

CORRUPTION, ASSET RECOVERY, AND THE PROTECTION OF PROPERTY IN PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW

In recovering assets that are or that represent the proceeds, objects, or instrumentalities of grand corruption, do states violate the human rights of politically exposed persons, their relatives, or their associates? Radha Ivory asks whether cooperative efforts to confiscate illicit wealth are compatible with rights to property in public international law. She explores the tensions between the goals of controlling high-level, high-value corruption and ensuring equal enjoyment of civil and political rights. Through the jurisprudence of regional human rights tribunals and the literature on confiscation and international cooperation, Ivory shows how asset recovery is a human rights issue and how principles of legality and proportionality have mediated competing interests in analogous matters. In cases of asset recovery, she predicts that property rights will likewise enable questions of individual entitlement to be considered in the context of collective concerns with good governance, global economic inequality, and the suppression of transnational crime.

RADHA IVORY is a Lecturer at the TC Beirne School of Law at the University of Queensland.

CORRUPTION, ASSET
RECOVERY, AND
THE PROTECTION OF
PROPERTY IN PUBLIC
INTERNATIONAL LAW

The Human Rights of Bad Guys

by

RADHA IVORY



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-05850-7 — Corruption, Asset Recovery, and the Protection of Property
 in Public International Law
 Radha Ivory
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107058507

© Radha Ivory 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Ivory, Radha, author.

Corruption, asset recovery, and the protection of property in public international
 law : the human rights of bad guys / Radha Ivory.
 pages cm

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-107-05850-7 (hardback)

1. International criminal law. 2. Forfeiture. 3. Reparation (Criminal justice)
 4. Right of property I. Title.
- KZ7460.I38 2014
 345'.02323–dc23
 2014006635

ISBN 978-1-107-05850-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page viii</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>ix</i>
1 Introduction	1
2 Concepts, sources, and case studies	12
2.1 Corruption	12
2.1.1 International and transnational criminal law distinguished	13
2.1.2 Soft law norms on corruption	17
2.1.3 A common definition of corruption in public international law?	20
2.1.4 Preliminary conclusions	22
2.2 Asset recovery	22
2.2.1 The broad definition	23
2.2.2 The narrow definition	27
2.2.3 Preliminary conclusions	28
2.3 Human rights to property	29
2.3.1 The concept of human rights to property in public international law	29
2.3.2 The sources of international human rights to property	31
2.3.3 Preliminary conclusions	37
2.4 Case studies	38
2.4.1 The success stories	38
2.4.2 The failed states	42
2.4.3 The counter-terrorist sanctions regimes	46
2.4.4 The Arab Spring	47
2.4.5 Preliminary conclusions	54
2.5 Conclusions	56
3 Criminalizing corruption	58
3.1 Jurisdiction	58
3.1.1 Mandatory grounds for assuming jurisdiction	59
3.1.2 Discretionary grounds for assuming jurisdiction	60
3.1.3 Preliminary conclusions	63

3.2	Prescription	63
3.2.1	Offenses	64
3.2.2	Defenses	90
3.2.3	Penalties	92
3.2.4	Preliminary conclusions	93
3.3	Enforcement	93
3.3.1	Detection	93
3.3.2	Prevention and investigation	94
3.3.3	Procedural guarantees	95
3.3.4	Non-enforcement	96
3.3.5	Preliminary conclusions	100
3.4	Conclusions	100
4	Cooperating for the purposes of confiscation	101
4.1	The duty to enable confiscation	102
4.1.1	The international standards on confiscation	102
4.1.2	The content of the duty to enable confiscation	106
4.2	The duty to cooperate for the purposes of confiscation	123
4.2.1	The anti-corruption treaties	123
4.2.2	Other international standards	129
4.3	The duty to cooperate in the disposal of confiscated illicit wealth	137
4.4	Conclusions	138
5	Asset recovery and European human right(s) to property	140
5.1	Human rights to property in Europe	141
5.1.1	Three European human rights to property	141
5.1.2	The relevance of Art. 1 ECHR-P1	143
5.2	The scope of the right under Art. 1 ECHR-P1	144
5.2.1	Temporal scope	144
5.2.2	Personal scope	145
5.2.3	Territorial scope	146
5.2.4	Substantive scope	172
5.2.5	Preliminary conclusions	183
5.3	The nature of the interference	184
5.3.1	The nature of an interference and the ECtHR's three rules	184
5.3.2	The three rules applied to (cooperative) confiscations	186
5.3.3	Criticisms of the three rules and a new approach	190
5.3.4	Preliminary conclusions	195
5.4	The lawfulness of the interference	196
5.4.1	The legal basis for enforcement orders	198
5.4.2	The compatibility of assistance powers with the rule of law	203
5.4.3	General principles of international law	218
5.4.4	Preliminary conclusions	218

CONTENTS vii

5.5	The proportionality of the interference to the general interest	219
5.5.1	The general interest	219
5.5.2	The proportionality of the interference	222
5.5.3	Preliminary conclusions	258
5.6	Property and equality under the ECHR	259
5.7	Conclusions	261
6	Asset recovery and other regional rights to property	264
6.1	Property rights in the two Americas	264
6.1.1	The scope of the right under Art. 21 ACHR	266
6.1.2	The nature of the interference	270
6.1.3	The justifications for the interference	271
6.1.4	The collective dimension	275
6.1.5	Preliminary conclusions	275
6.2	Property rights in pan-Africa	276
6.2.1	The scope of the right under Art. 14 AfCHPR	277
6.2.2	The nature of the interference and its justification	279
6.2.3	The right to property and the collective right to wealth and resources	281
6.2.4	Preliminary conclusions	288
6.3	The (new) Arab right to property	288
6.4	A human right to property in the Asia/Pacific?	290
6.5	Conclusions	291
7	General conclusions	293
	<i>Bibliography</i>	302
	<i>Index</i>	349

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Anyone who has written a dissertation – and then turned it into a book – knows just how many people, apart from the candidate/author, contribute to the finished work. In my case, sincere thanks are due to Prof. Anne Peters, who took me on as her student, engaged with my research, and supported my fellowship at the Basel Institute on Governance. Through the Institute, I met Prof. Mark Pieth, Ms. Gretta Fenner-Zinkernagel, and Mr. Daniel Thelesklaf, who gave me further important opportunities to research and write. I am also indebted to Ms. Gemma Aiolfi, Mr. Alan Bacarese, Prof. Sabine Gleß, Mr. Pedro Gomes Pereira, Dr. Juliette Lelieur, and Prof. J. A. E. Vervaele for reading and commenting on drafts of this work. Dr. Anthony Cassimatis, Dr. Jonathan Crowe, Prof. Ross Grantham, Prof. Lukas Handschin, and Dr. Christopher Kee were gracious in sharing their perspectives on particular issues. In other settings, Dr. Claudia Baez-Camargo, Ms. Kirstin Bentley Kröner, Mr. Olivier Burckhardt, Ms. Nina Schild, and Ms. Jannick Zumbrunnen supported me with their Romance languages, proof reading, and book production skills. The University of Basel accepted the original version of this book as a Basler Dissertation in 2012 and, in 2013, the Utrecht Law Review published part of Chapter 5 as an article. In the subsequent rounds of revisions, the Freiwillige Akademische Gesellschaft Basel generously contributed to my living costs and the Centre for Public, International and Comparative Law at the University of Queensland hosted me as a scholar. Prof. Sarah Derrington kindly facilitated that visit to Brisbane. Finally, my former partner, Dr. Jörg Spang, my parents, Prof. Julia Howell and Dr. Paul Ivory, and my mentor and friend, Dr. Peter Nelson, cannot be thanked enough for supporting this project – in many ways – all the way along.

R. D. I., Brisbane, November 2013

ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADRDM	American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man
AfCHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AfCmHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
AfCtHPR	African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights
AHRD	ASEAN Human Rights Declaration
AHRLR	African Human Rights Law Reports
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
ArCHR	Arab Charter on Human Rights
ArHRCmte	Arab Human Rights Committee
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
AU	African Union
AUCPCC	African Union Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption
BGE	<i>Bundesgerichtssentscheide</i>
BIS	Bank for International Settlements
CDIHR	Cairo Declaration on Islamic Human Rights
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CISCHR	Commonwealth of Independent States Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
COE	Council of Europe
COECivCC	Council of Europe Civil Law Convention on Corruption
COECrimCC	Council of Europe Criminal Law Convention on Corruption
COECrimCC-AP	Additional Protocol to the Council of Europe Criminal Law Convention on Corruption
COEMLC 1990	Council of Europe Convention on Laundering, Search, Seizure and Confiscation of the Proceeds from Crime (1990)
COEMLC 2005	Council of Europe Convention on Laundering, Search, Seizure and Confiscation of the Proceeds from Crime and on the Financing of Terrorism (2005)
COSP	Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption

X	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
DEM	Deutsche Mark
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EC	European Community(ies)
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECHR-P1	Protocol No. 1 to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECHR-P7	Protocol No. 7 to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECJ	Court of Justice (of the European Union)
ECmHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ECOWAS-PAC	Protocol on the Fight Against Corruption to the Treaty on the Economic Community of West African States
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EGC	General Court (of the European Union)
EHRR	European Human Rights Reports
EIF	entry into force
EITI	Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative
EmbA	Federal Act of March 22, 2002 on the Implementation of International Sanctions (Swiss) (or Embargos Act) (<i>Bundesgesetz vom 22. März 2002 über die Durchsetzung von internationalen Sanktionen, Embargogesetz, EmbG</i>)
EMRK	<i>Europäischen Menschenrechtskonvention</i>
ESC	Economic and Social Council (of the United Nations)
ETS	European Treaty Series
EU	European Union
EUCFR	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
EUCPFI	Convention on the protection of the European Communities' financial interests
EUCPFI-P1	Protocol to the Convention on the protection of the European Communities' financial interests
EUCPFI-P2	Second Protocol to the Convention on the protection of the European Communities' financial interests
EU Dec.	European Union (Framework) Decision
EUOCC	Convention on the fight against corruption involving officials of the European Communities or officials of Member States of the European Union
FAC	Federal Administrative Court (Switzerland)
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization (of the United Nations)
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
FCPA	Foreign Corrupt Practices Act (USA)

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xi

FDF	Federal Department of Finance of the Swiss Confederation (<i>Eidgenössisches Finanzdepartement, EFD</i>)
FDFA	Federal Department of Foreign Affairs of the Swiss Confederation (<i>Eidgenössisches Departement für auswärtige Angelegenheiten, EDA</i>)
FIU	financial intelligence unit
FOJ	Federal Department of Justice and Police of the Swiss Confederation, Federal Office of Justice (<i>Eidgenössisches Justiz- und Polizeidepartement, Bundesamt für Justiz, BJ</i>)
FYR Macedonia	The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
GA	General Assembly (of the United Nations)
GBP	British pounds
GDR	German Democratic Republic
GR	General Register number (Philippines Supreme Court Reports)
GRECO	Council of Europe's Group of States against Corruption
<i>HRLJ</i>	<i>Human Rights Law Journal</i>
IACAC	Inter-American Convention against Corruption
IACMACM	Inter-American Convention on Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters
IACmHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICHRP	International Council on Human Rights Policy
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ILC	International Law Commission
ILM	International Legal Materials
IMAC	Federal Act of March 20, 1981 on International Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters (Swiss) (<i>Bundesgesetz vom 20. März 1981 über internationale Rechtshilfe in Strafsachen, Rechtshilfegesetz, IRSG</i>)
MESICIC	Mechanism for Follow-up on the Implementation of the IACAC
MLA	mutual legal assistance
MLAT(s)	mutual legal assistance treaty(ies)
MNE(s)	multinational enterprise(s)
MOU	memorandum(a) of understanding
NCB	non-conviction-based
NGO(s)	non-governmental organization(s)
NIEO	New International Economic Order

OAG	Federal Authorities of the Swiss Confederation, Office of the Attorney General (<i>Die Bundesverwaltung der Schweizer Eignenossenschaft, Bundesanwaltschaft</i>)
OAS	Organization of American States
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OECD-ABC	Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business Transactions (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development Anti-Bribery Convention)
OECD-WGB	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union
PEP(s)	politically exposed person(s)
RIAA	Federal Act of October 1, 2010 on the Restitution of Assets of Politically Exposed Persons obtained by Unlawful Means (Restitution of Illicit Assets Act) (<i>Bundesgesetz vom 1. Oktober 2010 über die Rückerstattung unrechtmässig erworbener Vermögenswerte politisch exponierter Personen, RuVG</i>)
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SADC-MLAP	Protocol on Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters to the Treaty of the Southern African Development Community
SADC-PAC	Protocol Against Corruption to the Treaty of the Southern African Development Community
SC	Security Council (of the United Nations)
SRVG	Federal Act on Freezing and Restitution of Assets of Politically Exposed Persons obtained by Unlawful Means (Swiss), Consultation Draft of May 8, 2013 (Freezing and Restitution of Illicit Assets Act) (<i>Bundesgesetz über die Sperrung und die Rückerstattung unrechtmässig erworbener Vermögenswerte politisch exponierter Personen, SRVG, Vorentwurf vom 8. Mai 2013</i>)
StAR	Stolen Asset Recovery Initiative (of the World Bank and the UNODC)
TCL	transnational criminal law
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TI	Transparency International
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations (Organization)
UNC	Charter of the United Nations
UNCAC	United Nations Convention against Corruption

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS xiii

UNCATND	United Nations Convention against Illicit Traffic in Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNTOC	United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
USC	United States Code
USD	United States dollars
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organization