Comparative Counter-Terrorism Law

Terrorism law is as international as it is regionally distinct and as difficult to define as it is essential to address. Given recent pressures to harmonize terrorism laws from international organizations such as the United Nations Security Council, the Financial Action Task Force, and the Council of Europe, this book presents readers with an up-to-date assessment of terrorism law across the globe. Covering twenty-two jurisdictions across six continents, the common framework used for each chapter facilitates national comparisons of a range of laws, including relevant criminal, administrative, financial, secrecy, and military laws. Recognizing that similar laws may yield different outcomes when transplanted into new contexts, priority of place is given to examples of real-world application.

Including an extensive introduction to the field as well as a detailed final chapter on common themes and future challenges, this book will help establish comparative counter-terrorism law as an emerging discipline crossing traditional boundaries in legal scholarship.

Kent Roach is a professor of law at the University of Toronto. He served as General Reporter on counter-terrorism law at the XIX Congress on Comparative Law as well as Director of Research for the Air India bombing inquiry. His most recent book, The 9/11 Effect: Comparative Counter-Terrorism (2011), was co-recipient of the Mundell Medal for contributions to legal writing.
Comparative Counter-Terrorism Law

Edited by

KENT ROACH
University of Toronto
Contents

Notes on Contributors page ix
Acknowledgments xvii

1 COMPARATIVE COUNTER-TERRORISM LAW COMES OF AGE 1
   Kent Roach

PART ONE: NORTH AMERICA

2 The United States 49
   Sudha N. Setty

3 Canada 78
   Robert Diab

PART TWO: SOUTH AMERICA

4 Colombia 115
   Luz E. Nagle

5 Brazil 146
   Rodrigo de Souza Costa

PART THREE: EUROPE

6 The United Kingdom 167
   Keith Syrett

7 Switzerland 203
   Bertrand Perrin and Julien Gafner
Contents

8 Belgium
Anne Weyembergh and Céline Cocq

9 Italy
Sabrina Praduroux

10 Spain
Maria Ángeles Rueda and Miguel Ángel Boldova

11 Portugal
José Francisco de Faria Costa

12 Greece
Georgios Triantafyllou

13 Croatia
Marissabell Škorić

14 Slovenia
Vasilka Sancin and Maša Kovič Dine

15 Poland
Piotr Daranowski

16 The Czech Republic
Veronika Bříková

17 Romania
Raluca-Ioana Mocanu and George Antoniu

PART FOUR: MIDDLE EAST AND AFRICA

18 Israel
Shiri Krebs

19 South Africa
Jamil Ddamulira Mujuzi

PART FIVE: ASIA AND AUSTRALIA

20 Japan
Takeyoshi Imai
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Li Zhe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eugene K. B. Tan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fergal Davis, Nicola McGarrity and George Williams</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>THEMATIC CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE CHALLENGES</td>
<td>683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kent Roach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>789</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes on Contributors

Kent Roach, FRSC, holds the Prichard Wilson Chair in Law and Public Policy at the University of Toronto. He is the author of twelve books, including The 9/11 Effect: Comparative Counter-Terrorism, published by Cambridge University Press in 2011 and co-winner of the 2012 Mundell Medal. He has published widely on counter-terrorism matters in Australia, Canada, Hong Kong, Singapore, Sweden, the United Kingdom, and the United States and served as General Reporter on Counter-Terrorism Law at the XIV Comparative Law Conference in Vienna in July 2014. He served on the research advisory committee of the Commission of Inquiry into the Actions of Canadian Officials in Relation to Maher Arar from 2004 to 2006 and as Director of Research for the Commission of Inquiry into the Bombing of Air India Flight 182 from 2006 to 2010. In 2013, he was one of four academics awarded a Trudeau Fellowship for his academic and policy contributions. With Craig Forcese, he has analyzed Canada’s current counter-terrorism bills at www.antiterrorlaw.ca.

George Antoniu (Romania) was University Professor and editor-in-chief of the Revue de Droit Pénal. His many publications include La culpabilité pénale, IIe édition (Éditions de l’Académie, Bucharest, 2003) and La réforme pénale (a collaboration) (Éditions de l’Académie, Bucharest, 2003). Professor Antoniu passed away in August 2014.

Veronika Bílková (the Czech Republic) is a Research Fellow at the Institute of International Relations in Prague, a lecturer in international law at the Law Faculty of the Charles University in Prague, and a member of the European Commission on Democracy Through Law (Venice Commission) on behalf of the Czech Republic. Graduated from the Law and Philosophical Faculties of the Charles University (JUDr., PhDr., Ph.D.) and from the European Master’s Degree in Human Rights and Democratization (E.MA), she holds the diploma in international law from the University of Cambridge. Bílková’s work focuses on international law (especially the
use of force, international humanitarian law, international criminal law, and human rights) and international relations (mainly security topics and the United Nations).

Miguel Ángel Boldova (Spain) has been Professor (Catedrático) of Criminal Law at the University of Zaragoza (Spain) since 2010. His main research interests include the study of the fundamental problems of the general part of criminal law, the system of legal consequences of crime, juvenile delinquency, and corporate criminal liability, as well as the study of various offenses, including falsification of documents and human trafficking. He is the principal investigator of a research team funded by the government of Aragon and the University of Zaragoza.

Céline Cocq (Belgium) has obtained a law degree (2005), a master's degree in international humanitarian law (2010), and two university diplomas in criminology and criminal studies (2005 and 2011), and graduated with an L.L.M. in international public law (2012) from the Center of International Law (Université Libre de Bruxelles, Belgium). She is currently a Ph.D. researcher at the Legal Section of the Institut d’Études Européennes and a researcher on the SURVEILLE project studying surveillance technologies of different legal frameworks. Her research focuses mainly on substantive criminal law and criminal procedure, dealing with serious crime, at national and regional levels, including the European Union and the Association of South East Asian Nations, in order to conduct comparative analysis within and between regional organizations.

Piotr Daranowski (Poland) is Chair of International Public Law and International Relations at the University of Lodz in Poland. He is the author of the monograph *International Protection of Civil and Political Rights in statu nascendi – The International Pact of Human and Political Rights* (1993), which received an award for the best *habilitationsschrift* monograph from the Manfred Lachs Foundation (1994).

Fergal Davis (Australia) is a senior lecturer and member of the Australian Research Council Laureate Project: Anti-Terror Laws and the Democratic Challenge in the Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law in the University of New South Wales. He is well published in the area of terrorism and democracy, including in major international journals such as the *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies* and *POLITICS*.

José Francisco de Faria Costa (Portugal) is Chair Professor of Criminal Law at the College of Law of Coimbra University, where he teaches doctorate, master, postgraduate, and degree courses. He also serves currently as president of the Institute for Economical and European Criminal Law, as a designated member of the Supreme Judicial Council, and as an elected member of the General Council.
Rodrigo de Souza Costa (Brazil) is a criminal law professor at the University of the State of Rio de Janeiro in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. He is also Deputy Secretary General of the Brazilian group of the International Association of Penal Law. He coordinates the research group Criminal Law and Constitution, which is primarily focused in international and comparative criminal law and violence against women.

Robert Diab (Canada) is an assistant professor in the Faculty of Law at Thompson Rivers University in British Columbia. He holds a Ph.D., LL.M, and LLB from the University of British Columbia and is the author of *Guantanamo North, Terrorism and the Administration of Justice in Canada* (2009). His areas of interest include counter-terror law, public order policing, and criminal law.

Maša Ković Dine (Slovenia) is a Ph.D. candidate and teaching assistant at the Chair of International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Ljubljana. After receiving her graduate law degree in Slovenia, she obtained her LL.M. degree from the Faculty of Law at the University of Toronto and worked at the University of Toronto G8 Research Group, analyzing G8 countries' compliance with their summit commitments. Her research interests include cyber security and responsibility to protect.

Julien Gafner (Switzerland) is an attorney at law and partner in the law firm LEGENTIS Avocats (previously named Trivelli, Pelot, Sutter, Hahn, Genillod & Gafner) in Lausanne. Her publications include *Blanchiment d’argent, financement du terrorisme et nouvelles technologies*, contribution presented and edited within the seminar *E-banking et E-trading* held on February 15, 2006, by the Centre du Droit de l’Entreprise at the University of Lausanne.

Takeyoshi Imai (Japan) is a professor of criminal law and attorney at law at the Graduate School of Law in Hosei University in Japan. He serves as a member of the Justice Ministry’s Legislative Council Criminal Law Subcommittee and is the Japanese representative (examiner) to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development Working Group on Bribery, as well as the Japanese representative to the International Institute of Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences of the United Nations. He has been a visiting scholar at the universities of Cambridge and Geneva.
Shiri Krebs (Israel) is an international lawyer from Israel, specializing in international humanitarian law (law of war) and terrorism. From 2005 to 2010, she worked at the Israeli Supreme Court, where she served as legal advisor on international law matters in the chief justice’s chambers. After leaving the Supreme Court, Krebs joined the Israeli Democracy Institute as a researcher, working on “Terrorism and Democracy” projects. She is completing her doctoral dissertation at Stanford Law School, and her publications include “Lifting the Veil of Secrecy: Judicial Review of Administrative Detentions in the Israeli Supreme Court,” 45 *Vanderbilt Transnational Law Journal* 639–703 (2012). This article is an empirical analysis of preventive detention cases and won the Steven M. Block Civil Liberties Award.

Nicola McGarrity (Australia) is a lecturer and member of the Australian Research Council Laureate Project: Anti-Terror Laws and the Democratic Challenge in the Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law in the University of New South Wales. McGarrity’s research interests relate to the intersection of public and criminal law. She has published extensively in Australian and international journals on the human rights implications of antiterrorism law and policy and, in particular, the prosecution of suspected terrorists in Australia. She is a coeditor (with Andrew Lynch and George Williams) of *Counter-Terrorism and Beyond: The Culture of Law and Justice after 9/11* (2010). McGarrity has also practiced as a barrister in Australia in the fields of administrative, constitutional, and antiterrorism law.

Raluca-Ioana Mocanu (Romania) is Junior Lecturer on Criminal Law, Special Part, Department of Criminal Law and Criminology, Faculty of Law, at the University of Bucharest in Romania. She received her Ph.D. in law in 2010 for writing “Terrorism: Legal Aspects of National and International Criminal Law,” under the direction of Professor Constantin Mitache, Ph.D. Faculty of Law, University of Bucharest. Her publications include *Drug Trafficking and Abuse: Criminal Cases*, Hamangiu Ed. (2007).

Jamil Ddamulira Mujuzi (South Africa) is an associate professor of law in the Faculty of Law at the University of the Western Cape, Cape Town, South Africa. He has published more than eighty articles and chapters in books on various aspects of criminal law, criminal justice, and human rights that have appeared in some of the most prestigious peer-reviewed law journals in Africa, Asia, Europe, and North America. Some of his articles have been cited by the South African Supreme Court of Appeal and High Court. His publications have also been cited by human rights and international criminal law scholars in books, articles, and reports published in languages such as English, French, Italian, Czech, Danish, and Spanish. His article was also cited in the 2010 *United Nations Secretary General’s Report on the Death
Notes on Contributors

Penalty, E/2010/10, December 28, 2009. Mujuzi is the editor-in-chief of the Faculty of Law’s journal, Law, Democracy and Development.

Luz E. Nagle (Colombia) is a professor of law at Stetson University College of Law, where she specializes in international law, international criminal law, and national security law. Nagle’s scholarship probes the realities of law, society, transborder crime, and armed conflict in the Americas. Her distinguished career includes having been a judge in Medellín, Colombia, during the so-called War on Drugs in the 1980s; clerking for the Supreme Court of Virginia; and pursuing software pirates as a member of Microsoft Corporation’s Latin America Copyright Enforcement Practice. Nagle has participated in rule of law, judicial reform, and hemispheric security projects sponsored by the U.S. departments of Defense, Justice, and State throughout Latin America, and she is a regular presenter on various topics of international law and the rule of law for the State Department’s Distinguished Foreign Visitors’ Program. She is an El Centro Fellow of the Small Wars Foundation and an external researcher in the Strategic Studies Institute of the U.S. Army War College. An elected member of several learned legal societies, including the American Law Institute, Nagle currently sits on the International Bar Association’s Legal Practice Division Council. Nagle holds an LL.D. from the Universidad Pontificia Bolivariana, her J.D. from the College of William & Mary, an LL.M. in international law and an M.A. in Latin American studies from the University of California at Los Angeles, and two certifications in national security law from the Center for National Security Law at the University of Virginia School of Law.

Bertrand Perrin (Switzerland) is a professor of criminal law, University of Fribourg, Switzerland. He holds a doctor of law degree, is an attorney at law, and holds an M.A. in economics. He received his Doctor of Law degree from the University of Fribourg (summa cum laude) in 2008 and won the Joseph Vigener Award in 2010. His publications include Isabelle Augsburger-Bucheli and Bertrand Perrin (dir.), Les enjeux juridiques du secret bancaire (2010); Étienne Blais and Bertrand Perrin (dir.), La lutte contre la criminalité économique: réponses interdisciplinaires à un défi global (2010); and “L’incrimination du financement du terrorisme en droits canadien et Suisse” (2012) 42 Revue générale de droit (Ottawa) 213.

Sabrina Praduorous (Italy) is Research Fellow at the University of Torino. She holds a Ph.D. in comparative law from the University of Palermo, and in May 2012 she obtained a Ph.D. in European law from the University of Helsinki. She has spent training and working periods at both the European Court of Human Rights in Strasbourg and the European Agency for Fundamental Rights in Vienna. Her main
fields of interest concern human rights law, constitutional law, and European law, and much of her work is comparative and interdisciplinary.

Maria Ángeles Rueda (Spain) is Profesor Titular on Criminal Law at the University of Zaragoza and accredited Professor (Catedrática) since 2011. Rueda has carried out her teaching activity at the University of Zaragoza since the academic year 1993–1994. She has conducted research in organized crime, cyber crime, and the protection of privacy. Rueda has taken part in different research projects sponsored by the Spanish Ministry of Science and Education and is a member of the consolidated research group of the Autonomous Community of Aragon and of the University of Zaragoza, called Grupo de Estudios Penales.

Vasilka Sancin (Slovenia) is an assistant professor of public international law at the Faculty of Law, the University of Ljubljana, and a researcher at the Institute for Comparative Law at the same faculty. She is also a director of the Centre for International and Business Law. Sancin is a member of the Nuclear Weapons, Non-proliferation and Contemporary International Law Committee of the International Law Association, a member of the Chaudfontaine Group researching legal regulation of the export of dual-use items; she is also a member of the International Nuclear Law Association. She is an author of numerous articles and books on the area of international law.

Sudha N. Setty (The United States) is the associate dean for faculty development and intellectual life and a professor of law at Western New England University School of Law in Springfield, Massachusetts. She teaches law and terrorism, comparative constitutional law, constitutional law, civil rights, and contracts, and she was awarded the Catherine J. Jones Professor of the Year Award in 2009. Her scholarly work focuses on comparative analysis of separation of powers, rule of law, and national security issues. Her most recent article, “National Security Interest Convergence,” was published in the Harvard National Security Journal. She was a visiting professor at the University of Connecticut School of Law in 2011. Prior to joining the faculty of Western New England in 2006, Setty served as defense counsel in civil, regulatory, and criminal matters involving national security issues, including terrorism financing investigations and lawsuits, and a pro bono matter challenging sentencing guidelines for those convicted of terrorist acts. Setty graduated as a Harlan Fiske Stone Scholar from Columbia Law School and received her A.B. in history (concentration in comparative civil rights) with honors from Stanford University.

Marissabell Škorić (Croatia) graduated from the Faculty of Law, the University of Rijeka, in December 1995. In 2000, she was conferred a master of law at the Faculty of Law, Zagreb University. She defended her doctoral dissertation at the Faculty of Law University of Zagreb in 2005, on the topic “The Prosecutor in
International Criminal Tribunals.” She has published articles in internationally recognized publications and has presented papers at several international scientific conferences. Currently she works as an assistant professor at the Faculty of Law, Department of Criminal Law, University of Rijeka. Her main scientific and research interests are concerned with criminal law.

Keith Syrett (The United Kingdom) joined Cardiff Law School as Professor of Public Health Law in September 2012, having previously worked at the universities of East Anglia and Bristol. He has an LL.B. degree in jurisprudence from Oxford University, an M.A. in international relations from Yale University, and a Ph.D. in government from the London School of Economics. He is also a solicitor of the Supreme Court of England and Wales, having trained with Clifford Chance LLP. His publications include Law, Legitimacy and the Rationing of Health Care (2007) and The Foundations of Public Law: Principles and Problems of Power in the British Constitution (2011).

Eugene K. B. Tan (Singapore) is an assistant law professor at the School of Law, Singapore Management University. He is a graduate of the National University of Singapore, the London School of Economics and Political Science, and Stanford University, where he was a Fulbright Fellow. His interdisciplinary research interests include the mutual interaction of law and public policy, the regulation of ethnic conflict, and the government and politics of Singapore. He has published in internationally refereed journals, including the Australian Journal of Asian Law, China Quarterly, Citizenship Studies, Ethnic and Racial Studies, Ethnopolitics, the Hong Kong Law Journal, the Israel Law Review, the Singapore Year Book of International Law, and Terrorism and Political Violence. Tan is completing a book-length manuscript on the management of ethnic relations in Singapore. He also writes a regular column on law, society, and politics for a Singapore newspaper. In February 2012, he was appointed a nominated member of parliament.

Georgios Triantafyllou (Greece) is Assistant Professor of Criminal Law and Criminal Procedure at the School of Law, the University of Athens. He has published in the areas of criminal law, criminal procedure, and international criminal law. A member of the Athens Bar Association, Triantafyllou practices as defense counsel in all fields of criminal litigation.

Anne Weyembergh (Belgium) is Professor at the Université Libre de Bruxelles (ULB) and President of the Institute for European Studies of the ULB. She founded and coordinates the European Criminal Law Academic Network. Weyembergh is the coordinator of the ULB team on European criminal law and is co-coordinator of the research team RECL (University of Brussels – European Criminal Law), which is common to ULB and Vrij Universiteit Brussel. She has published numerous
scientific articles and coedited several collective books in the field of EU criminal law. Weyembergh has presented at many conferences in Belgium and abroad and given lectures in various countries. She is one of the chief editors of the New Journal of European Criminal Law.

George Williams (Australia) is Anthony Mason Professor, Scientia Professor, and Foundation Director of the Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law at the Faculty of Law, the University of New South Wales. As an Australian Research Council Laureate Fellow, he is engaged in a five-year international project on antiterror laws and democracy. Williams has written and edited thirty-one books, including Australian Constitutional Law and Theory and The Oxford Companion to the High Court of Australia. Williams was made an Officer of the Order of Australia in 2011 “For distinguished service to the law in the fields of anti-terrorism, human rights and constitutional law as an academic, author, adviser and public commentator.”

Li Zhe (China) is an assistant professor of criminal law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Macau (UM). She finished her Ph.D. degree at China University of Political Science and Law in July 2005, and her Ph.D. thesis was published by the Peking University Press in 2008; she was awarded as the Second-Grade Award on Excellent Monographs of Young and Middle-Aged Scholars by the Chinese Criminal Law Society in 2009. Before joining UM, she worked as a Research Fellow in the Policy Branch of the Supreme People’s Procuratorate of P.R. China for five years. Her publications include one monograph, four coauthored monographs, one edited book, chapters in sixteen books, and more than forty papers in journals and edited books.
Acknowledgments

I wish to thank the organizers of the XIX International Congress on Comparative Law held in Vienna in July 2014 for selecting comparative counter-terrorism law as a topic and for giving me the great privilege of serving as General Reporter on the topic. I thank all the national reporters for their hard work on their reports and subsequently on their chapters and for their helpful comments on my general report. I also thank Professor Ulrich Sieber, Director of the Max Planck Institute for Foreign and International Criminal Law in Freiburg, Germany, for chairing the session in Vienna and for his wise comments.

My work on this project has been made possible by the support of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and in particular by the excellent organizational work of my assistant Nancy Bueler and by the dedicated and creative research assistance of the staff of the Bora Laskin Law Library. My work has also been greatly assisted by the generous funding and other support provided by the Pierre Elliott Trudeau Foundation by way of the award to me of a 2013 Trudeau Fellowship.

Kent Roach
April 2015