

Externalism, Self-Knowledge, and Skepticism

Written by an international team of leading scholars, this collection of thirteen new essays explores the implications of semantic externalism for self-knowledge and skepticism, bringing recent developments in the philosophy of mind, the philosophy of language, and epistemology to bear on the issue. Structured in three parts, the collection looks at self-knowledge, content transparency, and then metasemantics and the nature of mental content. The chapters examine a wide range of topics in the philosophy of mind and the philosophy of language, including 2D semantics, transparency views of self-knowledge, and theories of linguistic understanding, as well as epistemological debates on contextualism, contrastivism, pragmatic encroachment, anti-luminosity arguments, and testimony. The scope of the volume will appeal to graduate students and researchers in epistemology, philosophy of mind, philosophy of language, cognitive science, psychology, and linguistics.

Sanford C. Goldberg is Professor and Chair of the Department of Philosophy at Northwestern University. His publications include Anti-Individualism (Cambridge, 2007), Relying on Others: An Essay in Epistemology (2010), and Assertion: On the Philosophical Significance of Assertoric Speech (2015).





Externalism, Self-Knowledge, and Skepticism

New Essays

Edited by

Sanford C. Goldberg

Northwestern University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107063501

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Externalism, self-knowledge, and skepticism: new essays / edited by Sanford C. Goldberg, Northwestern University. pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-06350-1

- 1. Reference (Philosophy) 2. Externalism (Philosophy of mind)
- 3. Self-knowledge, Theory of. I. Goldberg, Sanford, 1967 editor. B105.R25E98 2015

121'.68-dc23

2015014008

ISBN 978-1-107-06350-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



This book is dedicated, with deep affection, to the memory of Tony Brueckner – friend, colleague, teacher, and all-around *mensch*, who taught so many of us about these topics and so much more.





Contents

		List of contributors Acknowledgements	ix xi
		Introduction SANFORD C. GOLDBERG	1
Part 1		Foundations of Self-Knowledge	17
	1	Luminosity and the KK thesis ROBERT STALNAKER	19
:	2	Some questions about Burge's "self-verifying judgments" TONY BRUECKNER	41
:	3	Self-knowledge: the reality of privileged access CRISPIN WRIGHT	49
	4	Contrastive self-knowledge and the McKinsey paradox SARAH SAWYER	75
Part	2	Content Transparency	95
	5	Further thoughts on the transparency of mental content PAUL BOGHOSSIAN	97
	6	Counting concepts: response to Paul Boghossian MARK SAINSBURY AND MICHAEL TYE	113
	7	Internalism, externalism, and accessibilism BRIE GERTLER	119
	8	The insignificance of transparency ÅSA WIKFORSS	142

vii



viii	Contents	
Ģ	On knowing what thoughts one's utterances express GARY EBBS	165
10	Anti-individualism, comprehension, and self-knowledge SANFORD C. GOLDBERG	184
Part 3	Metasemantics and the Nature of Mental Content	195
1 1	Externalism, self-knowledge, and memory JORDI FERNANDEZ	197
12	Externalism, metainternalism, and self-knowledge JUSSI HAUKIOJA	214
13	Externalism, metasemantic contextualism, and self-knowledge	
	HENRY JACKMAN	228
	Bibliography	248
	Index	260



Contributors

- PAUL BOGHOSSIAN is Silver Professor of Philosophy at New York University. He is the author of Content and Justification: Philosophical Papers (2008) and Fear of Knowledge: Against Relativism and Constructivism (2006).
- TONY BRUECKNER passed away in 2014. He was Professor of Philosophy at the University of California-Santa Barbara, and was the author of *Essays on Skepticism* (2012) and co-author of *Debating Self-Knowledge* (with Gary Ebbs, Cambridge, 2012).
- GARY EBBS is Professor and Chair of Philosophy at Indiana University. He is the co-author of *Debating Self-Knowledge* (with Tony Brueckner, Cambridge, 2012), and is the author of *Truth and Words* (2009) and *Rule-Following and Realism* (1997).
- JORDI FERNANDEZ is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Adelaide. He is the author of *Transparent Minds: A Study of Self-Knowledge* (2012) and is co-editor of *Delusion and Self-Deception: Affective Influences on Belief-Formation* (with Tim Bayne, 2009).
- BRIE GERTLER is Commonwealth Professor of Philosophy at the University of Virginia. She is the author of Self-Knowledge (2011), the editor of Privileged Access: Philosophical Accounts of Self-Knowledge (2003), and co-editor of Arguing about the Mind (with Lawrence Shapiro, 2007).
- SANFORD C. GOLDBERG is Professor and Chair of Philosophy at Northwestern University. He is the author of Anti-Individualism: Mind and Language, Knowledge and Justification (Cambridge, 2007), Relying on Others: An Essay in Epistemology (2010), and Assertion: On the Philosophical Significance of Assertoric Speech (2015).
- JUSSI HAUKIOJA is Professor of Philosophy at Norwegian University of Science and Technology. He is the editor of *Advances in Experimental Philosophy of Language* (2015) and has published

ix



x List of contributors

many articles in the philosophy of mind and the philosophy of language.

- HENRY JACKMAN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at York University. He is the author of many articles in the philosophy of mind, the philosophy of language, epistemology, and pragmatism.
- MARK SAINSBURY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Texas at Austin. He is the author of many books, most recently Seven Puzzles of Thought and How to Solve Them: An Originalist Theory of Concepts (with Michael Tye, 2012), Fiction and Fictionalism (2009), and Reference Without Referents (2005).
- SARAH SAWYER is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Sussex. She is the author of many articles in the philosophy of mind, the philosophy of language, metaphysics, and epistemology.
- ROBERT STALNAKER is Professor of Philosophy at Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He is the author of many books, including Our Knowledge of the Internal World (2008), Ways a World Might Be: Metaphysical and Anti-Metaphysical Essays (2003), and Context and Content: Essays on Intentionality in Speech and Thought (1999).
- MICHAEL TYE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Texas at Austin. He is the author of Seven Puzzles of Thought and How to Solve Them: An Originalist Theory of Concepts (with Mark Sainsbury, 2012), Consciousness and Persons: Unity and Identity (2003), and Color, Consciousness, and Content (2000).
- ÅSA WIKFORSS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Stockholm. She is the author of many articles in the philosophy of mind, the philosophy of language, and epistemology.
- CRISPIN WRIGHT is Professor of Philosophy at New York University and Professor of Philosophical Research, University of Stirling. He is the author of many books, including *Saving the Differences* (2003), *Rails to Infinity* (2001), and *The Reason's Proper Study* (with Bob Hale, 2001).



Acknowledgements

I have thought about these topics with a great number of people over many years. My own thinking has been helped enormously by them. They include Kent Bach, Dorit Bar-On, Paul Boghossian, Larry Bonjour, Jessica Brown, Tony Brueckner, Tyler Burge, Earl Conee, Fabrizio Cariani, Dave Chalmers, Gary Ebbs, Ray Elugardo, Kati Farkas, Rich Feldman, Carrie Figdor, Bryan Frances, Richard Fumerton, Mikkel Gerken, Brie Gertler, John Gibbons, Michael Glanzberg, Katrin Glüer, Peter Graham, Thomas Grundmann, John Hawthorne, Henry Jackman, Jesper Kallestrup, Igal Kvart, Jennifer Lackey, Peter Ludlow, Matt McGrath, Sidney Morgenbesser, Peter Pagin, Nikolaj Pederson, Ted Poston, Duncan Pritchard, Hilary Putnam, Baron Reed, Sarah Sawyer, Laura Schroeter, Barry Smith, David Sosa, Ernie Sosa, Rob Stainton, Tim Sundell, Åsa Wikforss, Timothy Williamson, and Crispin Wright.

I would like to thank my home university, Northwestern, as well as the University of Edinburgh, where I was a Professorial Fellow from 2013 to 2015, for their generous support over the duration of this project.