

PLATO'S ANTI-HEDONISM AND THE *PROTAGORAS*

Plato often rejects hedonism, but in the *Protagoras*, Plato's Socrates seems to endorse hedonism. In this book, Clerk Shaw removes this apparent tension by arguing that the *Protagoras* as a whole actually reflects Plato's anti-hedonism. He shows that Plato places hedonism at the core of a complex of popular mistakes about value and especially about virtue: that injustice can be prudent; that wisdom is weak; that courage is the capacity to persevere through fear; and that virtue cannot be taught. The masses reproduce this system of values through shame and fear of punishment. The *Protagoras* and other dialogues depict sophists and orators who have internalized popular morality through shame, but who are also ashamed to state their views openly. Shaw's reading not only reconciles the *Protagoras* with Plato's other dialogues, but harmonizes it with them and even illuminates Plato's wider anti-hedonism.

CLERK SHAW is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Tennessee, Knoxville. His articles have appeared in journals including *Classical Philology* and *Polis*.





PLATO'S ANTI-HEDONISM AND THE *PROTAGORAS*

J. CLERK SHAW





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107046658

© J. Clerk Shaw 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Shaw, J. Clerk, 1977—
Plato's anti-hedonism and the Protagoras / J. Clerk Shaw.
pages cm
ISBN 978-1-107-04665-8 (hardback)

I. Plato. Protagoras. 2. Hedonism. I. Title. B382.853 2015 170–dc23 2014037525

ısвn 978-1-107-04665-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgments List of abbreviations		page vi
		vii
	Introduction	I
ı.	Against hedonist interpretations of the Protagoras	II
2.	Courage, madness, and spirit at 349d–51b	41
3.	Drama and dialectic in Plato's Protagoras	73
4.	Drama and dialectic in Plato's Gorgias, revisited	102
5.	Shame, internalization, and the many	123
5.	Hedonism, hedonic error, and ethical error	143
7.	Hedonist misconceptions of virtue	171
8.	Popular hostility to sophists and philosophers	191
Bibliography		205
General index		210
Index locorum		213



Acknowledgments

I owe special thanks to friends and mentors who shaped every stage of this project: especially Eric Brown, but also Julia Annas, Emily Austin, Rachana Kamtekar, and Rachel Singpurwalla. In each case, for various reasons, I doubt this book would exist without them. Thanks also to audiences who heard parts of the book presented at the American Philosophical Association, the Arizona Colloquium in Ancient Philosophy, the College of Charleston, the Society for Ancient Greek Philosophy, the Tahoe Workshop in Ancient Philosophy, and the University of Tennessee, Knoxville. A teaching-free semester and a Chancellor's Grant for Faculty Research from the University of Tennessee provided crucial time for developing the project. Thanks to referees for Cambridge University Press and to my colleagues at the University of Tennessee for feedback on the book; I also tested many of its ideas on students in my classes. Finally, I am truly grateful to my family, especially my parents George and Paula, my sister Katy, and my spouse Ginger, for their love and support during this project and throughout my life.



Abbreviations

Plato (Pl.)

Ap. Apology Ĉh. Charmides Cr. Crito Crat. Cratylus [*Def.*] Definitions [Ep.]Letters Euthyphro Eu. Euthyd. Euthydemus G. Gorgias

H. Ma. Greater Hippias

L. Laws La. Laches Lys.Lysis Meno \dot{M} . Phd. Phaedo Phdr. Phaedrus Phil. Philebus Pol. Statesman Pr.Protagoras R. Republic Soph. Sophist Symp. Symposium Ťht. Theaetetus Ti. Timaeus

[II Alc.] Second Alcibiades

Aristotle (Ar.)

An. Pr. Prior Analytics EE Eudemian Ethics

vii



viii List of abbreviations

EN Nicomachean Ethics

Meta. Metaphysics
Pol. Politics
Rhet. Rhetoric
Top. Topics