

CONTENTS

Preface xxiii
Table of cases xxvi
Table of statutes xxxii
List of abbreviations xxxv

1 Prerogative and Reserve Powers 1

Introduction 1

Prerogative powers and reserve powers 4

 The abrogation of prerogative and reserve powers 7

The classification of the reserve powers 10

The principle of the rule of law 11

The principle of the separation of powers 12

The principle of necessity 13

The principle of representative government 15

The principle of responsible government 15

 Ministers must be responsible to Parliament 16

 There must always be a government in place 16

 The head of state acts upon the advice of responsible ministers 17

 Must ministerial responsibility be taken for exercises of the reserve powers? 20

Conventions 23

 The sources of conventions 23

 The test for a convention 26

 The flexibility of conventions 27

 The value of conventions and precedents 28

 Relevant conventions 29

Lack of use does not mean the reserve powers have ceased to exist 30

The head of state as guardian of the Constitution 35

The codification of reserve powers 37

2 Advice to and from the Head of State 44

Responsible government and advice 44

Express provisions concerning acting on advice	44
Deeming a head of state to have acted according to advice	46
Power to request the reconsideration of advice	47
When receiving advice is impracticable	48
The effect of advice from responsible ministers	49
The different types of 'advice'	51
Formal binding advice	53
Advice by ministers	53
Advice by the Houses of Parliament	54
Advice by judicial bodies	54
Advice by the Attorney-General	55
Informal non-binding advice	57
The need for legal and constitutional advice	57
Advice on factual and political matters – Party elders and party caucuses	59
Advice by the Solicitor-General	61
Advice by judges	65
Advice by former office-holders	71
Advice by academics and practitioners	72
Sources of information upon which an exercise of discretion may be based	75
Uncertainty as to who should advise the head of state	76
Conflicting advice	76
Advice after a coup d'état or revolution	77
Rhodesia 1965	79
Sierra Leone 1967	82
Grenada 1979 and 1983	83
Fiji 1987	86
Acting without advice	90
The rights to be consulted, encourage and warn	92
Bagehot's formulation and its subsequent variation	93
The right to be consulted and informed	95
The right to encourage and warn	97
The right to advise	105
The right to delay acting on advice	107
A duty to counsel, encourage, warn and advocate policy positions?	108
The fine line between rejection of advice and persuasion to drop advice	109
3 Appointment of the Chief Minister	115
Commission to form a government	115
Reserve power of appointment	116
Advice by the outgoing chief minister	118

CONTENTS

xi

United Kingdom	120
Canada	126
New Zealand	126
India	127
Australia	128
Advice when the chief minister considers no one else can form a stable government	129
The resignation and recommissioning of a chief minister to allow a new ministry	130
Advice by other Members of Parliament	133
The role of the parliamentary party in advising on a new party leader	133
Consultation with elder statesmen and others	136
The role of the lower House in advising upon who should be chief minister	137
Express provisions and conventions regulating appointment of the chief minister	138
The application of discretion according to convention	138
The formalisation or codification of convention	142
Leaving the choice of chief minister to the lower House of Parliament	145
Caretaker and interim ministries	148
No appointment until there is a vacancy	150
The benefits of incumbency	151
Overriding the benefits of incumbency	155
Whether the benefits of incumbency survive a change in leader	157
No new appointment if no one holds the confidence of the House	161
Appointment after dismissal of chief minister who held the confidence of the House	162
Convention regarding who to call upon to form a government	162
Disputed rule no 1 – That the head of state must call upon the Leader of the Opposition to form a government	163
Disputed rule no 2 – That the head of state must call upon the leader of the party with the largest number of seats to form a government	163
Disputed rule no 3 – That the head of state must call upon the person who moved the successful no-confidence motion to form a government	168
The overriding convention	168
How to assess who is most likely to command the confidence of the House	169
Status of confidence and supply agreements	173
Factors that the head of state should or should not take into account in calling on a person to form a government	174
Proportion of the vote v seats in the lower House	174

Misleading statements during the election campaign	176
A constructive vote of confidence by the lower House	179
Likely stability of a government	181
Appointment where an election results in a hung Parliament	183
Newfoundland 1971–2	183
Fiji 1977	185
Tasmania 2010	189
Mid-term appointment of a chief minister in a minority government	191
Ceylon 1952	191
Australia 2013	192
Appointment of a chief minister leading a coalition	193
Appointment of a person who can secure the passage of supply	194
Appointment after the sudden death of a chief minister	197
Appointment after the chief minister becomes disqualified from office	202
Conditions on appointments	203
Appointment of a chief minister who does not hold a seat in the lower House	211
Appointment of a chief minister from outside Parliament	212
Appointment of a chief minister who sits in the upper House	218
Appointment of a chief minister while Parliament is dissolved	220
Appointment of a chief minister after Parliament has been abolished	221
Judicial challenges to appointment of a chief minister	222
Vanuatu	222
Solomon Islands	224
Nauru	224
Malaysia – State of Sabah	225
India – State of Assam	226
Appointment and removal of other ministers	227
4 Dismissal of Governments	232
Introduction	232
Dismissal, disqualification and removal	232
Disqualification and incapacity	233
Automatic removal due to loss of confidence	235
Responsibility of a chief minister to resign	237
Positive and negative exercises of power	239
Rejection of the resignation of a Prime Minister	240
Express constitutional provisions that require, permit or limit the dismissal of the chief minister	244
Requirement to dismiss	244
Discretion to dismiss	245

CONTENTS

xiii

Vacation of office after a general election	246
Limitations on dismissal	249
Effect of the resignation, dismissal or death of a chief minister	250
Dismissals, dissolutions and forced resignations	256
Dismissal and the need for an alternative government and dissolution	256
Forced dissolutions amounting to the dismissal of the government	257
Refusal of a dissolution amounting to an effective dismissal	260
Refusal of other advice, causing resignation and dissolution	261
Forced or induced resignations amounting to effective dismissal	262
Grounds for dismissal – Failure to resign after the loss of an election or loss of confidence in the House	265
Failure to resign after loss of an election	266
Failure to resign after defeat on a vote of no-confidence by the lower House	267
Defeat of a caretaker government appointed after dismissal of previous government	269
Temporary loss of confidence	272
Dismissal for lack of confidence when there has been no vote on the floor of the House	274
Dismissal for failure to summon House when confidence is at issue	288
Grounds for dismissal – Loss of support of own party	301
New South Wales 1916	302
Queensland 1987	303
New Zealand 1984	304
Grounds for dismissal – Illegality or corruption	306
Quebec 1891	310
British Columbia 1903	310
Manitoba 1915	311
New South Wales 1932	312
Tasmania 1947	318
British Columbia 1991	318
Grounds for dismissal – Breach of fundamental constitutional principle	320
Quebec 1878	320
Rhodesia 1965	321
Grounds for dismissal – Failure to achieve supply	326
Examples of the fall of governments involving the failure to secure supply	327
Supply and dismissal of governments in Victoria	329
The dismissal of the Australian Whitlam Government 1975	333
The grant of special warrants authorising expenditure	340
Grounds for dismissal – The government is out of step with the people	342

Obligation to warn before dismissing a government	346
Reversal of a dismissal	350
Nigeria – Western Region	352
Malaysia – State of Sarawak	352
Fiji	353
Papua New Guinea	353
5 Dissolution	358
Refusing or forcing a dissolution	358
Constitutional principles and the refusal of dissolutions	359
Responsible government	359
Representative government	360
Who may request a dissolution?	361
The relationship between resignation, dissolution and dismissal	365
Dissolution requested by a caretaker government	365
Must a government resign if refused a dissolution?	367
Express power to refuse a dissolution	369
Implied power to refuse a dissolution	371
The reserve power to refuse a dissolution in the United Kingdom prior to 2011	371
The Lascelles letter about the Sovereign's powers	374
The extension to other Realms of the reserve power to refuse a dissolution	378
The effect of fixed-term Parliaments	378
Factors favouring the grant of a dissolution	379
Refusal of a dissolution where the government holds majority support	380
Must a government justify an early election?	382
Dissolution where a government has lost the confidence of the lower House	385
The King/Byng Affair	388
Should Byng have accepted King's advice to dissolve?	395
Should Byng have granted a dissolution to Meighen or recommissioned King?	399
Newfoundland – Refusal of a dissolution to the Bond Government in 1908	402
Victoria – Refusal of a dissolution to the Bowser Government in 1918	404
New South Wales – Refusal of a dissolution to the Dooley Government in 1921	407
New Zealand – Forecast of action if the Massey Government fell in 1922–3	408
Tasmania – Grant of a dissolution to the Cosgrove Government in 1950	409

CONTENTS

xv

The need to exhaust Parliament of other possible governments	410
Refusal of a dissolution when a vote of no-confidence is pending	413
Refusal of a dissolution where supply is not available to cover the election period	416
New Zealand	416
Newfoundland	417
Victoria	417
Western Australia	419
Western Samoa	419
The importance of securing supply	420
Refusal of a dissolution because the lower House has voted against it	420
Dissolution advised by a chief minister who leads a minority government	423
Refusal of a dissolution to a chief minister who has recently lost an election	425
Request for dissolution before Parliament has sat following an election	426
Defeat upon facing Parliament after an election	430
Defeat some months after the previous election	434
A defeated chief minister is not entitled to a second dissolution	436
Exception – Dissolution if Speaker cannot be elected	437
Exception – Dissolution if no viable government can be formed	440
Refusal of a dissolution to a chief minister who was commissioned to form a government but could not obtain the confidence of Parliament	444
Refusal of a dissolution to a chief minister who has lost the support of his or her party or coalition government	446
South Africa	447
Ceylon	449
Queensland	450
United Kingdom	450
Refusal of a dissolution timed to exploit a leadership change process in the Opposition	451
Refusal of a dissolution during a time of peril	452
Dissolution as a condition of appointment as chief minister	453
Condition imposed upon the making of an appointment – That a dissolution be requested	454
Condition imposed upon acceptance of the office of chief minister – That a dissolution be granted	454
Forecasts and promises of future dissolutions	456
Conditions and assurances required before a dissolution is granted	458
Supply	458
Other conditions or assurances	460
Litigation to overturn a dissolution	462
Vanuatu	464

Nepal	465
India	469
Pakistan	469
Litigation to force a dissolution	470
Express restrictions upon the grant of dissolutions	471
Effect of fixed-term Parliaments on reserve powers concerning dissolutions	472
United Kingdom	472
Australia	474
Canada	476
Impact upon other conventions and reserve powers	479
Forced dissolutions and a positive power to dissolve Parliament without ministerial advice	480
Forceful or moral persuasion to request a dissolution	481
Forced dissolution arising from the dismissal of a government	482
Is there a positive reserve power to dissolve Parliament without advice?	483
The doctrine of necessity as a source of a positive discretion to dissolve	486
The rule of law as a source of a positive discretion to dissolve	491
Responsible government as a source of a positive power to dissolve	492
Representative government as a source of a positive power to dissolve	495
Express discretion or requirement to dissolve Parliament without ministerial advice	496
The practicalities of dissolving Parliament without ministerial advice	500
6 Caretaker Conventions	502
Caretaker conventions and constitutional principle	502
The development of the caretaker conventions	504
The obligation of a government to remain in office pending the appointment of a new government	505
Express constitutional provisions regarding the continuation of government	508
History of recognition of caretaker governments and conventions	509
Refusal to make significant appointments during the caretaker period	509
The requirement that caretaker governments only undertake routine government business	511
Use of the terminology of 'caretaker' and 'purdah'	513
The formalisation of the caretaker conventions	515
Shift of emphasis from ministerial constraint to public service rules	518

CONTENTS

xvii

Periods in which caretaker conventions apply	519
Pre-election caretaker period	519
Post-election caretaker period	522
Period after a mid-term loss of confidence	526
Transition period between chief ministers of the same party	528
Application of caretaker conventions	529
The content of caretaker conventions	530
Appointments	531
Major contracts and policy decisions	533
Consultation with the Opposition	535
Allowing the Opposition to consult with public servants	535
Government advertising and the independence of the public service	536
Status of the caretaker conventions	537
Whether there is a reserve power to reject or defer advice that breaches the caretaker conventions	539
Examples of refusals to act upon advice that breaches the caretaker conventions	544
When the head of state may enforce the caretaker conventions	546
No obligation on a head of state to enforce the caretaker conventions	546
Publicity of breach may be sufficient to provide a political remedy	547
Appointment of ministers during a caretaker period	548
7 Summoning Parliament	550
When Parliament is summoned	550
The power to summon Parliament after its dissolution or prorogation	550
Maximum period between sessions of Parliament	551
Summoning of Parliament after an election	552
Summoning Parliament during an emergency	553
Recalling a House that has been adjourned	555
Is the power to summon Parliament a reserve power?	555
Express reserve power to summon Parliament	556
Convention and reserve powers to summon Parliament	558
India	559
New Zealand	560
Australia	562
Canada	564
Solomon Islands	567
Tuvalu	571
The summoning of Parliament by order of the courts	577
Constitutional principles and a reserve power to summon Parliament	581
The principle of the rule of law	581

	The principles of responsible and representative government	582
	The doctrine of necessity	583
	Conclusion	583
8	Prorogation	584
	Prorogation and its consequences	584
	Express requirements concerning prorogation and sessions of Parliament	586
	Is prorogation a reserve power?	586
	The rights to warn and encourage	591
	Prorogation in breach of constitutional requirements	592
	Prorogation when the Government does not hold the confidence of the lower House	592
	Prorogation at a time when holding an election would be undesirable	595
	Prorogation where no other responsible government can be formed	596
	Prorogation where there is a temporary loss of confidence	596
	Prorogation where the alternative government is likely to be short-lived	598
	Prorogation where a motion of no-confidence is not yet before the House	603
	Prorogation after the dismissal of a government	604
	Prorogation when supply is about to run out	605
	Prorogation to disqualify absent members or end pairing arrangements	606
	Prorogation to cause a warrant of imprisonment for contempt to lapse	608
	Prorogation to prevent parliamentary scrutiny	609
	Prorogation to terminate parliamentary inquiries	610
	Prorogation to prevent the tabling of reports	612
	Prorogation to terminate orders for the production of documents	612
	Prorogation to prevent the House from sitting	613
	Prorogation contrary to a resolution of the House	613
	Prorogation in order to recall the House to make it sit	614
9	Royal Assent	616
	Assent to legislation	616
	The relevant constitutional principles	617
	Is the grant of royal assent a legislative or executive act?	618
	Textual indicators	619
	Judicial observations	621
	Academic views on the prevailing principle	622
	Practice and procedure	627

CONTENTS

xix

Is there a reserve power to refuse assent?	633
Refusal of assent in the United Kingdom – Has the power fallen into desuetude?	633
Express constitutional provisions concerning assent	635
Discretion regarding assent in the older Realms	637
Reform of discretionary power	641
Refusal of assent on ministerial advice	643
Refusal of assent due to error in bill	643
Refusal of assent on ministerial advice to a bill passed against the wishes of the government	645
Refusal of assent to a bill passed under a previous government without an intervening dissolution	647
Delay in the grant of assent	649
Withdrawal of assent once given	651
Refusal of assent to a bill on the ground of illegality or invalidity	652
Referral of bills to a court to test constitutional validity	652
Refusal of assent on constitutional grounds where it has not been tested in a court	655
Failure to meet mandatory procedural requirements	660
Refusal of assent to a bill that subverts representative democracy or fundamental rights	664
Refusal of assent to a bill that subverts the system of representative democracy	665
Refusal of assent to a bill that affects fundamental human rights	668
Refusal of assent because of a lack of a mandate	671
Refusal of assent to a bill so as to avert violence or a national disaster	672
Refusal of assent to a bill due to the wishes of the head of state	672
Refusal of assent because of personal objection to the bill	672
Refusal of assent to a bill that is contrary to the public will	674
Refusal of assent or consent to bills affecting the rights, powers or interests of the head of state	677
Consent or refusal of consent to bills affecting royal prerogatives and interests	680
Refusal of assent v dismissal of Ministers or dissolution	683
Justiciability of withholding of assent	684
The power to suggest amendments to a bill	686
Consequences of the refusal of assent	689
10 The Rejection of Advice to Act Illegally or Unconstitutionally	691
The head of state as the guarantor of legality	691
The conflicting principles that apply to illegal or unconstitutional advice	693

How such a conflict is usually resolved in practice	694
Reference to a court	695
Rejection of advice on the ground that acting on it would involve a breach of the law	696
The application of the rule of law to the head of state	696
Who may determine illegality?	698
Illegality and the Lang dismissal	700
Kerr's views on illegality	704
Illegality in New Zealand	706
Illegality in Canada	707
Advice that is inconsistent with a judicial decision	709
Reconciliation of the constitutional principles	714
Rejection of advice on the ground that it is unconstitutional	715
Rejection of advice on the ground that the chief minister has no jurisdiction or power to give it	720
Rejection of advice on the ground that a matter of constitutional principle is involved and the government has no mandate	722
Rejection of advice to swamp the Legislative Council of New South Wales	723
Canada and unilateral constitutional reform	726
Judges as vice-regal officers	727
Conclusion	730
11 Appointment and Dismissal of Vice-Regal Officers	731
The head of state – Election and succession	731
The status of a vice-regal officer – Head of state or delegate of the Sovereign?	734
The respective powers of the Sovereign and vice-regal representatives	739
Appointment and dismissal of vice-regal officers pre-1930	741
The 1926 and 1930 Imperial Conferences	743
The appointment of the Governor-General of Australia in 1930	745
Irish Free State 1932 – Removal and appointment of the Governor-General in 1932	746
The removal of James McNeill as Governor-General	748
Whether the offices of Governor-General and President could be held simultaneously	751
The Acting Governor-General and the Oath of Allegiance	753
Appointment of a new Governor-General	757
The post-1930 convention for the appointment of vice-regal officers	758
Canada 1935 – Appointment of a new Governor General	761
Fiji 1941 – The fine line between forced resignation and recall	762
Pakistan 1953 – The failed attempt to remove the Governor-General	762

CONTENTS

xxi

Ceylon 1962 – The removal of the Governor-General	764	
Western Region of Nigeria 1962 – The removal of the Governor		766
Dismissal of the Premier	766	
Removal of the Governor	767	
The Privy Council's decision	770	
Rhodesia 1965 – Whether the Governor should resign or remain		773
Sierra Leone 1967 – Removal of the Governor	775	
St Kitts 1969 – Resignation of the Governor	780	
Grenada 1974 – Removal or resignation of the Governor	782	
Queensland 1975 – The aborted removal of a State Governor		785
St Lucia 1980 – Resignation of the Governor-General	787	
St Lucia 1981–2 – Removal of the Governor-General	792	
St Kitts 1981 – Removal of the Governor	796	
Victoria 1985 – Resignation of the Governor	803	
Fiji 1987 – Resignation of the last Governor-General	805	
Papua New Guinea 1991 – Resignation of the Governor-General	806	
Tuvalu 1993 – Replacement and removal of Governors-General		807
Sir Toaripi Lauti's replacement	808	
Sir Tomu Sione's removal	809	
St Lucia 1997 – Resignation of the Governor-General	810	
Australia 2003 – Resignation of the Governor-General	811	
Tasmania 2004 – Resignation of the Governor	813	
Papua New Guinea 2003–4 – Invalid appointment of Governor-General	815	
Papua New Guinea 2010 – Invalid reappointment of Governor-General	815	
Papua New Guinea 2011 – Suspension of the Governor-General		816
Tuvalu 2013 – Attempt to remove Governor-General overtaken by events	817	
Antigua and Barbuda 2014 – Resignation of the Governor-General	819	
St Kitts 2015 – Resignation trumped by removal from office	820	
Removal by way of replacement once initial term has expired	821	
Does the Queen have a reserve power to reject advice to dismiss a Governor-General?	823	
Rejection of advice at the informal stage	828	
Tactical delay as means of effectively refusing advice	829	
Tactical delay in the appointment of a new Governor-General		833
Other methods of appointment of the Governor-General	834	
Canadian Advisory Committee on Appointments	834	
Approval by the Opposition	835	

xxii	CONTENTS
	Appointment of Governor-General by outgoing Governor-General 836
	Qualification and disqualification of Governors-General 838
	Elected Governors-General 841
	Appointment of a directly elected Governor-General 841
	Appointment of an indirectly elected Governor-General 842
	Term of office 844
	Dismissal from office 844
	Deputies and Administrators 846
	Abdication, resignation and the termination of Crowns 850
	Abdication by the Sovereign 851
	Resignation or abandonment of office by vice-regal officers 853
	Termination of the Sovereign’s role in a Realm 856
	<i>Index</i> 858