

# CONSTITUTION WRITING, RELIGION AND DEMOCRACY

What role do and should constitutions play in mitigating intense disagreements over the religious character of a state? And what kind of constitutional solutions might reconcile democracy with the type of religious demands raised in contemporary democratizing or democratic states? Tensions over religion–state relations are gaining increasing salience in constitution writing and re-writing around the world. This book explores the challenge of crafting a democratic constitution under conditions of deep disagreement over a state's religious or secular identity. It draws on a broad range of relevant case studies of past and current constitutional debates in Europe, Asia, Africa and the Middle East and offers valuable lessons for societies soon to embark on constitution-drafting or amendment processes where religion is an issue of contention.

ASLI Ü. BÂLI is Professor of Law at the UCLA School of Law, and Director of the UCLA Center for Near Eastern Studies. She is the author of numerous peer-reviewed and law review articles, including "Shifting into Reverse: Turkish Constitutionalism under the AKP," *Theory and Event* (2016) and "Courts and Constitutional Transitions: Lessons from the Turkish Case," in the *International Journal of Constitutional Law* (2013).

HANNA LERNER is a Senior Lecturer in Political Science at Tel Aviv University. She is the author of *Making Constitutions in Deeply Divided Societies* (Cambridge University Press 2011) and coeditor of *Global Justice and International Labour Rights* (Cambridge University Press 2016).



**More Information** 

# CONSTITUTION WRITING, RELIGION AND DEMOCRACY

Edited by

ASLI Ü. BÂLI

University of California, Los Angeles, USA

HANNA LERNER

Tel-Aviv University, Israel





**CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107070516

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Bali, Asli Ümmühan, 1971– editor. | Lerner, Hanna, editor.

Constitution writing, religion and democracy / edited by Asli U. Bali, University of California, Los Angeles; Hanna Lerner, Tel-Aviv University.

Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

LCCN 2016044611 | ISBN 9781107070516 (hardback : alk. paper) LCSH: Church and state. | Freedom of religion. | Constitutional law. LCC K3280 .C663 2016 | DDC 342.08/52–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016044611

ISBN 978-1-107-07051-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



More Information

## **CONTENTS**

List of Contributors page vii Acknowledgements ix

1 Introduction 1
ASLI Ü. BÂLI AND HANNA LERNER

## PART I Constitution Writing and Religion under Limited Sovereignty 27

- 2 The Curious Case of Religion in the Norwegian Constitution 29 JOHN MADELEY
- 3 Religion and the Japanese Constitution 49
  HELEN HARDACRE
- 4 Constitution-Making and Religion in West Germany in the Shadow of State Failure 74
  TINE STEIN

## PART II Postcolonial French-Influenced Constitution Writing and Religion 99

- Secularism in a Sectarian Society? The Divisive Drafting of the 1926 Lebanese Constitution 101
   MARK FARHA
- 6 The Constitution of a "Laïc" African and Muslim Country: Senegal 131 SOULEYMANE BACHIR DIAGNE
- 7 Constitution Writing and Religious Divisions in Turkey 153 ERGUN ÖZBUDUN

V



More Information

τ:	71	

#### CONTENTS

## PART III Postcolonial South Asian Constitution Drafting and Religion 177

- 8 Constitutionalism, Islamic Law, and Religious Freedom in Postindependence Indonesia 179

  MIRIAM KÜNKLER
- 9 Cross-Cutting Rifts in Constitutions and Minority Rights: India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka 207 SHYLASHRI SHANKAR
- 10 Islamic Law in an Islamic Republic: What Role for Parliament?235MATTHEW J. NELSON

## PART IV Constitution Writing and Religion in Contemporary Middle East 265

- 11 Constitutional Impasse, Democracy, and Religion in Israel 267
  HANNA LERNER
- 12 Islam and Constitutionalism in the Arab World: The Puzzling Course of Islamic Inflation 289
- 13 The Politics of Sacred Paralysis: Islam in Recent Moroccan and North African Constitutions 317

  DAVID MEDNICOFF
- Dancing by the Cliff: Constitution Writing in Post-Revolutionary Tunisia, 2011–2014
   NADIA MARZOUKI

## PART V Lessons from the Cases 371

Designing Constitutions in Religiously Divided
 Societies 373
 ASLI Ü. BÂLI AND HANNA LERNER

Index 397



## **CONTRIBUTORS**

ASLI Ü. BÂLI is Professor of Law at the UCLA School of Law and the Director of the UCLA Center for Near Eastern Studies.

NATHAN J. BROWN is Professor of Political Science and International Affairs and the Director of the Institute for Middle East Studies at George Washington University.

SOULEYMANE BACHIR DIAGNE is a Professor in the Departments of French and Philosophy at Columbia University.

MARK FARHA is Assistant Professor of Politics and International Relations at the Doha Institute for Graduate Studies.

HELEN HARDACRE is the Reischauer Institute Professor of Japanese Religions and Society at Harvard University.

MIRJAM KÜNKLER is Professor at the Institute for Advanced Study in the Humanities and Social Sciences at the University of Göttingen.

HANNA LERNER is a Senior Lecturer in Political Science at Tel Aviv University.

JOHN T. S. MADELEY was a Senior Lecturer in Government at the London School of Economics and Political Science until his retirement in 2009.

NADIA MARZOUKI is a permanent research fellow at CNRS (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique), Paris.

DAVID MEDNICOFF is the Director of Middle Eastern Studies and Assistant Professor in the School of Public Policy at the University of Massachusetts-Amherst.

MATTHEW J. NELSON is a Reader in the Department of Politics at SOAS, University of London.

vii



viii

### LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

ERGUN ÖZBUDUN is Professor of Constitutional Law and Political Science at Istanbul Şehir University.

SHYLASHRI SHANKAR is Senior Fellow at the Centre for Policy Research in New Delhi.

TINE STEIN is Professor of Political Theory and the Executive Director of the Institute of Social Sciences at the Christian-Albrechts-University of Kiel, Germany.



#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

We are grateful to the Rockefeller Foundation Bellagio Center in Italy for hosting our first workshop on Constitution Writing, Human Rights and Religion, where early drafts of most of the chapters included in this volume were presented in 2012. Some of the chapters were also discussed during a second workshop on Constitution Writing, Religion and Human Rights held in 2014 at the Center for Interdisciplinary Research (ZiF), Bielefeld University, Germany. The participants in both workshops were generous with their invaluable suggestions for the particular papers, as well as for the organizing concept of the book. We would particularly like to thank Tom Ginsburg, Bill Kissane, Tamir Moustafa, Ulrich Preuss, Ben Schonthal, Alfred Stepan and Mila Versteeg for the wise counsel they provided.

ZiF at Bielefeld University in Germany provided us with a most comfortable and inspiring place to complete our editorial work on this volume. Taking part in the research group on "Balancing Religious Accommodation and Human Rights in Constitutional Settings," organized by Mirjam Künkler, Hanna Lerner and Shylashri Shankar, during the summer and fall of 2014, contributed tremendously to our thinking about religion and constitution making. We are grateful to all of the fellows in the research group and the dozens of participants in the seminars and various workshops that took place during the summer and fall of 2014 for challenging our views and broadening our perspectives on these issues. In addition, we would like to thank the participants of the UCLA Law School Faculty Workshop for constructive comments on an early draft of the theoretical framework for the book; Omar Dajani, Raquel Aldana and the participants of the University of Pacific McGeorge School of Law Faculty Workshop for generous comments on a later draft of the theoretical framework; and Intisar Rabb, William Alford and participants of Harvard Law School's International and Comparative Law Workshop for helpful feedback on the concluding chapter of this



X

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

volume. Finally, we would like to thank Aaron Glasserman for his superb research support, Aileen Kim and Jessica Blatchley for additional research assistance, Tal Grietzer for extraordinary technical assistance, and especially Elizabeth Spicer and Marianna Prizio at Cambridge University Press with whom it has been a pleasure to work on this volume.