; your keen insights have made all the difference. Thank you, Matt Duques, for still reading so much of my work. Thank you, Jenn Solheim, my dear writing confidente, for our thought-provoking feedback sessions; you are a treasure! A very special thanks too to Heather Houser for helping me refine my thinking in key places and for being an extra mentor at crucial moments throughout this arduous process. Along with these colleagues and friends, I am especially grateful for those who have remained true intimates and whose kindness nourished my soul so I could complete this book. To all those who continue to inspire me every day, thank you so very much: Kathleen Tipler, Denise Bailey, Miriam Stanton, Miki Yagi, Talia Senders (and her family: Josh, Nate, and Jack!), Orlena Yee, Molly Keehn, Julia McQuade, Emily Lordi,



xiv

Acknowledgments

Jennifer Garcia Peacock, and Sarah Jacobson – I am very fortunate to have you all in my life.

A final thank you to my family: my mom, Dr. Terry Anne Vigil; my brother, Dr. Ryan Vigil; and my partner, Blake Johnson. All three of you are smart people who continue to push my intellectual growth. Thank you especially to the Vigils, who are superb editors and who have read or listened to a lot of this work with a generosity of spirit that is unmatched. I am very grateful to them for their insightful feedback, which has deepened my commitment and has encouraged me to write for a wide audience because the stories of these Native peoples' lives are worth hearing and worth repeating. Finally, a depth of gratitude for Blake because without your deep love, support, pet care, and cooking, this book (while keeping me happy and healthy) would never have been realized. Any errors are, of course, my own.