

Masters, Slaves, and Exchange

This book examines the political economy of the master-slave relation viewed through the lens of consumption and market exchange. What did it mean when human chattel bought commodities, "stole" property, or gave and received gifts? Forgotten exchanges, this study argues, measured the deepest questions of worth and value, shaping an enduring struggle for power between slaves and masters. The slaves' internal economy focused intense paternalist negotiation on a ground where categories of exchange – provision, gift, contraband, and commodity – were in constant flux. At once binding and alienating, these ties endured constant moral stresses and material manipulation by masters and slaves alike, galvanizing conflict and engendering complex new social relations on and off the plantation.

Kathleen M. Hilliard is Assistant Professor in the Department of History at Iowa State University. She received her B.A. from Wake Forest University and her Ph.D. from the University of South Carolina, where she worked under the direction of Mark M. Smith and won the Wienefeld Award for best dissertation in history. Since 2006 she has studied and taught about the Old South, slavery, and the social and cultural contradictions of antebellum America in the decidedly unsouthern climes of the University of Idaho and Iowa State University. Portions of her work have been published in major essay collections and presented in scholarly meetings in the United States, the Netherlands, and the United Kingdom. She has served on the Editorial Board for *Agricultural History* and Gale/Cengage's *Slavery and Anti-Slavery* digital history project.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES ON THE AMERICAN SOUTH

Series Editors

Mark M. Smith, University of South Carolina, Columbia
David Moltke-Hansen, Center for the Study of the American South, University of North
Carolina at Chapel Hill

Interdisciplinary in its scope and intent, this series builds upon and extends Cambridge University Press's long-standing commitment to studies on the American South. The series will not only offer the best new work on the South's distinctive institutional, social, economic, and cultural history but will also feature works in a national, comparative, and transnational perspective.

Titles in the Series

Robert E. Bonner, Mastering America: Southern Slaveholders and the Crisis of American Nationhood

Ras Michael Brown, African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry Christopher Michael Curtis, Jefferson's Freeholders and the Politics of Ownership in the Old Dominion

Ari Helo, Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress: The Morality of a Slaveholder

Kathleen M. Hilliard, Masters, Slaves, and Exchange: Power's Purchase in the Old South

Scott P. Marler, The Merchants' Capital: New Orleans and the Political Economy of the Nineteenth-Century South

Peter McCandless, Slavery, Disease, and Suffering in the Southern Lowcountry Johanna Nicol Shields, Freedom in a Slave Society: Stories from the Antebellum South Brian Steele, Thomas Jefferson and American Nationhood Jonathan Daniel Wells, Women Writers and Journalists in the Nineteenth-Century South



> To my parents, Margaret and Anthony Hilliard



Masters, Slaves, and Exchange

Power's Purchase in the Old South

KATHLEEN M. HILLIARD

Iowa State University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107046467

© Kathleen M. Hilliard 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Hilliard, Kathleen M., 1975 – Masters, slaves, and exchange: power's purchase in the Old South / Kathleen M. Hilliard, Iowa State University, Ames, Iowa.

pages cm. - (Cambridge studies on the American South)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-I-107-04646-7 (hardback) - ISBN 978-I-107-63664-4 (paperback)

- 1. Slavery Economic aspects Southern States History 19th century.
- Slavery Social aspects Southern States History 19th century.
 Slaves Southern States Economic conditions 19th century.
 Southern States Economic conditions 19th century.
 Slaveholders Southern States History 19th century.
 Plantation owners Southern States History 19th century.
 Exchange Social aspects Southern States History 19th century.
 Consumer behavior Social aspects Southern States History 19th century.
 Paternalism Southern States History 19th century.
 Title.
 E449.H65
 2013

306.3´620975-dc23 2013022112

ISBN 978-1-107-04646-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-63664-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Li	st of Figures and Tables	page viii
Αc	cknowledgments	ix
Ar	rchive Abbreviations	xiii
	Introduction	I
Ι	Money and Moralism	15
2	Slaves and Spending	46
3	Servants Served	69
4	Black Markets	94
5	Gilt Chains	132
6	The Choice	154
	Conclusion	182
Note on Sources		187
Bibliography		193
Index		211

vii



Figures and Tables

Figures

I.I	The slaveholders' central dilemma	page 29
1.2	John B. Miller's architectural plans	38
2.I	Austin Steward's great fear	53
3.1	Purchases made at John Black's store	91
5.1	Conflict and communion on the plantation	139
6.1	Portrait of Ellen Craft disguised as a white man	171
Table	es	
3.1	Ledgers containing slave accounts	82
3.2	Slaves' purchases recorded in six account ledgers	83
3.3	Percentages of goods purchased by slaves in account ledgers	84
3.4	Items purchased by slaves in stores	84-85
3.5	Top itemized percentages of total purchases	85
3.6	Percentages of total purchases devoted to homespun cloth	86
3.7	Itemized percentages of total cloth purchases	87
3.8	Percentages of total purchases devoted to ready-made clothing	87
3.9	Itemized percentages of ready-made clothing purchases	88
3.10	Itemized percentages of total food purchases	88
3.11	Top itemized percentages of total goods purchased by gender	91
4.I	Items Listed in 234 Indictments for Property Crimes in	
	the South Carolina Court of Magistrates and Freeholders,	
	Anderson/Pendleton and Spartanburg Districts, 1819–1860	109

viii



Acknowledgments

The experience of writing this book, I am chagrined to say, has often seemed to undermine the very argument it strives to make. I have received so many gifts freely bestowed; incurred countless debts graciously forgiven; trespassed without penalty upon the time of archivists, colleagues, and friends; and entered into a wealth of intellectual exchanges without the least concern of short-changing my partners. I guess that goes to show it is still sometimes possible to embrace scholarly exchange and the life of the mind beyond the purview of power and the dash for cash. Lucky me.

Fortunate I was, first off, to wander into Mark Smith's nineteenth-century seminar during my first term of grad school at the University of South Carolina. At that early point in my academic career, I understood little of what graduate education entailed, and Smith's course was a trial-by-fire experience that left me hooked on southern history. As teacher and mentor, his enthusiasm was immeasurable. Yet, Mark knew when to hold back, too. For both careful guidance and the gift of intellectual space to explore my own ideas, I cannot thank him enough. I offer my appreciation as well to Lawrence Glickman, Paul Johnson, Daniel Littlefield, Katherine Grier, Lacy Ford, Thomas Brown, and Walter Edgar. Well into revision, their comments, insights, and wonderfully divergent perspectives on antebellum society and economy helped shape this book.

Graduate peers were tough critics and generous first readers of this project in its earliest form. How lucky I was to share good conversation and scholarly debate with the likes of Aaron Marrs, Kevin Dawson, Rebecca Shrum, Michael Reynolds, Melissa Jane Taylor, and Eric Plaag. Although the plates of pimento cheese fries are long gone, Aaron and Kevin still pepper my inbox with tantalizing leads and obscure citations. I am grateful for their continued generosity. Even before this project began, Rebecca Shrum proved herself a true friend. She brought patience to my ramblings, good humor to my imagined burdens, and

ix



Acknowledgments

X

great food to my door when deadlines loomed. She remains a trusted colleague, friend, and critic. As her own manuscript goes forward, I hope that I may mirror her collegiality, kindness, and support.

Much of this project's maturation owes to series co-editor David Moltke-Hansen. His patient prodding to explain ideas more fully and unsurpassed understanding of paternalist thought in all its permutations helped transform this book from a narrow discussion of internal economy to a wide-ranging analysis of the master-slave relation. With intellect keen, vision uncommonly clear, and personality *sui generis*, David's good guidance made this book infinitely better. I'm also glad to thank Lewis Bateman, whose solid support and wry humor made working with Cambridge all the more rewarding, and Shaun Vigil, who shepherded this first-time author through the travails of publication and production.

The Southern Historical Association, the Society for Historians of the Early American Republic, the American Historical Association, the Organization of American Historians, the St. George Tucker Society, and the University of Illinois's Southern History Reading Group graciously provided opportunities for sharing my work. I am grateful to commentators and participants for their criticism. Thavolia Glymph, Larry Hudson, Stephen Mihm, James Oakes, Stephen Whitman, and Jeff Forret all provided wise suggestions and thoughtful insights. Over the years, too, Vernon Burton, Peter Coclanis, Charles Joyner, and Peter Kolchin have taken time to read portions of this manuscript. I am thankful for their kind words of encouragement and honest criticism.

The archives in Virginia, Georgia, and the Carolinas are stunningly rich, both in source material and in knowledgeable staff. At the South Caroliniana Library, Henry Fulmer, Graham Duncan, Robin Copp, Brian Cuthrell, and Allen Stokes guided me through the institution's vast resources. I appreciate, too, advice from Frances Pollard and Nelson Lankford at the Virginia Historical Society; Bryan Collars, Richard Harris, Patrick McCawley, and Steven Tuttle at the South Carolina Department of Archives and History; and the helpful professionals at the North Carolina Office of Archives and History, the Southern Historical Collection at the University of North Carolina, the Georgia Archives, the South Carolina Historical Society, the National Archives and Records Administration at College Park, and the Library of Virginia. Thanks especially to Leslie Rowland for taking the time to introduce me to Southern Claims Commission records and the rich files of the Freedmen and Southern Society Project at the University of Maryland.

Financial support from the Virginia Historical Society; the Institute for Southern Studies at the University of South Carolina; the Mayflower Society of South Carolina; the South Carolina Chapter of the Colonial Dames; and the College of Letters, Arts and Social Sciences at the University of Idaho facilitated the research and writing of this book. I am especially grateful to the Department of History and the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at Iowa State University for their continued support.



Acknowledgments xi

Last Christmas, I unwrapped a package of bright pink pencils, my name and academic title embossed upon each. They're the key prop in a running joke within my family: Margaret and Anthony Hilliard have long threatened to show up to conferences and classrooms, passing these out to friends, colleagues, and students, a commodified sign of my labors, and of the close tie between us. Today, the splash of color in my desk drawer reminds me daily of the love, support, and good-humored perspective they have offered over the years, and all the writing I have yet to do. Let this book serve as poor payment for those pencils, and all the wonderful things they stand for. *Masters, Slaves, and Exchange* is dedicated to my parents, with love.

Pencils to sharpen, books to write, archives to plumb, the journey ahead is all the more exciting with Lawrence McDonnell at my side. Larry and I came together in work and love over an awful dinner at a hole-in-the-wall restaurant in Washington, DC's, Chinatown, fates sealed, so the fortune cookie said. Every day since has been a gift. My thanks to him, for everything, knows no bounds.



Archive Abbreviations

DUKE	David M. Rubenstein Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Duke University, Durham, North Carolina
GDAH	Georgia Department of Archives and History, Morrow, Georgia
GHS	Georgia Historical Society, Savannah, Georgia
LVA	Library of Virginia, Richmond, Virginia
NCOAH	North Carolina Office of Archives and History, Raleigh, North
	Carolina
SCDAH	South Carolina Department of Archives and History, Columbia,
	South Carolina
SCHS	South Carolina Historical Society, Charleston, South Carolina
SCL	South Caroliniana Library, University of South Carolina,
	Columbia, South Carolina
SHC	Southern Historical Collection, Louis Round Wilson Special
	Collections Library, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill,
	Chapel Hill, North Carolina
VHS	Virginia Historical Society, Richmond, Virginia
SCL SHC	South Carolina Historical Society, Charleston, South Carolina South Caroliniana Library, University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina Southern Historical Collection, Louis Round Wilson Special Collections Library, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Chapel Hill, North Carolina

xiii