## CONTENTS

Preface xxiii  
Table of cases xxvi  
Table of statutes xxxii  
List of abbreviations xxxv  

1 Prerogative and Reserve Powers 1  
   Introduction 1  
   Prerogative powers and reserve powers 4  
      The abrogation of prerogative and reserve powers 7  
   The classification of the reserve powers 10  
   The principle of the rule of law 11  
   The principle of the separation of powers 12  
   The principle of necessity 13  
   The principle of representative government 15  
   The principle of responsible government 15  
      Ministers must be responsible to Parliament 16  
      There must always be a government in place 16  
      The head of state acts upon the advice of responsible ministers 17  
      Must ministerial responsibility be taken for exercises of the reserve powers? 20  
   Conventions 23  
      The sources of conventions 23  
      The test for a convention 26  
      The flexibility of conventions 27  
      The value of conventions and precedents 28  
      Relevant conventions 29  
   Lack of use does not mean the reserve powers have ceased to exist 30  
   The head of state as guardian of the Constitution 35  
   The codification of reserve powers 37  

2 Advice to and from the Head of State 44  
   Responsible government and advice 44
## CONTENTS

Express provisions concerning acting on advice 44
- Deeming a head of state to have acted according to advice 46
- Power to request the reconsideration of advice 47
- When receiving advice is impracticable 48

The effect of advice from responsible ministers 49

The different types of ‘advice’ 51
- Formal binding advice 53
  - Advice by ministers 53
  - Advice by the Houses of Parliament 54
  - Advice by judicial bodies 54
  - Advice by the Attorney-General 55
- Informal non-binding advice 57
  - The need for legal and constitutional advice 57
  - Advice on factual and political matters – Party elders and party caucuses 59
  - Advice by the Solicitor-General 61
  - Advice by judges 65
  - Advice by former office-holders 71
  - Advice by academics and practitioners 72

Sources of information upon which an exercise of discretion may be based 75

Uncertainty as to who should advise the head of state 76
- Conflicting advice 76
- Advice after a coup d’état or revolution 77
- Rhodesia 1965 79
- Sierra Leone 1967 82
- Grenada 1979 and 1983 83
- Fiji 1987 86

Acting without advice 90

The rights to be consulted, encourage and warn 92
- Bagehot’s formulation and its subsequent variation 93
- The right to be consulted and informed 95
- The right to encourage and warn 97
- The right to advise 105

A duty to counsel, encourage, warn and advocate policy positions? 108

The fine line between rejection of advice and persuasion to drop advice 109

### 3 Appointment of the Chief Minister 115

- Commission to form a government 115
- Reserve power of appointment 116
- Advice by the outgoing chief minister 118
CONTENTS

United Kingdom 120
Canada 126
New Zealand 126
India 127
Australia 128
Advice when the chief minister considers no one else can form a stable government 129
The resignation and recommissioning of a chief minister to allow a new ministry 130
Advice by other Members of Parliament 133
The role of the parliamentary party in advising on a new party leader 133
Consultation with elder statesmen and others 136
The role of the lower House in advising upon who should be chief minister 137
Express provisions and conventions regulating appointment of the chief minister 138
The application of discretion according to convention 138
The formalisation or codification of convention 142
Leaving the choice of chief minister to the lower House of Parliament 145
Caretaker and interim ministries 148
No appointment until there is a vacancy 150
The benefits of incumbency 151
Overriding the benefits of incumbency 155
Whether the benefits of incumbency survive a change in leader 157
No new appointment if no one holds the confidence of the House 161
Appointment after dismissal of chief minister who held the confidence of the House 162
Convention regarding who to call upon to form a government 162
Disputed rule no 1 – That the head of state must call upon the Leader of the Opposition to form a government 163
Disputed rule no 2 – That the head of state must call upon the leader of the party with the largest number of seats to form a government 163
Disputed rule no 3 – That the head of state must call upon the person who moved the successful no-confidence motion to form a government 168
The overriding convention 168
How to assess who is most likely to command the confidence of the House 169
Status of confidence and supply agreements 173
Factors that the head of state should or should not take into account in calling on a person to form a government 174
Proportion of the vote v seats in the lower House 174
Misleading statements during the election campaign 176
A constructive vote of confidence by the lower House 179
Likely stability of a government 181
Appointment where an election results in a hung Parliament 183
Newfoundland 1971–2 183
Fiji 1977 185
Tasmania 2010 189
Mid-term appointment of a chief minister in a minority government 191
Ceylon 1952 191
Australia 2013 192
Appointment of a chief minister leading a coalition 193
Appointment of a person who can secure the passage of supply 194
Appointment after the sudden death of a chief minister 197
Appointment after the chief minister becomes disqualified from office 202
Conditions on appointments 203
Appointment of a chief minister who does not hold a seat in the lower House 211
Appointment of a chief minister from outside Parliament 212
Appointment of a chief minister who sits in the upper House 218
Appointment of a chief minister while Parliament is dissolved 220
Appointment of a chief minister after Parliament has been abolished 221
Judicial challenges to appointment of a chief minister 222
Vanuatu 222
Solomon Islands 224
Nauru 224
Malaysia – State of Sabah 225
India – State of Assam 226
Appointment and removal of other ministers 227

4 Dismissal of Governments 232
Introduction 232
Dismissal, disqualification and removal 232
Disqualification and incapacity 233
Automatic removal due to loss of confidence 235
Responsibility of a chief minister to resign 237
Positive and negative exercises of power 239
Rejection of the resignation of a Prime Minister 240
Express constitutional provisions that require, permit or limit the dismissal of the chief minister 244
Requirement to dismiss 244
Discretion to dismiss 245
CONTENTS

Vacation of office after a general election 246
Limitations on dismissal 249
Effect of the resignation, dismissal or death of a chief minister 250
Dismissals, dissolutions and forced resignations 256
  Dismissal and the need for an alternative government and dissolution 256
  Forced dissolutions amounting to the dismissal of the government 257
  Refusal of a dissolution amounting to an effective dismissal 260
  Refusal of other advice, causing resignation and dissolution 261
  Forced or induced resignations amounting to effective dismissal 262
Grounds for dismissal – Failure to resign after the loss of an election or loss of confidence in the House 265
  Failure to resign after loss of an election 266
  Failure to resign after defeat on a vote of no-confidence in the lower House 267
  Defeat of a caretaker government appointed after dismissal of previous government 269
  Temporary loss of confidence 272
  Dismissal for lack of confidence when there has been no vote on the floor of the House 274
  Dismissal for failure to summon House when confidence is at issue 288
Grounds for dismissal – Loss of support of own party 301
  New South Wales 1916 302
  Queensland 1987 303
  New Zealand 1984 304
Grounds for dismissal – Illegality or corruption 306
  Quebec 1891 310
  British Columbia 1903 310
  Manitoba 1915 311
  New South Wales 1932 312
  Tasmania 1947 318
  British Columbia 1991 318
Grounds for dismissal – Breach of fundamental constitutional principle 320
  Quebec 1878 320
  Rhodesia 1965 321
Grounds for dismissal – Failure to achieve supply 326
  Examples of the fall of governments involving the failure to secure supply 327
  Supply and dismissal of governments in Victoria 329
  The dismissal of the Australian Whitlam Government 1975 333
  The grant of special warrants authorising expenditure 340
Grounds for dismissal – The government is out of step with the people 342
Obligation to warn before dismissing a government 346
Reversal of a dismissal 350
Nigeria – Western Region 352
Malaysia – State of Sarawak 352
Fiji 353
Papua New Guinea 353

5 Dissolution 358
Refusing or forcing a dissolution 358
Constitutional principles and the refusal of dissolutions 359
Responsible government 359
Representative government 360
Who may request a dissolution? 361
The relationship between resignation, dissolution and dismissal 365
Dissolution requested by a caretaker government 365
Must a government resign if refused a dissolution? 367
Express power to refuse a dissolution 369
Implied power to refuse a dissolution 371
The reserve power to refuse a dissolution in the United Kingdom prior to 2011 371
The Lascelles letter about the Sovereign’s powers 374
The extension to other Realms of the reserve power to refuse a dissolution 378
The effect of fixed-term Parliaments 378
Factors favouring the grant of a dissolution 379
Refusal of a dissolution where the government holds majority support 380
Must a government justify an early election? 382
Dissolution where a government has lost the confidence of the lower House 385
The King/Byng Affair 388
Should Byng have accepted King’s advice to dissolve? 395
Should Byng have granted a dissolution to Meighen or recommissioned King? 399
Newfoundland – Refusal of a dissolution to the Bond Government in 1908 402
Victoria – Refusal of a dissolution to the Bowser Government in 1918 404
New South Wales – Refusal of a dissolution to the Dooley Government in 1921 407
New Zealand – Forecast of action if the Massey Government fell in 1922–3 408
Tasmania – Grant of a dissolution to the Cosgrove Government in 1950 409
CONTENTS

Nepal 465
India 469
Pakistan 469
Litigation to force a dissolution 470
Express restrictions upon the grant of dissolutions 471
Effect of fixed-term Parliaments on reserve powers concerning dissolutions 472
United Kingdom 472
Australia 474
Canada 476
Impact upon other conventions and reserve powers 479
Forced dissolutions and a positive power to dissolve Parliament without ministerial advice 480
Forceful or moral persuasion to request a dissolution 481
Forced dissolution arising from the dismissal of a government 482
Is there a positive reserve power to dissolve Parliament without advice? 483
The doctrine of necessity as a source of a positive discretion to dissolve 486
The rule of law as a source of a positive discretion to dissolve 491
Responsible government as a source of a positive power to dissolve 492
Representative government as a source of a positive power to dissolve 495
Express discretion or requirement to dissolve Parliament without ministerial advice 496
The practicalities of dissolving Parliament without ministerial advice 500

6 Caretaker Conventions 502
Caretaker conventions and constitutional principle 502
The development of the caretaker conventions 504
The obligation of a government to remain in office pending the appointment of a new government 505
Express constitutional provisions regarding the continuation of government 508
History of recognition of caretaker governments and conventions 509
Refusal to make significant appointments during the caretaker period 509
The requirement that caretaker governments only undertake routine government business 511
Use of the terminology of ‘caretaker’ and ‘purdah’ 513
The formalisation of the caretaker conventions 515
Shift of emphasis from ministerial constraint to public service rules 518
CONTENTS

Periods in which caretaker conventions apply 519
  Pre-election caretaker period 519
  Post-election caretaker period 522
  Period after a mid-term loss of confidence 526
  Transition period between chief ministers of the same party 528
Application of caretaker conventions 529
The content of caretaker conventions 530
  Appointments 531
  Major contracts and policy decisions 533
  Consultation with the Opposition 535
  Allowing the Opposition to consult with public servants 535
  Government advertising and the independence of the public service 536
Status of the caretaker conventions 537
Whether there is a reserve power to reject or defer advice that breaches the caretaker conventions 539
  Examples of refusals to act upon advice that breaches the caretaker conventions 544
  When the head of state may enforce the caretaker conventions 546
  No obligation on a head of state to enforce the caretaker conventions 546
  Publicity of breach may be sufficient to provide a political remedy 547
Appointment of ministers during a caretaker period 548

7 Summoning Parliament 550
When Parliament is summoned 550
  The power to summon Parliament after its dissolution or prorogation 550
  Maximum period between sessions of Parliament 551
  Summoning Parliament after an election 552
  Summoning Parliament during an emergency 553
  Recalling a House that has been adjourned 555
Is the power to summon Parliament a reserve power? 555
  Express reserve power to summon Parliament 556
  Convention and reserve powers to summon Parliament 558
  India 559
  New Zealand 560
  Australia 562
  Canada 564
  Solomon Islands 567
  Tuvalu 571
The summoning of Parliament by order of the courts 577
  Constitutional principles and a reserve power to summon Parliament 581
  The principle of the rule of law 581
## CONTENTS

The principles of responsible and representative government 582
The doctrine of necessity 583
Conclusion 583

8 Prorogation 584
Prorogation and its consequences 584
Express requirements concerning prorogation and sessions of Parliament 586
Is prorogation a reserve power? 586
The rights to warn and encourage 591
Prorogation in breach of constitutional requirements 592
Prorogation when the Government does not hold the confidence of the lower House 592
Prorogation at a time when holding an election would be undesirable 595
Prorogation where no other responsible government can be formed 596
Prorogation where there is a temporary loss of confidence 596
Prorogation where the alternative government is likely to be short-lived 598
Prorogation where a motion of no-confidence is not yet before the House 603
Prorogation after the dismissal of a government 604
Prorogation when supply is about to run out 605
Prorogation to disqualify absent members or end pairing arrangements 606
Prorogation to cause a warrant of imprisonment for contempt to lapse 608
Prorogation to prevent parliamentary scrutiny 609
Prorogation to terminate parliamentary inquiries 610
Prorogation to prevent the tabling of reports 612
Prorogation to terminate orders for the production of documents 612
Prorogation to prevent the House from sitting 613
Prorogation contrary to a resolution of the House 613
Prorogation in order to recall the House to make it sit 614

9 Royal Assent 616
Assent to legislation 616
The relevant constitutional principles 617
Is the grant of royal assent a legislative or executive act? 618
Textual indicators 619
Judicial observations 621
Academic views on the prevailing principle 622
Practice and procedure 627
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>xix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Is there a reserve power to refuse assent?</td>
<td>633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent in the United Kingdom – Has the power fallen into desuetude?</td>
<td>633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Express constitutional provisions concerning assent</td>
<td>635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discretion regarding assent in the older Realms</td>
<td>637</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reform of discretionary power</td>
<td>641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent on ministerial advice</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent due to error in bill</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent on ministerial advice to a bill passed against the wishes of the government</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill passed under a previous government without an intervening dissolution</td>
<td>647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delay in the grant of assent</td>
<td>649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Withdrawal of assent once given</td>
<td>651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill on the ground of illegality or invalidity</td>
<td>652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referral of bills to a court to test constitutional validity</td>
<td>652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent on constitutional grounds where it has not been tested in a court</td>
<td>655</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Failure to meet mandatory procedural requirements</td>
<td>660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill that subverts representative democracy or fundamental rights</td>
<td>664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill that subverts the system of representative democracy</td>
<td>665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill that affects fundamental human rights</td>
<td>668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent because of a lack of a mandate</td>
<td>671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill so as to avert violence or a national disaster</td>
<td>672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill due to the wishes of the head of state</td>
<td>672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent because of personal objection to the bill</td>
<td>672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent to a bill that is contrary to the public will</td>
<td>674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent or consent to bills affecting the rights, powers or interests of the head of state</td>
<td>677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consent or refusal of consent to bills affecting royal prerogatives and interests</td>
<td>680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of assent v dismissal of Ministers or dissolution</td>
<td>683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justiciability of withholding of assent</td>
<td>684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The power to suggest amendments to a bill</td>
<td>686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consequences of the refusal of assent</td>
<td>689</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10 The Rejection of Advice to Act Illegally or Unconstitutionally | 691 |

The head of state as the guarantor of legality | 691 |
The conflicting principles that apply to illegal or unconstitutional advice | 693 |
How such a conflict is usually resolved in practice 694
Reference to a court 695
Rejection of advice on the ground that acting on it would involve a breach of the law 696
The application of the rule of law to the head of state 696
Who may determine illegality? 698
Illegality and the Lang dismissal 700
Kerr’s views on illegality 704
Illegality in New Zealand 706
Illegality in Canada 707
Advice that is inconsistent with a judicial decision 709
Reconciliation of the constitutional principles 714
Rejection of advice on the ground that it is unconstitutional 715
Rejection of advice on the ground that the chief minister has no jurisdiction or power to give it 720
Rejection of advice on the ground that a matter of constitutional principle is involved and the government has no mandate 722
Rejection of advice to swamp the Legislative Council of New South Wales 723
Canada and unilateral constitutional reform 726
Judges as vice-regal officers 727
Conclusion 730

11 Appointment and Dismissal of Vice-Regal Officers 731
The head of state – Election and succession 731
The status of a vice-regal officer – Head of state or delegate of the Sovereign? 734
The respective powers of the Sovereign and vice-regal representatives 739
Appointment and dismissal of vice-regal officers pre-1930 741
The 1926 and 1930 Imperial Conferences 743
The appointment of the Governor-General of Australia in 1930 745
Irish Free State 1932 – Removal and appointment of the Governor-General in 1932 746
The removal of James McNeill as Governor-General 748
Whether the offices of Governor-General and President could be held simultaneously 751
The Acting Governor-General and the Oath of Allegiance 753
Appointment of a new Governor-General 757
The post-1930 convention for the appointment of vice-regal officers 758
Canada 1935 – Appointment of a new Governor General 761
Fiji 1941 – The fine line between forced resignation and recall 762
Pakistan 1953 – The failed attempt to remove the Governor-General 762
CONTENTS

Ceylon 1962 – The removal of the Governor-General 764
Western Region of Nigeria 1962 – The removal of the Governor 766
Dismissal of the Premier 766
Removal of the Governor 767
The Privy Council’s decision 770
Rhodesia 1965 – Whether the Governor should resign or remain 773
Sierra Leone 1967 – Removal of the Governor 775
St Kitts 1969 – Resignation of the Governor 780
Grenada 1974 – Removal or resignation of the Governor 782
Queensland 1975 – The aborted removal of a State Governor 785
St Lucia 1980 – Resignation of the Governor-General 787
St Lucia 1981–2 – Removal of the Governor-General 792
St Kitts 1981 – Removal of the Governor 796
Victoria 1985 – Resignation of the Governor 803
Fiji 1987 – Resignation of the last Governor-General 805
Papua New Guinea 1991 – Resignation of the Governor-General 806
Tuvalu 1993 – Replacement and removal of Governors-General 807
Sir Toaripi Lauti’s replacement 808
Sir Tomu Sione’s removal 809
St Lucia 1997 – Resignation of the Governor-General 810
Australia 2003 – Resignation of the Governor-General 811
Tasmania 2004 – Resignation of the Governor 813
Papua New Guinea 2003–4 – Invalid appointment of Governor-General 815
Papua New Guinea 2010 – Invalid reappointment of Governor-General 815
Papua New Guinea 2011 – Suspension of the Governor-General 816
Tuvalu 2013 – Attempt to remove Governor-General overtaken by events 817
Antigua and Barbuda 2014 – Resignation of the Governor-General 819
St Kitts 2015 – Resignation trumped by removal from office 820
Removal by way of replacement once initial term has expired 821
Does the Queen have a reserve power to reject advice to dismiss a Governor-General? 823
Rejection of advice at the informal stage 828
Tactical delay as means of effectively refusing advice 829
Tactical delay in the appointment of a new Governor-General 833
Other methods of appointment of the Governor-General 834
Canadian Advisory Committee on Appointments 834
Approval by the Opposition 835
## CONTENTS

Appointment of Governor-General by outgoing Governor-General 836
Qualification and disqualification of Governors-General 838
Elected Governors-General 841
  Appointment of a directly elected Governor-General 841
  Appointment of an indirectly elected Governor-General 842
Term of office 844
  Dismissal from office 844
Deputies and Administrators 846
Abdication, resignation and the termination of Crowns 850
  Abdication by the Sovereign 851
  Resignation or abandonment of office by vice-regal officers 853
  Termination of the Sovereign’s role in a Realm 856

Index 858