

Warlords and Coalition Politics in Post-Soviet States

The breakup of the USSR was unexpected and unexpectedly peaceful. Though a third of the new states fell prey to violent civil conflict, anarchy on the post-Soviet periphery, when it occurred, was quickly cauterized. This book argues that this outcome had nothing to do with security guarantees by Russia or the United Nations and everything to do with local innovation by ruthless warlords, who competed and colluded in a high-risk coalition formation game. Drawing on a structured comparison of Georgian and Tajik militia members, the book combines rich comparative data with formal modeling, treating the post-Soviet space as an extraordinary laboratory to observe the limits of great powers' efforts to shape domestic institutions in weak states.

Jesse Driscoll is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the School of International Relations and Pacific Studies, University of California, San Diego. He was an OCV (Order, Conflict, and Violence) Fellow at Yale University and a GAGE (Governing America in a Global Era) Fellow at the University of Virginia, and most recently a member of the Harvard Academy for International and Area Studies from 2009 to 2013. His work has been published in the Journal of Conflict Resolution, Research and Politics, and the Journal of Survey Statistics and Methodology.





Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

General Editors

Kathleen Thelen Massachusetts Institute of Technology Erik Wibbels Duke University

Associate Editors

Robert H. Bates Harvard University

Gary Cox Stanford University

Stephen Hanson The College of William and Mary

Torben Iversen Harvard University

Stathis Kalyvas Yale University

Peter Lange Duke University

Margaret Levi Center for the Advanced Study of the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford University

Helen Milner Princeton University

Frances Rosenbluth Yale University

Susan Stokes Yale University

Sidney Tarrow Cornell University

Other Books in the Series

Ben W. Ansell, From the Ballot to the Blackboard: The Redistributive Political Economy of Education

Leonardo R. Arriola, Multi-Ethnic Coalitions in Africa: Business Financing of Opposition Election Campaigns

David Austen-Smith, Jeffry A. Frieden, Miriam A. Golden, Karl Ove Moene, and Adam Przeworski, eds., Selected Works of Michael Wallerstein: The Political Economy of Inequality, Unions, and Social Democracy

Andy Baker, The Market and the Masses in Latin America: Policy Reform and Consumption in Liberalizing Economies

Lisa Baldez, Why Women Protest: Women's Movements in Chile

Stefano Bartolini, The Political Mobilization of the European Left, 1860–1980: The Class Cleavage

Robert Bates, When Things Fell Apart: State Failure in Late-Century Africa Mark Beissinger, Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State

Nancy Bermeo, ed., *Unemployment in the New Europe*

Carles Boix, Democracy and Redistribution

(continued after the Index)





Warlords and Coalition Politics in Post-Soviet States

JESSE DRISCOLL

University of California, San Diego





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107063358

© Jesse Driscoll 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Driscoll, Jesse, 1978-

Warlords and coalition politics in post-Soviet states / Jesse Driscoll.

pages cm. - (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)

ISBN 978-1-107-06335-8 (hardback)

Warlordism-Georgia (Republic)
Warlordism-Tajikistan.
Coalition governments-Georgia (Republic)
Coalition governments-Tajikistan.
Georgia (Republic)-Politics and government-1991 Tajikistan-Politics and government-1991 Title.

JZ1317.2.D75 2015

320.94758-dc23 2014047366

ISBN 978-1-107-06335-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



I get it. I know what you want. I understand. You want to make up a list, on your computer, of all our bad men. 'Terrorists.' You want to cross names off the list when they were killed or jailed. To see that we Tajiks can take care of our own. But we can. We did. You'll see.

Yuri, Dushanbe, 2007





Contents

Acknowledgments		page x1	
I	Revisionist History	I	
2	Predator Collusion: A High-Stakes Game	30	
3	Kto Kogo?	46	
4	Warlord Coalitions and Militia Politics	85	
5	Coup-Proofing	123	
6	Implications	173	
Appendix A: Case Selection and External Validity		197	
Appendix B: Mathematical Proofs		207	
Appendix C: Ninety-Seven Anonymous Warlords		213	
References		221	
Index		237	

ix





Acknowledgments

None of this would have been conceivable – or be meaningful to me – without the love and support of my wife Emma; my parents, Mary and Wally; my sister, Amanda; and a number of friends that are increasingly indistinguishable from family. ("...We're all on one road ... and we're only passing through ...")

This book builds upon an ongoing research program that matured while I pursued graduate studies at Stanford's Department of Political Science. I owe a great deal to the patient guidance of David Laitin, James Fearon, and Jeremy Weinstein, and I owe far more to the friendly assistance of my exceptional graduate student cohort. But the book also exists because of a full decade of itinerant labor. During this time I gratefully accepted institutional and financial support from diverse sources: The Center for Russian and Eastern European Studies at Stanford University; the Russian Language program at Middlebury College; the Caucasus Research Resource Centers (CRRC); the Program on Order, Conflict, and Violence (OCV) at Yale University; the American University of Central Asia in Bishkek; the International Research and Exchanges Board (IREX); the Governing America in a Global Age (GAGE) program at the University of Virginia; and probably a few more that I am forgetting. Jorge Dominguez and the Harvard Academy for International and Area Studies at Harvard University deserve special thanks, both for connecting me with the Cambridge University Press team and giving me time to share my work with a fantastic network of young interdisciplinary scholars. I am grateful to all of these institutions for help getting my career started.

Along the way, many scholars shared critical thoughts on primitive drafts of the manuscript. The argument evolved in response to critiques from Dominique Arel, Robert Bates, Mark Beissinger, Timothy Blauvelt, Keith Darden, Georgi Derluguian, Paula Garb, Hans Gutbrod, Steph Haggard, Stephen Hanson, Miles Kahler, Stathis Kalyvas, Charles King, Bethany Lacina, David Lake, Jay Lyall, Ghia Nodia, Roger Petersen, Robert Powell, Phil Roeder, John

хi



xii Acknowledgments

Schoeberlein, Yuhki Tajima, Barbara Walter, and Christoph Zuercher. Special thanks must be extended to James Fearon, who continued to give me advice on how to streamline and simplify the argument long after professional obligations expired. The blunt advice of the anonymous reviewers and series editors at Cambridge University Press is largely responsible for the structure and intellectual coherence of the final book manuscript.

For most of the data in this book I relied on the goodwill and honesty of former combatants in Tajikistan and Georgia. The work must be dedicated, in large part, to Yuri, Vasha, Samojon, Sergei, and others who made introductions, vouched for my character, and shared difficult memories. None of their real names appear in this book for human subjects reasons that should be quickly apparent. Key respondents divulged their stories with the expectation that I would write a fair and accurate history. This book represents my best effort to honor their trust. I reserve a different sort of gratitude for the various families that opened their doors to me along the way – people who were not my human subjects, but whose humanity inspired me to try to write a good book about real people. Memories from the field fade unevenly, but I am always going to wonder what happened to Lira and Jamiliya and Siyl, to Anthony and Nino, to Elizabeth and Katherine, to Bahron and Mahmuba and Ikron and Shodmon. Most of my professional colleagues will recognize that the methods employed in this sort of fieldwork are not well-incentivized by the discipline of political science. As such, I am in an unusual sort of debt to David Laitin, whose scholarship and example convinced me that it really was all right, even in security studies, to lean heavily on the kinds of insights that only emerge through years of patient ethnography. That unusual debt extends to Stanford University's Department of Anthropological Sciences, personified by "Down Town" Melissa Brown and Kylea Liese. And to Azriel, who was one of the first to voice her concerns that this book was a thing of evil. (Mine!)

I have an enviable first job. The University of California at San Diego is a wonderful employer. Steph Haggard, Peter Gourevitch, Miles Kahler, and Barbara Walter have all been tremendous professional mentors in different ways. All empowered me, with their scholarship and their gentle advice, to write exactly the book that I did. I have also had the opportunity to teach some of the world's brightest students – some of whom I employed as the book moved toward the final stages of completion. Elaine Denny provided useful feedback on an early draft of the material related to human subjects and issues of anonymity. Karen Simpson and Megan Becker assisted in the preparation of this manuscript with careful copyediting. Daniel Maliniak created original maps, helped with a few of the figures, and continues to keep me honest with the data. John Porten organized the index.

I wouldn't have made it to Stanford at all if I hadn't met Charles King and Michael Brown just exactly when I did as an undergraduate at Georgetown University. If I wind the clock back further, I find that it is important that I use this space to thank Penny Johnston and Mark "Mad Dog" Bowman for



Acknowledgments xiii

different kinds of virtuous labor as underpaid public high school teachers at Mead High School in Spokane, Washington.

But past is past, and I'm working to be here now. My wife Emma was the first person thanked, but she insisted that she be thanked again at the end, as well. It isn't very much fun to live with someone whose work involves writing self-serious paragraphs about the representation of distant people in war zones. Emma, and our wonderful dog Sally, help to remind me that even when I'm most proud of my work, and even when I convince myself that my work is important, the truth is my work isn't my life. It's just work.