The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Logic

This volume, the first dedicated and comprehensive Companion to Medieval Logic, covers both the Latin and the Arabic traditions and shows that they were in fact sister traditions, which both arose against the background of a Hellenistic heritage and which influenced one another over the centuries. A series of chapters by both established and younger scholars covers the whole period including early and late developments, and offers new insights into this extremely rich period in the history of logic. The volume is divided into two parts, ‘Periods and Traditions’ and ‘Themes’, allowing readers to engage with the subject from both historical and more systematic perspectives. It will be a must-read for students and scholars of medieval philosophy, the history of logic, and the history of ideas.

Catarina Dutilh Novaes is professor and Rosalind Franklin Fellow in the Faculty of Philosophy of the University of Groningen (the Netherlands). She is the author of Formalizing Medieval Logical Theories (Springer, 2007) and Formal Languages in Logic (Cambridge University Press, 2012), as well as many articles on the history and philosophy of logic.

Stephen Read is Professor Emeritus of History and Philosophy of Logic at the University of St Andrews (Scotland). He is the author of Relevant Logic (Blackwell, 1988) and Thinking about Logic (Oxford University Press, 1995), editor of Sophisms in Medieval Logic and Grammar (Springer, 1993), editor and translator of Thomas Bradwardine: Insolubilia (Peeters, 2010), translator of John Buridan: Treatise on Consequences (Fordham University Press, 2015), as well as the author many articles on contemporary and medieval philosophy of logic and language.
Other Volumes in The Series of Cambridge Companions

ABELARD  Edited by JEFFREY E. BROWER and KEVIN GUILFOY
ADORNO  Edited by THOMAS HUHN
ANCIENT SCEPTICISM  Edited by RICHARD BETT
ANSELM  Edited by BRIAN DAVIES and BRIAN LEFTOW
AQUINAS  Edited by NORMAN KRETZMANN and ELEONORE STUMP
ARABIC PHILOSOPHY  Edited by PETER ADAMSON and RICHARD C. TAYLOR
HANNAH ARENDT  Edited by DANA VILLA
ARISTOTLE  Edited by JONATHAN BARNES
ARISTOTLE’S POLITICS  Edited by MARGUEREIT DESLAURIERS and PAUL DESTREÉ
ATEISM  Edited by MICHAEL MARTIN
AUGUSTINE 2nd edition  Edited by DAVID MECONI and ELEONORE STUMP
BACON  Edited by MARKKU PELTONEN
BERKELEY  Edited by KENNETH P. WINKLER
BOETHIUS  Edited by JOHN MARENBON
BRENTANO  Edited by DALE JACQUETTE
CARNAP  Edited by MICHAEL FRIEDMAN and RICHARD CREATH
THE COMMUNIST MANIFESTO  Edited by TERRELL CARVER and JAMES FARR
CONSTANT  Edited by HELENA ROSENBLATT
CRITICAL THEORY  Edited by FRED RUSH
DARWIN 2nd edition  Edited by JONATHAN HODGE and GREGORY RADICK
SIMONE DE BEAUVIOR  Edited by CLAUDIA CARD
DELEUZE  Edited by DANIEL W. SMITH and HENRY SOMERS-HALL
DESCARTES  Edited by JOHN COTTINGHAM
DESCARTES’ MEDITATIONS  Edited by DAVID CUNNING
DEWEY  Edited by MOLLY COCHRAN
DUNS SCOTUS  Edited by THOMAS WILLIAMS
EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY  Edited by A. A. LONG
EARLY MODERN PHILOSOPHY  Edited by DONALD RUTHERFORD
EPICURAENISM  Edited by JAMES WARREN
EXISTENTIALISM  Edited by STEVEN CROWELL
FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY  Edited by MIRANDA FRICKER and JENNIFER HORNSBY
FICTHE  Edited by DAVID JAMES and GUENTER ZOELLER
FOUCAULT 2nd edition  Edited by GARY GUTTING
FREGE  Edited by TOM RICKETTS and MICHAEL POTTER
FREUD  Edited by JEROME NEU
GADAMER  Edited by ROBERT J. DOSTAL
GALILEO  Edited by PETER MACHAMER
GERMAN IDEALISM  Edited by KARL AMERIKS
GREEK AND ROMAN PHILOSOPHY  Edited by DAVID SEDLEY
HABERMAS  Edited by STEPHEN K. WHITE
HAYEK  Edited by EDWARD FESER
HEGEL  Edited by FREDERICK C. BEISER
HEGEL AND NINETEENTH-CENTURY PHILOSOPHY  Edited by FREDERICK C. BEISER
HEIDEGGER 2nd Edition  Edited by CHARLES GUIGNON
HOBSES  Edited by TOM SORRELL
HOBSES’S ‘LEVIATHAN’  Edited by PATRICIA SPRINGBORG
HUME 2nd Edition  Edited by DAVID FATE NORTON and JACQUELINE TAYLOR
HUME’S TREATISE  Edited by DONALD C. AINSLIE and ANNEMARIE BUTLER
HUSSERL  Edited by BARRY SMITH and DAVID WOODRUFF SMITH
WILLIAM JAMES  Edited by RUTH ANNA PUTNAM
KANT  Edited by PAUL GUYER
KANT AND MODERN PHILOSOPHY  Edited by PAUL GUYER
KANT’S ‘CRITIQUE OF PURE REASON’  Edited by PAUL GUYER
KEYNES  Edited by ROGER E. BACKHOUSE and BRADLEY W. BATEMAN
KIERKEGAARD  Edited by ALASTAIR HANNAY and GORDON DANIEL MARINO
LEIBNIZ  Edited by NICHOLAS JOLLEY
LEVINAS  Edited by SIMON CRITCHELEY and ROBERT BERNASCONI
LIBERALISM  Edited by STEVEN WALL
LIFE AND DEATH  Edited by STEVEN LUPER
LOCKE  Edited by VERE CHAPPELL
LOCKE’S ‘ESSAY CONCERNING HUMAN UNDERSTANDING’  Edited by LEX NEWMAN
LOGICAL EMPIRICISM  Edited by ALAN RICHARDSON and THOMAS UEBEL
MAIMONIDES  Edited by KENNETH SEESKIN
MALEBRANCHE  Edited by STEVEN NADLER
MARX  Edited by TERRELL CARVER
MEDIEVAL JEWISH PHILOSOPHY  Edited by DANIEL H. FRANK and OLIVER LEAMAN
MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY  Edited by A. S. MCGRADE
MERLEAU-PONTY  Edited by TAYLOR CARMAN and MARK B. N. HANSEN
MILL  Edited by JOHN SKORUPSKI
MONTAIGNE  Edited by ULLRICH LANGER
The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Logic

Edited by
CATARINA DUTILH NOVAES
AND
STEPHEN READ
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Contributors</th>
<th>page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catarina Dutilh Novaes and Stephen Read</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part I: Periods and Traditions

1. The Legacy of Ancient Logic in the Middle Ages          | 19      |
   Julie Brumberg-Chaumont                                 |         |

2. Arabic Logic up to Avicenna                            | 45      |
   Ahmad Hasnawi and Wilfrid Hodges                       |         |

3. Arabic Logic after Avicenna                            | 67      |
   Khaled El-Rouayheb                                      |         |

4. Latin Logic up to 1200                                | 94      |
   Ian Wilks                                                |         |

5. Logic in the Latin Thirteenth Century                  | 119     |
   Sara L. Uckelman and Henrik Lagerlund                   |         |

6. Logic in the Latin West in the Fourteenth Century      | 142     |
   Stephen Read                                            |         |

7. The Post-Medieval Period                               | 166     |
   E. Jennifer Ashworth                                    |         |

vii
viii CONTENTS

PART II: THEMES

8 Logica Vetus 195
MARGARET CAMERON

9 Supposition and Properties of Terms 220
CHRISTOPH KANN

10 Propositions: Their Meaning and Truth 245
LAURENT CESALLI

11 Sophisms and Insolubles 265
MIKKO YRJÖNSUURI AND ELIZABETH COPPOCK

12 The Syllogism and Its Transformations 290
PAUL THOM

13 Consequence 316
GYULA KLIMA

14 The Logic of Modality 342
RICCARDO STROBINO AND PAUL THOM

15 Obligationes 370
CATARINA DUTILH NOVAES AND
SARA L. UCKELMAN

Bibliography 396
Index 437
Contributors

E. JENNIFER ASHWORTH is Distinguished Professor Emerita at the University of Waterloo (Canada). She is the author of Language and Logic in the Post-Medieval Period (Reidel, 1974) and the editor and translator of Paul of Venice's Logica Magna Part II.8 (Oxford University Press, 1988).

JULIE BRUMBERG-CHAUMONT is a researcher at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris (France). She is the editor of Ad notitiam ignoti, L’Organon dans la translatio studiorum à l’époque d’Albert le Grand (Brepols, 2013).

MARGARET CAMERON is the Canada Research Council Chair in the Aristotelian Tradition and associate professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Victoria (Canada). She is the editor of Methods and Methodologies: Aristotelian Logic East and West 500–1500 (Brill, 2010) and Linguistic Content: New Essays on the History of the Philosophy of Language (Oxford University Press, 2014).

LAURENT CESALLI is professor of medieval philosophy at the Département de philosophie, Université de Genève (Switzerland). He is the author of Le réalisme propositionnel: Sémantique et ontologie des propositions chez Jean Duns Scot, Gauthier Burley, Richard Brinkley et Jean Wyclif (Vrin, 2007).

ELIZABETH COPPOCK is a fellow at the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study and a researcher at the Department of Philosophy, Linguistics and Theory of Science, University of Gothenburg.
X CONTRIBUTORS

(Sweden). She has published articles in journals such as *Linguistics and Philosophy* and the *Journal of Semantics*.

CATARINA DUTILH NOVAES is professor at the Faculty of Philosophy, University of Groningen (the Netherlands). She is the author of *Formalizing Medieval Logical Theories* (Springer, 2007) and *Formal Languages in Logic* (Cambridge University Press, 2012).

KHALED EL-ROUAYHEB is James Richard Jewett Professor of Arabic and Islamic Intellectual History at the Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations, Harvard University (USA). He is the author of *Relational Syllogisms and the History of Arabic Logic, 900–1900* (Brill, 2010).

AHMAD HASNAWI is director of research at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris. He is the author of articles in venues such as *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* and *L.E.U.S.* and the editor of *La lumière de l'intellect: La pensée scientifique et philosophique d'Averroès dans son temps* (Peeters, 2011).

WILFRID HODGES is a fellow of the British Academy and Emeritus Professor at Queen Mary, University of London (England). He is the author of *Logic* (Penguin, 1977) and *Building Models by Games* (Dover, 2006).

CHRISTOPH KANN is professor at the Institute of Philosophy, University of Düsseldorf (Germany). He edited and translated William of Sherwood’s *Introduction to Logic* (Meiner, 1995) as well as his *Syncategoremata* (Meiner, 2012) and is the author of *Die Eigenschaften der Termini. Eine Untersuchung zur 'Perutilis logica' Alberts von Sachsen* (Brill, 1994).

GYULA KLIMA is professor at the Department of Philosophy, Fordham University (USA). He is the author of *John Buridan* (Oxford University
HENRIK LAGERLUND is professor and chair at the Department of Philosophy of the University of Western Ontario (Canada). He is the author of Modal Syllogistics in the Middle Ages [Brill, 2000] and the editor of the Encyclopaedia of Medieval Philosophy [Springer, 2011].

STEPHEN READ is Professor Emeritus of History and Philosophy of Logic at the University of St Andrews and researcher at the Arché Research Centre (Scotland). He is the author of Thinking about Logic [Oxford University Press, 1995], and the editor and translator of Bradwardine’s Treatise on Insolubles [Peeters, 2010] and Buridan’s Treatise on Consequences [Fordham University Press, 2015].

RICCARDO STROBINO is Mellon Bridge Assistant Professor at the Department of Classics of Tufts University (USA). He has published articles in journals such as Vivarium, Oriens, and the British Journal for the History of Philosophy.

PAUL THOM is Honorary Visiting Professor at the School of Philosophical and Historical Inquiry, University of Sydney (Australia). He is the author of The Syllogism [Philosophia, 1981], Medieval Modal Systems [Ashgate, 2003], and Logic and Ontology in the Syllogistic of Robert Kilwardby [Brill, 2007].

SARA L. UCKELMAN is a lecturer at the Department of Philosophy, Durham University (England). She has published articles in journals such as Synthese, Vivarium, and the Journal of Philosophical Logic.

IAN WILKS is professor and chair at the Department of Philosophy, Acadia University (Canada). He has published articles in journals such as the Journal of the History of Philosophy and the Review of Metaphysics.
Contributors

MIKKO YRJÖNSUURI is professor at the Department of Social Sciences and Philosophy, University of Jyvaskyla (Finland). He is the editor of Medieval Formal Logic (Kluwer, 2001) and author of Obligationes: 14th Century Logic of Disputational Duties (Acta philosophica Fennica, 1994).