

HUMANITY ACROSS INTERNATIONAL LAW AND BIOLAW

The concepts of humanity, human dignity and mankind have emerged in different contexts across international law and biolaw. This raises many different questions. What are the aims for which 'humanity' is mobilised? How do these aims affect the ensuing interpretations of this concept? What are the negative counterparts of humanity, mankind and human dignity? And what happens if a concept developed in one particular context is taken up in another? By bringing together research from international law, biolaw and legal theory, this volume answers such questions by analysing how the concepts overlap and contradict each other across the disciplines. The result is not an examination of what humanity is but rather what it does and what it brings about in a variety of contexts.

BRITTA VAN BEERS is an assistant professor at the Department of Legal Theory of VU University Amsterdam, where her research and teaching involve the legal–philosophical aspects of biomedical regulation.

LUIGI CORRIAS is an assistant professor at the Faculty of Law at VU University Amsterdam, within 'The Boundaries of Law' research programme. His research deals with community and identity in the European and international legal order.

WOUTER WERNER is Professor of Public International Law at VU University Amsterdam. He is also Programme Director of programme 'The Boundaries of Law' research, chair of the COST action on the constitutionalisation of international law and co-founder of the Center on the Politics of Transnational Law at VU University Amsterdam.





HUMANITY ACROSS INTERNATIONAL LAW AND BIOLAW

Edited by
BRITTA VAN BEERS, LUIGI CORRIAS
and
WOUTER WERNER





AMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

> www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107048188

> > © Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Humanity across international law and biolaw / edited by Britta van Beers, Luigi Corrias, Wouter G. Werner.

> pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-04818-8 (Hardback)

- Crimes against humanity.
 Human rights.
 Human body-Law and legislation.
 Sociological jurisprudence.
 Beers, Britta Chongkol van, 1977- editor of compilation.
 - II. Corrias, Luigi, editor of compilation. III. Werner, W. G. (Wouter G.), 1966editor of compilation.

KZ7145.H86 2013 341.4'8-dc23 2013029647

ISBN 978-1-107-04818-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of contributors	vii
List of abbreviations	xvi

- 1 Introduction: probing the boundaries of humanity 1
 BRITTA VAN BEERS, LUIGI CORRIAS AND WOUTER WERNER
 PART I Crimes against humanity 23
- 2 Crimes against humanity: a category hors concours in (international) criminal law? 25

HARMEN VAN DER WILT

- 3 Humanity's exemplary justice: from hostis to hostia humani generis 42

 EDWIN BIKUNDO
- 4 The inhuman stain: representing humanity in international criminal law 67

 LUIGI CORRIAS
- 5 Crimes against humanity, simple crime, and human dignity 87

ROGER BROWNSWORD

6 Crimes against the human species ('type II crimes against humanity' explained) 115

GEORGE ANNAS

PART II Human rights and human dignity 133

7 Human remains in French law: the snare of personification 135

FLORENCE BELLIVIER



vi

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-04818-8 - Humanity Across International Law and Biolaw Edited by Britta Van Beers, Luigi Corrias and Wouter Werner Frontmatter More information

	CONTENTS
8	'Not in our name!': losing humanity in current human rights discourse 152 WOUTER VERAART
9	Deciding what is humane: towards a critical reading of humanity as a normative standard in international law 178 RENE URUEÑA
10	The promise of human dignity and some of its juridical consequences, especially for medical criminal law 197 LAN C. JOERDEN
	PART III The commons of mankind 221
11	The concept of humanity and biogenetics 223 BARTHA M. KNOPPERS AND VURAL ÖZDEMIR
12	Interdependencies, conceptualizations of humanity and regulatory regimes 244 ELLEN HEY
13	The protection of human dignity in research involving human body material 265
	KRISTOF VAN ASSCHE AND SIGRID STERCKX
14	The many faces of humanity: some concluding remarks 288 BRITTA VAN BEERS, LUIGI CORRIAS AND WOUTER WERNER
	Index 295



CONTRIBUTORS

GEORGE ANNAS is the William Fairfield Warren Distinguished Professor and Chair of the Department of Health Law, Bioethics & Human Rights of Boston University School of Public Health, and Professor in the Boston University School of Medicine, and School of Law. He is the cofounder of Global Lawyers and Physicians, a transnational professional association of lawyers and physicians working together to promote human rights and health. He has degrees from Harvard College (AB economics, 1967), Harvard Law School (JD 1970) and Harvard School of Public Health (MPH 1972), where he was a Joseph P. Kennedy Fellow in Medical Ethics.

Professor Annas is the author or editor of sixteen books on health law and bioethics, including American Bioethics: Crossing Human Rights and Health Law Boundaries (2005), The Rights of Patients, 3rd edn (2004), Some Choice: Law, Medicine, and the Market (1999), Standard of Care: The Law of American Bioethics (1993) and Judging Medicine (1987), and a play, entitled Shelley's Brain, that has been presented to bioethics audiences across the United States and in Australia. Professor Annas has been called 'the father of patient rights', 'the doyen of American medico-legal analysts' and a 'national treasure'. Professor Annas wrote a regular feature on 'law and bioethics' for the Hastings Center Report from 1976 to 1991, and a regular feature on 'Public Health and the Law' in the American Journal of Public Health from 1982 to 1992, and since 1991 has written a regular feature on 'Legal Issues in Medicine' for the New England Journal of Medicine, now under the title 'Health Law, Ethics, and Human Rights'.

He is a fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, a member of the Institute of Medicine, co-chair of the American Bar Association's Committee on Health Rights and Bioethics (Individual Rights and Responsibilities Section) and a member of the Committee on Human Rights of the National Academies.

vii



viii

CONTRIBUTORS

KRISTOF VAN ASSCHE, LLM, MA (philosophy) (Ghent, 1974), obtained a PhD in philosophy in 2010 (Ghent University). Currently he is a PhD candidate in Law at the Vrije Universiteit Brussel (Free University of Brussels), where he is a member of the Department Metajuridica and the research group 'Law, Science, Technology & Society Studies', as well as an affiliated member of the Department of Philosophy & Moral Sciences.

His research project (2010–14), funded by the Council for Scientific Research Flanders, focuses on the legal and ethical aspects of the commodification, including the commercialisation, of human body material. More specifically, he is analysing the arguments invoked as grounds for the possible moral wrongness of commodification practices in the fields of organ transfer, biobanking and patenting of body material in order to clarify the boundaries of legitimate commodification and deepen the understanding of the principles that should inform regulation in these fields.

BRITTA VAN BEERS is an assistant professor at the Department of Legal Theory of VU University Amsterdam. Her research involves the legal-philosophical aspects of biomedical regulation. After studying law and philosophy (cum laude) at the University of Amsterdam and New York University School of Law, she worked and studied in Tokyo as part of a one-year postgraduate programme of Japanese language and culture. She then joined the law faculty of VU University as a PhD candidate. In 2005, she was a visiting scholar at the Parisian universities Panthéon-Sorbonne and the EHESS. In 2009, van Beers was invited to write an advisory report on the legal regulation of medical biotechnology for the general association of Dutch lawyers (The Humanity of Human Biotechnology: Legal Perspectives on Human Dignity and Medical Biotechnology, published in Dutch in 2009). For her PhD thesis, 'Person and Body in the Law: Human Dignity and Self-Determination in the Era of Medical Biotechnology', published in Dutch in 2009, she received the C. J. Goudsmit prize from the Dutch Health Law Association and the Praemium Erasmianum Research Prize from the Praemium Erasmianum Foundation in 2011. Since 2011, van Beers has been a member of several advisory committees of the Dutch Health Council - an independent scientific advisory body and network that provides the Dutch government and parliament with advice in the field of public health.



CONTRIBUTORS

ix

FLORENCE BELLIVIER obtained a degree (DEA) in literature. In 1997, she defended a PhD in private law on the legal dimension of 'genetic patrimony'. In 1999, she became a professor in private law and she is currently teaching at Université Paris Ouest La Défense. Among her main publications are: Contrats et vivant: essai sur la circulation juridique des ressources biologiques (2006) (with C. Noiville) and Les Biobanques (2009). She is deputy general secretary at the Fédération internationale des ligues des droits de l'homme, specializing in capital punishment.

is a lecturer at the School of Law at Griffith EDWIN BIKUNDO University in Brisbane, Australia. He has teaching and research interests in international and comparative law and critical legal theory. His current research focuses on the role of the international criminal trial in preventing the recurrence of violence. Before joining Griffith University he was a member of the Law Faculty as well as a research student at the University of Sydney. Prior to that he studied at the University of Pune in India, Utrecht University in the Netherlands and at the Kenya School of Law. Edwin also practised as an Advocate of the High Court of Kenya and taught at the Faculty of Law at the University of Nairobi and the Faculty of Arts at Egerton University, both in Kenya. Publications include: 'Exclusion and Inclusion: Bio-Politics and Global Governance through Criminalisation', in Mark Findlay and Ralph Henham (eds), Exploring the Boundaries of International Criminal Justice (2011); 'The Responsibility to Protect Civilians: Between the Rule and its Exception', in Charles Sampford, Ramesh Thakur and Angus Francis (eds), Responsibility to Protect and the Protection of Civilians in Armed Conflicts (2012).

ROGER BROWNSWORD is a graduate of the London School of Economics. He is Professor of Law at King's College London, where he was the founding director of TELOS (a research centre that focuses on technology, ethics, law and society); an honorary professor in law at the University of Sheffield; and a visiting professor at Singapore Management University.

His interests span legal theory, regulation and technology, and the common law. His more recent books include (with Deryck Beyleveld) Human Dignity in Bioethics and Biolaw (2001) and Consent in the Law (2007), Contract Law: Themes for the Twenty-First Century (2006),



X CONTRIBUTORS

Rights, Regulation and the Technological Revolution (2008), and (with Morag Goodwin) Law and the Technologies of the Twenty-First Century (2012). He is a member of the editorial board of the Modern Law Review; general editor of the Understanding Law series of books; and founding general editor of the journal Law, Innovation and Technology.

Professor Brownsword has acted as a specialist adviser to parliamentary committees dealing with stem cells and hybrid embryos. From 2004 to 2010, he was a member of the Nuffield Council on Bioethics, during which time he was a member of the working party on public health. Currently, he is a member of the UK NHS Screening Committee and chair of the Ethics and Governance Council of UK Biobank.

LUIGI CORRIAS is an assistant professor at the Faculty of Law at VU University Amsterdam. After studying European and international law and legal philosophy (cum laude), he obtained a PhD from Tilburg University. His dissertation, 'The Passivity of Law: Competence and Constitution in the European Body Politic', was awarded with the prize for the best dissertation in legal philosophy 2009-10 by the board of the Dutch IVR section (Society for Philosophy of Law). Publications include: 'Het chiasme van de rechtsmacht' [The Chiasm of Legal Power], Tijdschrift voor Filosofie 70.3 (2008): 537-62; 'L'Europa esprime se stessa: identità europea e potere costituente' [Europe Expresses Itself: European Identity and Constituent Power], in B. Montanari and G. Bombelli (eds), Identità europea e politiche migratorie (2008) and (with M. Brand), 'Editorial: The Enlarging Europe and its Implications for the Concept of European Identity', Tilburg Foreign Law Review 12.2 (2004): 103-9. His research interests include sovereignty, constitutional theory, the limits of political representation, phenomenology and the foundations of EU law.

ELLEN HEY is Head of the Department and Professor of Public International Law, Erasmus School of Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam. She has lectured at academic institutions in the Netherlands and abroad, including Argentina, China, Ethiopia, Indonesia, the United States and Europe. She has worked for the Netherlands government, non-governmental organisations and as a consultant for international organisations such as the European Union, the UN Food and Agriculture Organization, the UN Development Programme, the UN Environment Programme and the World Bank. Ellen Hey grew up in the Netherlands,



CONTRIBUTORS

хi

Egypt and Venezuela and holds law degrees from Utrecht University and an MSc. from the University of Wales.

Hey's research interests include international institutional law and international natural resources law. Her publications include (as coeditor) the Oxford Handbook of International Environmental Law. She is the editor in chief of Erasmus Law Review and Netherlands Yearbook of International Law. She is a member of the Aarhus Compliance Mechanism (elected summer 2008) of the advisory board on legal aspects of water management of the government of the Netherlands.

JAN C. JOERDEN holds the Chair for Criminal Law, especially international criminal law and comparative law, jurisprudence at the European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder). He is co-editor of the Jahrbuch für Recht und Ethik / Annual Review of Law and Ethics (18 volumes since 1993) and of volume 50 of Menschenwürde und moderne Medizin. Interdisziplinäre Studien zu Recht und Staat. Other publications include: Menschenleben. Ethische Grund- und Grenzfragen des Medizinrechts (2003); Staatswesen und rechtsstaatlicher Anspruch. Ethische Fragestellungen zwischen Recht und Politik (2008); Der Mensch und seine Behandlung in der Medizin: Bloß ein Mittel zum Zweck? (1999).

BARTHA MARIA KNOPPERS, PhD holds the Canada Research Chair in Law and Medicine. She is Director of the Centre of Genomics and Policy, Faculty of Medicine, Department of Human Genetics, McGill University. She held the Chair d'excellence Pierre Fermat (France: 2006-8) and was named distinguished visiting scientist (Netherlands Genomics Initiative) (2009). A graduate of McMaster University (BA), University of Alberta (MA), McGill University (LLB, BCL), Cambridge University (DLS), University of Paris 1 (PhD), she was admitted to the Bar of Quebec in 1985 and named Governor and Advocatus Emeritus in 2009. Professor Knoppers was the chair of the international ethics committee of the Human Genome Organisation (HUGO) (1996-2004) and a member of the International Bioethics Committee of UNESCO, which drafted the Universal Declaration on the Human Genome and Human Rights (1993-7). Co-founder of the International Institute of Research in Ethics and Biomedicine (IIREB) (2000-9), she also founded the international Population Project in Genomics (P3G) and CARTaGENE, a Quebec population study, in 2003. From 2000 to 2006, she served on the board of Genome Canada, became chair of the ethics working party of the



xii CONTRIBUTORS

International Stem Cell Forum, co-chair of the Sampling/ELSI Committee of the 1000 Genomes Project (2008) and a member of the scientific steering committee of the International Cancer Genome Consortium (ICGC) (2009). Professor Knoppers has received four doctorates *honoris causa*, is Fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, of the Hastings Center (Bioethics) and the Canadian Academy of Health Sciences (CAHS). She is an Officer of the Order of Canada and of Quebec.

VURAL ÖZDEMIR is Vice Dean, Faculty of Communications, and adviser to the President, International Affairs and Global Development Strategy, Office of the President, Gaziantep University, Turkey. He has published in the field of genomics and personalised medicine, including the social, ethical and public policy aspects. He is a member of the Society for Social Studies of Science (4S) and serves as President for the Pacific Rim Association for Clinical Pharmacogenetics. He is an associate editor for OMICS: A Journal of Integrative Biology and editor in chief for Current Pharmacogenomics and Personalized Medicine. Present research focuses on anticipatory governance, foresight and upstream policy on emerging health technologies in data intensive sciences, personalized medicine and global health.

SIGRID STERCKX is a professor of ethics at Ghent University. She lectures courses in theoretical ethics, methods in ethics, contemporary continental ethics and global ethics. Her current research focuses on: ethical aspects of biobanking, organ transplantation and patenting of human body material; ethical issues regarding human enhancement (attempts to enhance non-disease-related traits); medical decisionmaking at the end of life; environmental ethics and governance, particularly in relation to climate change and ethical aspects of the patent system. Sigrid Sterckx also serves on various advisory boards and commissions, including the Belgian Advisory Council on Bioethics, which advises the Federal Government. She is an ethics consultant for various EU research projects. Recent publications include: (with J. Cockbain), 'Assessing the Morality of the Commercial Exploitation of Inventions concerning Uses of Human Embryos and the Relevance of Moral Complicity', SCRIPT-ed - A Journal of Law, Technology & Society 7.1 (2010): 83-103; (with J. Cockbain), 'Something More Is Necessary - Are Genes and Genetic Diagnostic Tests Statutory Subject Matter for US Patents?', Expert Review of Molecular Diagnostics 11.2 (2011): 149-58;



CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

(with K. Raus and F. Mortier), 'Is Continuous Sedation at the End of Life an Ethically Preferable Alternative to Physician-Assisted Suicide?', *American Journal of Bioethics* 11.6 (2011): 32–40; 'Patenting and Licensing of University Research: Promoting Innovation or Undermining Academic Values?', *Science & Engineering Ethics* 17.1 (2011): 45–64.

is Professor and Director of the International Law RENE URUEÑA Program, Universidad de Los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia, where he is also a faculty member of the Global Justice and Human Rights Clinic. He was a visiting fellow at the Institute for International Law and Justice at the New York University School of Law. He holds an LLD (eximia cum laude) and an LLM (laudatur) in international law, both from the University of Helsinki. He graduated with a law degree from the Universidad de Los Andes, Colombia and holds a postgraduate degree in economics from the same university. Recent publications include: No Citizens Here: Global Subjects and Participation in International Law (2012); 'Internally Displaced Population in Colombia: A Case Study on the Domestic Aspects of Indicators as Technologies of Global Governance', in Benedict Kingsbury et al. (eds), Governance by Indicators: Global Power through Quantification and Rankings (2012); 'Risk and Randomness in International Legal Argumentation', 21 Leiden Journal of International Law (2008).

WOUTER VERAART is Professor of Legal Philosophy at the Department of Legal Theory and Legal History, VU University Amsterdam. His PhD thesis, 'Deprivation and Restitution of Property Rights during the Years of Occupation and Post-War Reconstruction in the Netherlands and in France' (in Dutch) was published in 2005. He is currently working on a research project 'Time, Restitution and the Law', for which a Veni-grant has been awarded by the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research. He is co-editor (with Laurens Winkel) of *The Post-War Restitution of Property Rights in Europe: Comparative Perspectives* (2011). An English translation of his inaugural lecture, under the title 'Forgetting, Remembering, Forgiving and the Mundane Legal Order', is published in Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren (eds), *Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts* (2012).

WOUTER WERNER is Professor of Public International Law at VU University Amsterdam. His main fields of interest are international legal theory, the interplay between international law and international politics



xiv CONTRIBUTORS

and the international legal regime on the use of force. Recent publications concern the politics of legal cosmopolitanism, critical analyses of Carl Schmitt's international legal theory and the political implications of the International Criminal Court.

Professor Werner is Programme Director of the "The Boundaries of Law" research programme, which brings together scholars from international and European law, IT and law, legal theory and legal philosophy; he has obtained a four-year grant from Cooperation in Science and Technology (COST) to establish a European research network. The research network studies foundational changes in the international legal order from the perspectives of international law, international relations, international political sociology and legal and political theory. Currently, some twenty-five institutions from seventeen different countries participate in the project.

His publications include: 'The Curious Career of Lawfare', Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law 43.1–2 (2011): 61–72; 'The Changing Face of Enmity: Carl Schmitt's International Theory and the Evolution of the Legal Concept of War', International Theory 2.3 (2010): 351–80; (with S. H. Nouwen), 'Doing Justice to the Political: The ICC in Uganda and Sudan', European Journal of International Law 11.4 (2010): 1–25; co-editor (with R. M. Pierik), Cosmopolitanism in Context: Perspectives from International Law and Political Theory (Cambridge University Press, 2010); (with O. Kessler), 'Extrajudicial Killing as Risk Management', Security Dialogue 39.2–3 (2008): 289–308.

HARMEN VAN DER WILT is a professor of international law at the Amsterdam School of Law, University of Amsterdam. His research interests lie in the concepts of criminal responsibility in international criminal law; the European arrest warrant; ICC: principle of complementarity; harmonisation of criminal law in Europe; criminal procedure of international criminal tribunals; legal reaction to terrorism; cooperation between states and international criminal tribunals.

Van der Wilt has been involved in professional training programmes for judiciary and public prosecutors in Addis Abeba and training programmes for young staff members of Lobatchevski University of Nijni Novgorod. He has been a member of the Research Council of an EU project on the European arrest warrant and is currently a member of the steering committee of the EU project on the impact of international procedures on domestic criminal procedures in mass atrocity cases



CONTRIBUTORS

xv

(DOMAC). In 1997, he was awarded 'best teacher of the year' by the Faculty of Law and in 1999, he received the Edmond Hustinx Prize for excellence in research. Recent publications include: 'National Law: A Small but Neat Untensil in the Toolbox of International Criminal Tribunals', *International Criminal Law Review* 10.2 (2010): 209–41; 'Why International Criminal Lawyers Should Read Mirjan Damaška', in Carsten Stahn and Larissa van den Herik (eds), *Future Perspectives on International Criminal Justice* (2010); 'A Valiant Champion of Equity and Humaneness: The Legacy of Bert Röling for International Criminal Law', *Journal of International Criminal Justice* 8 (2010): 1127–40; 'Joint Criminal Enterprise and Functional Perpetration', in André Nollkaemper and Harmen van der Wilt (eds), *System Criminality in International Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2009); 'Equal Standards? On the Dialectics between National Jurisdictions and the International Criminal Court', *International Criminal Law Review* 8.1–2 (2008): 229–72.



ABBREVIATIONS

BBMRI Biobanking and Biomolecular Resources Research Infrastructure

BGB Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch
BGH Bundesgerichtshof
BVerfG Bundesverfassungsgericht
CAH crimes against humanity

CCNE Comité consultatif national d'éthique

CEDH Convention européenne des droits de l'homme

CURAPP Centre Universitaire de Recherches sur l'Action Publique et le Politique

ECFR European Council on Foreign Relations
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
EHRR European Human Rights Reports
FAO Food and Agriculture Organization

GG Grundgesetz

HUGO Human Genome Organisation
IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
ICC International Criminal Court

ICGC International Cancer Genome Consortium ICI International Consortium Initiative

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda ICTRP International Clinical Trials Registry Platform

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

IRB institutional review board
ISA International Seabed Authority
NIEO new international economic order
NIH National Institutes of Health
SNP single nucleotide polymorphism

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

UNGAOR United Nations General Assembly Official Records

WHO World Health Organization

xvi