

Recalibrating Reform

Some of the most important eras of reform in U.S. history reveal a troubling pattern: often reform is compromised after the initial legislative and judicial victories have been achieved. Thus Jim Crow racial exclusions followed Reconstruction; employer prerogatives resurged after the passage of the Wagner Act in 1935; and after the civil rights reforms of the mid-twentieth century, principles of color-blindness remain dominant in key areas of constitutional law that allow structural racial inequalities to remain hidden or unaddressed. When momentous reforms occur, certain institutions and legal rights will survive the disruption and remain intact, just in different forms. Thus governance in the postreform period reflects a systematic recalibration or reshaping of the earlier reforms as a result of the continuing influence and power of such resilient institutions and rights. *Recalibrating Reform* examines this issue and demonstrates the pivotal role of the United States Supreme Court in postreform recalibration.

Stuart Chinn is an assistant professor at the University of Oregon School of Law. He received his BA, PhD (political science), and JD degrees from Yale University. Previously, he was a visiting assistant professor at the University of Texas School of Law. His research and teaching interests are in constitutional law, constitutional theory, legislation, and legal and political history. He has published in the journals *Law & Social Inquiry*, *The Journal of Law*, and *Polity*, and he has a chapter in the edited volume *Living Legislation* (2012).





Cambridge Historical Studies in American Law and Society

Series Editor

Christopher Tomlins, University of California, Irvine

This series publishes leading-edge work in American legal history, broadly construed. Its watchword is breadth no less than depth of analysis. Methodologically, the series seeks work that extends the boundaries of how legal history is defined. Substantively, the series is interdisciplinary, exploring law and legal history through numerous perspectives and techniques – economic, social, cultural, political, and intellectual – rather than concentrate on particular doctrinal areas.

Previously published in the series:

Yvonne Pitts, Family, Law, and Inheritance in America: A Social and Legal History of Nineteenth-Century Kentucky

David M. Rabban, Law's History

Kunal M. Parker, Common Law, History, and Democracy in America, 1790–1900 Steven Wilf, Law's Imagined Republic

James D. Schmidt, Industrial Violence and the Legal Origins of Child Labor

Rebecca M. McLennan, The Crisis of Imprisonment: Protest, Politics, and the Making of the American Penal State, 1776–1941

Tony A. Freyer, Antitrust and Global Capitalism, 1930-2004

Davison Douglas, Jim Crow Moves North

Andrew Wender Cohen, The Racketeer's Progress

Michael Willrich, City of Courts, Socializing Justice in Progressive Era Chicago

Barbara Young Welke, Recasting American Liberty: Gender, Law and the Railroad Revolution, 1865–1920

Michael Vorenberg, Final Freedom: The Civil War, the Abolition of Slavery, and the Thirteenth Amendment

Robert J. Steinfeld, Coercion, Contract, and Free Labor in Nineteenth Century America

David M. Rabban, Free Speech in Its Forgotten Years

Jenny Wahl, The Bondsman's Burden: An Economic Analysis of the Common Law of Southern Slavery

Michael Grossberg, A Judgment for Solomon: The d'Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in the Antebellum South





Recalibrating Reform

The Limits of Political Change

STUART CHINN

University of Oregon





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107057531

© Stuart Chinn 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Chinn, Stuart.

Recalibrating reform: the limits of political change / Stuart Chinn.
pages cm. – (Cambridge historical studies in American law and society)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-05753-1 (hardback)

United States – Politics and government.
 Political science – United States – History.
 Political culture – United States – History.
 Title.

E183.C64 2014 973-dc23 2013039551

ISBN 978-1-107-05753-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my parents Leung and Betty Chinn





Contents

Acknowledgments		page x1
	PART I. INTRODUCTION	
	Introduction: Reconstructing Governance	3
I	The Theory and Political Processes of Recalibration	16
2	The Supreme Court and Transformative Recalibration	40
	PART II. LEGAL REFORM AND ITS DELIMITATION	
3	Emancipation, the Reconstruction Era, and Delimitation	65
4	Labor Rights, the New Deal Era, and Delimitation	109
5	Constitutional Equal Protection, the Civil Rights Era,	
	and Delimitation	152
6	Explaining Judicial Delimiting Behavior	178
	PART III. THE CONSTRUCTION AND MAINTENANCE OF GOVERNANCE	
7	The Entrenchment and Maintenance of the	
	Jim Crow Order	193
8	The Entrenchment and Maintenance of Industrial	
	Pluralism	237
9	The Entrenchment and Maintenance of the	
	Anticlassification Order	270



X	Contents	
10	Explaining Order-Affirming and Tension-Managing	
	Judicial Behavior	298
ΙI	Conclusion	312
Bibliography		321
Index		339



Acknowledgments

I am very pleased to be able to acknowledge in print the many individuals who generously offered their time and energy in support of this project over the past several years. First and foremost, I owe a special debt of gratitude to my teachers and advisors in graduate school: Bruce Ackerman, David Mayhew, and Stephen Skowronek. Bruce Ackerman's feedback and encouragement on a seminar paper were the genesis of this book, and he has been generously supportive ever since. David Mayhew read innumerable drafts of this project, and I have benefited from his vast knowledge of American political history and his tireless attention to detail. Stephen Skowronek has devoted more time and energy to this project over the past several years than any student could reasonably expect. He has been a source of continual assistance, and his influence undoubtedly pervades this entire book.

Others who graciously commented on prior drafts of various chapters or who offered encouragement include Rachel Barkow, Jack Beerman, Mitch Berman, Angelica Bernal, Walter Dean Burnham, Ian Farrell, Willy Forbath, Mark Graber, Joel Grossman, Ken Kersch, Sandy Levinson, Eric Patashnik, Danilo Petranovich, Scot Powe, Dan Rodriguez, Steve Teles, and Robert Tsai.

I also owe thanks to colleagues at the University of Oregon for their direct or indirect support on this project, including, among others, Ibrahim Gassama, John Greenman, Michelle McKinley, Michael Moffitt, Jennifer Reynolds, Joan Malmud Rocklin, Suzanne Rowe, and Dan Tichenor. Erick Hoffman provided timely and valuable assistance on the charts and figures in the manuscript. A number of research assistants provided invaluable assistance on this project as well: Lauren Boyd,



xii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-05753-1 - Recalibrating Reform: The Limits of Political Change Stuart Chinn Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

Linda Bruce, Gabe Chase, Sally Claycomb, Karianne Conway, Beth Ford, Sarah Garrott, Dustin Littrell, David Mintz, Carrie Murray, Jennifer Nicholls, and Jacqueline Quarré. I owe thanks to Chris Tomlins and Robert Dreesen at Cambridge University Press for their interest in this project, and for shepherding it through the publication process.

I am grateful to Margaret Hallock and the Wayne Morse Center at the University of Oregon for providing me with a timely semester-long research leave during the course of this project. I am also grateful to the Donald Walker–Norman Wiener Research fund for financial assistance.

Some material in this book is drawn from the work previously published in, and used here by permission from: *The Journal of Law* 1, no. 1 (2011): 95–184; *Law & Social Inquiry* 37, no. 3 (Summer 2012): 535–64; Jeffrey A. Jenkins and Eric M. Patashnik, eds., *Living Legislation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press 2012), 197–220 (© 2012 by The University of Chicago).

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org