

LYING AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS

Lying and Christian Ethics defends the controversial “absolute view” of lying, which maintains that an assertion contrary to the speaker’s mind is always wrong, regardless of the speaker’s intentions. Whereas most people believe that a lie told for a good cause, such as protecting Jews from discovery by Nazis, is morally acceptable, Christopher O. Tollefsen argues that Christians should support the absolute view. He looks back to the writings of Augustine and Aquinas to illustrate that lying violates the basic human goods of integrity and sociality, and severely compromises the values of religion and truth. He critiques the comparatively permissive views espoused by Cassian, Bonhoeffer, and Niebuhr, and argues that lies often jeopardize the good causes for which they are told. Beyond framing a moral absolute against lying, this book explores the questions of to whom we owe the truth and when, and what steps we may take when we should not give it.

Christopher O. Tollefsen is a professor of philosophy at the University of South Carolina. He has also been a visiting associate professor of politics and a Visiting Fellow in the James Madison Program at Princeton University. He serves on the editorial boards of *The Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* and *Christian Bioethics*. His most recent book is *Biomedical Research and Beyond: Expanding the Ethics of Inquiry* (2010).

NEW STUDIES IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS

General Editor

ROBIN GILL

Editorial Board

STEPHEN R. L. CLARK, STANLEY HAUERWAS, ROBIN W. LOVIN

Christian ethics has increasingly assumed a central place within academic theology. At the same time the growing power and ambiguity of modern science and the rising dissatisfaction within the social sciences about claims to value-neutrality have prompted renewed interest in ethics within the secular academic world. There is, therefore, a need for studies in Christian ethics which, as well as being concerned with the relevance of Christian ethics to the present-day secular debate, are well informed about parallel discussions in recent philosophy, science, or social science. *New Studies in Christian Ethics* aims to provide books that do this at the highest intellectual level and demonstrate that Christian ethics can make a distinctive contribution to this debate – either in moral substance or in terms of underlying moral justifications.

TITLES PUBLISHED IN THE SERIES

1. *Rights and Christian Ethics*, Kieran Cronin
2. *Biblical Interpretation and Christian Ethics*, Ian McDonald
3. *Power and Christian Ethics*, James Mackey
4. *Plurality and Christian Ethics*, Ian S. Markham
5. *Moral Action and Christian Ethics*, Jean Porter
6. *Responsibility and Christian Ethics*, William Schweiker
7. *Justice and Christian Ethics*, E. Clinton Gardner
8. *Feminism and Christian Ethics*, Susan Parsons
9. *Sex, Gender and Christian Ethics*, Lisa Sowle Cahill
10. *The Environment and Christian Ethics*, Michael Northcott
11. *Concepts of Person and Christian Ethics*, Stanley Rudman
12. *Priorities and Christian Ethics*, Garth Hallett
13. *Community, Liberalism and Christian Ethics*, David Fergusson
14. *The Market Economy and Christian Ethics*, Peter Sedgwick

(continued after the index)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-06109-5 — Lying and Christian Ethics
Christopher O. Tollefsen
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

LYING AND
CHRISTIAN ETHICS

CHRISTOPHER O. TOLLEFSEN
University of South Carolina



Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-06109-5 — Lying and Christian Ethics
 Christopher O. Tollefsen
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107061095

© Christopher O. Tollefsen 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Tollefsen, Christopher.

Lying and Christian ethics / Christopher O. Tollefsen.

pages cm. — (New studies in Christian ethics ; 33)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-06109-5 (hardback)

1. Truthfulness and falsehood — Religious aspects — Christianity. 2. Christian ethics. 3. Truthfulness and falsehood. I. Title.

BV4647.T7T65 2014

241'.673—dc23 2013049915

ISBN 978-1-107-06109-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>General Editor's Preface</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
Introduction	I
1 What Is Lying?	12
The First Question	12
Some Initial Considerations	12
Assertions and the Definition of the Lie	17
The Intention to Deceive	21
The Right to the Truth	25
2 The Christian Case against Lying: Augustine and Aquinas	31
St. Augustine	31
Augustine on God and Truth	33
The Negative Consequences of Lying	35
Augustine on Objections to the Absolute View and Defenses of Lying	40
St. Thomas on Lying	44
The Communicative Order	48
Integrity	53
3 The Christian Case for Lying: Cassian, Bonhoeffer, and Niebuhr	57
Cassian	58
Bonhoeffer	62
Niebuhr	73
4 Moral Absolutes	79
Moral Absolutes and the Moral Life	82
John Paul II on Moral Absolutes	85
The Definition of Lying Again	87
The Pope against Proportionalism	92
Consequentialism and Consequentialist Thought	95
Conclusion	101

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
5	Integrity, Sociality, Truth, and Religion	102
	Integrity	103
	Sociality and Community	114
	Truth	122
	Religion	125
6	Justice and the Right to Truth	129
	The Right to the Truth	130
	The Obligation <i>Not</i> to Provide the Truth	136
	The Ordinary Injustice of Lying	138
	Defeating Conditions for the Injustice of Lying	142
7	The Casuistry of Truth-Telling and Deception	147
	Double Effect	148
	Reasons for Nondisclosure	151
	Silence and Evasion	154
	Selective Truth-Telling	155
	Economy	157
	Equivocation and Reservation	159
	Deception	164
	Nonlinguistic Deceptions	166
	Opting Out of Assertion and Speaking One's Interlocutor's Language	169
	Conclusion	172
8	Lying for a Good Cause	173
	Nazis at the Door	175
	Lying for the <i>Polis</i>	180
	Lying for a Good Social Cause	188
	Conclusion	196
	<i>Bibliography</i>	199
	<i>Index</i>	207

General Editor's Preface

In this new contribution to *New Studies in Christian Ethics*, Christopher O. Tollefsen makes a tightly argued and well thought-out claim that lying is never to be done, even for a good cause. Given that most of us tell lies on occasions, sometimes to protect other people but, regrettably, more often to protect ourselves, we are going to have think long and hard if we are going to disagree intelligently with this challenging book. He combines the skills of both philosophy and theology and admirably fulfills the aims of the series, namely to promote monographs in Christian ethics that engage centrally with the present secular moral debate at the highest possible intellectual level and to encourage contributors to demonstrate that Christian ethics can make a distinctive contribution to this debate.

He is strongly committed to the absolutist position on lying taken by both Augustine and Aquinas. He also sides firmly with the moral absolutism, attack on proportionalism and consequentialism, and defense of natural law in Pope John Paul II's *Veritatis Splendor*. Tollefsen writes as a committed Catholic. However, he also includes sensitive accounts of John Cassian, Dietrich Bonhoeffer, and Reinhold Niebuhr's non-absolutist accounts of lying – from which he finally dissents – in addition to the well-known absolutist position of Kant. He is dissatisfied with attempts either to define lying in a way that permits one to assert contrary to one's belief or to allow altruistic circumstances where lying is sanctioned or even encouraged.

He is well aware, however, that many of us find it difficult not to condone altruistic lying, and to his credit, he faces at length one of the most obvious examples of this, namely non-Jews in Nazi Germany sheltering persecuted Jews. The section titled "Nazis at the Door" provides an acute test for his absolutist position. Was it really wrong for these non-Jews to deny that they were sheltering Jews? Tollefsen offers a number of ingenious strategies that do not resort to lying but do involve, say, challenging

the Nazis about their right to have such information and insisting on their need to repent. He concludes simply that “Lying is not to be done, even to Nazis, for a good personal cause.”

Readers may or may not agree with this conclusion, but they will, I believe, be forced to think more clearly about what lying actually is and whether it is ever to be permitted. This is an important and well-sustained contribution both to Christian ethics and, more widely, to moral thought.

ROBIN GILL

Acknowledgments

There are many friends to thank for their assistance on this book, particularly Ryan Anderson, Hadley Arkes, Joseph Boyle, Gerard Bradley, Christian Brugger, Bethany Carlson, Dan Castell, Barry Cushman, Gabriele de Anna, Michael Dickson, Dawn Eden, Anthony Ferrara, John Finnis, Jennifer Fitz, Glenn Gentry, Robert P. George, Sherif Girgis, Germain Grisez, John Hathaway, Patrick Hough, Ana Iltis, Christopher Kaczor, George Kateb, George Khushf, Patrick Langrell, Patrick Lee, Richard Lloret, Alex Marsland, Kevin O'Brien, Alex Pruss, Diana Schaub, Nathan Schlueter, Matthew Schmitz, Mark Shea, Brandon Watson, Dan Williams, and Brad Wilson.

Various chapters of the book were read as papers, in whole or in part, at the following institutions: The University of St. Thomas, Yale University, The Franciscan University of Steubenville, The University of Udine, Princeton University, and The University of Scranton.

A first draft of the book was written while I was a Visiting Fellow of the James Madison Program at Princeton University. I am grateful to the university and the program for an altogether excellent year of intellectual companionship and stimulation. I have rarely worked so well as in my office in Bobst Hall. I am grateful as well to my own University of South Carolina, and to the Witherspoon Institute, for funding that made this year possible.

Glenn Gentry and Michael Dickson organized a reading group consisting of faculty and students from my university, and from Columbia International University, which read a penultimate draft of the book; regular participants included Craig Bacon, Brandon Boesch, Ron Childress, John Crutchfield, Jim Curley, Chip Edgar, George Khushf, and Michelle Panchuk. The discussions were lively, and their assistance was very helpful.

Although the material has undergone extensive development and maturation, the original idea for this book emerged out of three essays

published in the online journal *Public Discourse*, and a subsequent online controversy about the moral permissibility of lying for a good cause. I am very grateful for Ryan Anderson's encouragement both in writing those essays and in the subsequent discussions.

Chapter 3 would not exist but for the helpful proddings of a referee for Cambridge University Press and Robin Gill, and it would be far more deficient in its account of Bonhoeffer but for the help of Dan Williams and George Khushf.

My wife Laurie read an early draft of this book and made many helpful comments and suggestions; I made changes in response to almost every one of these, and the book is much better for her help. It is dedicated to her, and to my children, each of whom in their own way also contributed to its completion: Emma, Olaf, Abe, Alice, Joseph, Hilde, Mac, Leif, and Mariama.