

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums

Innovative forums that integrate citizen deliberation into policy making are revitalizing democracy in many places around the world. Yet controversy abounds over whether these forums ought to be seen as authentic sources of public opinion and how they should fit with existing political institutions. How can civic forums include less powerful citizens and ensure that their perspectives are heard on equal terms with more privileged citizens, officials, and policy experts? How can these fragile institutions communicate citizens' policy preferences effectively and legitimately to the rest of the political system? *Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums* proposes creative solutions for improving equality and publicity, which are grounded in new theories about democratic deliberation, a careful review of research and practice in the field, and several original studies. This book speaks to scholars, practitioners, and sponsors of civic engagement, public management and consultation, and deliberative and participatory democracy.

Christopher F. Karpowitz is an associate professor of political science and the co-director of the Center for the Study of Elections and Democracy at Brigham Young University. He is a coauthor of *The Silent Sex: Gender, Deliberation, and Institutions* (2014) and of *Democracy at Risk: How Political Choices Undermine Citizen Participation, and What We Can Do about It* (2005). He has published in a variety of journals, including the *American Political Science Review*, the *American Journal of Political Science*, the *Journal of Politics*, *Public Opinion Quarterly*, the *British Journal of Political Science*, *Perspectives on Politics*, *Political Communication*, *Politics & Society*, *PS: Political Science and Politics*, and the *Journal of Public Deliberation*. Prior to joining BYU, he was a postdoctoral fellow in democracy and human values at Princeton University's Center for Human Values.

Chad Raphael is a professor of communication at Santa Clara University. He is the author of *Investigated Reporting: Muckrakers, Regulators, and the Struggle over Television Documentary* (2005), which won the Frank Luther Mott-Kappa Tau Alpha Research Award for the best book on journalism and mass communication, the Donald McGannon Award for social and ethical relevance in communications policy research, and the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication History Division Award for best book. He has published in many journals, including *Political Communication*, *Politics and Society*, *Communication Law and Policy*, *Journalism Studies*, the *Journal of Educational Computing Research*, the *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, and *Games and Culture*, and in many edited volumes. He consults for non-profit organizations on their communication strategies and is former chair of the board at the Jessie Smith Noyes Foundation and the Silicon Valley Toxics Coalition. Before entering academia, he was a community organizer on affordable housing and environmental issues.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality
and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality
and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums

Improving Equality and Publicity

CHRISTOPHER F. KARPOWITZ

Brigham Young University

CHAD RAPHAEL

Santa Clara University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107046436

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Karpowitz, Christopher F., 1969–

Deliberation, democracy, and civic forums : improving equality and publicity /

Christopher F. Karpowitz, Chad Raphael.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04643-6 (hardback)

1. Political participation. 2. Political planning – Citizen participation.

3. Democratization. I. Raphael, Chad. II. Title.

JF799.K37 2014

323'.042 – dc23 2014018611

ISBN 978-1-107-04643-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality
and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*For Betty and Adin and
for Jordan, Caleb, Quinn, Cami, and Zachary*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality
and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality
and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Tables and figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
Introduction	1
1 Democratic deliberation in civic forums	34
Part I Equality	
2 Enclave deliberation of the disempowered	89
3 Enclave deliberation about the digital divide <i>with Allen S. Hammond IV</i>	157
Part II Publicity	
4 Deliberative publicity	201
5 Argumentation	242
6 Transparency	294
7 Strengthening deliberative civic forums	337
<i>References</i>	361
<i>Index</i>	390

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Tables and figures

Table I.1	Types of civic forums	<i>page</i> 13
Table 1.1	Elements of democratic deliberation in civic forums	37
Table 1.2	Decision methods and autonomy in civic forums	55
Table 2.1	Inclusion and enclaves in civic forums	109
Figure 2.1	Ways of integrating enclave deliberation	93
Table 3.1	Community panel and control panel characteristics	165
Table 3.2	Community panelists' views of participation	167
Table 3.3	Community panelists' views of agreement and disagreement	171
Table 3.4	Community panelists' views of autonomy	174
Table 3.5	Expert evaluations of diversity of views	176
Table 3.6	Panelists' rationales for municipal broadband	178
Table 3.7	Impressions of community panelists' knowledge of the issues	185
Table 3.8	Expert views of the consensus conference	192
Figure 3.1	(a) Recognition of disagreement. (b) Recognition of diversity of views	170
Figure 3.2	Internal efficacy	175
Figure 3.3	(a) Interpersonal trust. (b) Self-interest and common good	181
Figure 3.4	(a) Knowledge of broadband. (b) Knowledge of broadband's advantages	183
Figure 3.5	Knowledge of US broadband penetration ranking in the world	184
Figure 3.6	Opinion strength	188
Table 4.1	Argumentation indicators	215
Table 4.2	Transparency indicators	230
Table 5.1	Sample of reports	245

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of tables and figures*

ix

Table 5.2	Percentage of conclusions associated with other categories	277
Table 5.3	Document-level coherence coding results	282
Figure 5.1	Overview of coded sentences in each document	251
Figure 5.2	Relationship between conclusions and reasoning	252
Figure 5.3	Types of evidence	258
Figure 5.4	Opposing views as a percentage of coded sentences	267
Figure 5.5	Varieties of opposing views	271
Figure 5.6	Normative appeals as a percentage of coded sentences	274
Figure 5.7	Ratio of conclusions to reasoning	278
Figure 5.8	Overview of coherence	280
Figure 5.9	Relationship between document-level and conclusion-level coherence	283
Table 6.1	Transparency coding results	298
Table 6.2	Internal and external legitimacy	333
Figure 6.1	Proportion of sentences including transparency	296
Figure 6.2	Relationship between sentences and categories	300
Figure 6.3	Relationship between transparency and argumentation	301
Figure 6.4	Dimensions of transparency	302
Figure 6.5	Overview of deliberative polling	320
Figure 7.1	Guiding questions for integrating enclave deliberation	342
Figure 7.2	Deliberative publicity checklist	356

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Unlike Athena, the Greek goddess and protector of Athenian democracy who sprang from Zeus' head fully grown, this book did not leap from the authors' brains in its finished form. Instead, it was the product of much deliberation with colleagues, research assistants, and each other, and a great deal of support from our funders, publishers, and families.

Our thinking about democratic deliberation benefitted from good advice offered by our academic colleagues, including Betty Achinstein, Jane Mansbridge, Tali Mendelberg, Seeta Peña Gangadharan, and Kathy Cramer. We especially appreciate the thoughtful and helpful feedback on drafts of the book manuscript from Archon Fung, John Gastil, Peter Levine, and Kenneth Manaster. Allen Hammond IV coauthored the research reported in Chapter 3. We also benefitted from the support of colleagues in our home departments, Brigham Young University's Department of Political Science and Santa Clara University's Department of Communication.

Our analysis of how civic forums practice publicity depended upon the research assistance of several terrific undergraduate students who assisted us with content analysis, including Etmae Brinkers, Sarina Caragan, Channing Hancock Christensen, Alicia Gessell, Kyla Moran, and Amanda Waldron. Kathleen Lynn conducted interviews with participants for the study reported in Chapter 3.

We are grateful to the Community Technology Foundation of California and the California Consumer Protection Foundation for funding the civic forum that introduced us to one another, which we discuss throughout this book. Our research and writing were also supported by Santa Clara University's Center for Science, Technology, and Society and the university's Markkula Center for Applied Ethics as well as Brigham

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04643-6 - Deliberation, Democracy, and Civic Forums: Improving Equality and Publicity

Christopher F. Karpowitz and Chad Raphael

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

xi

Young University's Department of Political Science and Center for the Study of Elections and Democracy.

Several chapters expand considerably upon previously published journal articles, which we thank the publishers for permission to use:

Chapter 3: Christopher F. Karpowitz, Chad Raphael, and Allen S. Hammond IV. 2009. Deliberative Democracy and Inequality: Two Cheers for Enclave Deliberation among the Disempowered. *Politics & Society* 37: 576–615, by permission of Sage Publishers.

Chapters 5 and 6: Chad Raphael and Christopher F. Karpowitz. 2013. Good Publicity: The Legitimacy of Public Communication of Deliberation. *Political Communication* 30: 17–41, by permission of Taylor & Francis Publishers.

Figure 6.5 is used with permission of By the People-MacNeil/Lehrer Productions and the Center for Deliberative Democracy.

We thank Robert Dreesen, our editor at Cambridge University Press, and Elizabeth Janetschek at Cambridge, for shepherding this book to completion. The anonymous reviewers for the Press offered insightful and critical feedback that improved the work. Many thanks also to Sara Barnes for copyediting the book, Ariel O. Tuplano for indexing it, Chloe Harries for designing the cover, and Nitesh Sharma for managing production.

Each of us is also thankful for the opportunity we have had to collaborate with one another. Like all good partnerships, ours involved both shared and complementary contributions. We designed and performed this research together. Chris was primarily responsible for conducting and drafting the data analyses we report in Chapters 3 through 6. Chad took the lead on drafting the theoretical material. However, we passed our drafts back and forth many times, editing and improving each other's thinking, so that both of us have shaped each section of the final manuscript. In the process, we learned a great deal from one another about the theory, research, and practice of civic deliberation, and about scholarly collaboration.

We are most grateful to our families for supporting us in countless ways and for forgiving us the hours we spent writing. We dedicate this book to them.