# Skills and Inequality

*Skills and Inequality* studies the political economy of education and training reforms from the perspective of comparative welfare state research. Highlighting the striking similarities between established worlds of welfare capitalism and educational regimes, Marius R. Busemeyer argues that both have similar political origins in the postwar period. He identifies partisan politics and different varieties of capitalism as crucial factors shaping choices about the institutional design of post-secondary education. The political and institutional survival of vocational education and training as an alternative to academic higher education is then found to play an important role in the later development of skill regimes. Busemeyer also studies the effects of educational institutions on social inequality and patterns of public opinion on the welfare state and education. Adopting a multi-method approach, this book combines historical case studies of Sweden, Germany, and the United Kingdom with quantitative analyses of macro-level aggregate data and micro-level survey data.

MARIUS R. BUSEMEYER is Professor of Political Science in the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Konstanz, Germany. His research focuses on comparative political economy and welfare state research, education and social policy, public spending, theories of institutional change, and, more recently, public opinion on the welfare state. He has published a large number of journal articles and edited *The Political Economy of Collective Skill Formation* (with Christine Trampusch, 2011) and a special issue of the *Socio-Economic Review* on *The Political Economy of Skills and Inequality* (with Torben Iversen).

## Skills and Inequality

Partisan Politics and the Political Economy of Education Reforms in Western Welfare States

MARIUS R. BUSEMEYER





University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107062931

© Marius R. Busemeyer 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

ISBN 978-1-107-06293-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

#### Contents

List of figures	<i>page</i> vi
List of tables	viii
Preface and acknowledgments	xi
List of abbreviations	xiv
Introduction	1
Part I The political and institutional determinants of education policy	
1 Theoretical framework: partisan politics in context	29
2 The politics of education and training reform: case studies	58
3 Worlds of skill formation: cross-national quantitative analysis	123
Part II The impact of educational institutions on outcomes and popular attitudes	
4 Educational institutions and socioeconomic inequality	177
5 The impact of educational institutions on popular attitudes and preferences	215
6 Conclusion	253
<i>Appendix: Data sources for quantitative analyses (all chapters)</i>	266
Bibliography	269
Index	298

v

### Figures

De-commodification and stratification in	
education systems p	<i>age</i> 32
De-commodification and stratification in education systems	s 124
Results of a hierarchical cluster analysis of countries	133
Public spending on educational institutions and social	
policies as percentage of GDP, average values 1997-2008	135
Private share of education funding and public social	
spending, 1997–2008	138
Partisan politics (1945-2000) and private share of	
education spending (1997-2008)	139
Educational stratification and the ratio of VET enrollment	
to the entry rate into higher education	146
Importance of VET relative to higher education and	
combined cabinet share of Christian and social democrats	148
Share of upper-secondary students in VET	
(average 1997–2008) and cabinet share of Christian	
democrats (1945-2000)	151
Economic coordination and the apprenticeship	
training share	155
Wage dispersion and educational inequality	182
VET share and inequality	191
Apprenticeship training and inequality	193
· · ·	194
VET and educational inequality	196
VET and youth unemployment	198
1 1	
	205
Role of Government IV, 2006	220
	education systems <i>p</i> De-commodification and stratification in education systems Results of a hierarchical cluster analysis of countries Public spending on educational institutions and social policies as percentage of GDP, average values 1997–2008 Private share of education funding and public social spending, 1997–2008 Partisan politics (1945–2000) and private share of education spending (1997–2008) Educational stratification and the ratio of VET enrollment to the entry rate into higher education Importance of VET relative to higher education and combined cabinet share of Christian and social democrats Share of upper-secondary students in VET (average 1997–2008) and cabinet share of Christian democrats (1945–2000) Economic coordination and the apprenticeship training share Wage dispersion and educational inequality VET share and inequality Apprenticeship training and inequality VET and educational inequality VET and educational inequality VET and educational inequality VET and youth unemployment Predicted effect on inequality of an increase in the respective independent variable by one standard deviation Percentage share of respondents in favor of "more" or "much more" government spending on education, ISSP

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-06293-1 - Skills and Inequality: Partisan Politics and the Political Economy
of Education Reforms in Western Welfare States
Marius R. Busemeyer
Frontmatter
More information

List of figures	vii
5.2 Share of respondents recommending general and academic studies rather than VET to school-leavers, Eurobarometer	
62.1, 2004	223
5.3 Comparison of the impact of income and educational	
background on spending preferences	230
5.4 Levels of socioeconomic inequality and public support for	
more government spending on education	239
5.5 Interaction between income and VET share	240
5.6 Interaction between income and private share of	
education spending	242
5.7 Popular support for redistribution and private share of	
tertiary education spending	251

## Tables

3.1	The diversity of education and training systems in	
		2125
3.2	Selected quantitative indicators, cross-national averages,	
	1997–2008	126
3.3	Partisan politics, social spending and the private share of	
	education spending, cross-sectional regression analyses	140
3.4	Partisan politics and the determinants of different types of	
	education spending, cross-sectional regression analyses	142
3.5	Educational stratification and enrollment patterns in	
	upper- and post-secondary education, average values	
	1997–2008	144
3.6	Partisan politics and enrollment patterns in upper- and	
	post-secondary education (I)	147
3.7	Partisan politics and enrollment patterns in upper- and	
	post-secondary education (II)	149
3.8	Determinants of private share of education spending,	
	1993–2008, panel-corrected standard errors and	
	panel-specific AR(1) error correction	160
3.9	Determinants of gross level of enrollment, 1971–2008,	
	error-correction model with country fixed effects	162
3.10	Regression analysis: left-wing government and gross	
	enrollment levels in tertiary education, 1993-2008,	
	panel-corrected standard errors with lagged	
	dependent variable	167
3.11	Determinants of levels of enrollment in VET, 1993–2008,	
	panel-corrected standard errors and panel-specific AR(1)	
	error correction	170
3.12	Determinants of levels of enrollment in apprenticeship	
	training, 1993–2008, panel-corrected standard errors and	
	panel-specific AR(1) error correction	172

viii

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-06293-1 - Skills and Inequality: Partisan Politics and the Political Economy
of Education Reforms in Western Welfare States
Marius R. Busemeyer
Frontmatter
More information

List	of tables	ix
4.1	Educational institutions as determinants of socioeconomic	
	inequality, cross-sectional regressions	200
4.2	Socioeconomic inequality and VET share, 1997–2008	202
4.3	Socioeconomic inequality and the public/private division	
	of labor in education financing, 1997–2008	204
4.4	Education spending and socioeconomic inequality	
	(Gini index), 1997–2008	206
4.5	Interactions between private involvement and	
	enrollment patterns	208
4.6	Educational institutions and wage inequality, 1997-2008	210
4.7	Determinants of youth unemployment, 1997-2008	212
5.1	Individual-level determinants of preferences on	
	education spending	225
5.2	The individual level determinants of preferences for social	
	spending, ISSP Role of Government IV, 2006	226
5.3	Multilevel regression of individual support for	
	government spending on education, ISSP 2006	234
5.4	Multilevel regression (cross-level interactions) of	
	individual support for government spending on education,	
	ISSP 2006	236
5.5	Multilevel regression of preferences for different kinds of	
	education, Eurobarometer 62.1, 2004	243
5.6	Multilevel regressions of preferences for redistribution,	
	ISSP 2006	246

#### Preface and acknowledgments

This book represents the culmination and summary of my research on education politics and policies over a period of approximately the last five years. I started working on this topic during my doctoral dissertation at the University of Heidelberg in a project directed by Manfred G. Schmidt, who got me interested not only in education, but also in the role of partisan politics as a crucial factor explaning differences in policy output. I continued doing research on education during my postdoc years at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Societies in Cologne. Working with Wolfgang Streeck and Kathleen Thelen broadened my perspective and prompted me to give more serious consideration to the role of vocational education and training and the impact of socioeconomic institutions. Much of the theoretical perspective of this book is motivated by the attempt to bring together these two different theoretical perspectives of partisan theory and historical institutionalism. Moving beyond these more conventional approaches to comparative public policy, however, this book also looks at the impact of educational institutions on inequality and individual attitudes, two topics that have dominated my research agenda in the past two years and will continue to do so in the coming ones.

There are many, many people who have contributed directly and indirectly to making this project possible. First and foremost, I would like to thank my mentors, advisors, and employers – Manfred G. Schmidt, Wolfgang Streeck, and Kathleen Thelen – who played a crucial role in guiding me towards the study of education from different perspectives during the various stages of my academic career. I have also benefited enormously from the thoughts, comments, and ideas of a large group of colleagues, co-authors, and collaborators. I feel at once extremely privileged and humbled to be part of this academic community of scholars, who are not only colleagues but also personal friends. There were several "critical junctures" in the last couple of years when the "positive feedback" I received from my peers

xii

Preface and acknowledgments

was crucial in motivating me to write this book. I am deeply grateful for this support through the years and for the numerous invitations to present parts of the book (or in exceptional circumstances of extreme bravery, the entire thing) at research workshops, conferences, and invited talks. It would take several pages to highlight the critical input of each member of this group of scholars, which lies beyond the scope of the present foreword. For this reason, I will ask preemptively for your forgiveness (and for the understanding of any who were inadvertently overlooked) before I present the following list of colleagues in alphabetical order. Each of them contributed in their own way to the success of the project, whether by commenting on a paper or chapter, inviting me for a talk or a workshop, coauthoring a paper, or simply sharing a meal: Klaus Armingeon, Frank Castles, Maria A. Cattaneo, Ute Clement, Pepper Culpepper, Johan Bo Davidsson, Thomas Deißinger, Bernhard Ebbinghaus, Werner Eichhorst, Patrick Emmenegger, Simon Franzmann, Achim Goerres, Peter Hall, Silja Häusermann, Thomas Hinz, Martin Höpner, Evelyne Huber, Torben Iversen, Carsten Jensen, André Kaiser, Desmond King, Herbert Kitschelt, Bernhard Kittel, Stephan Leibfried, Johannes Lindvall, Philip Manow, Cathie Jo Martin, Paul Marx, Dick Moraal, Renate Neubäumer, Rita Nikolai, Herbert Obinger, Harald Pfeifer, Matthias Pilz, David Rueda, Paul Ryan, Armin Schäfer, Josef Schmid, Manfred G. Schmidt, Carsten Q. Schneider, Heike Solga, David Soskice, John D. Stephens, Markus Tepe, Kathleen Thelen, Christine Trampusch, Pieter Vanhuysse, Stefanie Walter, Felix Wenzelmann, Frieder Wolf, Stefan Wolter, Nick Ziegler, Reimut Zohlnhöfer, and many others that I cannot possibly mention here. I would also like to especially thank my colleagues at the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Konstanz for their continued support and intellectual stimulation, in particular Christian Breunig, Katharina Holzinger, Sven Jochem, Christoph Knill, Gerald Schneider, Volker Schneider, Wolfgang Seibel, Peter Selb, Susumu Shikano, and Nils Weidmann. Last, but certainly not least, I want to thank my team of postdocs and doctoral researchers, with whom I have worked most closely over the last couple of years. They all provided important and critical input during various stages of the project and "volunteered" to read the manuscript (several times, actually). In particular, I am grateful to Aurélien Abrassart, Michael Dobbins, Julian Garritzmann, Ulrich Glassmann, Susanne Münn, Erik Neimanns, Roula Nezi,

#### Preface and acknowledgments

Raphaela Schlicht-Schmälzle, and Janis Vossiek. Margot Beier provided excellent secretarial support. I am also grateful to Dana Behrens, Anne Sophie Fendrich, Aline Grünewald, Adrian Rinscheid, Tobias Tober, and Marie Zeller for excellent research assistance. Thanks also to John Haslam and Carrie Parkinson at Cambridge University Press for their editorial support (as well as the anonymous reviewers of the book manuscript for extremely helpful comments and suggestions) and Casey Butterfield for language editing.

I would also like to thank the various institutions and organizations that supported me in various ways for the duration of this project. First of all, I thank the University of Konstanz, in particular Rector Ulrich Rüdiger, for providing crucial institutional and financial support. The Center for European Studies at Harvard University hosted me during a long research stay in 2009/10 (sponsored by the MPI for the Study of Societies) and a shorter one in 2012. In both cases, the project benefited enormously from the input of the CES community (in particular Kathleen Thelen, Torben Iversen, Cathie Jo Martin, and Peter Hall). I am also grateful to Nuffield College at Oxford (and David Soskice and David Rueda in particular), which hosted me during a short research stay in January 2012. A generous fellowship from the Institute for Advanced Study Konstanz in the academic year 2013/14 provided me with the opportunity to finish the book project in a congenial, interdisciplinary environment with a gorgeous view of Lake Constance. Most importantly, I am grateful to the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG) for providing financial support for the project "The Politics of Education and Training Reforms in Western Welfare States" (Grant No. BU 1852/4-1).

Finally, I would like to thank my friends and family for supporting me during the challenges of these past few years.

xiii

#### Abbreviations

ABB	Arbeitsstelle für Betriebliche Berufsausbildung
ABF	Workers' Educational Association
AMB	Area Manpower Board
BAFöG	Bundesausbildungsförderungsgesetz
BBiG	Berufsbildungsgesetz
BDI	Bundesverband der Deutschen Industrie
BerBiFG	Berufsbildungsförderungsgesetz
BGJ	Berufsgrundbildungsjahr
BIBB	Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung
BLK	Bund-Länder Kommission für Bildungsplanung und
	Forschungsförderung
CBI	Confederation of British Industry
CDU	Christlich Demokratische Union Deutschlands
CME	Coordinated market economy
DATSCH	Deutscher Ausschuß für Technisches Schulwesen
DGB	Deutscher Gewerkschaftsbund
DIHT	Deutscher Industrie- und Handelstag
ERA	Education Reform Act
GNVQ	General National Vocational Qualification
ILA	Individual Learning Account
ISCED	International Standard Classification of Education
ITB	Industrial Training Board
ITO	Industrial training organization
KMK	Kultusministerkonferenz; short for Ständige Konferenz
	der Kultusminister der Länder in der Bundesrepublik
	Deutschland
LEA	Local Education Authority
LLSC	Local Learning and Skills Council
LME	Liberal market economy
LO	Landsorganisationen i Sverige
LSC	Learning and Skills Council

xiv

#### List of abbreviations

xv

MA	Modern Apprenticeship
MSC	Manpower Services Commission
NCVQ	National Council for Vocational Qualifications
NTI	New Training Initiative
NVQ	National Vocational Qualification
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and
	Development
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
POS	Polytechnische Oberschule
QCA	Qualifications and Curriculum Authority
SAF	Svenska Arbetsgivareföreningen
SAP	Swedish Social Democrats
SPD	Sozialdemokratische Partei Deutschlands
TCO	Tjänstemännens Centralorganisation
TEC	Training and Enterprise Council
TUC	Trades Union Congress
TVEI	Technical and Vocational Education Initiative
VET	Vocational education and training
VoC	Varieties of capitalism
YOP	Youth Opportunities Programme
YT	Youth Training
YTS	Youth Training Scheme