

#### Idealism beyond Borders

This is a major new account of how modern humanitarian action was shaped by transformations in the French intellectual and political land-scape from the 1950s to the 1980s. Eleanor Davey reveals how radical left third-worldism was displaced by the 'sans-frontiériste' movement as the dominant way of approaching suffering in what was then called the third world. Third-worldism regarded these regions as the motor for international revolution, but revolutionary zeal disintegrated as a number of its regimes took on violent and dictatorial forms. Instead, the radical humanitarianism of the 'sans-frontiériste' movement pioneered by Médecins Sans Frontières emerged as an alternative model for international aid. Covering a period of major international upheavals and domestic change in France, Davey demonstrates the importance of memories of the Second World War in political activism and humanitarian action and underlines the powerful legacies of Cold War politics for international affairs since the fall of the Iron Curtain.

Eleanor Davey is a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellow and Lecturer in the History of Humanitarianism at the Humanitarian and Conflict Response Institute, University of Manchester.



#### **Human Rights in History**

Edited by

Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, University of California Berkeley Samuel Moyn, Harvard University

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights, but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation-states, international governance, and transnational law.



# **Idealism beyond Borders**

The French Revolutionary Left and the Rise of Humanitarianism 1954–1988

ELEANOR DAVEY
University of Manchester







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107069589

© Eleanor Davey 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-06958-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Bob and Alice, Joan and Alan



Naître juste après Vichy, tu sais, ça donne des envies d'épopée . . . Olivier Rolin, *Tigre en papier*, 2002



### Contents

Acknowledgements		page viii
	Introduction	I
	PART I IDEALISM BEYOND BORDERS	
1	A revolution in aid: the creation of sans-frontiérisme	19
2	Aiding the revolution: influences on tiers-mondisme	50
	PART II VIOLENCE AND MORALITY	
3	The struggle for international justice: tiers-mondiste	
	engagement on the outskirts of May	81
4	Complicity, conscience, and autocritique: reconfiguring	
	attitudes to political violence	II2
5	A rhetoric of responsibility: Vichy, the Holocaust, and	
	suffering in the third world	144
	PART III ETHICS AND POLEMICS	
6	Idealism beyond borders: the turn to sans-frontiériste	
	spectacle	181
7	Controversy in a humanitarian age: attacks on	
	tiers-mondisme in the 1980s	215
	Conclusion	248
Notes		257
Index		327



## Acknowledgements

This research has been supported by a number of institutions over several years, including Queen Mary University of London, the Institute of Historical Research at the University of London, the University of Manchester, and the British Academy. I would also like to thank the Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles, for its hospitality during part of this research. I am grateful to MSF France for granting me access to their archives and specifically to Odile Hardy and Christine Pinto for their assistance. Thanks are also due to Laurence Binet, Rony Brauman, Claire Brière-Blanchet, and Michaël Neuman for their generosity in sharing their reflections; Rony and Michaël also took time to comment on some earlier incarnations of parts of what follows, from which I benefitted greatly. I am grateful to Virginie Alauzet for welcoming me into the resource room of the Croix-Rouge Française and to Isabelle Polisset-Whitehouse and Virginie Troit for their assistance. For his help with the translation of dozens of revolutionary and humanitarian phrases, I would like to thank Jean-Christophe Plantin. For their contribution to the final stages of this book, many thanks to Samuel Moyn, Michael Watson, and the CUP reviewers and team. Earlier versions of some of this work also appeared in *French* Historical Studies and the European Review of History.

To Julian Jackson, I am entirely indebted – for countless hours of reading, the almost equally numerous hours of discussion, and for the acuity and style of his contribution in both. In different ways, Alex Fairfax-Cholmeley has also been utterly irreplaceable. For support and advice during this project's development as a PhD and its transformation since, I am grateful to Robert Horvath, Jeremy Jennings, Colin Jones, and Georgios Varouxakis. Through their own work and as much



#### Acknowledgements

ix

valued colleagues Peter Gatrell and Bertrand Taithe have challenged, advanced, and enriched my own reflection on these ideas and the process of getting them into shape. I have learned enormously from (and thoroughly enjoyed) discussions with Adriano Aymonino, Emily Baughan, Ludivine Broch, Roland Burke, Juliano Fiori, Arjan Hehenkamp, Stephen Hopgood, Daniel Lee, Alan Lester, Ed Naylor, Robert Priest, Rosa Salzberg, Andrew Smith, and Benjamin Thomas White. For offering patience, perspective, and fortification (as he would say), I will always be thankful to Pierre Fuller. Along the way I was privileged to have worked and debated with the wonderful people of ODI's Humanitarian Policy Group and would particularly like to acknowledge for their inspiration and friendship Véronique Barbelet, Jennifer Benson, Tania Cheung, Samir Elhawary, Wendy Fenton, Matthew Foley, Clara Hawkshaw, Simone Haysom, Francesca Iannini, Ashley Jackson, Hanna Krebs, Simon Levine, Irina Mosel, Sara Pantuliano, Clare Price, Eva Svoboda, and David White. I would also like to warmly thank John Borton for many thoughtful and stimulating conversations about humanitarianism and its history.

My work as a historian, my belief in academic practice, and my engagement both in the world of ideas and with ideas of the world have been influenced beyond measure and to my great benefit by Robert Horvath, Colin Nettelbeck, and Charles Sowerwine. I would also like to recognise the late David Philips, whose passion and precision inspired all who learned from him. Finally, for the various forms that their advice, encouragement, and forbearance took, I am deeply grateful to my friends and family. Special acknowledgement is due to my parents, Philip Davey and Deborah Trengove, and sister, Megan Davey, whose love and support throughout have been fundamental.