

No Exit from Pakistan

America's Tortured Relationship with Islamabad

This book tells the story of the tragic and often tormented relationship between the United States and Pakistan. Pakistan's internal troubles have already threatened U.S. security and international peace, and Pakistan's rapidly growing population, nuclear arsenal, and relationships with China and India will continue to force it upon America's geostrategic map in new and important ways over the coming decades. This book explores the main trends in Pakistani society that will help determine its future; traces the wellsprings of Pakistani anti-American sentiment through the history of U.S.-Pakistan relations from 1947 to 2001; assesses how Washington made and implemented policies regarding Pakistan since the terrorist attacks on the United States on September 11, 2001; and analyzes how regional dynamics, especially the rise of China, will likely shape U.S.-Pakistan relations. It concludes with three options for future U.S. strategy, described as defensive insulation, military-first cooperation, and comprehensive cooperation. The book explains how Washington can prepare for the worst, aim for the best, and avoid past mistakes.

Daniel S. Markey is a Senior Fellow at the Council on Foreign Relations (CFR), where he specializes in security and governance issues in South Asia. From 2003 to 2007, Dr. Markey held the South Asia portfolio on the Secretary's Policy Planning Staff at the U.S. Department of State. Prior to government service, he taught in the Department of Politics at Princeton University, where he also served as executive director of Princeton's Research Program in International Security. Dr. Markey earned his bachelor's degree in international studies from the Johns Hopkins University and his doctorate in politics from Princeton University. He completed a postdoctoral fellowship at Harvard University's Olin Institute for Strategic Studies. Dr. Markey served as project director of the CFR-sponsored *Independent Task Force Report on U.S.* Strategy in Pakistan and Afghanistan (2010). He has published articles in Foreign Affairs, The National Interest, The American Interest, Foreign Policy, and Security Studies among other journals. His commentary has been featured in many newspapers, including the New York Times, Washington Post, Wall Street Journal, Los Angeles Times, and International Herald Tribune. He has been awarded grants from the MacArthur and Smith Richardson foundations to support his research, including regular trips to Pakistan and elsewhere in Asia.





A Council on Foreign Relations Book

The Council on Foreign Relations (CFR) is an independent, nonpartisan membership organization, think tank, and publisher dedicated to being a resource for its members, government officials, business executives, journalists, educators and students, civic and religious leaders, and other interested citizens in order to help them better understand the world and the foreign policy choices facing the United States and other countries. Founded in 1921, the CFR carries out its mission by maintaining a diverse membership, with special programs to promote interest and develop expertise in the next generation of foreign policy leaders; convening meetings at its headquarters in New York and in Washington, D.C., and other cities where senior government officials, members of Congress, global leaders, and prominent thinkers come together with CFR members to discuss and debate major international issues; supporting a Studies Program that fosters independent research, enabling CFR scholars to produce articles, reports, and books and hold roundtables that analyze foreign policy issues and make concrete policy recommendations; publishing Foreign Affairs, the preeminent journal on international affairs and U.S. foreign policy; sponsoring Independent Task Forces that produce reports with both findings and policy prescriptions on the most important foreign policy topics; and providing up-to-date information and analysis about world events and American foreign policy on its website, www.cfr.org.





No Exit from Pakistan

America's Tortured Relationship with Islamahad

DANIEL S. MARKEY

A Council on Foreign Relations Book





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107623590

© Daniel S. Markey 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Markey, Daniel Seth, 1973- author.

No exit from Pakistan : America's tortured relationship with Islamabad / Daniel S. Markey. pages : maps; cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04546-0 (hardback : alkaline paper) – ISBN 978-1-107-62359-0 (paperback)

1. United States – Foreign relations – Pakistan. 2. Pakistan – Foreign relations – United

States. 3. Anti-Americanism – Pakistan. 4. Pakistan – Politics and government.

5. Pakistan - Strategic aspects. I. Title.

E183.8.P18M375 2013

327.7305491-dc23 2013019456

ISBN 978-1-107-04546-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-62359-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

The Council on Foreign Relations takes no institutional positions on policy issues and has no affiliation with the U.S. government. All views expressed in its publications and on its website are the sole responsibility of the author or authors.



Contents

Maps	page ix
Acknowledgments	xi
ı No Exit	I
2 The Four Faces of Pakistan	29
3 Why Do They Hate Us?	72
4 U-Turn to Drift: U.SPakistan Relations during the Musharraf Era	105
Great Expectations to Greater Frustrations: U.SPakistan Relations after Musharraf	136
6 From the Outside-In: U.SPakistan Relations in the Regional Context	169
7 America's Options	200
Index	239





Maps



Pakistan.

ix





Pakistan and Its Region.



Acknowledgments

This book is a hybrid, born of experiences in academia and government. I could only have written it while working at an institution that values both. Few come as close to that ideal as the Washington, D.C., office of the Council on Foreign Relations (CFR). I am forever grateful to CFR President Richard N. Haass, who hired me at the State Department as well as at CFR, and who supported this project from its earliest conceptual stages. Thanks also go to CFR's director of studies, James M. Lindsay, who fulfilled the dream of every author: he freed me to research, think, and write, then offered candid, constructive criticism of every chapter along the way.

Four research associates dedicated their time, energy, and impressive intellectual talents to this book. Daniel Simons and Robert Nelson contributed good ideas and research as the project was just starting to germinate. Later, they graciously made time to read and respond to the entire manuscript despite the demands of new government jobs. The greatest burden of research and editorial assistance fell to Kunaal Sharma, and later, to Kevin Grossinger. Each handled these tasks in his own way, but always masterfully and with good cheer. Kevin's enthusiasm and attention to detail were invaluable down the home stretch. Joining the task for shorter stints were several generations of bright CFR interns: Azmat Khan, Reyad Allie, Arsla Jawaid, Emilie Shumway, Emma Barnes, Bradley Saunders, Jesse Sedler, Edward Krasniewski, Mashal Shah, and Sikander Kiani.

I hope this book reflects well the lessons I have learned from U.S. government colleagues, particularly the policy planning directors, staffers, and officers of the embassies and consulates in Pakistan, India, and China. U.S. embassy Islamabad, in particular, has welcomed and assisted me during various research trips. If this book also reveals a measure of academic wisdom, it is because I have benefited from my time at Johns Hopkins and Princeton, and



xii Acknowledgments

especially from the teaching and guidance of Professors Steven David and Aaron Friedberg.

As part of the editorial process, I was fortunate to convene a group of top experts on Pakistan and U.S. foreign policy chaired by George Perkovich. Their responses to the manuscript, as well as those of two outstanding reviewers, Stephen Cohen and Ashley Tellis, helped me to revise and strengthen the final product. The help of Dennis Kux and Alan Kronstadt was invaluable as I pulled together the historical threads in U.S.-Pakistan relations. Others, including many U.S. officials from administrations past and present, generously agreed to sit for interviews but were not always able to be cited by name in the text. Thanks to all, and also to my colleagues at CFR and elsewhere, including Paul Stares, Michael Krepon, Dick Sokolsky, Howard and Teresita Schaffer, Anita Weiss, Lisa Curtis, Amanda Catanzano, Patricia Dorff, Amy Baker, Janine Hill, Elliott Abrams, Jakub Grygiel, Edward Lacey, Eric Lupfer, and Gary Samore. Many other intellectual debts are paid in footnotes.

My gratitude is even deeper for the many Pakistanis who have so generously opened their offices and homes to me over the years. Whatever troubles may ail Pakistan, many of its people remain unfailingly hospitable and willing to share their perspectives. Numerous prominent Pakistanis are profiled in this book, but my appreciation of their political significance was informed by hundreds of conversations with knowledgeable Pakistani diplomats, politicians, scholars, journalists, officers, civil servants, and concerned citizens from across the political spectrum. For many reasons, I will not name them here. However, one of my guides to Pakistan deserves special mention: Tariq Zaheen. Tariq is an idealist of boundless energy and patience. I know I still have much more to learn from him.

Thanks to Cambridge University Press and to my editor, Lewis Bateman, for his quick and unstinting support of this project. The entire team at Cambridge deserves great credit for managing the publication process with impressive speed and skill. The book was made possible with financial support from the Rockefeller Foundation, Starr Foundation, and other generous donors. If not for these sorts of institutions and the people who sustain them, serious and policy-relevant research would be an American hobby, not a profession.

Thank you to my parents, who have always been a vital source of love and strength, and to my grandmother, Sophie Fischer, who at one hundred years of age expresses her affection by urging me to stay closer to home. The joy of spending time with family and close friends provides the greatest incentive to heed her advice. This is especially true for my wife, Robyn, and our children, Zachary and Chloe. Fortunately, Robyn understands my devotion to this line of work. For that understanding and her love, I thank her most of all.