

The Original Position

At the center of John Rawls's political philosophy is one of the most influential thought experiments of the twentieth century: which principles of justice would a group of individuals choose to regulate their society if they were deprived of any information about themselves that might bias their choice? In this collection of new essays, leading political philosophers examine the ramifications and continued relevance of Rawls's idea. Their chapters explore topics including the place of the original position in rational choice theory, the similarities between Rawls's original position and Kant's categorical imperative, the differences between Rawls's model and Scanlon's contractualism, and the role of the original position in the argument between Rawls and other views in political philosophy, including utilitarianism, feminism, and radicalism. This accessible volume will be a valuable resource for undergraduates as well as advanced students and scholars of philosophy, game theory, economics, and the social and political sciences.

Timothy Hinton is Professor of Philosophy at North Carolina State University, Raleigh, North Carolina. He has published numerous papers on political philosophy, ethics, and the philosophy of religion in journals including *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, *Analysis*, and *Journal of Social Philosophy*.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04448-7 - The Original Position
Edited by Timothy Hinton
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Classic Philosophical Arguments

Over the centuries, a number of individual arguments have formed a crucial part of philosophical enquiry. The volumes in this series examine these arguments, looking at the ramifications and applications which they have come to have, the challenges which they have encountered, and the ways in which they have stood the test of time.

Titles in the series

The Prisoner's Dilemma
Edited by Martin Peterson
The Original Position
Edited by Timothy Hinton

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04448-7 - The Original Position
Edited by Timothy Hinton
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Original Position

Edited by
Timothy Hinton



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04448-7 - The Original Position
Edited by Timothy Hinton
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107627512

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The original position / edited by Timothy Hinton.

pages cm. – (Classic philosophical arguments)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04448-7 (Hardback : alk. paper) –

ISBN 978-1-107-62751-2 (Paperback : alk. paper)

1. Political science–Philosophy. 2. Liberalism–Philosophy. I. Hinton, Timothy, 1964- editor.

JA71.O675 2015

320.01–dc23 2015020040

ISBN 978-1-107-04448-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-62751-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of contributors	page vii
Acknowledgments	x
List of abbreviations	xi
Introduction: the original position and <i>The Original Position</i> – an overview Timothy Hinton	1
1 Justice as fairness, utilitarianism, and mixed conceptions David O. Brink	18
2 Rational choice and the original position: the (many) models of Rawls and Harsanyi Gerald Gaus and John Thrasher	39
3 The strains of commitment Jeremy Waldron	59
4 Our talents, our histories, ourselves: Nozick on the original position argument John Christman	77
5 Rawls and Dworkin on hypothetical reasoning Matthew Clayton	97
6 Feminist receptions of the original position Amy R. Baehr	119
7 G. A. Cohen's critique of the original position David Estlund	139
8 Liberals, radicals, and the original position Timothy Hinton	159
9 The original position and Scanlon's contractualism Joshua Cohen	179

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04448-7 - The Original Position
Edited by Timothy Hinton
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

vi	Contents	
10	The “Kantian roots” of the original position Andrews Reath	201
11	Stability and the original position from <i>Theory</i> to <i>Political Liberalism</i> Paul Weithman	224
12	The original position in <i>The Law of Peoples</i> Gillian Brock	247
	References	266
	Index	274

Contributors

Amy R. Baehr is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Hofstra University. Her work has appeared in journals including *Ethics*, *Law and Philosophy*, *Hypatia: A Journal of Feminist Philosophy*, and *The Journal of Political Philosophy*. Her papers have also appeared in anthologies including *The Philosophy of Rawls: A Collection of Essays* (edited by Henry S. Richardson) and *Feminist Interpretations of John Rawls* (edited by Ruth Abbey). She is editor of *Varieties of Feminist Liberalism* (2004) and author of "Liberal Feminism" (*Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*).

David O. Brink is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, San Diego, Director of the Institute for Law and Philosophy at the University of San Diego School of Law, and editor of the journal *Legal Theory*. He is author of *Moral Realism and the Foundations of Ethics* (Cambridge, 1989), *Perfectionism and the Common Good* (2003), and *Mill's Progressive Principles* (2013).

Gillian Brock is a Professor of Philosophy at the University of Auckland in New Zealand. She is the author of *Global Justice: A Cosmopolitan Account* (2009) and editor or co-editor of *Current Debates in Global Justice* (with Darrel Moellendorf, 2005), *The Political Philosophy of Cosmopolitanism* (with Harry Brighouse, 2005), *Necessary Goods: Our Responsibilities to Meet Others' Needs* (1998), and *Global Health and Global Health Ethics* (with Solomon Benatar, 2011). She has published in journals including *Ethics*, *The Monist*, *American Philosophical Quarterly*, *Philosophy*, *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, *Journal of Social Philosophy*, *Analysis*, *The Journal of Ethics*, and *Utilitas*.

John Christman is Professor of Philosophy, Political Science, and Women's Studies at Penn State University. He is the author of *The Myth of Property: Toward a Theory of Egalitarian Ownership* (1994) and *The Politics of Persons: Individual Autonomy for Socio-historical Selves* (Cambridge, 2009). He is also the editor of *The Inner Citadel: Essays on Individual Autonomy* (1989) and *Autonomy and the Challenges to Liberalism: New Essays* (with Joel Anderson, Cambridge, 2004).

Matthew Clayton is Associate Professor of Political Theory at the University of Warwick. He is the author of *Justice and Legitimacy in Upbringing* (2006) and has co-edited *The Ideal of Equality* (with Andrew Williams, 2000) and *Social Justice* (with Andrew Williams, 2004).

Joshua Cohen is 'on the faculty at Apple University and a Senior Distinguished Fellow at the School of Law, the Department of Philosophy, and the Department of Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley.' His recent publications include *Philosophy, Politics, Democracy* (2009), *Rousseau: A Free Community of Equals* (2010), and *The Arc of the Moral Universe and Other Essays* (2011).

David Estlund is Lombardo Family Professor of Humanities, in the departments of Philosophy and Political Science at Brown University. He edited the collection *Democracy* (2001) and is the author of *Democratic Authority: A Philosophical Framework* (2008). He is also the editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Political Philosophy* (2012).

Gerald Gaus is the James E. Rogers Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona. He is the author of a number of books, including *On Philosophy, Politics, and Economics* (2008), *Contemporary Theories of Liberalism* (2003), *Justificatory Liberalism* (1996), and *Value and Justification* (1990). He was a founding editor of *Politics, Philosophy and Economics*. His most recent publications include *The Order of Public Reason* (Cambridge, 2011) and with Fred D'Agostino he edited *The Routledge Companion to Social and Political Philosophy* (2013).

Timothy Hinton is Professor of Philosophy at North Carolina State University in Raleigh. He has published articles in journals including *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, *Analysis*, *Social Theory and Practice*, and *The Philosophical Forum*.

Andrews Reath is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Riverside. He is the author of *Agency and Autonomy in Kant's Moral Theory* (2006) and editor of *Reclaiming the History of Ethics: Essays for John Rawls* (with Barbara Herman and Christine Korsgaard, Cambridge, 1997) and *Kant's 'Critique of Practical Reason': A Critical Guide* (with Jens Timmermann, Cambridge, 2010).

John Thrasher is a lecturer in philosophy at Monash University in Melbourne, Australia. His published work has appeared in *Philosophical Studies*, *The Journal of Moral Philosophy*, *The European Journal of Philosophy*, *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice*, and *The Adam Smith Review*.

Jeremy Waldron is University Professor in the School of Law at New York University. 'From 2010 to 2014, he was' also the Chichele Professor of Social and Political Theory at the University of Oxford. His books include *Liberal Rights*

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04448-7 - The Original Position
Edited by Timothy Hinton
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

(Cambridge, 1993), *The Dignity of Legislation* (Cambridge, 1999), *Law and Disagreement* (1999), *Torture, Terror, and Trade-offs* (2010), *The Harm of Hate Speech* (2012), and *Dignity, Rank and Rights* (2012).

Paul Weithman is Glynn Family Honors Collegiate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. His most recent book is *Why Political Liberalism? On John Rawls's Political Turn* (2011), which won the David and Elaine Spitz Prize for the best book on liberal democratic theory published in 2010.

Acknowledgments

The editor gratefully acknowledges the assistance of Allison Freeman, Kenneth Peters, and Ann Rives in preparing the manuscript for publication. Thanks are also due to North Carolina State’s College of Humanities and Social Sciences for a Scholarship and Research Award that helped to fund research for the book. Finally, the editor wishes to record his deep gratitude to Allison Freeman, Hilary Gaskin, and Michael Pendlebury for their indispensable advice and encouragement.

Abbreviations

The following abbreviations are used for John Rawls’s works:

<i>TJ</i>	<i>A Theory of Justice</i> (Harvard University Press, 1971)
<i>TJR</i>	<i>A Theory of Justice</i> , revised edition (Harvard University Press, 1999)
<i>PL</i>	<i>Political Liberalism</i> (Columbia University Press, 1993)
<i>LP</i>	<i>Law of Peoples</i> (Harvard University Press, 1999)
<i>CP</i>	<i>Collected Papers</i> , S. Freeman (ed.) (Harvard University Press, 1999)
<i>LHMP</i>	<i>Lectures on the History of Moral Philosophy</i> (Harvard University Press, 2000)
<i>JFR</i>	<i>Justice as Fairness: A Restatement</i> (Harvard University Press, 2001)
<i>LHPP</i>	<i>Lectures on the History of Political Philosophy</i> (Harvard University Press, 2007)

The following abbreviation is used for Robert Nozick’s work:

<i>ASU</i>	<i>Anarchy, State, and Utopia</i> (Basic Books, 1974)
------------	---