

SOCIAL THEORY IN ARCHAEOLOGY AND ANCIENT HISTORY

At a time when archaeology has turned away from questions of the long term and large scale, this collection of essays reflects on some of the big questions in archaeology and ancient history: how and why societies have grown in scale and complexity; how they have maintained and discarded aspects of their own cultural heritage; and how they have collapsed. In addressing these long-standing questions of broad interest and importance, the authors develop counternarratives – new ways of understanding what used to be termed *cultural evolution*. In essays that encompass the Middle East and Egypt, India, Southeast Asia, Australia, the American Southwest, and Mesoamerica, the fourteen essays offer perspectives on long-term cultural trajectories; on cities, states, and empires; on collapse; and on the relationship between archaeology and history. The book concludes with a commentary by one of the major voices in archaeological theory: Norman Yoffee.

Geoff Emberling is Assistant Research Scientist at the Kelsey Museum of Archaeology at the University of Michigan. He has held positions as Museum Director and Chief Curator at the Oriental Institute at the University of Chicago and as Assistant Curator in the Department of Ancient Near Eastern Art of the Metropolitan Museum of Art. He has directed archaeological fieldwork at Tell Brak in northeastern Syria and in the Fourth Cataract region of northern Sudan and is currently excavating at El Kurru, also in northern Sudan.

Social Theory in Archaeology and Ancient History

The Present and Future of Counternarratives

Edited by

GEOFF EMBERLING

Cambridge University Press



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-05333-5 — Social Theory in Archaeology and Ancient History
 Edited by Geoff Emberling
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107053335

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Social theory in archaeology and ancient history : the present and future of counternarratives / edited by Geoff Emberling.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-05333-5 (Hardback)

1. Social archaeology. 2. Civilization, Ancient. 3. Social systems—History.

4. Excavations (Archaeology) 1. Emberling, Geoff, editor, author.

cc72.4.s53 2015

930.1—dc23 2015029262

ISBN 978-1-107-05333-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of tables</i>	xi
<i>Contributors</i>	xii
<i>Preface</i>	xv

PART I INTRODUCTION

1 Counternarratives: The Archaeology of the Long Term and the Large Scale	3
GEOFF EMBERLING	

PART II CULTURAL TRAJECTORIES

2 Social Evolutionary Theory and the Fifth Continent: History Without Transformation?	19
TIM MURRAY	
3 Structures of Authority: Feasting and Political Practice in the Earliest Mesopotamian States	34
GEOFF EMBERLING	
4 Counternarratives and Counterintuition: Accommodating the Unpredicted in the Archaeology of Complexity	60
STEVEN E. FALCONER	
5 Inscribing Legitimacy and Building Power in the Mekong Delta	75
MIRIAM T. STARK	

PART III CITIES, STATES, AND EMPIRES

6 The City in the State	109
CARLA M. SINOPOLI AND UTHARA SUVRATHAN	

7	Cities and Ideology: The Case of Assur in the Neo-Assyrian Period PETER MACHINIST	129
8	City and Countryside – Image and Text: Balancing Rural and Urban Values in Third-Millennium Egypt JOHN BAINES	161
9	Local Courts in Centralizing States: The Case of Ur III Mesopotamia LAURA CULBERTSON	185
PART IV COLLAPSE AND RESILIENCE		
10	Writing Collapse SEVERIN FOWLES	205
11	Objects in Crisis: Curation, Repair, and the Historicity of Things in the South Caucasus (1500–300 BCE) ADAM T. SMITH AND LORI KHATCHADOURIAN	231
12	Leaving Classic Maya Cities: Agent-Based Modeling and the Dynamics of Diaspora PATRICIA A. MCANANY, JEREMY A. SABLOFF, MAXIME LAMOUREUX ST-HILAIRE, AND GYLES IANNONE	259
PART V ARCHAEOLOGY AND HISTORY		
13	Settling on the Ruins of Xia: Archaeology of Social Memory in Early China LI MIN	291
14	Anti-History SHANNON LEE DAWDY	328
PART VI COMMENTARY		
15	The Present and Future of Counternarratives NORMAN YOFFEE	345
	<i>Index</i>	358

Figures

3.1	Map of Greater Mesopotamia	<i>page</i> 38
3.2	Contour plan of Tell Brak	45
3.3	The Niched Building at Tell Brak, TW Level 16, LC 3 period	47
3.4	Limestone mace heads from the Niched Building at Tell Brak, TW Level 16, LC 3 period	47
3.5	The Niched Building and nearby houses at Tell Brak, TW Level 16, LC 3 period	48
3.6	Coarse, shallow plates, LC 3 period	48
3.7	Bead cache from Tell Brak, TW Level 16, LC 3 period	49
4.1	Bronze Age settlement clusters in the Southern Levant	63
4.2	Map of the Eastern Mediterranean showing the locations of Bronze Age settlements	67
4.3	Relative bone frequencies for domesticated sheep/goat and pig	68
4.4	Semi-subterranean house at Middle Bronze Age Zahrat adh-Dhra' 1, Jordan	69
4.5	Politiko-Troullia, Cyprus, facing south toward the Troodos Mountains	70
5.1	Map of the Mekong River and its delta	79
5.2	Brick architectural features from the Mekong Delta	84
5.3	Distribution of dated archaeological localities in the Lower Mekong Archaeological Project (LOMAP) survey area	92
5.4	Distribution of Phase 2 localities (ca. 200 BCE–200 CE) in LOMAP survey area	94

5.5	Distribution of Phase 3 localities (ca. 300–750 CE) in LOMAP survey area	95
6.1	Major early historic cities in India	113
6.2	Banavasi and its hinterland	117
6.3	The Vijayanagara empire	120
8.1	Map of Egypt	163
8.2	Chronological table	164
8.3	Tomb of Ptahhotep II at Saqqara, offering chapel, north wall, east section	165
8.4	Tomb of Ptahhotep II at Saqqara, offering chapel, north wall, west section	166
8.5	Detail of the lower part of Figure 8.4	170
8.6	Procession of estates in the chapel of the tomb of Ti at Saqqara	171
8.7	Section of the façade of the mastaba tomb of Meruakhtinisut from Giza	176
9.1	Interaction among court actors from Shulgi's thirty-second year into Amar-Sin's reign	194
9.2	Interaction among court actors from the middle of Amar-Sin's reign to the middle of Shu-Sin's reign	195
9.3	Interaction among court actors in the last phases of Ur III documentation at Girsu	197
10.1	Chetro Ketl ruin, in Chaco Canyon	216
10.2	<i>Passage, Purification</i> by Victor Masayeva, accompanying his essay "Opticalypse".	219
10.3	"Nature" attacks, reducing New York City to ruin. Still from the 2004 film <i>The Day After Tomorrow</i> .	225
10.4	Relative positions of nature and culture in the collapse narratives of the modern West and the contemporary pueblos	226
11.1	Map of the Tsaghkahovit Plain	240
11.2	Topographic map of the site of Gegharot	241
11.3	Plan of Tsaghkahovit	242
11.4	Photo of the east citadel shrine at Gegharot	245

List of Figures

ix

11.5	Heirloomed late Middle Bronze Age storage jar from the Late Bronze Age west terrace shrine at Gegharot	246
11.6	Destruction debris from the first destruction of Gegharot underneath the east wall of the reconstructed west terrace shrine	246
11.7	Photo of the Tsaghkahovit fortress	249
11.8	Plan of the Tsaghkahovit citadel	252
11.9	Distribution of Iron 3 pottery from the Tsaghkahovit citadel	253
11.10	Comparison of ceramic distribution between Tsaghkahovit citadel and Precinct A	253
12.1	The Maya region showing the key locations and Classic-period royal courts mentioned in text	260
12.2	NetLogo control panel and field of view for “Leaving Maya Cities” simulation	274
12.3	Time 1: Low-intensity land issues plague the royal court and sustainers in NE sector, but there is little movement away from the court	275
12.4	Time 2: High-intensity land issues in the NE sector result in significant movement of sustaining population away from the royal court.	275
12.5	Time 3: High-intensity martial conflict added to simulation results in movement out of sphere of royal court in NE sector and toward NW sector court	276
12.6	Time 4: The third variable – weather – is added to the simulation at a low-intensity. More agents leave the NE sector, but many still cluster around the royal court	276
12.7	Time 5: The implosion of the SW sector royal court leaves only a cluster of sustainer agents	277
12.8	Time 6: Agents from the SW sector migrate north to the royal court in the NW sector	277
12.9	Time 7: The royal court in the NW sector collapses	278
12.10	Time 8: Refugees from the NW court migrate to the challenged but enduring royal court in the NE sector	278
13.1	Major sites and regions in the Circum-Songshan region and the Jinnan basin in northeastern China, with adjacent highlands	293

13.2	The Longshan site of Taosi on the northern slope of Mt. Chong in the Jinnan Basin	295
13.3	The three-dimensional representation of archaeological landscape of Shimao in the Tuwei River valley, Shenmu, Shaanxi	297
13.4	The Zhou political landscape at the turn of the first millennium BCE	307
13.5	The spatial correlation between important Zhou centers and the important pre-Zhou sites from the late third to the late second millennium BCE	308
13.6	Archaeological landscape of the Quwo basin	311

Tables

- 5.1 *Radiocarbon Dates for Wooden Buddhas From Vietnam's Mekong Delta (n.b.: Calibrations Using the Stuiver and Reimer (1986–2005) Calib-Program)* *page 88*

Contributors

John Baines is Professor of Egyptology Emeritus at the University of Oxford. His most recent book is *High Culture and Experience in Ancient Egypt* (Equinox, 2013).

Laura Culbertson is interested in ancient legal systems and social institutions in the Near East. She has edited *Slaves and Households in the Near East* (Oriental Institute, University of Chicago, 2011) and has recently taught at Xavier University and American Public University.

Shannon Lee Dawdy is Associate Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Chicago. She is the author of *Building the Devil's Empire: French Colonial New Orleans* (University of Chicago Press, 2008).

Geoff Emberling is Assistant Research Scientist at the Kelsey Museum of Archaeology at the University of Michigan. He has recently written "Mesopotamian Cities and Urban Process 3500–1600 BC" for *Early Cities in Comparative Perspective*, edited by Norman Yoffee (Cambridge University Press, 2015).

Steven E. Falconer is Chair of the Department of Anthropology at the University of North Carolina at Charlotte. He has recently published (with Patricia L. Fall; 2013) "Households and Community Behavior at Bronze Age Politiko-Troullia, Cyprus," *Journal of Field Archaeology*, 38(2):101–19.

Severin Fowles is Associate Professor of Anthropology at Barnard College. He is the author of *An Archaeology of Doings: Secularism and the Study of Pueblo Religion* (SAR Press, 2013) and co-editor of the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook of the Archaeology of the American Southwest* (Oxford University Press, 2016).

List of Contributors

xiii

Gyles Iannone is Associate Professor in the Anthropology Department at Trent University. His most recent publication is an edited volume entitled *The Great Maya Droughts in Cultural Context* (University Press of Colorado, 2014).

Lori Khatchadourian is Assistant Professor of Near Eastern studies at Cornell University. She is the author of *Imperial Matter: Ancient Persia and the Archaeology of Empires* (University of California Press, 2016).

Li Min received his PhD from the University of Michigan and teaches East Asian archaeology at UCLA. He is currently completing his first book: *Social Memory and the Rise of the State in Bronze Age China*.

Maxime Lamoureux St-Hilaire is a PhD candidate in anthropology at Tulane University. With Gyles Iannone, he has co-authored “The Last Waltz at Minanha: Exploring Gradual Abandonment in the North Vaca Plateau” in the *Research Reports in Belizean Archaeology* #12 (2011).

Peter Machinist is Hancock Professor of Hebrew and other Oriental languages in the Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations at Harvard University. He has recently written “How Gods Die, Biblically and Otherwise: A Problem in Cosmic Restructuring,” in *Reconsidering the Concept of Revolutionary Monotheism*, ed. Beate Pongratz-Leisten (Eisenbrauns, 2011).

Patricia A. McAnany is Kenan Eminent Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill and external faculty at the Santa Fe Institute. She has authored and edited several books, including *Questioning Collapse: Human Resilience, Environmental Vulnerability, and the Aftermath of Empire* (co-edited with Norman Yoffee; Cambridge University Press, 2010).

Tim Murray is the Charles La Trobe Professor of Archaeology at La Trobe University in Melbourne, Australia. His latest publications are *World Antiquarianism: Comparative Perspectives*, edited by Alain Schnapp, Lothar von Falkenhausen, Peter Miller, and Tim Murray (Getty Research Institute, 2013), and *From Antiquarian to Archaeologist* (Pen and Sword Press, 2014).

Jeremy A. Sabloff is the past President and member of the External Faculty of the Santa Fe Institute. He is the author or co-author of nine books, including *The New Archaeology and the Ancient Maya* (W. H. Freeman,

rev. ed. 1994), and the editor or co-editor of twelve books – the most recent of which is *The Ancient City* (with Joyce Marcus, SAR Press, 2008).

Carla M. Sinopoli is Professor of Anthropology, Curator of Asian archaeology and ethnology, and Director of the Museum Studies Program at the University of Michigan. She has recently published *The Vijayanagara Metropolitan Survey: Volume 1* (with Kathleen Morrison, University of Michigan Museum of Anthropology, 2007).

Adam T. Smith is Professor and Chair of Anthropology at Cornell University. His most recent book *The Political Machine: Assembling Sovereignty in the Bronze Age Caucasus* was published in 2015 by Princeton University Press.

Miriam T. Stark is Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa. She is editor of *Archaeology of Asia* (Blackwell, 2005).

Uthara Suvrathan received her PhD in anthropological archaeology from the University of Michigan in 2013. She is currently the Hirsch Postdoctoral Associate in archaeology at Cornell University. Her research draws on archaeological and textual material to examine the organization of polities and places on the margins of large sociopolitical systems and empires in ancient South Asia.

Norman Yoffee is Professor Emeritus in the Department of Near Eastern Studies and Anthropology at the University of Michigan and Senior Fellow at the Institute for the Study of Ancient World, New York University. Most recently, he edited the volume *Early Cities in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2015).

Preface

Geoff Emberling

There is no hiding the origin of this volume: It grew out of papers given at a session of the American Anthropological Association's annual meeting in New Orleans in 2010. The session, entitled "Counternarratives of State, Civilization, and History: Papers in Honor of Norman Yoffee," was co-organized by Lori Khatchadourian, Adam Smith, and me in the year of Norm's retirement from the University of Michigan.¹ And the session itself grew out of Norm's inspiring teaching and admirable breadth of intellectual interests, drawing on his former students and current colleagues working in regions around the world. A session including all of Norm's former students and colleagues would have taken days, and we organizers hope that other former students, colleagues, and friends of Norm's will not be disconcerted for not being asked to write and that they will derive some pleasure from the essays.

At the same time, we did not want to write a Festschrift in the usual sense of short articles that present a small aspect of a question of interest to the honoree. Rather, we wanted to engage with the future of Norm's scholarship in more extended ways: How has his work stimulated our thinking and how will it continue to do so? Thus, we forego the biographical sketch and list of all his publications here (for the latter, one can consult <https://sites.google.com/a/umich.edu/norman-yoffee>).

The title and methodological connection of the essays come from a telling observation by Sev Fowles, who pointed out that much of Norm's work has been devoted to building "counternarratives" (and, of course, continues to be; few scholars have been more active *after* retirement!). Sev put it well:

I think I'm most impressed by Norm's distinctive engagement with the grand narrative, which never took the easy route of naive rejection that has led so many into inane specificity or bland truisms about identity, embodiment, power, agency, etc. Even though he taught on these latter themes at Michigan, he was always most brilliant when he was building counter-narratives. He loved talking about collapse rather than rise. He loved discussing *negara* and the inversion of pomp and power in historical trajectories. And he loved going on and on about the evolutionary implications of Jones's article on why the Tasmanians didn't eat fish.

Thus, this volume represents our collective efforts to follow Norm's lead and to build on his many insights.

It is a pleasure to thank all the contributors to the volume. I've learned a great deal from reading and thinking about their chapters, and I hope other readers will too.

Note

- 1 The title of this book was originally intended to be *Counternarratives and Macrohistories: New Agendas in Archaeology and Ancient History*. My introduction and several of the chapters respond to this title. The "new agendas" part of the title was meant to recall the book edited by Norman Yoffee and Andrew Sherratt: *Archaeological Theory: Who Sets the Agenda?* (Cambridge University Press, 1993). Alas, the original title was altered in the production process by the press. The cover of the book, showing the historic minaret at Samarra, was meant to be juxtaposed with a line drawing of an Assyrian ziggurat, connecting two cultures widely separated in time yet rarely connected in scholarship or popular thought.