Dispute Processes
ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-making

Third Edition

This wide-ranging study considers the primary forms of decision-making – negotiation, mediation, umpiring, as well as the processes of avoidance and violence – in the context of rapidly changing discourses and practices of civil justice across a range of jurisdictions. Many contemporary discussions in this field – and associated projects of institutional design – are taking place under the broad but imprecise label of Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR). The book brings together and analyses a wide range of materials dealing with dispute processes, and the current debates on and developments in civil justice. With the help of analysis of materials beyond those ordinarily found in the ADR literature, it provides a comprehensive and comparative perspective on modes of handling civil disputes. The new edition is thoroughly revised and is extended to include new chapters on avoidance and self-help, the ombuds, Online Dispute Resolution and pressures of institutionalisation, as well as offering a section including classroom role plays, and making extended suggestions for further (open-access) reading.

Michael Palmer is Emeritus Professor of Law at the University of London’s School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS). He is also Senior Research Fellow at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies (IALS) and at the Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies (HKIAPS) at the Chinese University of Hong Kong. His publications are mainly in the field of comparative legal studies and give particular attention to Chinese law, both traditional and modern. Michael has been Joint Editor of the Journal of Comparative Law for more than a decade and is also Editor of the journal Amicus Curiae. He is a barrister at Serle Court and at McNair Chambers. He has been a special adviser to the Attorney-General of Hong Kong, the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and the European Commission, and also recently served as (very probably) the first western dean of a mainland Chinese law school.

Simon Roberts (1941–2014) was Professor of Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE). A renowned legal anthropologist, his early career included two years’ teaching in Malawi in the 1960s and three years as Adviser on Customary Law to the Botswana Government (1968–1971). He authored the seminal work Order and Dispute: An
Introduction to Legal Anthropology (1979, with a second edition in 2013), a study of law, order and dispute settlement and how they are conceptualised and socially founded. His analysis drew inter alia upon field research among the Kgatla in Botswana and later encouraged his work on issues in dispute processes in jurisdictions such as England and Wales. His most recent book was A Court in the City: Civil and Commercial Litigation in London at the Beginning of the 21st Century (2013), based on his ethnographic research at the Mayor’s and City of London Court. This study examined the work of the court in sponsoring dispute settlement. He continued to teach ADR at the LSE long after retirement. Simon also served on the Lord Chancellor’s family law advisory board which assisted in preparations for the Family Law Act (1996) and was General Editor of the Modern Law Review from 1988 until 1995. In 2011, Simon was elected an Honorary Fellow of the LSE.
The Law in Context Series

Editors: William Twining (University College London), Maksymilian Del Mar (Queen Mary, University of London) and Bronwen Morgan (University of New South Wales).

Since 1970 the Law in Context series has been at the forefront of the movement to broaden the study of law. It has been a vehicle for the publication of innovative scholarly books that treat law and legal phenomena critically in their social, political and economic contexts from a variety of perspectives. The series particularly aims to publish scholarly legal writing that brings fresh perspectives to bear on new and existing areas of law taught in universities. A contextual approach involves treating legal subjects broadly, using materials from other social sciences, and from any other discipline that helps to explain the operation in practice of the subject under discussion. It is hoped that this orientation is at once more stimulating and more realistic than the bare exposition of legal rules. The series includes original books that have a different emphasis from traditional legal textbooks, while maintaining the same high standards of scholarship. They are written primarily for undergraduate and graduate students of law and of other disciplines, but will also appeal to a wider readership. In the past, most books in the series have focused on English law, but recent publications include books on European law, globalisation, transnational legal processes, and comparative law.

Books in the Series
Acosta: The National versus the Foreigner in South America: 200 Years of Migration and Citizenship Law
Ali: Modern Challenges to Islamic Law
Alyagon Darr: Plausible Crime Stories: The Legal History of Sexual Offences in Mandate Palestine
Anderson, Schum & Twining: Analysis of Evidence, 2nd Edition
Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice, 6th Edition
Barton & Douglas: Law and Parenthood
Baxi, McCrudden & Paliwala: Law's Ethical, Global and Theoretical Contexts: Essays in Honour of William Twining
Bell: French Legal Cultures
Bercusson: European Labour Law, 2nd Edition
Birkinshaw: European Public Law
Broderick & Ferri: International and European Disability Law and Policy: Text, Cases and Materials
Brownsword & Goodwin: Law and the Technologies of the Twenty-First Century: Text and Materials
Cane & Goudkamp: Atiyah's Accidents, Compensation and the Law, 9th Edition
Clarke: Principles of Property Law
Clarke & Kohler: Property Law: Commentary and Materials
Cowan: Housing Law and Policy
Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State
Darian-Smith: Laws and Societies in Global Contexts: Contemporary Approaches
Dauvergne: Making People Illegal: What Globalisation Means for Immigration and Law
Davies: Perspectives on Labour Law, 2nd Edition
David: Kinship, Law and Politics: An Anatomy of Belonging
de Sousa Santos: Toward a New Legal Common Sense: Law, Globalization, and Emancipation
Diduck: Law's Families
Estella: Legal Foundations of EU Economic Governance
Fortin: Children's Rights and the Developing Law, 3rd Edition
Garnsey: The Justice of Visual Art: Creative State-Building in Times of Political Transition
Glover-Thomas: Reconstructing Mental Health Law and Policy
Gobert & Punch: Rethinking Corporate Crime
Goldman: Globalisation and the Western Legal Tradition: Recurring Patterns of Law and Authority
Haack: Evidence Matters: Science, Proof, and Truth in the Law
Harlow & Rawlings: Law and Administration, 3rd Edition
Harris: An Introduction to Law, 8th Edition
Harris, Campbell & Halson: Remedies in Contract and Tort, 2nd Edition
Harvey: Seeking Asylum in the UK: Problems and Prospects
Herring: Law and the Relational Self
Hervey & McHale: European Union Health Law: Themes and Implications
Hervey & McHale: Health Law and the European Union
Jackson & Summers: The Internationalisation of Criminal Evidence: Beyond the Common Law and Civil Law Traditions
Kostakopoulou: The Future Governance of Citizenship
Kreiczer-Levy Destabilized Property: Property Law in the Sharing Economy
Kubal: Immigration and Refugee Law in Russia: Socio-Legal Perspectives
Lewis: Choice and the Legal Order: Rising above Politics
Likosky: Transnational Legal Processes: Globalisation and Power Disparities
Likosky: Law, Infrastructure and Human Rights
Loughnan: Self, Others and the State: Relations of Criminal Responsibility
McGlynn: Families and the European Union: Law, Politics and Pluralism
Mertens: A Philosophical Introduction to Human Rights
Moffat: Trusts Law: Text and Materials
Monti: EC Competition Law
Morgan: Contract Law Minimalism: A Formalist Restatement of Commercial Contract Law
Morgan & Yeung: An Introduction to Law and Regulation: Text and Materials
Nicola & Davies: EU Law Stories: Contextual and Critical Histories of European Jurisprudence
Norrie: Crime, Reason and History: A Critical Introduction to Criminal Law, 3rd Edition
O’Dair: Legal Ethics: Text and Materials
Oliver: Common Values and the Public-Private Divide
Oliver & Drewry: The Law and Parliament
Palmer & Roberts: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-Making, 1st Edition
Palmer & Roberts: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-Making, 3rd Edition
Picciotto: International Business Taxation
Probert: The Changing Legal Regulation of Cohabitation, 1600–2010: From Fornicators to Family, 1600–2010
Radi: Rules and Practices of International Investment Law and Arbitration
Reed: Internet Law: Text and Materials
Richardson: Law, Process and Custody
Rowbottom: Democracy Distorted: Wealth, Influence and Democratic Politics
Sauter: Public Services in EU Law
Scott & Black: Cranston’s Consumers and the Law
Seneviratne: Ombudsmen: Public Services and Administrative Justice
Seppänen: Ideological Conflict and the Rule of Law in Contemporary China: Useful Paradoxes
Siems: Comparative Law, 2nd Edition
Stapleton: Product Liability
Stewart: Gender, Law and Justice in a Global Market
Tamanaha: Law as a Means to an End: Threat to the Rule of Law
Turpin & Tomkins: British Government and the Constitution: Text and Materials, 7th Edition
Twining: General Jurisprudence: Understanding Law from a Global Perspective
Twining: Globalisation and Legal Theory
Twining: Human Rights, Southern Voices: Francis Deng, Abdullahi An-Na’im, Yash Ghai and Upendra Baxi
Twining: Jurist in Context: A Memoir
Twining: Karl Llewellyn and the Realist Movement, 2nd Edition
Twining: Rethinking Evidence: Exploratory Essays, 2nd Edition
Twining & Miers: How to Do Things with Rules, 5th Edition
Ward: A Critical Introduction to European Law, 3rd Edition
Ward: Law, Text, Terror
Ward: Shakespeare and Legal Imagination
Zander: Cases and Materials on the English Legal System, 10th Edition

International Journal of Law in Context: A Global Forum for Interdisciplinary Legal Studies

The International Journal of Law in Context is the companion journal to the Law in Context book series and provides a forum for interdisciplinary legal studies and offers intellectual space for ground-breaking critical research. It publishes contextual work about law and its relationship with other disciplines including but not limited to science, literature, humanities, philosophy, sociology, psychology, ethics, history and geography. More information about the journal and how to submit an article can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/ijc
Dispute Processes

ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-making

Third Edition

MICHAEL PALMER
SOAS and IALS University of London

SIMON ROBERTS
London School of Economics and Political Science
To the Memory of Simon Roberts
# Contents

## Preface

Page xv

## 1 Introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preliminaries</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformations in the Common Law World</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian Parallels</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Comparative Scene</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Reform Initiatives, the Role of ADR and Normative Pluralism</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nature and Scope of this Book</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 2 Cultures of Decision-making: Precursors to the Emergence of ADR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideals of Informal Justice</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Establishment of Formal Justice</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Religious Impulse towards Informalism</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Political Impulse towards Informalism</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ethnic Impulse towards Informalism</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Occupational Impulse towards Informalism</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Territorial Identity and the Impulse towards Informalism</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family and Kinship</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Reform, Pluralism and Informalism</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-regulation</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporal Dimensions</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 3 The Debates around Civil Justice and the Movement towards Procedural Innovation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Debates of the 1980s</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Subsequent Trajectory of the ADR Movement</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reiterating the Critiques of Informalism</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Direction of ADR</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4 Disputes and Dispute Processes 73
   Introduction 73
   Typologies of Response 75
   Reconstructing a Panorama of Decision-making 79
   Conclusions 99

5 Development of Disputes, Avoidance and Self-help 101
   Introduction 101
   The Genesis of Disputes 102
   Characterising Dispute Responses 104
   Avoidance: Its Forms and Close Relatives 106
   Violence and Its Forms 113
   Conclusions 122

6 Negotiations 123
   The Nature of Negotiation 123
   Intra-party and Multi-party Negotiations 127
   The Processual Shape of Negotiation 132
   Power in Negotiation 138
   Strategy in Negotiation 139
   Representative Negotiations 146
   Ethical Issues in Negotiation 148
   Conclusions 152

7 Mediation 153
   Introduction – The Nature of Mediation 153
   The Mediator in the Negotiation Process: The Processual
   Shape of Mediation 163
   The Late Twentieth-century Re-institutionalisation of Mediation 167
   Conclusions 190

8 Umpiring: Courts and Tribunals 191
   Introduction 191
   Government and Dispute Institutions 192
   The Legitimation of Third-party Decision-making 194
   The Role of Courts 197
   The Heterogeneity of Court Practice 200
   Contemporary Transformations in the Common Law World 201
   The Popular Element in Courts 209
   Tribunals 210
   Conclusions 211

9 Umpiring: Arbitration 213
   Introduction 213
   Arbitration – Court-linked 216
   Arbitration – International 217
## Contents

Processual Styles in International Arbitration from a Comparative Perspective 219
Conclusions 223

### 10 Hybrid Forms and Processual Experimentation 225
- Introduction 225
- Settlement as Civil Justice 230
- Negotiation-related Innovations 234
- Mediation-related Innovations 238
- Refurbishing Umpiring 246
- Conclusions 270

### 11 The Ombuds and its Diffusion: From Public to Private 273
- Introduction 273
- The Growing Importance of the Ombuds 274
- Two Kinds of Ombuds 277
- Public Law Ombuds 279
- Organisational Ombuds 280
- Sectoral Ombuds 281
- Transplanting the Ombuds to China? 284
- Conclusions 285

### 12 Online Dispute Resolution and its Diffusion: From Private to Public 287
- Introduction 287
- ODR and ADR 288
- ODR Systems 291
- Regulation 294
- ODR: The Flourishing in China 295
- The Emergence of E-courts 297
- Conclusions 300

### 13 Institutionalisation of ADR 301
- Introduction 301
- Informal and Formal Justice Reconsidered 303
- The Mixed Message of the ‘Multi-door Courthouse’ 306
- Woolf’s Doors 308
- What Happened to Naming, Blaming and Claiming? 308
- Formalisation and its Contexts 312
- Formalisation and the Routinisation of Charisma? 317
- Harmony and Deformalisation in China? 319
- Conclusions 320

### 14 Reflections 323
- Introduction 323
- The Contemporary Scene 324
- Lawyers and ADR 325
Contents

The Changing Nature of the Court 326
The Future 327

Appendix A: Some Role Plays 331
References 347
Further Reading 367
Recommended Viewing 393
Index 405
Preface

This book grew out of more than two decades of teaching ‘Alternative Dispute Resolution’ for postgraduate students in law at the University of London, as well as many years of research and writing in this field by both of us. The approach taken in assembling the study is intentionally wide-ranging and comparative so that it can be read not only in its own right but also as a broader, contextualising companion to more conventional and jurisdiction-specific ADR texts. The present study is also informed by the view that litigation and adversarial proceedings should no longer be seen as the paradigmatic processes of decision-making in our civil justice systems. Looking first at the sources of ‘ADR’ ideas and the debates which have surrounded the rise of alternative approaches to dispute resolution, we then move on to examine the primary forms of decision-making: negotiation, mediation, umpiring and also avoidance and force. This is followed by an examination of the emergence in contemporary Anglo-American practice of the fusions of the foundational modes of decision-making that are generally referred to as hybrid or mixed processes, as well as by consideration of other important contemporary developments.

In putting together this book, we have been given generous help by others. William Twining persuaded us to write this in the first place, and has throughout remained a source of wise counsel. Marian Roberts has helped not only by teaching family disputes for our students but also by providing consistent support and excellent advice. Maria-Frederica Moscati has also been a constant source of advice and encouragement, as have Patricia Ng, Chen Yongzhu, Amy Kellam, Lin Yang, Li Jing and Cong Wanshu. Last, but by no means least, there are the many students who gave enthusiastic and critical response to our first and second editions, and whose observations have helped to make the third edition a better book.

Michael Palmer and Simon Roberts