

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ANCIENT LOGIC

This Companion provides a comprehensive guide to ancient logic. The first part charts its chronological development, focussing especially on the Greek tradition, and discusses its two main systems: Aristotle's logic of terms and the Stoic logic of propositions. The second part explores the key concepts at the heart of the ancient logical systems: truth, definition, terms, propositions, syllogisms, demonstrations, modality and fallacy. The systematic discussion of these concepts allows the reader to engage with some specific logical and exegetical issues and to appreciate their transformations across different philosophical traditions. The intersections between logic, mathematics and rhetoric are also explored. The third part of the volume discusses the reception and influence of ancient logic in the history of philosophy and its significance for philosophy in our own times. Comprehensive coverage, chapters by leading international scholars and a critical overview of the recent literature in the field will make this volume essential for students and scholars of ancient logic.

LUCA CASTAGNOLI is the Stavros Niarchos Foundation Clarendon Associate Professor in Ancient Greek Philosophy at the University of Oxford, and a Fellow of Oriel College. He is the author of *Ancient Self-Refutation* (Cambridge, 2010) and the co-editor of *Greek Memories: Theories and Practices* (Cambridge, 2019).

PAOLO FAIT is the Anthony Quinton Fellow in Classical Philosophy at New College, Oxford. He has published a translation and commentary on Aristotle's *Sophistical Refutations* (2007) and articles on Aristotle's logic and metaphysics.



OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

ABELARD Edited by Jeffrey E. Brower and Kevin Guilfoy

ADORNO Edited by Thomas Huhn

ANCIENT ETHICS Edited by Christopher Bobonich

ANCIENT GREEK AND ROMAN SCIENCE Edited by LIBA TAUB

ANCIENT SCEPTICISM Edited by RICHARD BETT

ANSELM Edited by Brian Davies and Brian Leftow

AQUINAS Edited by Norman Kretzmann and Eleonore Stump

ARABIC PHILOSOPHY Edited by Peter Adamson and Richard C. Taylor

HANNAH ARENDT Edited by DANA VILLA

ARISTOTLE Edited by Jonathan Barnes

ARISTOTLE'S 'POLITICS' Edited by marguerite deslauriers and pierre destrée

ATHEISM Edited by MICHAEL MARTIN

AUGUSTINE 2nd edition Edited by DAVID MECONI and ELEONORE STUMP

BACON Edited by Markku Peltonen

BERKELEY Edited by Kenneth P. Winkler

BOETHIUS Edited by John Marenbon

BRENTANO Edited by DALE JACQUETTE

CARNAP Edited by Michael Friedman and Richard Creath

CICERO'S PHILOSOPHY Edited by JED W. ATKINS and THOMAS BÉNATOUÏL

CIVIL DISOBEDIENCE Edited by WILLIAM E. SCHEUERMAN

COMMON-SENSE PHILOSOPHY Edited by RIK PEELS and RENÉ VAN WOUDENBERG

THE COMMUNIST MANIFESTO Edited by Terrell Carver and James Farr

CONSTANT Edited by Helena Rosenblatt

CRITICAL THEORY Edited by FRED RUSH

DARWIN 2nd edition Edited by Jonathan Hodge and Gregory Radick

SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR Edited by CLAUDIA CARD

DELEUZE Edited by Daniel W. Smith and Henry Somers-Hall

DEMOCRACY IN AMERICA Edited by RICHARD BOYD

DESCARTES Edited by John Cottingham

DESCARTES' 'MEDITATIONS' Edited by DAVID CUNNING

DEWEY Edited by Molly Cochran

DUNS SCOTUS Edited by Thomas Williams

EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY Edited by A. A. LONG

Continued at the back of the book



THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ANCIENT LOGIC

Edited by

LUCA CASTAGNOLI

University of Oxford

PAOLO FAIT

University of Oxford





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge. It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

> www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107062948 DOI: 10.1017/9781107477674

> > © Cambridge University Press 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Names: Castagnoli, Luca, 1975– editor. | Fait, Paolo, editor.

Title: The Cambridge companion to ancient logic / edited by Luca Castagnoli, University of Durham, Paolo Fait, University of Oxford.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, [2022] | Series: The Cambridge companion to ancient logic | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021053892 (print) | LCCN 2021053893 (ebook) | ISBN 9781107062948 (hardback) | ISBN 9781107656772 (paperback) | ISBN 9781107477674 (epub) Subjects: LCSH: Logic, Ancient.

Classification: LCC BC28 .C36 2022 (print) | LCC BC28 (ebook) | DDC 180-dc23/eng/20211207 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021053892 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021053893

ISBN 978-1-107-06294-8 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-65677-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

| | List of Contributors vii |
|---|--|
| | Introduction 1 |
| | LUCA CASTAGNOLI AND PAOLO FAIT |
| | I The Development of Logic in Antiquity 19 |
| 1 | The Prehistory of Logic 21 |
| | NICHOLAS DENYER |
| 2 | Aristotle and Theophrastus 37 |
| | PAOLO FAIT |
| 3 | Megarians and Stoics 57 |
| | KARLHEINZ HÜLSER |
| 4 | Late Antiquity 82 |
| | BENJAMIN MORISON |
| | II Key Themes 107 |
| 5 | Truth as a Logical Property and the Laws of Being True 109 |
| | WALTER CAVINI |
| 6 | Definition 128 |
| | MICHAEL FEREJOHN |
| 7 | Terms and Propositions 147 |
| | PAOLO CRIVELLI |
| 8 | Validity and Syllogism 167 |
| | LUCA CASTAGNOLI AND PAOLO FAIT |
| 9 | Demonstration 199 |

ALEXANDER BOWN



| vi | | CONTENTS |
|----|----|---|
| | 10 | Modalities and Modal Logic 216 MARKO MALINK |
| | 11 | Fallacies and Paradoxes 236 LUCA CASTAGNOLI |
| | 12 | Logic in Ancient Rhetoric 263 CHRISTOF RAPP |
| | 13 | Ancient Logic and Ancient Mathematics 283 REVIEL NETZ |
| | | 111 The Legacy of Ancient Logic 299 |
| | 14 | Ancient Logic in the Middle Ages 301 JOHN MARENBON |
| | 15 | Ancient Logic from the Renaissance to the Birth of Mathematical Logic 319 MIRELLA CAPOZZI AND LEILA HAAPARANTA |
| | 16 | Ancient Logic Today 345 JOHN WOODS |
| | | Bibliography 364 List of Abbreviations 407 Index of Passages 411 General Index 424 |



CONTRIBUTORS

ALEXANDER BOWN is a Fellow and Tutor in Ancient Philosophy at Balliol College, Oxford. He is also an Associate Professor in Ancient Philosophy in the Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford.

MIRELLA CAPOZZI is a Professor of History of Logic at the University La Sapienza, Rome.

LUCA CASTAGNOLI is the Stavros Niarchos Foundation Clarendon Fellow in Ancient Greek Philosophy at Oriel College, Oxford. He is also an Associate Professor in Ancient Philosophy in the Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford.

WALTER CAVINI is an Alma Mater Studiorum Honorary Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the Department of Philosophy and Communication Studies of the University of Bologna.

PAOLO CRIVELLI is a Professor of Ancient Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy of the University of Geneva.

NICHOLAS DENYER is a Fellow of Trinity College, Cambridge.

PAOLO FAIT is the Anthony Quinton Fellow and a Tutor in Classical Philosophy at New College, Oxford.

MICHAEL FEREJOHN is a Professor of Philosophy in the Department of Classical Studies of Duke University.

LEILA HAAPARANTA is a Professor Emerita of Philosophy in the Faculty of Social Sciences at Tampere University and a Docent of Theoretical Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, History and Art Studies at the University of Helsinki.



viii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

KARLHEINZ HÜLSER is affiliated to the Philosophy Department of the University of Konstanz, where he works especially on Stoic and post-Stoic logic and philosophy of language.

MARKO MALINK is a Professor of Philosophy and Classics at New York University.

JOHN MARENBON is a Senior Research Fellow of Trinity College, Cambridge. He is also an Honorary Professor of Medieval Philosophy in the Faculty of Philosophy.

BENJAMIN MORISON is a Professor in the Department of Philosophy of Princeton University.

REVIEL NETZ is the Suppes Professor in Greek Mathematics and Astronomy in the Department of Classics, Stanford University.

CHRISTOF RAPP is the Chair for Ancient Philosophy at Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich.

JOHN WOODS is the University of British Columbia Honorary Professor of Logic and the Director of the Abductive Systems Group in the Department of Philosophy at the University of British Columbia.