

Democracy in a Russian Mirror

What can we learn about democracy from the experience of post-Soviet Russia? What can we learn about the prospects for democracy in Russia from the experience of "really existing democracies"? Must some "prerequisites," cultural or material, be fulfilled for democracy to become possible? This book examines the current state of and prospects for democracy in Russia, posing several challenges to our understanding of democracy. Thirteen contributors expand the debate over these questions, offering a variety of insights, interpretations, and conclusions vital to understanding the conditions of emergence and survival of successful democracies

Adam Przeworski is the Carroll and Milton Petrie Professor of Politics at New York University. He previously taught at the University of Chicago, where he was the Martin A. Ryerson Distinguished Service Professor. Przeworski is the recipient of the 1985 Socialist Review Book Award, the 1998 Gregory M. Luebbert Article Award, the 2001 Woodrow Wilson Prize, the 2010 Lawrence Longley Award, and the 2010 Johan Skytte Prize. He has been a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences since 1991.





Cambridge Studies in the Theory of Democracy

General Editor Adam Przeworski, New York University

Other Books in the Series

Robert Barros, Constitutionalism and Dictatorship: Pinochet, the Junta, and the 1980 Constitution

Jon Elster, ed., Deliberative Democracy

Roberto Gargarella, Constitutionalism in the Americas, 1776-1860

José María Maravall and Adam Przeworski, eds., Democracy and the Rule of Law

José María Maravall and Ignacia Sánchez-Cuenca, Controlling Governments: Voters, Institutions, and Accountability

Adam Przeworski, Democracy and the Limits of Self-Government

Adam Przeworski, Susan Stokes, and Bernard Manin, eds., *Democracy, Accountability, and Representation*

Adam Przeworski et al., Democracy and Development: Political Institutions and Well-Being in the World, 1950–1990

Melissa Schwartzberg, Democracy and Legal Change

Melissa Schwartzberg, Counting the Many: The Origins and Limits of Supermajority Rule





Democracy in a Russian Mirror

Edited by ADAM PRZEWORSKI

New York University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107053397

© Adam Przeworski 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Democracy in a Russian mirror / edited by Adam Przeworski, New York University.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-05339-7 (hardback)

Democracy – Russia (Federation)
 Russia (Federation) – Politics and government –
 3. Democracy – Russia.
 Russia – Politics and government.
 Przeworski, Adam.
 DK510.76.D46
 2015

320.947-dc23 2014044908

ISBN 978-1-107-05339-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

PART I RUSSIA 1 Peculiarities of Russian Politics Andranik Migranyan 1.1 The Law of the Pendulum 7.2 On Elections 9.3 On Sovereign Democracy 1.4 A Response to My Critics 2 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity Stephen Holmes 2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 5 8 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60	Contributors		page xiii
Peculiarities of Russian Politics Andranik Migranyan 1.1 The Law of the Pendulum 7.2 On Elections 9.3 On Sovereign Democracy 1.4 A Response to My Critics 2 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity Stephen Holmes 2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60		Introduction	I
Andranik Migranyan 1.1 The Law of the Pendulum 1.2 On Elections 1.3 On Sovereign Democracy 1.4 A Response to My Critics 2 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity Stephen Holmes 2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3 Russian Permeval Democracy 6 6	PAI	RT I RUSSIA	
1.2 On Elections91.3 On Sovereign Democracy131.4 A Response to My Critics252 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity30Stephen Holmes302.1 Introduction302.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy312.3 Two Incarnations, One System332.4 The Great Disconnect402.5 Why Steal Elections?452.6 Shock-Absorber Parties502.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions542.8 Detached and Disjointed563 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political58Emancipation, and Integrity58Mikhail Ilyin583.1 Introduction583.2 Primeval Democracy60	Ι	Andranik Migranyan	7
1.3 On Sovereign Democracy 1.4 A Response to My Critics 2.5 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity Stephen Holmes 2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 3.1 Two Incarnations, One System 3.2 Two Incarnations? 4.4 The Great Disconnect 4.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 6 6		1.1 The Law of the Pendulum	7
1.4 A Response to My Critics252 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity30Stephen Holmes302.1 Introduction302.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy312.3 Two Incarnations, One System332.4 The Great Disconnect402.5 Why Steal Elections?452.6 Shock-Absorber Parties502.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions542.8 Detached and Disjointed563 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political58Emancipation, and Integrity58Mikhail Ilyin3.1 Introduction583.2 Primeval Democracy60		1.2 On Elections	9
2 Imitating Democracy, Feigning Capacity Stephen Holmes 2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 31 2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 33 2.4 The Great Disconnect 40 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30			13
Stephen Holmes 2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 33 2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3 Name of the process of		1.4 A Response to My Critics	25
2.1 Introduction 2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy 31 2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 33 2.4 The Great Disconnect 40 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 45 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 50 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 56 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity 58 Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 58 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60	2		30
2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 53 33 40 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50		•	30
2.3 Two Incarnations, One System 2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60		2.2 A Procrustian Dichotomy	31
2.4 The Great Disconnect 2.5 Why Steal Elections? 4.5 2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 5.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 5 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity 5 Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 5 Primeval Democracy 6 6		2.3 Two Incarnations, One System	33
2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties 2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity 58 Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60			40
2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions 2.8 Detached and Disjointed 3 Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60		2.5 Why Steal Elections?	45
2.8 Detached and Disjointed Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 56		2.6 Shock-Absorber Parties	50
2.8 Detached and Disjointed Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political Emancipation, and Integrity Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Primeval Democracy 56		2.7 Democracy and Its Preconditions	54
Emancipation, and Integrity 58 Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 58 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60			56
Emancipation, and Integrity 58 Mikhail Ilyin 3.1 Introduction 58 3.2 Primeval Democracy 60	3	Russian Perspectives on Democracy, Political	
3.1 Introduction583.2 Primeval Democracy60	3	Emancipation, and Integrity	58
3.2 Primeval Democracy 60		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	58
		· ·	60
			63

vii



viii	Contents
3.4 Sovereignty of the People	68
3.5 Democracy of the Soviets	70
3.6 Perestroika: More Democracy, M	· ·
3.7 Crippled Democracy	74
3.8 Sovereign Democracy	75
3.9 Some Tentative Conclusions	77
4 Color Revolutions and Russia	78
Valery Solovei	, ,
4.1 Introduction	78
4.2 Were There Any Revolutions?	, 79
4.3 Causes of the Revolutions	81
4.4 Revolutionary Results	84
4.5 Following Nicholas I	86
4.6 Why Not Russia or When Russia	? 88
4.7 Conclusions	92
PART II DEMOCRACY IN A RUSSIAN MIR	ROR
5 Judging Democracy as Form of Gov	ernment for Given
Territories: Utopia or Apologetics?	97
John Dunn	,
5.1 Democratic Authority as Repudic	ition of
Self-Authorization	97
5.2 Agenda	99
5.3 Method	100
5.4 Elections	IOI
5.5 Russian Particularities and Unive	rsal Dilemmas 108
6 Democracy: Ancient and Modern, C	Good and Bad 110
Pasquale Pasquino	
6.1 Introduction	110
6.2 Athens	112
6.3 The Thomist Conceptual Revolut	tion 113
6.4 What Is Good and What Is Bad a	ibout Modern
Democracy (Elections)	117
6.5 Lessons from Russia	126
7 The Role of Elections in Democracy	130
Boris Makarenko	
7.1 Why Are Elections Important?	130
7.1.1 Not Limited to Competitio	n 130
7.1.2 Why Elections?	133
7.1.3 How Much Competition?	135
7.2 Functions of Competitive Election	-
7.2.1 Instituting and Consolidati	_ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~
7.2.2 Legitimizing Winners and	Losers 137



Coi	ontents	1X
	7.2.3 Shaping Competition and Political Regime	138
	7.2.4 Shaping the Style of Politics	140
	7.3 Platforms or Personalities? What Is Being Voted For	r? 141
	7.4 Free and Fair: How to Smell a Rat	143
	7.5 Conclusions	145
8	Elections and the Challenge of More Democracy	147
	José María Maravall	.,
	8.1 A Defense of Electoral Democracy	147
	8.2 Fears about Democratic Elections:	
	The Russian Experience	149
	8.3 Shortcomings of Electoral Democracies	151
	8.3.1 Asymmetries of Information	152
	8.3.2 The Predictability of Incumbents	155
	8.3.3 Conflict over Divided Power	157
	8.3.4 Bending the Rules of Competition	159
	8.3.5 The Usurpation of the Voice of the People	162
	8.4 Are Democracies a Threat?	164
	8.4.1 Are Elected Governments Less Able to	
	Promote Economic Growth?	165
	8.4.2 Are Elected Governments Less Able to	
	Promote Socioeconomic Equality?	167
	8.5 Conclusion	169
9	Democracy between Elections	173
	Ian Shapiro	
	9.1 Introduction	173
	9.2 "Loyal" Opposition	174
	9.3 Interest Groups	177
	9.4 Civil Society	180
10	General Settings, Regional and National Factors,	
	and the Concept of Non-Western Democracy	184
	Alexei D. Voskressenski	'
	10.1 Introduction	184
	10.2 Applied Political Analysis in the East and the West:	
	General Parameters and Specific Factors	186
	10.3 The Spatial and Analytical System of Coordinates	192
	10.4 Comparative Analysis of the Special Factors of	ŕ
	Non-Western Political Systems and Processes:	
	General Principles, Regional Factors, and Models	
	of Democracy	194
	10.5 The Concept of Non-Western Democracy	199
	10.6 Conclusion	208



X		Contents
ΙΙ	"Non-Western Democracy" in the West	212
	Adam Przeworski 11.1 Introduction	
	11.1 Introduction 11.2 The "West"	212
	11.2 The West 11.2.1 Introduction	215
	11.2.1 Introduction 11.2.2 Harmony of Interests	215 215
	11.2.3 Fear of Divisions	213
	11.2.4 Opposition as Obstruction	218
	11.2.5 Conclusion	220
	11.2.5 Concussion 11.3 On the Political Use of "Traditions"	220
PAI	RT III PATHS OF POLITICAL CHANGE	
Т2.	Instituting Political Change	229
	John Ferejohn)
	12.1 Introduction	229
	12.2 What's Good and Bad about Democracy	233
	12.3 Building Democracy in Real Time	236
	12.4 Two Model Democracies	238
	12.5 Discussion: Posttransition Politics	244
13		247
	Adam Przeworski	
	13.1 Introduction	247
	13.2 Political Institutions and Political Conflicts	248
	13.2.1 Preliminaries	248
	13.2.2 Structuring Conflicts	249
	13.2.3 Incentives to Participate and to Obey	251
	13.2.4 Not All Is the Same	258
	13.3 Different Orders	262
	13.4 Regime Dynamics	264
	13.5 Conclusions	266
14	How Do Transitions to Democracy Get Stuck,	
·	and Where?	268
	Boris Makarenko and Andrei Melville	
	14.1 The Problem	268
	14.2 Preconditions versus Policies in the Study of	
	Democracy and Democratization	270
	14.3 Why and How Democratizations Fail	273
	14.4 Preconditions and Policies in the Outcome of	, ,
	Transition: Favorable or Unfavorable?	279
	14.5 How Policy Choices Worked	283
	14.5.1 Central Asia	283
	14.5.2 Transcaucasia	287
	14.5.3 Eastern Europe	288
	14.6 Conclusions	293



X1
298
298
299
299
301
304
307
333
335





Contributors

John Dunn is a Fellow of King's College, Cambridge, and Emeritus Professor of Political Theory at Cambridge. He is a Fellow of the British Academy, an Academician of the Academy of the Social Sciences, and a Foreign Honorary Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. His most recent book is *Setting the People Free/Democracy: A History* (2005–6).

John Ferejohn is the Samuel Tilden Professor of Law at New York University and Professor of Political Science Emeritus at Stanford University. He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Science and of the National Academy of Sciences and was a recipient of an honorary doctorate in the social sciences from Yale University in 2007. He is the author of *Pork Barrel Politics* (1974) and a coauthor of *The Personal Vote* (1987) and *A Republic of Statutes* (2010).

Stephen Holmes is Walter E. Meyer Professor of Law at New York University School of Law. Former editor of the *East European Constitutional Review*, Holmes has written numerous essays on the disappointments of liberalization and democratization after Communism.

Mikhail Ilyin is professor of political science and vice-dean of the Faculty of Politics at the National Research University–Higher School of Economics in Moscow and the head of the Centre for Advanced Research Methods in Humanities of the Institute of Scientific Information on Social Sciences of the Russian Academy of Sciences. He also teaches comparative politics at MGIMO University in Moscow and at Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University in Kaliningrad. With Andrei Melville, he coauthored *Political Atlas of the Modern World: An Experiment in Multidimensional Statistical Analysis of Political Systems of Modern States* (2010). Ilyin is a vice president of the International Political Science Association.

xiii



xiv Contributors

Boris Makarenko is the chairman of the board of the Center for Political Technologies, an independent Moscow-based think tank, and director of internal policy at the Institute of Contemporary Development. Author of two books and more than fifty articles, he recently coauthored *Russia in the 21 Century: The Image of Desired Tomorrow* (2010)

José María Maravall is professor of sociology at the Universidad Complutense de Madrid and an Honorary Fellow of St. Antony's College, Oxford. He is a Corresponding Fellow of the British Academy and a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. He was the Spanish minister of education and science between 1982 and 1988. His recent books are (as coeditor with I. Sanchez Cuenca) Controlling Governments: Voters, Institutions, and Accountability (2008) and La Confrontacion Politica (2008).

Andrei Melville is professor of political science and dean of the Faculty of Politics at the National Research University-Higher School of Economics in Moscow. He is author and coauthor of ten books, most recently *Political Atlas of the Modern World: An Experiment in Multidimensional Statistical Analysis of Political Systems of Modern States* (with Mikhail Ilyin, 2010).

Andranik Migranyan is the director of the Institute on Democracy and Cooperation, a Russian nongovernmental organization based in New York City, and a member of the Russian Public Chamber. He was previously a professor at the Institute of International Relations, MGIMO University, Moscow, and a member of the Russian Presidential Council.

Pasquale Pasquino is Senior Research Fellow at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique EHESS, Paris, and Distinguished Professor in Politics and Law at New York University. He is the author or the editor of five books and a hundred articles about European constitutional and political theory and history. His recent publications include *La controverse sur "le gardien de la Constitution" et la justice constitutionnelle. Kelsen contre Schmitt* (coedited with Olivier Beaud, 2007) and *How Constitutional Courts Make Decisions* (coedited with B. Randazzo, 2009).

Adam Przeworski is the Carroll and Milton Petrie Professor of Politics at New York University. A member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, he is the recipient of the 1996 Gregory Luebbert Prize, the 2001 Woodrow Wilson Prize, the 2010 Lawrence Longley Award, and the 2010 Johan Skytte Prize. He recently published *Democracy and the Limits of Self-Government* (2010).

Ian Shapiro is Sterling Professor of Political Science and Henry R. Luce Director of the MacMillan Center for International Studies at Yale University. He is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and of the American Philosophical Society. His recent books include *Death by a Thousand*



Contributors xv

Cuts: The Fight over Inherited Wealth (with Michael Gratz) and Containment: Rebuilding a Strategy against Global Terror.

Valery Solovei is a professor at Moscow State Institute of International Relations (University). He is author and coauthor of five books, including, published in the United States, *Russia's Communists at the Crossroads* (with Joan Urban). His latest book, *Failed Revolution* (2009), was awarded the National Prize for "The Best Books and Publishing."

Alexei D. Voskressenski is dean of the School of Political Affairs and professor of comparative politics and Asian studies, MGIMO University (Moscow). He is the author, coauthor, and editor of fifty books (the latest is *The East and Politics: Political Systems, Political Cultures, Political Process* [2011]), of which twelve are monographs, including *Russia and China: A Theory of Interstate Relations* (2003) and *Political Systems and Models of Democracy in the East* (2007). He also edits a Russian journal, *Comparative Politics*.