# GENERAL INTERESTS OF HOST STATES IN INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW

It is a function of sovereign States to take action in order to maintain their financial stability, stimulate economic development or to further their non-economic interests (such as health, the environment and food security). However, such measures can conflict with the rights granted to foreign investors under international treaties. Regulators and policy makers must take States' international commitments towards foreign investors into account when making decisions and when negotiating must also avoid resorting to protectionism in drafting new treaties.

With this tension in mind, this book offers a balanced reappraisal of bilateral treaties and regional agreements on foreign investments. The sensitive issues are examined in the light of the case law of arbitral investment tribunals and other international courts, and the analysis highlights how cross-fertilisation between trade and investment law can assist in resolving conflicts.

GIORGIO SACERDOTI is Professor of International and European Law at Bocconi University, Milan, Italy. He is an internationally recognised expert on both investment and trade law, having been both a member of the WTO Appellate Body and an investment arbitrator at ICSID.

PIA ACCONCI is Professor of European Union Law at the University of Teramo, Italy, where her research focuses on the social responsibility of multinational companies and the relationship between international regulation of trade and investment and non-economic matters such as the protection of public health.

MARA VALENTI is a Lecturer in International Law at the Department of International Studies, University of Milan, Italy, teaching International Organization. Her research focuses on International Investment Law.

ANNA DE LUCA is a Researcher at Bocconi University, Milan, Italy, and a practising lawyer. Her research focuses on International Investment Law and EU Investment Policy.

#### CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL TRADE AND ECONOMIC LAW

#### Series Editors

Dr Lorand Bartels, University of Cambridge Professor Thomas Cottier, University of Berne Professor William Davey, University of Illinois

As the processes of regionalisation and globalisation have intensified, there have been accompanying increases in the regulations of international trade and economic law at the levels of international, regional and national laws.

The subject matter of this series is international economic law. Its core is the regulation of international trade, investment and cognate areas such as intellectual property and competition policy. The series publishes books on related regulatory areas, in particular human rights, labour, environment and culture, as well as sustainable development. These areas are vertically linked at the international, regional and national level, and the series extends to the implementation of these rules at these different levels. The series also includes works on governance, dealing with the structure and operation of related international organisations in the field of international economic law, and the way they interact with other subjects of international and national law.

#### Books in the series

General Interests of Host States in International Investment Law Edited by Giorgio Sacerdoti, Pia Acconci, Mara Valenti and Anna De Luca The Law of Development Cooperation: A Comparative Analysis of the World Bank, the EU and Germany Philipp Dann WTO Disciplines on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures: Balancing Policy Space and Legal Constraints Dominic Coppens Domestic Judicial Review of Trade Remedies: Experiences of the Most Active WTO Members Müslüm Yilmaz International Organizations in WTO Dispute Settlement: How Much Institutional Sensitivity? Marina Foltea Public Services and International Trade Liberalization: Human Rights and Gender Implications

Barnali Choudhury

> The Law and Politics of WTO Waivers: Stability and Flexibility in Public International Law Isabel Feichtner African Regional Trade Agreements as Legal Regimes James Thuo Gathii Processes and Production Methods (PPMs) in WTO Law: Interfacing Trade and Social Goals Christiane R. Conrad Non-Discrimination in International Trade in Services: 'Likeness' in WTO/ GATS Nicolas Diebold The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn The Multilaterization of International Investment Law Stephan W. Schill Trade Policy Flexibility and Enforcement in the WTO: A Law and Economics Analysis Simon A.B. Schropp

# GENERAL INTERESTS OF HOST STATES IN INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW

Edited by GIORGIO SACERDOTI with PIA ACCONCI MARA VALENTI ANNA DE LUCA



www.cambridge.org

#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107050235

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data General interests of host states in international investment law / edited by Giorgio Sacerdoti with Pia Acconci, Mara Valenti, Anna De Luca. p. cm. – (Cambridge international trade and economic law; 13) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-05023-5 (hardback) 1. Investments, Foreign (International law) 2. Investments, Foreign–Law and legislation. 3. Arbitration and award, International. I. Sacerdoti, Giorgio, editor of compilation author. K3830.G46 2014 346'.092–dc23 2013044150

ISBN 978-1-107-05023-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## $C \ O \ N \ T \ E \ N \ T \ S$

Notes on contributors page x Editors' preface xv

PART I General interests of host States in the application of investment treaties 1

- 1The application of BITs in time of economic crisis: limits to<br/>their coverage, necessity and the relevance of WTO law3GIORGIO SACERDOTI3
- 2 The protection of general interests of host States in the application of the fair and equitable treatment standard 26 MARA VALENTI
- Indirect expropriations and regulatory takings: what role for the "legitimate expectations" of foreign investors? 58
   ANNA DE LUCA
- 4 Trade and investment law: what relations? 76 FRIEDL WEISS
- 5 On the evolution and slow convergence of international trade and investment law 104
   JÜRGEN KURTZ
- 6 Sovereign wealth funds as protected investors under BITs and the safeguard of the national security of host States 130 MICHELE BARBIERI

```
Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-05023-5 - General Interests of Host States in International Investment Law
Edited by Giorgio Sacerdoti with Pia Acconci, Mara Valenti, Anna De Luca
Frontmatter
More information
```

viii

CONTENTS

PART II The protection of non-investment concerns in international investment law 163

7 The integration of non-investment concerns as an opportunity for the modernization of international investment law: is a multilateral approach desirable? 165

PIA ACCONCI

- 8 Intellectual property protection in investment agreements and public concerns 194 ANTONIETTA DI BLASE
- 9 Up-keeping non-economic values in development assistance: does the World Bank practise what it preaches? Answers from the Inspection Panel 218
   AGOSTINA LATINO
- 10 The protection of indigenous peoples' concerns in World Bank-funded projects 237 MARTINA GUIDI

PART III The protection of general interests of host States and the EU as a new player in the investment arena 263

- 11 The future of BITs between EU Member States: are intra-EU BITs compatible with the internal market? 265 PAOLA MARIANI
- 12 European Union restrictions to the free movement of capital v. BITs guarantees: learning from the European Court of Justice case law 287

ELSA MILANESI

Ensuring the consistency of the EU investment policy within the EU external action: the relevance of non-trade values 308

ALESSANDRO PERFETTI

14Non-financial concerns in the lending policy of the European<br/>Investment Bank in context325

EMANUELA PISTOIA

#### CONTENTS

ix

PART IV The protection of general interests of host States in the trade and investment context: other regional perspectives 355

- 15 The protection of general interests of host States in regional agreements in the Asia-Pacific Area 357 CLAUDIO DORDI AND HAI YEN TRINH
- 16 The regulation of foreign investments in Mercosur: failed attempts and challenges ahead 378

ARNO DAL RI JR AND PAULO POTIARA DE ALCÂNTARA VELOSO

PART V The protection of general interests of host States from the Italian perspective 397

- 17 Italy's treaty practice and case-law: what balance between investors' protection and general interests of host States? 399
  FEDERICO ORTINO AND DOMENICO DI PIETRO
- 18 Diplomatic intervention and State-to-State arbitration as alternative means for the protection of foreign investments and host States' general interests: the Italian experience 422

MATILDE RECANATI

Index 445

## CONTRIBUTORS

PIA ACCONCI (**Co-editor**) is a professor of International Investment Law and European Union Law at the University of Teramo, Italy. She holds a PhD in International Economic Law from the University of Bergamo. She was awarded the special prize 'eccellenza nella ricerca' ('Excellency in Research') at Bocconi University, Milan in 2002. She was a member of the ILA Committee on the Law of Foreign Investment from 2004 to 2008. She has been a member of the editing staff of the *Italian Yearbook of International Law* since 2005. She has authored many works, in particular two books: *Il collegamento tra Stato e società in materia di investimenti stranieri (The Link between State and Company in the Field of Foreign Investments*, CEDAM, 2002) and *Tutela della salute e diritto internazionale (Health Protection and International Law*, CEDAM, 2011). Her writings mainly concern international investment law, corporate social responsibility in international law and European Union law, human rights protection and health issues in international law.

MICHELE BARBIERI is currently with an international financial and tax consultancy in Luxembourg. He holds a PhD from Bocconi University, Milan, where he was a research assistant in International and EU Law. Previously he was a visiting lecturer in International Investment Law at the Belarus State Economic University, where he contributed to the reform of the investment code of Belarus.

ARNO DAL RI JUNIOR is a professor of International Law at Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil. He earned a PhD in International Law and Economics from Bocconi University, Milan, and a Master's degree in European Union Law and Policies from the University of Padova, Italy.

PAULO POTIARA DE ALCÂNTARA VELOSO teaches International Law at Faculdade de Ciências Sociais de Florianópolis (CESUSC), Brazil. He is a PhD candidate at Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil, and

Х

#### NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

xi

a researcher with the Research Groups in International Law *Ius Gentium* and in History of Law *Ius Commune* (UFSC/CNPq).

ANNA DE LUCA (**Co-editor**) is a research fellow at Bocconi University in Milan and holds a PhD from the State University of Milan. She specialises in international investment law and arbitration, and EU investment policy. She is a member of the editorial committee of the *Rivista dell'Arbitrato* and a practising lawyer in the field of investment arbitration as a member of the Milan Bar. Besides several articles in international yearbooks and Italian law reviews, she authored in 2013 *La competenza dell'Unione europea sugli investiment esteri* (Giappichelli, Torino).

ANTONIETTA DI BLASE is Professor of International Law at Roma Tre University Law School. Previously Prof. Di Blase taught International Law at the Universities of Bologna, LUISS in Rome and Camerino, where she was also Dean of the Law School. She has published widely in the area of international law and international economic law.

DOMENICO DI PIETRO practises international arbitration both as counsel and as an arbitrator in Rome where he lectures on International Arbitration at Roma Tre University. He was a fellow of the Center for Transnational Litigation and Commercial Law at New York University School of Law. He is qualified to practice in Italy and in England and Wales.

CLAUDIO DORDI, PhD, is Associate Professor of International Law at Bocconi University, Milan. He has worked as a consultant for a number of international organisations (APEC, ASEAN, EU, UNCTAD, UNDP, World Bank). He has taught and researched in a number of American, European and Asian universities and has published in the main international economic law journals. Since 2008 he has also been Technical Assistance Team Leader of the EU Multilateral Trade and Investment project in Vietnam.

MARTINA GUIDI holds a PhD in International and EU Law. She is currently a Research Fellow at LUISS University in Rome. Her writings mainly concern corporate social responsibility, the protection of the environment and of human rights in international and European Union law.

xii

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

JÜRGEN KURTZ is an associate professor and Director of the International Investment Law Program of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at the University of Melbourne. He researches and teaches in the various strands of international economic law including WTO and investment law on which he has published in leading international law journals. He teaches annually at the Academy of International Trade and Investment Law in Macau, and at Master programmes at Universidade Catolica in Portugal, at the University of Barcelona and at the Singapore International Arbitration Academy. He was recently appointed F. Braudel Senior Fellow at the European University Institute.

AGOSTINA LATINO is Research Fellow in International Law at the University of Camerino, Italy, and lectures in International Economic Law at Roma Tre University. She holds an LLM and an MBA from LUISS University in Rome and a PhD from the University of Bari, Italy.

PAOLA MARIANI is Associate Professor of International Law and EU Law at Bocconi University, Milan, where she has been in charge of the courses of private international law and EU law since 2001. Mariani's research interests focus on the international fight against corruption, EU external relations, EU private international law and the EU internal market, on which subjects she has published in Italian and European journals.

ELSA MILANESI is a researcher and lecturer in European Law at the University of Milan (Political Sciences). Her publications cover subjects in international law and EU law, the latter mainly focused on the fiscal policy of the European Union.

FEDERICO ORTINO PhD is Reader in International Economic Law at King's College London. He joined King's in 2007. He is a member of the ILA Committee on International Trade Law; founding Committee Member (and now Co-treasurer) of the Society of International Economic Law; consultative member of the Investment Treaty Forum; editorial board member of the Journal of International Economic Law, the Yearbook on International Investment Law and Policy and the Journal of International Dispute Settlement.

ALESSANDRO PERFETTI holds a PhD from the University of Teramo, Italy, where he is a teaching Fellow. He specialised in European Union law and has written in Italian academic journals on anti-dumping, corporate

#### NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

social responsibility, food security, customs cooperation and foreign investment regimes.

EMANUELA PISTOIA is Associate Professor of European Union Law at the University of Teramo, Italy. She holds a PhD in International Organizations. Her research interest in the area of non-economic values in EU economic law covers corporate social responsibility. She has published on environmental performance certification in the EU ('Ecolabel') and on the support to CSR by means of legal instruments in the EU system.

MATILDE RECANATI holds a PhD from Macerata University, Italy, and is currently Research Fellow at Bocconi University in Milan. Her area of expertise is international economic law, specifically in that of international trade and investment on which she has published articles in books and journals both in Italian and non-Italian publications. Before Bocconi she practised with international law firms in Hong Kong and Shanghai.

GIORGIO SACERDOTI (Editor) has been Professor of International Law at Bocconi University in Milan since 1986, holding also the Jean Monnet Chair in European Law. He was a member of the WTO Appellate Body from 2001 to 2009 and its chairman in 2006–7. Previously he had been the Vice President of the OECD Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions (1995-2001) where he was one of the negotiators of the 1997 OECD Anti-bribery Convention. He is on the ICSID Roster of arbitrators (designated by Italy) where he has chaired various tribunals in high profile cases. An editor of the Italian Yearbook of International Law, he has lectured extensively in universities and at conferences around the world including as Senior F. Braudel Fellow at the European University Institute in 2012. He has authored more than 150 works in his fields of interest, combining his international trade and investment law expertise, including the first course on investment law at the Hague Academy in 1994. He is also active in international commercial arbitration as an independent arbitrator and as counsel to Eversheds Bianchini in Milan.

HAIYEN TRINH has been a lecturer in International Law at the Diplomatic Academy of Vietnam since 2001. She has also been a visiting lecturer at the Hanoi University of Law and the Hanoi University and Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences. Trinh graduated in International Relations from Vietnam's Institute for International Relations and completed

xiv

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

a Master's degree in Law and Diplomacy at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, Tufts University (USA) and a PhD degree in Law at the National University of Singapore.

MARA VALENTI (**Co-editor**) is a researcher in International Law at the University of Milan focusing on international investment law. She is the author of *Gli standard di trattamento nell'interpretazione dei trattati in materia di investimenti stranieri* (Giappichelli, Torino, 2009). She is a lecturer on the Law of International Organizations at her university and teaches at the PhD in International Law and Economics at Bocconi University, Milan. She holds a PhD in International Law and Economics from Bocconi and a Diplome d'Etudes Supérieures in EU Law from Université Paris 1 – Panthéon Sorbonne.

FRIEDL WEISS is a professor in the Department of European, International and Comparative Law of the University of Vienna. He was formerly a lecturer at LSE, London, and a professor of International (Economic) Law and Organisations at the University of Amsterdam where he was also Director of the Amsterdam Law School. His publications include *EU Recht* (co-authored and co-edited with G. Hafner and A. Kumin; Mainz, 2013); *Free Movement of Persons within the European Community* (with Frank Wooldridge, European Monographs, Kluwer, 2nd edition 2007); *International Law and Sustainable Development: Principles and Practice* (co-edited with Nico Schrijver; Brill, 2004).

### EDITORS' PREFACE

This volume brings together sixteen specialists, mostly academics but also practising lawyers in the field of international investment and trade law. The focus of their contribution is primarily the 'protection' of general interest of host States under bilateral investment treaties and other agreements, and on how to reconcile this concern with the traditional primary focus of those treaties, namely the protection of foreign investors.

The issue of safeguarding the policy space of host States when they adopt general regulations and measures in the pursuit of public interest which are liable to prejudice and discriminate against foreign investors has come to the forefront with the recent economic and financial crises. Prudential and other urgent measures for the preservation of financial stability and the viability of the banking system have been accused of having discriminated against foreign business entities and investors. Already before the crisis, the challenge of general measures by aggrieved investors in high profile arbitral litigations, resulting in huge amounts being awarded to claimants at the cost of host States' budgets, has raised the issue of the proper limits of the protection afforded by Bilateral Investment Treaties (BITs) against general measures and regulation that may qualify as indirect expropriation. This would extend treaty coverage well beyond the traditional core protection against arbitrary, discriminatory and confiscatory measures.

As a result, the very legitimacy of BITs and of the direct arbitral dispute settlement process they establish has been questioned. A few countries are opting out from the system or at least signalling their rejection of direct investor–State arbitration. This would mean re-politicising investment disputes and discriminating against investors from weaker countries unable to obtain effective diplomatic protection from their home States. The process of negotiating new treaties goes on, however, to the point of involving the two largest world economies, the United States and China. The trend includes major regional trade agreements comprising investment chapters, on the model of NAFTA, being negotiated in the

xvi

### EDITORS' PREFACE

Transatlantic and Transpacific arenas as well as in the Far East. In all of these negotiating fora, new clauses are being devised, with a view to shielding host States from potentially abusive claims by investors against bona fide non-discriminatory general regulation in the public interest. This evolution puts pressure on arbitral case law and should encourage both treaty negotiators and arbitrators to look at WTO law and its jurisprudence for a model of a multilateral, more balanced and legitimate system.

Finally, given the active role of the European Parliament in shaping the investment policy of the European Union, the EU may well become not just a new actor but a new type of actor in the evolution of investment law and policies. Current negotiations of investment chapters in free trade agreements and economic partnership agreements between the EU and major trade partners can contribute to the emergence of a new pattern in international investment law that is more deferent to the general interests of host States.

This collection of chapters investigates systematically these current pressing issues from a variety of points of views. Most of them stem from a collective research on the evolution of international investment law, financed by the Italian Ministry of Education and University (PRIN project 2008-12, Grant No. 602366). The European dimension has been added, with chapters by authors from various other countries, thanks to the participation of Bocconi University through its International Law and Economics programme of the PhD school in the Marie Curie 'DISSETTLE' (economic dispute settlement) doctoral and post-doctoral programme, financed by the European Commission (Grant No. 264633). This project links the Geneva Graduate Institute, Université Libre of Brussels and the Universities of St Gallen, Warsaw and Bocconi, focusing on both the legal and economic dimensions of investment, trade and competition international dispute settlement. The Editors thank Dr Geraldo Vidigal and Dr Emily Lydgate, the DISSETTLE researchers at Bocconi University, for their valuable assistance with the final revision of the volume.