

CONSTITUTIONALISM IN GLOBAL CONSTITUTIONALISATION

Constitutionalism offers a governance order a set of normative values including, amongst others, the rule of law, divisions of power and democratic legitimacy. These normative values regulate the relationship between constituent and constituted power holders. Such normative constitutional legal orders are commonplace in domestic systems but the global constitutionalisation debate seeks to identify a constitutional narrative beyond the state.

This book considers the manner in which the global constitutionalisation debate has neglected constitutionalism within its proposals. It examines the role normative constitutionalism plays within a constitutionalisation process, and considers the use of community at both the domestic and global governance levels to identify the holders of constituent and constituted power within a constitutional order. In doing so this analysis offers an alternative narrative for global constitutionalisation based within normative constitutionalism.

AOIFE O'DONOGHUE is a senior lecturer at Durham Law School, Durham University, where her teaching centres on public international law, international economic law, and law and gender.





CONSTITUTIONALISM IN GLOBAL CONSTITUTIONALISATION

AOIFE O'DONOGHUE





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107050259

© Aoife O'Donoghue 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
O'Donoghue, Aoife, 1981– author.
Constitutionalism in global constitutionalisation / Aoife O'Donoghue.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-05025-9 (hardback)

1. Constitutional law. 2. Law and globalization. I. Title.

K3165.O32 2014 342-dc23 2013045309

ISBN 978-1-107-05025-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Colin





CONTENTS

	Ack	cnowledgements page ix	
1	Int	roduction 1	
2	Norms of constitutionalism 14		
	2.1	Constitutionalism 15	
	2.2	The norms of constitutionalism: the rule of law,	
		divisions of power and democratic legitimacy 24	
	2.3	The relationship between domestic and global constitutionalism 44	
	2.4	Conclusion 51	
3	Wł	no benefits? Constituent and constituted power 54	
	3.1	Constituent and constituted power holders and their relationship with constitutional governance 56	
	3.2	Community 59	
	3.3	Constituency 77	
	3.4	Conclusion: community or constituency? 84	
4	The	e global constitutionalisation debate in context 87	
	4.1	Context of debate 90	
	4.2	What to do about global governance? 106	
	4.3	· ·	
	4.4	Verdross and New Haven within constitutionalisation 132	
	4.5	Conclusion 133	
5	The	e structure of global constitutionalisation 135	
	5.1	Theories of global constitutionalisation 140	
	5.2	Coherence, competence, consistency and hierarchy? 151	
6	The	e development of a constitutional approach 155	
	6.1	The rule of law and constitutionalisation theories 156	
	6.2	Divisions of power 171	

vii



viii		CONTENTS	
		6.3 Democratic legitimacy 183	107
	7	6.4 Constitutional norms in global constitutionalisation Whom does global constitutionalism address?	197200
		7.1 Community 202	
		7.2 International constituency 225	
		7.3 The possible use of constituency in international constitutionalism 236	
		7.4 Conclusion: constituency or community? 241	
	8	Constitutionalism in global constitutionalisation theories 243 Bibliography 250 Index 266	



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people were instrumental in enabling me to complete this work. Professor Dr M. M. T. A. Brus was extremely supportive at all stages of my research. His analysis of my work was always insightful, critical and constructive, and without his help it would not have been completed. Thanks to Andrew Hayward, Fiona de Londras, Máiréad Enright, Aoife Nolan, Neil Cobb, Clare McGlynn, Erika Rackley, Gleider Hernández and Roger Masterman, as well as the staff of Durham Law School for their willingness to discuss my ideas and being supportive at all stages of this work. Special thanks to Laura Laffler, Illan rua Wall, Matt Saul, Tom Frost and Richard Collins for reading chapters and offering extremely helpful and astute comments. Thanks also to Monica, Jim, Léan, Martin, Niamh, Brendan, Cormac, Gráinne, Seán, Conor, Eoghan, Fionn, Cian and John who are always supportive. Finally, without Colin Murray's support during this process, from listening to my endless talk about 'constituent power' on the way home from the train station to accepting the arduous task of reading the manuscript in its entirety several times, this project would have never been completed. Most of all I wish to thank him for his wise counsel, which, whenever I need it, is there.